
Wellington, New Zealand, 2-6 July 2007

Edited by Christine McCarthy and Gill Matthewson

IDEA 2007
Charter
IDEA was formed to encourage and support excellence in Interior Design/Interior Architecture education and research and be the regional authority on, and advocate for, Interior Design/Interior Architecture education and research.

Objectives
The objectives of IDEA are to:
- Act as an advocate for Interior Design/Interior Architecture undergraduate and postgraduate degree programs;
- Support the diversity of degree programs;
- Provide recognition for excellence through refereed citations awarded to academic staff of the above programs;
- Publish and disseminate results of research and referred work carried out in member institutions;
- Foster and encourage collaboration within and beyond the membership of IDEA;
- Foster an attitude of lifelong learning; and
- Encourage academic exchange within the membership of IDEA.

Member Institutions
Curtin University, Perth, Australia
Massey University, Welling, New Zealand
Monash University, Victoria, Australia
Queensland University of Technology, Queensland, Australia
RMIT University, Victoria, Australia
Swinburne University of Technology, Melbourne, Australia
University of New South Wales, New South Wales, Australia
University of South Australia, South Australia, Australia
Unitec New Zealand, Auckland, New Zealand
University of Technology, Sydney, New South Wales, Australia
Victoria University, Wellington, New Zealand
Wellington Institute of Technology (WelTec), Wellington, New Zealand

2-6 July 2007
Edited by Christine McCarthy and Gill Matthewson
Published by WelTec, Victoria University of Wellington and Massey University
Wellington, New Zealand
Inhabiting Risk: Interior Designer Educators Association Conference 2007
All copyright of the papers remains the intellectual property of the authors concerned. The copyright of this volume belongs to IDEA. Reproduction is prohibited without written permission of the publisher.
Refereeing Process

Inhabiting Risk IDEA Conference 2007 adopted a double-blind refereeing process. The anonymity of author and referees were maintained at all times. Conflicts of interest were avoided within the Editorial Committee. Christine McCarthy managed the refereeing process for all papers excluding her own and those by colleagues which were managed by Gill Matthewson.

The referees were asked to submit confidential reports directly to the Editorial Committee by a required date. The Editorial Committee accepted for publishing the submissions that receive majority support from referees. The decision of the Editorial Committee was final, with no correspondence entered into regarding the awarded status of the submissions. Referees’ reports were made available to authors to re-dress specific areas of review prior to publication.

Criteria for Selection

Submissions were accepted based on the following criteria:

- The work addresses the conference theme as defined by the call for papers.
- The work contributes to the body of knowledge that is the basis of Interior Design/Interior Architecture.
- The intentions are well articulated and their achievement is substantiated through intellectual and academic rigour.
- Outcomes are identified and there is evidence of scholarly reflection on their significance.
- The work has not been previously published or is in the process of being refereed for another publication.

Editorial Committee

Christine McCarthy & Gill Matthewson

Referees

Professor Mike Austin, School of Architecture, Unitec, Auckland, New Zealand
Douglas Baker, Faculty of the Built Environment and Engineering, Queensland University of Technology, Brisbane, Australia
Dr. Diane Bender, College of Design, Arizona State University, Tempe, Arizona, USA
Assoc Prof Richard Blythe, School of Architecture, University of Tasmania, Launceston, Australia
Dr Rachel Carley, School of Design, Unitec, Auckland, New Zealand
Judy Darragh, Manukau School of Visual Arts (MSVA), The University of Auckland and Manukau Institute of Technology, Auckland, New Zealand
Tony De Goldi, Centre for Creative Technologies, Wellington Institute of Technology, Wellington, New Zealand
Kathryn Dethier, Interior Design Program, Drexel University, Philadelphia, USA
Assoc Prof Nnamdi Ellen, School of Architecture and Interior Design, University of Cincinnati, Ohio, USA
Prof Marco Frascari, School of Architecture, Carleton University, Canada
Dr Helene Frichot, Architecture and Design, RMIT, Melbourne, Australia
Prof Stephen Frith, School of Design and Architecture, University of Canberra, Australia
Lance Green, Faculty of the Built Environment, University of New South Wales, Sydney, Australia
Morten Gjerde, School of Architecture, Victoria University, Wellington, New Zealand
Michael Gulliver, Centre for Deaf Studies, University of Bristol, England
Assoc Prof D. Kirk Hamilton, Department of Architecture, Texas A&M University, Texas, USA
Dr. Debra Harris, Department of Interior Design, University of Florida, Gainesville, Florida, USA
Dr Michael Hill, Faculty of the Built Environment, University of New South Wales, Sydney, Australia
Nigel Isaacs, School of Architecture, Victoria University, Wellington, New Zealand
Paul James, School of Architecture, Victoria University, Wellington, New Zealand
Chris Kane, Building Research Association New Zealand, Wellington, New Zealand
Assoc Prof George Katodrytis, School of Architecture and Design, American University of Sharjah, Dubai, United Arab Emirates
Dr Eugenie Keefer-Bell, School of Design and Architecture, University of Canberra, Australia
Dr Peter Kohane, Faculty of the Built Environment, University of New South Wales, Sydney, Australia
Dr Andrew Leach, School of Geography, Planning and Architecture, University of Queensland, Brisbane, Australia
Dr Gini Lee, Louis Laybourne Smith School of Architecture and Design, University of South Australia, Adelaide, Australia
Assoc Prof Tom Leslie, College of Design, Iowa State University, Iowa, USA
Kate Linzey, College of Creative Arts, Massey University, Wellington, New Zealand
Prof Vivian E Loftness, School of Architecture, Carnegie Mellon University, Pittsburgh, USA
Bridie Lonie, School of Art, Otago Polytechnic, Dunedin, New Zealand
Russell Lowe, Faculty of the Built Environment, University of New South Wales, Sydney, Australia
Dr Tom Loveday, Faculty of the Built Environment, University of New South Wales, Sydney, Australia
Dr Mirjana Lozanovska, School of Architecture and Building, Deakin University, Geelong, Australia
Dr Antony Moulis, School of Geography, Planning and Architecture, University of Queensland, Brisbane, Australia
Julieanna Preston, College of Creative Arts, Massey University, Wellington, New Zealand
Ann Quinlan, Faculty of the Built Environment, University of New South Wales, Sydney, Australia
Prof Mardelle Shepley, Department of Architecture, Texas A&M University, Texas, USA
Dr Robin Skinner, School of Architecture, Victoria University, Wellington, New Zealand
Assoc Prof Leigh Smith, School of Psychology, Curtin University of Technology, Perth, Australia
Prof Penny Sparke, Faculty of Art, Design and Architecture, Kingston University, London, England
Dr Paolo Tombesi, Faculty of Architecture Building and Planning, University of Melbourne, Melbourne, Australia
Dr Sarah Treadwell, School of Architecture and Planning, National Institute of Creative Arts and Industries, University of Auckland, New Zealand
Assoc Prof Gregor Weiss, School of Architecture and Design, American University of Sharjah, Dubai, United Arab Emirates
Assoc Prof Julie Willis, Faculty of Architecture Building and Planning, University of Melbourne, Melbourne, Australia
Charles Walker, School of Architecture and Planning, National Institute of Creative Arts and Industries, University of Auckland, New Zealand
# Contents:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Foreword</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gill Matthewson</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Integration of Risk Management into the Design of the Airport Metropolis</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Douglas Baker &amp; Kelly Dungey</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Foreign Body: Whiteread’s <em>Untitled (Room 101)</em> in the Italian Cast Courts</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rachel Carley</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Un-owned Territories</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joanne Cys</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unsanctioned Occupation: experiments in threshold interiority</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dolly Daou &amp; Gini Lee</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACCIDENT + EMERGENCY: Risky Intervals in the Design Studio</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carl Douglas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uneasy: design and working between culture in remote Western Australia</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fiona Harrisson</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Designing Risk into the Design Studio</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Hedley, Dianne Smith &amp; David Fermer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Case of McDonalds Restaurant: the Built Environment and the perpetuation of the phenomenon of globalisation</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kristine Jerome</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 keys: the (ad)venture of student/industry projects</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jane Lawrence &amp; Joanne Cys</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inside Trading: a qualitative review of two urban markets</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jane Lawrence &amp; Rachel Hurst</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
threatening to unravel: the material of teaching & research in design

Jane Lawrence & Rachel Hurst

Domestic Consumption: SubArt

Kate Linzey & Emma Febvre-Richards

Foreignness and Productions of Interiority

Christine McCarthy

Intrusion and Reconfiguration in Occupied Territories

Terry Meade

Design Led Futures: Provocative Concepts as Promotional Tools

Edgar Rodriguez Ramirez, Ross Stevens & Simon Fraser

To Take Risk in Education Requires Time for Exploration

Nancy Spanbroek & Brenda Ridgewell

Interior Design from an Integrative Health Systems Perspective Reveals the 'Hidden Dimension'

Mini Suresh, Jill Franz & Dianne Smith

Strangers in a Material World: mapping the application of new materials and risk in the design process

George Verghese

Home Invasion and Political Risk

Kathy Waghorn

Risks to the Designers' Safe Interior Design Due to the Actions of Building Owners Undertaking Minor Building Alterations

B. J. (Jack) Williamson
Foreword

To produce anything [new], something in the world must be displaced… All ideas are partly evil (in the dissimulating sense of undermining) in so far as they threaten that which stands before them in the world… All new work is firstly destructive in this sense… Oddly, the first act of teaching, then, must be to destroy existing conditions, as found, prior to their reconstruction under other and more contemporary terms.¹

Risk is “a situation involving exposure to danger.” It is the thing which comes into play with every possibility of something progressive or challenging. Risk is a recipe for making, and engaging with strangeness. Risk can be denied, suppressed, or encouraged and cherished. Risk can be productive or utterly destructive. Risk chances failure, but it also chances success. Without risk the world enters mediocrity.

In the call for papers and proposals for the third IDEA conference Inhabiting Risk we asked for participants to engage in a forensic analysis of risk in the context of the education and practice of interior design and interior architecture. We considered that in this accountancy-prone era a re-evaluation of risk was needed. We wondered if true progression and intellectual play occur without risk and whether progressive interior design / architecture be taught or practiced in a context of safety, hesitancy and conservatism.

The response to our call created the five days of papers, workshops, discussion, site visits, studios and exhibitions that constitute the conference. This publication is of the papers presented. The conference held on and within the fault lines of Wellington is co-hosted by Massey University, Victoria University of Wellington and the Wellington Institute of Technology (WelTec).

No conference is possible without the help of a number of people. In particular, I would like to thank Kate Linzey of Massey University and Christine McCarthy of Victoria University who were my colleagues on the organising committee and the collegiality of the committee reflected the great collegiality of the wider IDEA community. In addition I want thank Andrew Barrie (Cheshire Architects), Nicole Doriguzzi (WelTec), Amanda Tonks (Victoria) for their various help; all those who refereed papers and contributed to workshops; and all those interior design and interior architecture students, teaching staff and practitioners who took part.

And no conference is possible with sponsors. We were lucky to receive support from each of the host tertiary institutions as well as InterfaceNZ, Aon Risk Insurance, Carter Holt Harvey, Resenes and the New Zealand Institute of Architects. For their help I’d like to thank Cherry Howard, Don Bouchen, Andy Millard, Karen Warman and John Balasoglou.

Gill Matthewson
WelTec
Convenor Inhabiting Risk

¹ Rhowbotham, Kevin 'Back to School', Architectural Design (September/October 2004) v.74. n 5, p 78.
The Integration of Risk Management into the Design of the Airport Metropolis

Douglas Baker & Kelly Dungey
Queensland University of Technology, AU

The role of airports and the management of the space in and around airports have changed considerably since 9-11. The concept of risk and resilience are now dominant themes in the daily management of airlines and airports. In addition, the airport is changing in its urban function. Airport management has also changed significantly in the past decade in Australia as a result of deregulation and privatisation. Airport property is now being developed for retail and commercial outlets, where the products may not remotely be linked to aircraft or aeronautical services. The city airport is becoming the airport city. The concept of the airport metropolis is introduced with reference to how the changing role of the airport impacts risk. The different types of risk including strategic, compliance, operational and economic risk are reviewed with respect to how design can impact risk management strategies. Design can be used as a tool to manage risk at functional, economic, security and aesthetic levels.

Introduction
The role of large international airports is changing. Airports are now becoming economic hubs that court a changing range of land uses in and around the airport lands. The transformation of functions has been termed the aerotropolis or airport metropolis, where the airport is recognised as an economic centre with land uses that access a global market. A successful airport metropolis will determine a city’s position in the global economy and the economic success of the surrounding urban and regional area is dependant on its airport’s interaction with the global economy. The greatest change to an airport will be the diversification of land uses and with this change will come changes in the way risk is conceptualised.

This paper will address the evolving airport metropolis concept with respect to risk and design. An overview of the different types of risk that impact airports will be presented. The airport metropolis is introduced with reference to how the changing role of the airport impacts risk. The different types of risk including strategic, compliance, operational and economic risk are reviewed with respect to how design can impact risk management strategies.

The Airport Metropolis
Modern airports world-wide are very different from traditional airports, where in the past, the primary function was to provide infrastructure to land and board aircraft. Large international airports in Europe, North America and Asia have varied functions beyond airport traffic and operate as metropolitan hubs with a diverse range of land uses. Airports in Australia have changed over the past decade both in their ownership structure and in the land uses that accompany airports. Since 1997, the Australian capital city airports have been leased to private companies and land uses within airport lands have included retail and commercial development. The new airport owners have diversified their operations to include a wide range of non-aviation businesses on airport land.

The evolution of the airport into an urban hub that impacts both the city and region has been termed the aerotropolis or airport metropolis (airmet). While airports have become more important to cities in recent decades, the airport metropolis concept asserts that airports themselves can invest in developments to guarantee that the airport is more than just a crucial piece of infrastructure, and is actually generating otherwise unattainable economic and social benefits. The airport metropolis becomes an economic generator that is a gateway to international destinations and markets that link regions on a global scale. This in turn, requires specific industry clustering and infrastructure to provide the necessary support for global competition. Blanton has referred the districts around the airport as an ‘airfront’ which describes the wide range of commercial, industrial and transportation facilities required to service the new demands. The airport metropolis becomes a hub that provides the city and region with a different context for markets and flow of goods. As Kasarda notes this type of global market is based on speed and access where the airport metropolis provides an unimpeded gateway for the flow of goods between the region and global markets.

The concept of the airport metropolis has not been empirically tested, and has received very little attention in the literature. The topic has been primarily dominated by Kasarda’s assertion that the airport is in the process of changing into the ‘Fifth wave’ – where airports provide same-day service to global markets. As Kasarda argues:

We are now entering the fifth and most opportune development era – the Fifth Wave – where aviation, international markets, and time-based competition will predominate. This new era is being ushered in by large, high-speed jet airplanes, advanced telecommunications technologies, and three irreversible forces of immense significance: 1) the globalization of business transactions; 2) the shift to just-in-time manufacturing and distribution methods; and as a result of the first two, 3) the growing requirement of industries of all types to ship products quickly by air to distant customers. The combined thrust of these interacting forces is creating new commercial growth nodes around the world, with international airports supplanting seaports, rail, and highway systems as primary wealth and job generators.

Thus, hypothetically, the role of the airport becomes much more economically significant due to its connections with the global economy, and this in turn, impacts the airport’s relationship to the surrounding metropolis and region. The land uses within and around the airport also evolve to suit this changing function. Kasarda cites a variety of land use changes world-wide due to corporations, such as FedEx, Nokia, and Intel, locating near airports that use global networks to take advantage of manufacturing and distribution. More recently, Kasarda and Green examine the increasing role of air cargo in economic development, primarily as an indicator for national economies. The primary assertion here is that land use is changing around the terminal and hangars – and it is not aviation based. Rather, the airport metropolis is a commercial hub that connects to a global market that is based on access and speed, and land uses around the airport are strategically situated to take competitive advantage of this global gateway.

The aerotropolis or airport metropolis concept centers the airport as a development node with changing land use patterns to

---

7 Kasarda & Green ‘Air cargo as an economic development engine’ p 460.
service a global economy. This includes land uses such as hotels and conference centers, freight and logistics companies, just-in-time assembly and warehousing, parking and car rentals, and large-scale retail outlets. Again, very little research has been conducted on the specific location and orientation of these land uses with respect to how they should be sited for effectiveness and economic efficiency.

Airports are evolving from aviation activities to incorporate non-aviation related land uses within the operational airport. To understand how design will differ between an airport and an airport metropolis the current evolution of airports must be understood. How were the first airports designed? How much did functionality affect airport design? How did airports come to be as they are today?

**Design and Airports**

Airports are viewed as iconic structures that act as a gateway to a region both practically and aesthetically. For many years, airports have moved away from the purely functional design to incorporate local design themes as well as making design statements. Airports are considered to be a status symbol that contributes to a city’s position as a desirable destination. This has evolved from the perception that air travel is glamorous and the airport symbolises a modern city. As early as 1922, Le Corbusier clearly integrated the airport symbolises a modern city. As early as 1922, Le Corbusier clearly integrated transportation (and air travel) as one of the early design elements in the Contemporary City.

Airports have evolved considerably from their shed beginnings. The focus at an airport was originally the airplane, and not the passenger. When airports were seen as little more than planes and a runway, the terminal portion of the airport was purely functional. Konigsburg, built in Germany in 1922, was the first permanent airport for commercial crafts. The relevance of this airport was that for the first time, it brought all facilities of the airport (administration, passenger waiting area) into one building. The next German airport, built the following year, had its functionality mistaken for design; the fence adjacent to terminal building was curved, and this design was adopted as a model for other airports. Airport terminals tended to be based on train station design as the concept of flight and airports was unchartered. This mirrored initial airplane design that modelled the interior of plans on the interiors of train passenger cars.

As airport traffic grew, airports had to find a new way to arrange the building to suit both passengers and airplanes. The resulting plan was the satellite design, first built in Gatwick, England, in 1936, where the planes fanned out from the circular island that was joined to the terminal by a moving walkway. Airports from as early as the 1930s considered airport expansion inevitable and necessary, and so created designs that could easily be expanded using wedge-shaped buildings or positioning runways around a central terminal. Examples of this foresight include Heathrow, Paris Orly, Le Bourget, and Tempelhof airports.

A shift in airport design came in the 1960s when air travel became accessible to the masses. In addition to the increase in passenger numbers, the prestige associated with flying diminished. For a short time there was a move away from large extravagant structures. Airport development in the 1970s was characterised by the fear of terrorism and the shift away from positioning passengers close to the aircraft to positioning arrival and departure areas away from aircrafts. This separation of activities led to a focus on the aesthetics of the airport. The standard airport design from that time was visible steel trusses, large open spaces, light and using the ceiling as a feature (for example: Britain’s Stansted, Japan’s Karoai, and Ronald Regan Washington National Airport).

The latest evolution of the airport, from airport to airmet is being driven by business and money rather than design and functionality. Air travel started as something for the privileged few, became a mass transport option and is now a vital ingredient in the success of a region’s economy. The airport metropolis needs to be many things to many customers and the design is important in achieving functionality. As Blanton

---

8 Blanton 'On the Airfront' pp 34-35.
9 Gill Retail Architecture for Passenger Terminals’ unpaginated
10 Gill ‘Retail Architecture for Passenger Terminals’ unpaginated
11 Rumerman ‘Airport Design’ unpaginated
12 Rumerman ‘Airport Design’ unpaginated
13 Rumerman ‘Airport Design’ unpaginated
14 Rumerman ‘Airport Design’ unpaginated
15 Pearman Airports p 9
16 Rumerman ‘Airport Design’ unpaginated
17 Blanton ‘On the Airfront’ unpaginated
suggests the airport metropolis fulfills the following roles in land use:

- Hotels
- Conference Centres
- Freight
- Logistics
- Just in time assembly
- Warehousing
- Parking
- Retail

The design challenge is to ensure that these diverse activities come together in a way that is functional and aesthetically pleasing. Design must go beyond functionality to address risk and must become a risk management tool. It is not enough to consider what might minimize the effect of a terrorist’s bomb, a designer needs to consider the requirements following a terrorist attack: for example, are there enough roads to bring in emergency services and to allow emergency services to leave the airport or are there too many ‘closed’ spaces that may lead to injured people not being found?

No research has been disseminated on the changes to risk management that this model creates in the bundling of non-aviation related land uses within the operational airport. A primary question to be asked is what are the primary elements that impact risk in the emerging paradigm change in airport management? Although the empirical data on the airport metropolis is presently weak, we propose a conceptual framework to assess risk with respect to changing land uses. What are the key elements to determine how risk should be perceived in this changing model?

**Risk at an Airport Metropolis**

Like all businesses, risk is prevalent and therefore managed at all airports. Airports face five types of risk: financial, strategic, economic, compliance and operational risks. Risk in the business sense of the word is defined as the potential impact combined with the likelihood of an event.  

For the purpose of this paper, risk refers to a function of the social and economic costs of an event and the probability of that event occurring.

Financial risk is very important and incorporates currency markets, futures, swaps, options and their associated risks. These risks face all businesses that operate in the global economy with foreign suppliers, customers and partners, in similar ways. This type of risk receives a great deal of attention both in academic and popular press and has many universal processes to manage risk. Because Airport Metropolises don’t face unique financial risks, this risk will not be addressed in this paper. Instead it will focus on four types of airport risk: strategic, economic, compliance and operational risk, as these areas are most likely to have airport-specific concerns.

Risk differs between airports and airmets because of the diversification of activities at an airmet. The primary concern for airmet managers is the complexity of the risk resulting from airport expansion and activity diversification. The diversification of activities at an airport metropolis both increases and decreases risk to the airport corporation. A diversity of land uses increases operational, strategic and compliance risk, however, economic risk is decreased as the airport metropolis’ income comes from a variety of sources and opportunities. Airports and airmets face the same types of risks, but risk becomes more complex for airmets. Each of the risk categories will be briefly overviewed.

**Strategic risk** refers to the risks that result from the company’s strategic vision and the consequential decisions. These risks may include airport expansion, diversification and infrastructure development. The strategic risk has cost implications as well as additional strategic implications. For example, an airport may choose between constructing an additional runway or an additional terminal. Obviously, the first risk is the cost of development. The strategic implication is that if the airport chooses to build an additional runway they cannot use that development to further other strategies such as increased retail or new landside facilities. A commitment to one development is to exclude the second opportunity. At an airport, this decision will be primarily related to aviation, whereas for an airmet the decision may be to build a warehousing precinct for just in time assembly - which is a large risk.

**Economic risk** refers to standard economic indicators such as supply, demand and income. The most topical economic risks are a sudden sharp decrease in either supply or demand as a result of terrorism or an epidemic. Should bird flu, for example, cause a moratorium on international trade and travel, airports around the world would face...
months without income. An airmet may be able to tread water during that time if they received enough of their income from non-aviation income and if that income would remain without the flights. Schiphol Airport is an example of an airmet that may survive such an incident, as it has developed a large shopping precinct that is accessible to non-travellers and has a clientele of locals.

Compliance risk refers to both the social and economic risk associated with complying with government regulations. Regulations will remain the same even if an airport decides to make the evolutionary step to airmet, but it is likely that by making that decision they may need to comply with previously irrelevant legislation, or even that government may create new regulations as a result of the airport becoming an airmet.

Operational risk refers to risks that result from standard operational issues such as birdstrike, infectious diseases and security threats. All of the previous types of risk create new risks, and complicate standard operational risk. The operational risk will become more complicated as the airmet expands and new risks arise. Figure one shows the relationship between the four types of risk and presents a few examples of the differences between airport and airmet risk.

Design as a Risk Management tool

It is proposed here that design be used as a risk management tool for the airport metropolis. With the additional complexity of risks faced by an airport metropolis, it is important to minimize risk in as many ways as possible. We assert that design can be used to manage the four types of risk in different ways. An example of using design to manage strategic risk is to encourage non-flying patrons to the retail sections. The busiest areas of the airport in terms of non-aviation spending are the secure side of the departure terminal and the unsecured side of the arrivals terminal. To encourage non-flying patrons, car parks must be close to the arrivals terminal. As mentioned, this has been achieved at Schiphol where locals go to the airport on Sunday nights when other shops are closed. Ultimately the airport will become the centrepiece of the city so the design must reflect the meeting place functionality.

The greatest challenge for the airmet designer versus the airport designer is that they must incorporate all the security, flow and aesthetic considerations while incorporating the strategic purpose of the airmet. The design must achieve a "town square" feel without forgetting that the original purpose of an airport is to process arriving and departing passengers. As Pearman argues designing an airport is more "a matter of designing a city-state." As with the design of a city-state, risk must be the foremost consideration.

The aim of the airmet designer is to achieve the following with their design:

- Functionality
- Economy
- Beauty and aesthetics
- Risk Management
- Security

There is little guidance as to how to use design as a risk management tool in developing the airport metropolis because of the limited empirical research in this area. We propose a set of organising concepts to link the preceding design aims with the four elements of risk.

---

20 Lee et al ‘A loophole in international quarantine’ pp 22-28; Asamoa-Baah ‘Can new infectious diseases be stopped?’ pp 14-15.
21 Amoore & Goede ‘Governance, risk and dataveillance’ pp 149-173.
22 Fishkin The Shape of Risk p 150.
Functionality
The priority for the designer should be to allow for smooth transitions for passengers. It must be remembered that even at an airport metropolis the main customers are the passengers. Additional considerations for the airmet designer are incorporating security functions into the building to minimise the feel of threat to passengers. For example, have the airport divided into small sections that can be locked down in case of a security breach. Sydney airport was locked down earlier this year when a man went through security without being screened. When the individual was not found, the terminal was evacuated and every passenger and their carry-on luggage had to be re-screened. This resulted in no flights for two hours (at an airport with a curfew).25 If Sydney had been able to quickly lock down the area adjacent to the security gate, most of the terminal could have operated unaffected by the incident.

The airmet designer must also realise that space within airport terminals is at a premium26 and while the feeling of openness is necessary, to the airmet operators, filling available space with retail or food and beverage opportunities is a priority. It is important to understand the difference between the airport and a shopping mall. Most significantly, at a shopping mall patrons enter and exit through the same door, traffic will move in all directions whereas at the airport passengers enter and exit through different doors and the traffic will generally be only in one direction. Gill27 identified that it is essential for the retail to be on the way for the passenger and not to be separated from the flow. This point is not relevant when considering retail opportunities on the non-secured side of the terminal, as is the case in Schiphol. When planning for patrons who may not be passengers, the airmet designer should consider traditional retail design.

Beauty and aesthetics
To appropriately address this aim the airmet designer must consider current and future stakeholders when making aesthetic decisions. The stakeholders include local government authorities, the airport corporation, airplane partners, airplane customers, non-aviation lessees, the airmet management and the local community. The Local Government Authority will most likely want an iconic structure reflecting the region’s heritage. For example, Memphis International Airport is an extension of the city itself with all the eateries reflecting the local cuisine, some cafes have blues or rock bands playing live, there are memorabilia stores dedicated to Elvis and the art and memorabilia that adorns the walls reflects the heritage of the city.28

The airmet corporation will want an inviting space that reflects the primary function of the airport without isolating patrons who are not there to fly or meet passengers. The aesthetics of the airport is seen as a competitive advantage with airports now employing world-renowned architects to design airports. In 2003 Frank Gehry declared the one type of building he would like to design by himself is an airport.29 Customers want a space that feels light, clean and new. Airplane customers want to be able to reach their plane with minimum fuss but maximum enjoyment. For most airplane customers the airport is the start or the end of their journey and for this reason their passage through the airport must be smooth and incident-free. Customers want the airport to be just as exciting as the rest of their journey. The designer must enable this by designing a building that is beautiful but also provides easy flow, the feeling of space (even though space may be scarce) and a variety of activities.

Risk Management
It is essential to provide more than one entrance and exit in and out of the airport. While most airports have more than one entrance and exit, usually only one is open to the public and the others could not be opened to the public in a crisis without causing a security risk. Likewise, there should be more than one mode of transportation in and out of the airport. Adelaide airport was closed for hours due to a car accident on a freeway that restricted traffic from both entering and leaving the airport.30 Passengers and freight failed to leave the airport during this time. More entrances and exits, as well

25 ‘Passengers allowed back into Sydney Airport’ unpaginated
26 Gill ‘Retail Architecture for Passenger Terminals’ unpaginated
27 Gill ‘Retail Architecture for Passenger Terminals’ unpaginated
29 Pearman Airports p 14.
as more methods of accessing the airport were needed.

Security
An important consideration to ensure the security of the airmet is to not place dangerous factories or distribution centres on airport land. Recently, a fireworks factory was interested in relocating to Brisbane Airport which would have posed a threat to the runways and planes, as well as the large numbers of patrons and staff in the area. It may not always be so obvious, but in the current climate even a designer must try to consider the worst case scenario. Businesses that have a higher incident of accidents should not be allowed on airmet land.

Economy

To the airmet designer achieving economy is to create functional and aesthetic buildings within budget. It is anticipated that by evolving to an airmet the corporation will decrease its economic risk by receiving income from various and diverse activities. An additional risk management tool to be considered is the creation of ambiguous spaces that can be used for many activities over its lifetime. If part of the Airmet Master Plan is to build warehousing facilities, it would be ideal if such buildings could serve another purpose just in case the airmet has difficulty leasing all the buildings. This will manage against economic risk. Design can also be economic by providing alternative energy options, incorporating water recycling into the airmet plan and allowing space for solar panels. Initiatives like these will provide long-term economic and environmental benefits to an airport metropolis.

Figure 2 shows which types of risk the designer should be trying to manage when trying to achieve each design aim.

Conclusion
The purpose of this paper was to present the airport metropolis concept and examine this concept with respect to risk and design. Airport metropolises are seeking to increase economic prosperity by diversifying their activities and this diversification will increase the risk faced by the airmet. The airport metropolis faces increased risk due to an increased flow of traffic, increased number of activities occurring on airport land and an increased commitment of funds. It is asserted in this paper that the increased risk faced by airport metropolises can be partially managed by design. It is important that airport metropolis designers are aware of how their role has evolved with the evolution of the airport. It is necessary for the designer to incorporate considerations for increased retail, additional security measures, and diversification of uses while achieving a balance of the perception of open space - minimisation of unused space paradox. In the current climate it is essential that design be functional, economic, secure, and aesthetic while managing risk.
References:


Kasarda, J. D., & Green, J. D. (2005) 'Air cargo as an economic development engine: A note on opportunities and constraints' / *Journal of Air Transport Management* 11(6), 459-462.


This paper examines the manifold risks involved in representing an interior made infamous by George Orwell in his novel *Nineteen Eighty-Four* (1949). Sculptor Rachel Whiteread’s *Untitled (Room 101)* (2004) was cast from Orwell’s former office in the BBC’s Broadcasting House in London. This room inspired the novel’s torture chamber where terrifying manifestations of private fears were brought to light. After being bomb damaged during WWII, Orwell’s former office was converted into a boiler room, becoming a repository for architectural ‘undersides.’ Like Orwell’s literary account of Room 101, the boiler room is also a risky place within the interior where trouble starts brewing. It is proposed that *Untitled (Room 101)* iterates a contemporary anxiety with terrorism, suggesting that threats of terror can no longer be contained. This paper examines how Whiteread reconfigures this emblem of totalitarian power from the past into the present. The artist directs an adversarial encounter between her contemporary sculpture and the plaster casts of antique statuary that surround it in the Italian Cast Court in the Victoria and Albert Museum. Within this interior, *Untitled (Room 101)* operates as a foreign body, confusing and contradicting the classification system at work within the gallery. In locating her work within this context, Whiteread takes a risk by challenging and affronting the taxonomic system at work in the Cast Courts.

---

1 Orwell *Nineteen Eighty-Four* p 296.
novel. The room was scheduled to be destroyed as part of the redevelopment of Broadcasting House. Whiteread had read Orwell’s novels when she was growing up, and because the room was being demolished she “felt an urgency to keep it.”

This paper examines the manifold risks involved in representing an interior made infamous by Orwell. It looks at how Whiteread reconfigures this emblem of totalitarian power from the past into the present. This is achieved by comparing Orwell’s fictional account of the room to the actual room in Broadcasting House that the artist represents. Comparisons are made to determine the extent to which Whiteread endowed anxiety with an architectural character. Her choice of subject extends her career-long fascination with architectural undersides and spaces that harbour unease. The work is part of a continuum that sounds out the malevolent possibilities that lie latent within the interior. Whiteread’s placement of the sculpture in the Italian Cast Court in the Victoria and Albert Museum further contributes to this argument.

The Literary Construction of Room 101

In Orwell’s novel, Room 101 was lodged deep inside the Ministry of Love: an ironic title given that those housed in the building maintained law and order within the totalitarian regime. The Ministry of Love was one of four Ministry buildings dividing the different branches of government. Each Ministry contained “three thousand rooms above ground level, and corresponding ramifications below.” Of all the Ministry Buildings, the Ministry of Love was portrayed as the most frightening. Orwell writes:

> There were no windows in it at all... It was a place impossible to enter except on official business, and then only by penetrating through a maze of barbed wire entanglements, steel doors and hidden machine-gun nests. Even the streets leading up to its outer barriers were

While imprisoned inside this heavily fortified building, the novel’s central protagonist, Winston Smith, sensed his way through the megalithic structure by noticing subtle changes in air pressure. Winston:

> had known, or seemed to know, whereabouts he was in the windowless building. Possibly there were slight differences in the air pressure. The cells where the guards had beaten him were below ground level. The room where O’Brien had interrogated him was high up near the roof. This place (Room 101) was many metres underground, as deep down as it was possible to go.

Winston exhibits a litmus-like sensitivity to changes in the architectural atmosphere. Such sensitivity calls to mind the Italian architect Luigi Moretti’s fascination with haptic space and with navigating interiors according to shifts in air pressure. In his essay “Structures and Sequences of Spaces”, Moretti argues that sequences of architectural spaces can be defined by the degrees of pressure and release they exert on the subject. He insisted that internal volumes have a “concrete presence on their own account, independently of the figure and coprosity of the material embracing them, as though they were formed of a rarefied substance lacking in energy but most sensitive to its reception.”

It is deep within the bowels of the earth, in a windowless room in the Ministry of Love, that the victim’s greatest fears are sounded out and brought to light. Room 101 was customised to contain the unique fears and phobias of individuals sent there for committing crimes against Big Brother. In Room 101, the prisoner is exposed to grave threats to their life and/or their emotional wellbeing. Under these conditions, they are interrogated until their dissident spirit is broken. Orwell’s description of this subterranean space, and the activities that take place in it, sound out the depths of the subject’s psychological interior. In Orwell’s literary account, Room 101 is not a space that is in itself terrifying. The room is terrifying because it is a repository for horrifying contents.

In the case of Winston Smith, his greatest nightmare was one of rats rummaging through

---

1 Between 1940-3 Orwell was employed by the BBC as a Talks Assistant and later as a Producer within the Indian Section of the BBC’s Eastern Service. Townsend ‘Live as if Someone is Always Watching You’ p 200.
3 These were The Ministry of Truth, concerned with news, entertainment, education and the fine arts, The Ministry of Peace, which concerned itself with war, The Ministry of Love, that maintained law and order and finally, The Ministry of Plenty, responsible for economic affairs. Orwell Nineteen Eighty-Four p 6.
4 Orwell Nineteen Eighty-Four p 6.
5 Orwell Nineteen Eighty-Four p 6.
6 Moretti Structures and Sequences of Spaces’ p 124.
the hidden interspace within the wall. Under torture, he must confront his fears head on. A wire cage with two compartments, each containing rats, is brought into Room 101 and placed on a table. When Winston realises what lies ahead, "his bowels seemed to turn to water." O’Brien, his torturer, describes what will happen next:

The mask will fit over your head, leaving no exit. When I press this other lever, the door of the cage will slide up. These starving brutes will shoot out of it like bullets. Have you ever seen a rat leap through the air? They will leap onto your face and bore straight into it. Sometimes they attack the eyes first. Sometimes they burrow through the cheeks and devour the tongue.

To avoid his sorry fate, Winston betrays his comrade Julia, shouting that she should be subjected to the torture not him. His spirit broken, the mask is then removed. His release from the terror coincides with a feeling of release from the confining walls of Room 101. He escapes, in his imagination, to a space that knows no bounds. It is dimensionless; it is infinitely extensive.

Winston’s sense of suffocation is replaced by a feeling of free-falling through time and space, far and away from his worst nightmare.

The Original Room 101
In choosing to name the torture chamber after his former office, it was likely Orwell harboured animosity toward this space. Richard Cork notes that the author, "abhorred the tedious departmental meetings, and the room where they took place was transformed, in his vengeful imagination, into a centre of fear and degradation.

Prior to casting Room 101, Whiteread had created an artwork based upon her own frustrations with bureaucracy. Untitled (Ten Tables), 1996, was her personal response to the interminable ennui surrounding the endless meetings she had to attend to decide the fate of her Holocaust memorial, Nameless Library, 2000, in Vienna. Thus, the artist and author, in their sculptural and literary constructions, have both rendered manifest their antagonism for spaces where torture takes the form of being bored to death.

A similarity can also be seen between Whiteread’s memorial project and the themes enumerated in Orwell’s novel. Nameless Library can be interpreted as a commentary on the books burned in the Holocaust. The memorial consists of thousands of cast concrete book elements that have their spines facing inward. Orwell’s novel also talks of the destruction of words. Winston Smith participates in a continuous re-editing of the historical record. With the development of languages such as doublethink and newspeak in this totalitarian regime, Chris Townsend notes that it "ultimately becomes impossible to have dissenting thoughts because the words do not exist to articulate them."

Consequently, these acts of censorship disable the subjective capacity of the individual for freedom of thought.

Eviscerating the Boiler Room
The original Room 101 was located at the end of a corridor. The room had ceased to be an office after the building was bomb damaged during WWII. Orwell’s office was subsequently converted into a boiler-room. When Whiteread first encountered the space it was a repository for building services and was full of heating and plumbing ducts.

The artist has expressed a fascination with building services and the potential they have, when malfunctioning, to transmit allergens and diseases throughout the interior. She has spoken of offices in London that were decommissioned because they had sick


Townsend ‘Live as if Someone is Always Watching You’ p 201.
building syndrome. She comments: "It’s as if we’re building these mausoleums for ourselves. We don’t know how to deal with these buildings that are almost living and breathing, they have their own viruses: Legionnaire’s disease is transmitted through air conditioning systems."16

The boiler room is the location within the interior where trouble often starts brewing. Blockbuster disaster movies such as The Towering Inferno (1974) show how a wrongly installed piece of wiring in the boiler room can have catastrophic consequences.17 David Bass has identified the malevolent aspects of services. He writes: "Though they rarely exercise such rights, the ineluctable presence of an 'underside' to building services is part of their capacity to instil fear."18 This fear is a fear of the unseen, of the latent life that lurks within the ducts and pipes. This 'life,' Bass notes, 'normally restrained but occasionally bursting forth insolently and extravagantly, is at the root of the feelings of disquiet, fear and fascination which are provoked by building services.'19

As the fictitious Room 101 was frightening as a repository of terrifying contents, so too is the contemporary Room 101 that Whiteread discovers. The boiler room is a space full of architectural undersides that also contain latent life. The qualities that characterised the fictitious Room 101 are, therefore, mirrored in its contemporary use.

Prior to making her cast of Room 101, Whiteread ripped out all of the pipes and ducting. She described what was left as being, "A blown-up, pock-marked room. It was at the beginning of the Iraq war, so it felt like a response to that – it actually felt like a room that had been bombarded with shrapnel."20 The procedures involved in preparing the room for casting and the casting itself are characterised by violence. Beatriz Colomina has noted that the maker of the cast can be seen as a torturer, interrogating space and "violently pulling evidence out of it, torturing it, forcing a confession."21

The locations of the building services leave their indelible impressions on the plaster cast as scars. They are indexed by patches of rough plastering where the holes left by the ductwork were filled in. By removing this ductwork, Whiteread effectively cuts off the blood supply to the room and, by extension, to the rest of the building. Her plaster cast exsanguinates the interior, draining it of its original substance and colour.

Whiteread cast all six sides of the room using a plasticised plaster. Hermetically sealed, the sculpture exacerbated the oppressive qualities described in the literary account of the windowless torture room. By casting space and giving air a material register she rendered the suffocating, subterranean space of Room 101 palpable.

Room 101 in the Italian Cast Court
Room 101 had its inaugural showing at the Victoria and Albert Museum’s Italian Cast Court. The Cast Courts were designed by the architect General Scott, with the assistance of J.W Wild. They were opened in 1873 to accommodate the museum’s burgeoning collection of plaster casts. The collection was assembled for the use of design students at the South Kensington Art academies at a time when design teaching involved studying the techniques of copying and reproduction.22 The courts provide a record of casts taken from statues, tombs, doors, pulpits, reliefs, architectural ornament, and fountains, ranging in date from ancient Rome to the seventeenth century.23 The vast proportions of the courts allow for the display of large monuments such as Trajan’s column (AD. 113) and the Pórtico de la Gloria (1188) of the Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela.24 An open arcade links the Architectural Cast Court with the Italian Cast Court and, from two galleries above, viewers can look down into these cavernous spaces.

Initially, Whiteread wanted her work to be shown in the Architectural Court. Unable to grant this request, the museum placed Room 101 in the Italian Court instead. The Italian Court is predominantly populated with figurative casts.25 Some highlights include

16 Blazwick ‘Rachel Whiteread in conversation with Iwona Blazwick’ p 12.
17 Bass ‘Towering Inferno’ p 27.
18 Bass ‘Towering Inferno’ p 27.
20 Cole ‘Mapping Traces’ p 41.
21 Colomina I Dreamt I Was A Wall’ p 73.
22 Williamson European Sculpture at the Victoria and Albert Museum p 184.
23 Williamson European Sculpture at the Victoria and Albert Museum p 185.
24 Each court is 135 feet long by 60 feet wide, with a height to the centre of the curved glass roof of 83 feet. Physick The Victoria and Albert Museum p 157.
pulpits by Nicola and Giovanni Pisano, Ghiberti’s Gates of Paradise, Donatello’s St George, and Michelangelo’s David, Moses, and Dying Slave.  

**Foreign Bodies**

Within the context of the Italian Cast Court, Whiteread’s Room 101 was akin to a foreign body, defined as, “an object or piece of extraneous matter that has entered the body by accident or design.” Room 101 was placed within the body of the cast court by careful design. Its construction techniques and materials share similarities with the casts that populate the courts. Whiteread’s choice of subject and her casting method also render it an ‘irritant’ or an unwelcome guest within this context. The artist carefully rearranged the sculptures in the court in order to accommodate her work, choreographing an adversarial encounter between the Italian Renaissance figures and her architectural interloper.

There are both similarities and differences between Whiteread’s cast and the plaster reproductions that surround it. In terms of the similarities, the cast copies that surround the work are also impressions taken, literally, from ‘foreign bodies’ that have been freighted to Britain. Like these casts, Whiteread’s room has also been taken out of its original context. Like these casts in plaster that were taken from originals wrought in materials such as marble and bronze, Whiteread’s Room 101 is deprived of the mass of the original, its dead load. Finally, like its neighbours, the artist’s sculpture demonstrates virtuosity in sectioning and reconstructing the cast.

There are also a number of differences between Whiteread’s cast and the copies in the Italian Court. Firstly, the signature casting process that she employs thwarts the reproductive imperative used in casting copies of antique statuary. Her subject is not cast in order to procure a positive form, but is forestalled in an intermediate phase of the casting process. The artist renders palpable an absence of interior space, whilst simultaneously bearing witness to the impressions taken from the interior surfaces of that very space. Secondly, Whiteread’s subject for casting is also atypical in this context. Hers is the only physical record of an interior that has, through Orwell’s celebrity, gained mythical proportions. Her cast cuts the room down to its true size. With its collection of figurative statuary, the cast court supplies the room with a relation to human scale, however this relation to human scale is unstable, as witnessed by the gargantuan proportions of Michelangelo’s David towering over Whiteread’s sculpture.

Thirdly, whilst the plaster reproductions in the courts are copies of revered originals, most of which are still in existence, Whiteread’s subject was condemned to destruction. Her cast has been taken for posterity. It operates as the death mask of a room that no longer exists. Within this context, the newborn Whiteread sculpture, with its sparkling white pallor, gives itself away as the latest addition to the court. Within the Italian Cast Court, Room 101 is a

---

28 Whiteread rearranged the following works in the Italian cast court: (Numbers are inventory numbers) 1899-55 Plaster cast of David, original in marble by Michelangelo in the Academy, Florence; 1872-62 Plaster cast of Bruges Madonna by Michelangelo, original in Notre Dame, Bruges; 1888-519 Plaster cast of Putto with a fish, original in bronze by Verrochio from Palazzo Vecchio, 15th century; 1884-298 Plaster cast of Crouching boy, original by Michelangelo in the Hermitage, Leningrad; 1889-91 Young Woman, original in limestone in Bode Museum, Berlin; 1867-181 Young Man, original in terracotta attributed to Antonio Pollaiolo in the Bargello, Florence; 1872-430 Electrotyp candelabrum in Chester Cathedral, original in bronze; 1863-2 Electrotypc candelabrum by Alessandro Leopardi, original in Bronze in the Piazza San Marco, Venice; 1885-198 Plaster cast of bust of Colleoni from the Colleoni monument, original in bronze by Verrochio; 1890-5 Francesco di Tommaso Sassetti, original in marble in the Bargello, Florence; 1864-15 Filippo Strazzi, original in terracotta by Benedetto de Maiano in Staatliche Museum, Berlin; 1899-57 Piero di Cosimo, original in marble by Mino da Fiesole in the Bargello, Florence; 1882-238 Plaster cast of Perseus with the head of Medusa, original by Cellini in the Bargello, Florence. Details of works courtesy the Victoria and Albert Museum.

29 A copy of Michelangelo’s David (at 14 feet high) mounted on a plinth, looms larger than life-size over the elevation of Untitled (Room 101) that faces the rear wall of the Italian Cast Court.
foreigner in terms of its subject, scale, and the method by which it serves to represent the room from which it was cast. By relentlessly casting negative space the artist demonstrates her ongoing fascination with solidifying the ground surrounding the figure rather than the figure itself.

Staging an Encounter

Like the heavily defended exterior of the Ministry of Love, Whiteread’s sculpture was similarly surrounded on all four sides. As guards staked out the perimeter of the Ministry, so too do the assemblage of plaster casts surrounding Whiteread’s representation of Room 101. They treat the impostor with suspicion, keeping their distance. However, Whiteread’s Room 101 is doubly immunised against occupation. Its interior can no longer be occupied by conventional means. The room’s interior surfaces are expressed as exterior elevations, while its ‘inner-most interior’ has been sealed up on all six sides.

Room 101 was sited toward the rear wall of the Cast Court. Two elevations are given pre-eminence in the space. The first is the elevation seen when looking toward the rear wall of the court. This wall of the sculpture bears the impression of the only door into the room. Viewers can contemplate this elevation from a strategically placed bench seat. Whiteread has re-arranged Verrochio’s bust of Ascanio Sforza that so he casts a sideways glance at Room 101 from this vantage point. He appears to be scrutinising the bulwark to try and identify any possible points of weakness to the structure, any openings he might be able to penetrate.

Behind the bench seat Whiteread has also re-arranged a pair of plaster busts so that they are confronting the sculpture. Another pair of figures turn their heads away from Room 101 and exchange menacing looks at one another.

The second elevation that is given prominence is articulated by the barred-over windows cast from the original room. The windows have been disavowed of their ability to let light into the interior. In the cast, they are like permanently closed window dressings, furnishing the outer limits of a room whose inner core is blanketed in darkness.

Whiteread’s care and attention toward rearranging the existing sculptures in the space of the court was critical to the resonance of Room 101 in relation to its environment. The artist constructed her own battle lines, her own installation strategy for her sculptural interloper. The Béton brut aspect of Whiteread’s cast in this context is disturbing. Its rough, pockmarked surfaces are a jarring contrast to the ornamental reliefs and highly modelled surfaces of the architectural details that surround it. Whiteread’s secular artefact is surrounded by a host of sacred subjects: these include multiple reliefs of the Madonna and child, as well as altarpieces and pulpits, which festoon the walls surrounding Room 101.

Richard Cork has observed that the effect of Room 101 is so unsettling that, “even Michelangelo’s robust, sinewy figures appear to recoil from it. The Rebellious Slave and the Dying Slave seem to twist and writhe as they try to avoid the alien intruder.” Through her installation practice, Whiteread re-organises the sculptures in the cast court so that they appear to react to the arrival of this foreign body in their space. The existing casts are enlivened by Room 101’s presence, which brings the present into contact with the past. In her careful construction and placement of Room 101, Whiteread succeeds in creating the tension between a work of art and its location in space. Even Whiteread herself recognised that within this particular context, her work, “looks like the Tardis has landed.”

On the Defensive: The Chaps and Whiteread’s Room 101

It was not only the statuary that appeared to take objection to Room 101 in the Italian Cast Court. Whiteread has mentioned that this cast was more robust than her earlier room.
castings. This robustness was tested by the weight of several protesters who took umbrage at its presence in the court.

The protesters were all members of The Chap, a collective who publicize their ideas through their website, magazine, and protest actions. Followers of The Chap lament the decline of modern manners and sartorial standards in contemporary Britain. They propose a "revolution of panache," to oust this culture of vulgarity. The Chaps advocate a return to the civility and genteel drinking habits of yesteryear. They promote the abandonment of nylon tracksuits and other heinous forms of leisurewear for well-tailored suits designed to conceal a multitude of sins born from overindulgence.

The Chaps also take offence at how some contemporary artworks occupy public spaces. Whiteread's sculptures have twice been the focus of their protests. On 25th May 2004, twenty-seven followers of The Chap handcuffed themselves around Untitled (Room 101), protesting "against the pointless intrusion by contemporary art pieces into public areas." Members of the group declared that, "by giving a single artist the exclusive privilege of reflecting on the contents of the Cast Courts, the V & A has denied the same pleasure to the general public." The demonstrators surrounded the sculpture and recited lines from John Keats' Ode on a Grecian Urn. When their antics solicited no reaction from the museum's security guards they decided to climb onto the work, continuing their protest "from its surprisingly wobbly surface." This group of dandies were finally coerced down from the sculpture with the help of a negotiator from the museum.

The Chaps took offence at Room 101, arguing that Whiteread’s work failed to take account of its surroundings. They took illegal occupation of the sculpture, attempting to conquer the enemy by climbing atop its wobbly upper surface en masse. It was as though the statue of the martial hero Colleoni had goaded them on and encouraged their dissidence. To counter The Chaps, one could argue that the very resonance of the piece in this context was due to the fact that it created an incursion within the cast courts. Far from blending into its surroundings, the work was intended to generate a sense of dissonance and unease.

Like several of the sculptures that turned their backs to the work, some visitors to the courts followed suit, preferring to sketch the installation Embankment in the Turbine Hall of the Tate Modern on 27th April 2006.

36 Cork 'Inside-out Nightmare' p 16.
37 'The Chap' publishes a quarterly magazine and also operates a website. In their manifesto published online they write that:

"The Chap proposes to take a stand against this culture of vulgarity. By turning ancient rituals of courtesy and dress into revolutionary acts, the immaculately attired Anarcho-Dandyist can use the razor-sharp crease in his trousers to press home his advantage. Once presented with the dazzling sight of rakishly angled trilbies, gleaming brogues and exquisitely mixed dry martinis, hoi polloi's long-cherished nylon sportswear and strawberry milkshakes will suddenly lose their appeal. It is time for Chaps and Chapettes from every walk of life to stand up and be counted. Naturally unsuited to all forms of exertion, we propose a Charmed Uprising based on excessive languor and delivering pleasantry such as "How do you do?" and "A very good day to you, madam!" with revolutionary zeal. Our methods will be stealth, civility and charm, our targets the behemoths of corporate blandification." Excerpt from The Chap Manifesto' unpaginated
38 The Chaps protested against the placement of Whiteread's Untitled (Room 101) in the Cast Courts in 2003 and also attempted to scale the summit of her sculpture.
antiquities rather than Whiteread’s impostor. Room 101 was a rude interruption in this context. By placing her version of Room 101 in the Italian Court, Whiteread forced an encounter between the reproductions that provide a potted history of European sculpture and her own contemporary sculptural practice. This court, showcasing the Victorian’s predilection for copies was now home to a work that explored the artist’s ongoing fascination with morbidity and terror, manifested in the cast of an interior space of infamous origin. The work’s placement in this context contributed to a sense of unease, like that at work in its fictional namesake as well as the room as Whiteread encountered it: as a repository for architectural undersides.

Conclusion

Whiteread’s act of casting does something extraordinary to the original room, giving the latent fears held captive in the fictional construct of Room 101 a public airing. Within Orwell’s dystopian environment, divisions between public and private spheres no longer exist. Within this totalitarian state, interrogators quarried the dreams of individuals to identify their greatest fears. Townsend notes that in Room 101, “the most private space imaginable to the individual — private because it is not really a space, because it is not tangible — has been the subject of another’s scrutiny.” Whiteread recasts Orwell’s former office by turning it inside out and assigning it a tangible form and substance. This act of inversion places the room’s capacity to contain terrifying contents into question.

Whiteread’s signature casting practice offers viewers a unique way of experiencing Room 101. She allows viewers to inspect the surface impressions of the interior of the room whilst simultaneously being outside it. This gesture could be construed as ameliorating the psychological threat its fictional namesake evokes. However, the turning inside-out of Room 101 foregrounds other sinister aspects of this interior. For example, the surface impressions of the interior (now exterior) of the sculpture bear witness to damage. The walls of the sculpture are populated by repairs, holes roughly plugged up, structure partly ripped away. If one considers the acts of torture that take place in Orwell’s fictional construct, these marks and scratches can be interpreted as evidence left on the interior surfaces of the room by victims trying to fight off their assailants. It brings to mind the marks left in the shower rooms of the Nazi’s concentration camps. In Alain Resnais’ film Nuit et Brouillard the narrator states: “The only traces now, if you know what they are, are on the ceiling. Scrabbling nails scoring even concrete.”

Townsend notes that Orwell’s Room 101 is a “cipher for the capacity of torturers to commit upon you the worst atrocity you can imagine.” He assigns the room a capacity, a volume which, in the case of Whiteread’s cast, cannot be entered into. Townsend also notes that the torture chamber as it was described by Orwell “still has a very real existence throughout the world.” But there is a counter position to Townsend’s proposal and this is that the threat of terror in contemporary times is not so easily contained.

Room 101 in Broadcasting House and Orwell’s literary construction of this space are both repositories for fearful things: building services and the subject’s greatest fears. It is not the specifics of the room itself that are frightening, but rather the terrifying contents or events that are staged within its walls. By turning the room inside out, Whiteread places in question the room’s ability to contain these terrifying contents.

What is most frightening about Whiteread’s re-conceptualisation of Room 101 is the suggestion that the threat of terror cannot be contained. Her casting process draws Orwell’s torture chamber into the twenty-first century, into a climate where there has been an escalation in the scale of terrorist activity, and where acts of terror respect no societal, political, or geographic divides. Acts of terrorism are almost impossible to contain. Reliant upon the element of surprise, they involve the random killing of civilians by suicide bombers, the destruction of buildings by re-directed aircraft, or the dissemination of chemical weapons in the form of lethal airborne viruses carried through postal systems. In the current political climate, territorial and aerospace borders are vigilantly policed in attempts to avoid all incursions by ‘foreign bodies’. As recent
events such as the London bombings (2005) attest to, this threat does not always come from outside but from within. The Court in the Victoria and Albert Museum is a repository for casts of Italian sculpture that was at its most popular during the mid-nineteenth century, when opportunities for travel abroad were limited. A contemporary British sculptor revisits this space during a time when there are abundant opportunities to travel, but also a political climate where there is trepidation and wariness about setting foot on foreign soils. Whiteread’s Room 101 reconfigures the past into the present, inviting viewers of the work to re-appraise the threats of terror facing the contemporary subject.

References:
The Chap Manifesto' The Chap www.thechap.net/content/section_manifesto/index.html c.f. www.thechapmagazine.com/manifesto2.html (downloaded 5/1/05) www.thechap.net /protests.html (downloaded 5/1/05)
Resnais, Alain (dir.) (1958) Nuit et Brouillard, Trans. commentary by Jean Cayrol (Script based on Olga Wormser and Andre Michel’s “La Tragedie des Deportations.”)
Un-owned Territories

Joanne Cys
Louis Laybourne Smith School of Architecture and Design, University of South Australia, AU

Multi-disciplinary collaborative practice is well established as a contributor to design creativity. There is also a strengthening body of literature that identifies interior design as an expansive and relatively unrestricted discipline well suited to embrace multi-disciplinary and transdisciplinary practices, yet the structures and processes of mainstream commercial practice provide limited opportunities for interior designers to extend existing or enter new discipline areas and take the creative risks required to inhabit these territories. When less restricted by the professional structures and commissioning processes that dictate this conventional approach, multi-disciplinary and transdisciplinary collaborative practices have the potential to generate new and experimental design outcomes within the realm of the built environment.

The creative potential of multi-disciplinary design collaboration in 'un-owned' areas of practice is heightened when it occurs in projects that occupy the spaces between traditional discipline boundaries that are somewhere between architecture, landscape, product, interior, furniture and graphic design.

Through analysis of some recent built environment events and projects in South Australia and Queensland, the paper explores what can happen when designers contest and redefine the boundaries of their own practice by conceptually designing within a multi-disciplinary, if not transdisciplinary, context. A context in which both risk and opportunity for movement into new territories is intensified.

Fertile ground
This paper is based upon an unconventional but strengthening premise that interior design practice is not restricted to the design of space that is rendered ‘interior’ because it is enclosed by architecture. The practices and projects discussed in this paper acknowledge interior design as an expansive discipline\(^1\) that addresses interiority as something beyond that which is simply enclosed by architecture (for example, as event, installation or object). These are practices that transcend territories traditionally demarcated by either perceived or regulated

---

\(^1\) In this paper, the term ‘discipline’ is used to mean the field of interior design, both as a practice and an area of research
professional ownership. Yet the paper also recognises the difficulty in reconciling this position with the significant component of ‘mainstream’ interior practice in Australia that, at the current time, occurs largely within a paradigm of architectural practice and theory; project and process.

The concept of ‘un-disciplined’ design practice, particularly multi-disciplinary collaboration and transdisciplinarity between differing design disciplines at the conceptual stage of projects, and their value as fertile areas of creativity has been discussed by Carter⁵ and Linder.⁶ Further, the premise has received consideration in relation to interior design by authors including Klingenberg,⁴ Attiwill⁵ and Franz & Lehmann.⁶ Both as a profession and a discipline of study, interior design is closely positioned with a number of kindred fields including, amongst others, architecture, industrial design, furniture design and graphic design. As a profession it is relatively unregulated⁷ and does not bear the legacy of a long history of protective and privileged institutional control (as does architecture.) As a discipline, its body of knowledge is in its infancy and predominantly characterised by contributions from researchers in other fields.³ Interior design is open, unbounded and overlapping: a fertile ground for risky, undisciplined and unprecedented practices.

Through his description of a series of multi-disciplinary projects on which he collaborated, writer and artist Paul Carter identifies the creative opportunity afforded by exposure to the design processes of other disciplines as liberation from conventional practice “…the precondition of collaboration is a mutual inclination — a willingness to abandon the statuesque poses associated with orthotic thinking and to be light-footed.”⁹ The outcomes of this type of un-bounded practice are revealed as fundamental in the context of Carter’s collaboration with a curator, composer, installation artist, filmmaker and audio-visual designer to design the permanent exhibitions for the Museum of Sydney. Beginning his recount with “Early in 1993 I was given the opportunity to collaborate in the making of a real museum” Carter explains that the work he and his collaborators undertook to make the museum began just as:

the... architects... were putting the finishing touches to a spare, elegantly façaded three-storey sandstone-and-glass building... unlike most new institutions of its kind, it did not inherit the kind of historical collection that, in the case of most new museums, provides the material and raison d’etre of the permanent exhibition. In this sense, it was a monument to emptiness.¹⁰

Carter’s perception is that the ‘real museum’ was made quite independently of the architectural envelope which in a conventional sense would be its principal identity. This interpretation reveals the significance of what can occur within architecture when the architecture itself is not regarded as a paramount contributor to what happens within it. Carter’s account may also be interpreted to suggest exhibition design as an un-owned realm of practice, a realm that has few (if any) territorial boundaries of either necessity or opportunity; of discipline or profession.

Mark Linder’s discussion of the design discipline, in particular architecture, is quite literally focussed at the edge of discipline boundaries. Linder’s position is one that acknowledges not only the creative freedoms afforded by interdisciplinary practice, but argues the importance of also maintaining unique discipline characteristics. Linder proposes “transdisciplinarity... [as] distinct from more pervasive notions of interdisciplinarity that understand the combination of various disciplines as a means to establish shared methods or concepts. Yet it also insists on the value of distinctly disciplinary identities.”¹¹ This view of transdisciplinarity is charged with meaning in relation to interior design — a discipline that is accompanied by the ever-present discourse that strives to define its own identity.¹²  

---

² Carter Material Thinking.
¹ Carter Material Thinking p 72.
⁴ Klingenberg ‘Interspace’ pp 57-63.
⁵ Attiwill ‘Towards an interior history’ pp 1-8.
⁷ Except for In the United States and Canada, where 40 states and provinces have some form of regulation, most commonly in the form of title acts which restrict the use of title ‘interior designer’ to those who have fulfilled the requirements to be registered to use the title and licensed to practice.
⁹ Carter Material Thinking p 179.
Linder acknowledges Homi Bhabha’s position that transdisciplinarity involves “the formulation of knowledges that require our disciplinary scholarship and technique but demand that we abandon disciplinary mastery and surveillance.”\(^{13}\) Again, it would appear that interior design is well positioned to embrace transdisciplinary practices. Ambiguous territorial mastery and relative freedom from professional surveillance results in a predisposition for interior design to be light-footed and inhabit new practices. Linder proposes that:

Transdisciplinary work navigates a contested field of discourses that have been claimed, structured, and adapted to specific disciplines. Those discourses are constantly reconfigured as they are shared by or shift between various disciplines... The object of transdisciplinary work is not to enforce or clarify differences, identities or limits, but to demonstrate the flexibility of disciplinary identities and to explain how negotiations between disciplines produce re-configured modes of practice.\(^{14}\)

It is possible that these modes of practice can be even further transformed when transdisciplinary work occurs on a project that in turn does not belong to a particularly disciplinary typology. It could be argued that (in Australia at least) exhibition design (such as that described by Carter) is one such area, as is installation work and hybrid projects for example interpretations, street furniture and shelters.

Linder further cites Bhabha’s proposition that transdisciplinary work “happens at the edge of one’s own discipline” and that it is not an attempt to strengthen one foundation but to draw on another; it is a reaction to the fact that we are living at the real border of our own disciplines, where some of the fundamental ideas of our discipline are being profoundly shaken.\(^{15}\)

Movement and hybridity

What are the fundamental ideas of the interior design discipline that are being profoundly shaken? From a body of knowledge point of view it could be the shift away from the behavioural sciences as a quantitative justification for the design of human environments and embracing cultural theories and philosophies as foundations for the making of environments. From a professional point of view, it could be the overwhelming realisation that the traditional model of institutional control by professional organisations has limited application for creative practices. For both profession and discipline, it could be the move beyond the idea of interior design being so defined because it is enclosed by architecture.

Some recent considerations of the contemporary identity of interior design as a practice and a field of study reveal shift towards an expansive, unbounded attitude towards the discipline. In her argument for a more relevant acknowledgement of interior design history and theory, Suzie Attiwill proposes the term ‘inter-story’ as a response to “current forces emerging in the design of interiors – for example, temporality, movement, change, encounters.”\(^{16}\) Attiwill goes on to ascertain that:

the design of interiors is not to be limited to inside built form... The question of interior and exterior are still pertinent and potent but they are dynamic, changing relations rather than one of permanence defined by built form. Interior design then becomes an activity of organising material spatially and temporally.\(^{17}\)

At the 2006 International Federation of Interior Architects/Interior Designers (IFI) Roundtable Conference, ‘Interior Design: the State of the Art’, Ellen Klingenberg and Joo Yun Kim both advocated the term ‘interspace’ as more accurate descriptor for the interior design discipline. Klingenberg’s argument is based on her identification of the need “to find a solid platform for Interior Architecture when the various design studies including Interior Architecture move towards a more trans-disciplinary study, not towards stronger specialisation.”\(^{18}\) As espoused in her positioning paper for the Roundtable, Klingenberg’s ‘solid platform’ does not represent a retreat into specific enclosed discipline territory, but rather something that moves beyond, embracing “abstract space – the storytelling, or the action space, the indefinable aspects that deal with the user’s perceptions of the environment.”\(^{19}\) Kim’s use of ‘inter_space’ is based upon a diagrammatic representation of the increasing hybridity within design fields and the many “interfaces of inter_space” in which he includes virtual space design, land art, installation art, event design, museography, exhibition design,

\(^{13}\) Linder ‘Transdisciplinarity’ p 13.
\(^{15}\) Bhabha cited, Linder ‘Transdisciplinarity’ p 13.
\(^{16}\) Attiwill ‘Towards an interior history’ p 1.
\(^{17}\) Attiwill ‘Towards an interior history’ p 3.
\(^{18}\) Klingenberg [Untitled paper] p 20
\(^{19}\) Klingenberg ‘Interspace’ p 58.
design management, facility management, lighting design, furniture design, architectural design, stage and set design and virtual space design.\(^{20}\)

From an educational perspective, Jill Franz and Steffen Lehmann have further extended the understanding of multi-disciplinary and collaborative pedagogy in their reporting of a studio project based upon the principle of transdisciplinarity. The project involved architecture and interior design students working in studio to design a beach house. During the project, the authors observed that the interior design students "appreciated the chance to go outside the interior."\(^{21}\) In reflection, Franz & Lehmann concluded that the project contributed to the students’ understanding of multi-disciplinarity and a shift towards transdisciplinary understandings. What is of particular interest in the context of this discussion of interior design is that the authors observed that although interior design has been traditionally viewed as a "more specialist discipline operating within the confines of a structure’s boundary", it was the interior design students who were more adept at embracing these trans- and multi-disciplinary paradigms, leading the authors to conclude that this may be a result of the:

perception of the outcome of mainstream architecture in objective terms (the building) contrasting with the understanding in interior design of the outcome as experience that is the result of a dialectic process involving people and the environment... This observation lends support for the idea of transdisciplinarity as being tied to the issue and its context and subsequently of the redundancy of the design disciplines as they are currently defined.\(^{22}\)

**Engineered conditions**

Given the risk-adverse constraints that bound mainstream commercial design practice in Australia, there are few opportunities for these theoretical propositions of interdisciplinary and transdisciplinary collaboration to be manifest in practice. Typically, the most creative and experimental design work occurs when opportunities and conditions for such practice are deliberately engineered and organised by professional organisations, educational institutions or event-specific committees and funded through public and private sponsorship. Such events are usually characterised by a highly public, exhibitory nature and aim to increase the awareness and acceptance of creative practices in the general community. Two significant examples in Australia in recent years have been the 'match' creative disciplines collaboration tournament in Adelaide, South Australia and 'art + arch infinite' in Brisbane, Queensland. Both events occurred in 2004 and although independent of each other, were based on an acknowledgement of the fertile, creative outcomes of multi-disciplinary collaborative practice and the desire to make these outcomes public in an effort to not just promote the expertise of the participating art and design collaborators, but to attempt to increase the acceptance, and ultimately the commissioning of creative, experimental work in the public (and possibly the private) realm.

The 'match' tournament\(^{23}\) was the inaugural event of the South Australian Collaborations Steering Committee\(^{24}\) and was funded by the organisations that comprise the Committee itself along with a number of private businesses, most of whom were companies that supply materials or services to the design industry. Entry to the tournament was open to members and associates of each of the organisations represented by the Collaborations Steering Committee. The registration process required participants to nominate their own discipline area as well as up to three other disciplines with which they would like collaborate. 104 practitioners initially registered to participate in 'match', representing a range of design and visual arts disciplines.\(^{25}\) Participants were placed by the organisers into multi-disciplinary teams of

---

20 Kim ‘Interior architecture’ p 32.
21 Franz ‘Side-by-side’ p 27.
four, based upon their discipline preferences. All teams represented a range of disciplines and no team had more that one member from a discipline. Between April and November 2004 the teams completed in four ‘Design Challenges’ that required highly conceptual responses to Adelaide-focussed, deliberately open design briefs that ranged in scale and included the design of an experimental object; a street lighting system; a shelter for a person without a home; and a section of Adelaide’s urban riverfront precinct.

Teams were given 6-8 weeks to develop their design solution for each challenge. At the conclusion of each challenge, the team proposals were judged by a panel of renowned designers and government stakeholders and were publicly exhibited. In her essay for the publication that documented the process and outcomes of the ‘match’ tournament, Jane Andrew concluded that:

“It is evident the ‘match’ tournament has stimulated creative knowledge, sharing and learning in a playful but highly competitive forum... Let’s hope that the ‘match’ tournament grows to become a permanent fixture in the South Australian creative industries calendar, and in doing so imparts a culture of creative collaboration cross the whole economy.”

‘art + arch infinite’ was curated by architecture academic Steffen Lehmann and sponsored by tertiary education providers, the Royal Australian Institute of Architects and local and state government bodies. The event had a narrower disciplinary focus than the ‘match’ tournament, involving architecture (including landscape architecture) and visual art practitioners who collaborated in multi-disciplinary teams to propose site-specific installations for the Brisbane area. Like ‘match’ the brief for ‘art + arch infinite’ was deliberately open with four themes identified to guide the teams that ranged from the theoretical and interpretive to the practical and responsive: people and public space; crossovers and interdisciplinary collaboration; mobility and the river; and the sub-tropical climate. Over forty proposals were submitted and reviewed by a selection panel comprised of distinguished art and design practitioners and academics and key government office holders. Fourteen submissions were selected to be fabricated and exhibited (installed) with the selected teams receiving financial assistance to realise their proposals. Lehmann’s description of the event reveals that there was a conscious intent to stimulate risk-taking.

The concept of the project was to realise 14 site-specific installations at different locations in the city — outside, not in a gallery context... The works were temporary installations, and such an ephemeral character generally allows one to take higher risks, since the installations were not lasting permanently in the public space.

Yet Lehmann goes on to discuss the meaning and value of such experimental, multi-disciplinary collaborative practice that is specific to architects, concluding that such experimental and risky practices do not always sit easily within the architecture profession.

Discussions between architects and artists involved in innovative collaborations require changing roles... In this context it often seems that the question of assumed disciplinarial rights (namely that of form-giver and space-maker) bothers architect more than it bothers artists... For a long time architects have recognised and have attempted to respond in situations in practice where the collaboration with consultants from various disciplines on one project has become a common standard. Unfortunately this has too often been rather piecemeal and not explicitly informed by theory, substance or procedure, and with the architect being unable to experiment with the same freedom as the artist.

Apart from the suggestion that architectural practice is restricted by the ‘orthotics’ of its own professional protection and the conventional processes of commercial practice, a wider consideration in relation to architecture’s closely kindred profession of interior design (that has, at times been referred to as a ‘hand maiden’ to architecture) reveals some problems of association. For a profession whose mainstream practice is so closely associated with that of architecture, it could be claimed that interior design, when defined conventionally as the design of space inside of architecture, has and does struggle to assert its own disciplinarial rights — if in fact it has any. No wonder inter-disciplinarity and transdisciplinarity are increasing embraced by...
interior design practitioners and academics alike.

Consideration of the 'match' and 'art + arch infinite' events in relation to conventional commercial design practice, is problematic and generates the question of whether creative risk is possible to inhabit in the context of day-to-day design practice. Despite Andrew’s desire for 'match' to be real, it was not. Although many of the outcomes of 'match' were appropriate and directly applicable to the Adelaide built environment, 'match' was a competition of conceptual proposals that were never commissioned or realised. The successful proposals from 'art + arch infinite' although realised, were temporary and better characterised as ephemeral and exhibitory rather than inhabitable (although this was indeed a deliberate intent). Both events were artificially engineered, philanthropically funded and short-lived. Although inspirational for both public and profession and extremely valuable as creative development exercises, their possible application or influence on commercial practice is unclear.

Competitive commissioning

This is not to say that there is no evidence of experimental or risky built environment design practice at all within the commercial realm, but it can be argued that this mostly occurs in projects that are, by their very nature, located in un-owned disciplinary territories. The most acknowledged un-owned area of practice, as discussed previously, is exhibition design, but other project types include interpretive installations, shelters and rest-points. Recent and varied examples of such projects in Australia include 'Solivoid' by the Monash University Faculty of Art & Design Spatial Research Group (2005), the 'No.1 Pump Station at Mundawarring Weir, WA' (2005) and 'Kapunda Visitor Information Centre SA' (2006), interpretive projects by Mulloway Studio, Exhibition Services and Paul Kloeden, and the 'Christies Beach Shade Structures' (2005) by Craige Andrae, Gregg Mitchell, Stuart Hesseltine and Anton Hart. All projects were authored by multi-disciplinary teams where the conceptual idea was borne from a collaborative, transdisciplinary process. All the projects occupy 'un-owned' areas of practice in spaces between (or beyond) traditional discipline boundaries (somewhere between landscape, sculpture, furniture, graphic, interior and architecture).

The projects referred to above are evidence of attempts to move beyond the boundaries of 'form-giving' and 'space-making', a movement that is at once made possible and enriched by deliberate transgressions and extensions of discipline territory. But again, these examples are not part of mainstream practice. They are relatively small, site-specific (if not temporary – as was the case with 'Solivoid') or purposely offered to selected designers because of their perceived potential to create something edgy or experimental and because of the client’s expressed desire for something 'creative' in the absence of precedents or because of their own unfamiliarity with the project type. After all, it is difficult to ask a designer to demonstrate a track-record of similar projects if there aren’t any similar projects.

Cathy Smith identifies that:

Many architectural theorists have become dissatisfied with the emphasis on fixed physical form in architectural practice: looking at the ephemeral, interactive aspects of art and experimental building...

In conventional design practice, architects design buildings that are then constructed by builders and, subsequently inhabited by clients: there is little scope for deviation from plans once construction begins.

But what of the entire process of competitive commissioning of designers for private and public projects that occurs even before the design work is undertaken? In South Australia, most public art and public architecture is typically commissioned through a ‘competitive’ submission process characterised by a call for registrations of interest and/or an invitation to submit a competitive submission that responds to ‘specific’ selection criteria and includes a fee proposal. To be able to compete for a project, designers and design practices must be pre-qualified or pre-registered with the commissioning body and projects are generally required to have a sole, principal consultant. Short-listing then occurs resulting in the awarding of the project. The most common factors used in the selection process to determine the successful submission are a demonstrated track-record of completed similar projects and the design fee. There are no standard criteria for ‘creativity’ or even ‘design’ (and in the context of what risk means in this paper) there are certainly no criteria for risk. In fact it could be argued that the more common the project type, the

32 Smith ‘The ‘spectacular everyday’ p 59.
more reliance there is on the selection criteria of proven track record as opposed to exploratory or experimental method.

**Without precedent**

‘Xpress’, the 2006 event of the South Australian Collaborations Steering Committee provides a model that has the most potential of all projects discussed in this paper to usefully inform mainstream commissioning processes. Following from the 2004 ‘match’ tournament, ‘Xpress’ was a Collaborations Steering Committee event developed in partnership with, and funded by, two government departments, Transport SA and Zero Waste SA. ‘Xpress’ called for multidisciplinary teams of artists and designers to propose concepts for a permanent interpretive installation to be sited at the constructed Wingfield Wetlands north of Adelaide. Located adjacent the main refuse dump that services the Adelaide area, and a major new resource recovery centre, the installation was intended to be a component of a future eco-education centre.

The critical defining characteristic of the ‘Xpress’ project was in the briefing process that occurred (following a visit to the site) at a workshop for participants facilitated by two renowned creative academics and practitioners, Linda Walker and Ross Gibson. Walker and Gibson’s workshop was as much a professional development seminar as it was a briefing session. The workshop focussed on creative thinking, idea generation and discussed with the participants various ways of approaching the project as opposed to focussing on client needs and requirements. Coming to the project (as did the members of the design teams) without precedent or expectation, the government ‘clients’ involvement in the briefing workshop was more as participant than patron. Some participants reported that compared to other conventional briefing sessions they had attended, there was a definite sense from the beginning that this project was primarily about the creative idea.34

Following the workshop, the teams had four weeks to submit their proposals which were assessed by a selection panel comprising of Ross Gibson, representatives from Zero Waste and Transport SA and key members of ArtsSA’s Art for Public Places Committee. There were three selection criteria, to which the collectively established brief was pivotal: artistic merit in response to the brief; the way in which the proposal met the brief; and the conceptual response to the site and the brief.35 Ultimately nine teams submitted proposals and the successful team were commissioned for design development and construction.36

Although the issues of professional design fees and project budgets have not been addressed in this analysis, ‘Xpress’ offers not only a model that could potentially inform some aspects of future processes for the commissioning of design work, but analysis of ‘Xpress’ illustrates an alternative approach to such commissions, for both client and designer. This is an alternative that places the creative idea as paramount right from the very initiation of the project.

**Un-owned territory**

Interior design in Australia is at a disciplinary checkpoint. Its developing discipline theory appears to be moving towards a comprehension of practice beyond conventional discipline, professional and physical boundaries, yet its mainstream practice is significantly contained within, and tethered to architecture with its restrictive practices and risk-adverse commissioning processes.

These processes elevate the value of track-record experience above creative concept and do not allow for shared multi-disciplinary authorship, acknowledging only the position of a lead consultant (normally the architect). So where and what is the ‘scope for deviation’, experiment, creativity and risk in the competitive submission process of commissioning mainstream commercial and public projects? Is it possible for commercial reality to match the strengthening direction of discipline theory? If collaborative practice is one of the potent generators of design creativity, then there is potential for commissioning bodies to adopt some aspects of un-conventional project processes with the aim of extending the outcomes of design practice.

As discipline boundaries stretch, overlap and even dissolve, the design professions that are

---

33 There were nine teams, comprised of a total of 22 participants that included five architects, one graphic designer, two landscape architects, two interior designers, seven visual artists, one metalwork/jewellery designer, one sculptor, one sound artist and two musicians.

34 Interview with ‘Xpress’ participants (2007) 3 April.

35 South Australian Collaborations Steering Committee ‘Xpress 06 Presentation Guidelines for Participants’

36 At the time of writing the project was still in development stage, with final completion not due until the second half of 2007.
'light-footed' and open to multi-disciplinary and transdisciplinary collaborative practices will evolve in accord with, and (particularly in the design fields where practice-led research is increasing regarded as a legitimate contribution to knowledge) possibly even ahead, of disciplinary theory. These professions will be able to inhabit the risks (and new territories) that transdisciplinary practices offer.

References


South Australian Collaborations Steering Committee. (2006) 'Xpress 06 Presentation Guidelines for Participants'
Unsanctioned Occupation
experiments in threshold
interiority

Dolly Daou & Gini Lee
University of South Australia, AU

This paper discusses an interior practice informed by travelling into, and experiencing first-hand, the appropriated spaces of protest sites derived from and around precarious ways of living. The first space is the ephemeral tent city of Sahat - Al - Bourj Square in Beirut and the second, the impermanently occupied Ottoman walls of Istanbul. Both sites reveal a temporary inhabitation with permanent ‘affect where “Affect is this passing of a threshold, seen from the point of view of the change in capacity.”’

This change in capacity requires that small experimental steps are undertaken to ‘affect’ bodily movement. Such movement is receptive to the experiences and dimensions of everyday living, informed by regard for ethical practice. Brian Massumi describes these ‘affective’ practices as encouraging a sense of being, felt intensely. These two sites of Beirut and Istanbul are places of intense temporal experience yet they are enduringly ‘affected’ by the traces of living that occur everyday in and around them; their exterior markings hint at interior occupations where adaptation, transformation and appropriation are tactics adopted to ‘affect’ evolving spatial forms. There are risks in such occupying tactics. They challenge normative interior practice through intense engagement with the consequences of investing design with the political and cultural narratives that shape spatial practices; and they demand a cross-disciplinary approach.

By moving outside the comfort of the interior zone, what do we risk?

* Massumi ‘Navigating Movements’ p 212.
Temporary inhabitation with permanent ‘affect’

This paper discusses an interior practice informed by travelling into, and experiencing first-hand, the appropriated spaces of protest sites derived through and around precarious ways of living. The following writing reveals the impressions of two researchers who have toured separately to Beirut and Istanbul, at different times and with different intent. The first space is the ephemeral tent city of Sahat - Al - Bourj Square in Beirut and the second, the impermanently occupied Ottoman Walls of Istanbul. Beirut is a place of protest and possibility, whereas Istanbul is a place of subtle insinuation of the everyday into a space conceived of as a boundary between the inside [the city] and the outside [the country]. Both sites reveal a temporary inhabitation with permanent ‘affect’ where “Affect is this passing of a threshold, seen from the point of view of the change in capacity.”

This change in capacity requires that small experimental steps are undertaken to ‘affect’ bodily movement. Such movement is receptive to the experiences and dimensions of everyday living, informed by regard for ethical practice. Brian Massumi describes these ‘affective’ practices as encouraging a sense of being, felt intensely. In exploring these places, we notice that The Bourj and the Ottoman Walls are enduringly ‘affected’ by the traces of living that occur everyday in and around them; their exterior markings hint at interior occupations where adaptation, transformation and appropriation are tactics adopted to ‘affect’ evolving spatial forms.

Motivated by Inhabiting Risk, this research experiments with coinciding readings of the ephemeral interior spaces of The Bourj and the Wall; readings that navigate domesticity, threshold conditions and temporality becoming permanency. We speculate on the possibilities of thinking and practicing in interiors concerned with the inhabitation of marginalised and political places where temporary and unsanctioned occupation is possible. As travellers in places both exotic and unfamiliar, our outsiders’ gaze seeks the everyday conditions and coincidental ‘affect’ on marginalised interiorities.

To develop a critical view of interior spaces and the political and cultural forces under which marginalised people mediate unconventional existences in difficult places, we examine the following two writings. Massumi’s conversation with Mary Zournazi on the nature of hope examines thresholds [of potential] that provide an opening for transformational, experimental and ethical practice in everyday conditions. We also draw on Christine McCarthy’s definitions of abstract concepts of interiority that both coincide with and contradict architectural concerns, thus reinforcing the ambiguous and mobile nature of threshold interior [and exterior] conditions.

The Bourj: Navigating events

Beirut’s central square Sahat-Al-Bourj, commonly known as The Bourj, has undergone many transformations over time, and the historical and cultural traces and narratives that can be experienced when visiting this place demonstrate its hybrid identity and spatial porosity. Below, we develop a series of spatial readings of the events that have found their expression in the Bourj Square through the following themes; navigating events, permanency and temporality and tents in the square/square in the tents. The particular pivotal navigational event was the assassination of Rafic-Al-Hariri the former Lebanese Prime Minister; an event that not only profoundly altered the Lebanese political psyche, but also resulted in a spatial transformation of the Bourj Square through unsanctioned occupation of Rafic-Al-Hariri’s grave and the emergence of an ephemeral tent city. The Bourj: Navigating Events is structured to establish the following conditions. Firstly, permanency of temporality discusses the temporary and the interior domestic nature of the tents which became permanent through their habitation of the square and the tents. And secondly, tents in the square/square in the tents discusses the interiority of the Square projected in the containment of the grave and the tent city, and in the merging of the public and private thresholds through conceptual and physical boundaries.

The unsanctioned existence of these tents in the Bourj make the threshold between interiority and exteriority indefinable; though the experiences of materiality, acoustics, and lighting define the interior spatial qualities of the tents in ways that seep into the exterior to invite onlookers and passers by in.

---

1 Massumi ‘Navigating Movements’ p 212.

2 McCarthy ‘Towards a Definition of Interiority’ p 112-125.
Mary Zournazi writes that "When we navigate our way through the world, there are different pulls, constraints and freedoms that move us forward and propel us into life." The Bourj is an important Lebanese national icon that has adapted to many historical milestone events which 'navigate' the Lebanese identity. According to Samir Khalaf the site itself dates back to the Lower Palaeolithic period, and before the civil war of 1975, the Bourj was the symbol of Beirut’s glorious pre-war Golden era and was the commercial and cultural centre of Lebanon. During the war, the Green Line which divided Beirut between East and West passed through the Square and brutal fighting led to its ultimate destruction. After the war, the Square underwent a transient period, full of hope and opportunity and awaiting reconstruction. In recent history, after the assassination of the former Lebanese Prime Minister Rafic-Al-Hariri on the 14th of February 2005, the Square became the focus of national and international attention, reacquiring its importance as a Lebanese national symbol. Thousands of people joined in Rafic-Al-Hariri’s public funeral marching from Kraeteem (his residence in Beirut) to his burial place in the ‘Heart of Beirut’, the Bourj. Rafic-Al-Hariri and seven of his friends murdered with him were buried under humble white tents near Al-Ameen’s Mosque. His funeral turned into a public demonstration; an event that led to the subsequent demonstrations of February and March 2005 as the beginning of a phenomenal and unsanctioned occupation of the Bourj by the ‘Independence 05’ ‘tent city’ alongside the slain prime minister’s burial tents.

The unsanctioned occupation of Rafic-Al-Hariri’s grave encouraged people to use the site to protest against political and cultural conditions. Due to the subsequent demonstrations, after the funeral, tents started to appear in the centre of the Square near and around Rafic-Al-Hariri’s grave to meet people’s needs for habitation and sheltering. The Bourj Square is porous and exhibits many interior qualities; it is a bounded enclosure, made up of various unconventional thresholds and edges which offer a good environment to navigate events temporally, spatially and culturally. While the centre contains archaeological findings, the anonymous Martyrs’ Statue, and a car park, the Square’s perimeter is surrounded by new and old war-torn buildings, the newly reconstructed architectural belt of the Beirut downtown area, and the Mediterranean Sea.

McCarthy’s review of the definition of interiority is instructive in informing a spatial reading of the Bourj where she states that “Interiors are notoriously transient, subject to fashion and impermanent materials” and often short-lived occupations. McCarthy paraphrases Abercombie in noting that interiors may express a fleeting “celebration of a very particular time, place and situation.” The Bourj’s many interior qualities contained and protected people during the demonstrations, affecting bodily comfort, enabling intense feeling and a sense of being, and in the process and itself being affected by various spatial transformations.

The permanency of temporality

Khalaf describes both Rafic-Al-Hariri’s burial tent and the ‘Independence 05’ tents as being ‘makeshift’, commenting that “In no time, the makeshift grave was transformed into a shrine and a solemn religious site for reciting the Fateha or observing a moment of silence.” This makeshift quality pictures the tents as the temporal embodiment of the transient nature of the square; they occupy the square ephemerally; physically, spiritually and culturally, yet become permanent through everyday existence and rituals. The original function of the tents as shelters evolved according to people’s needs. While Rafic-Al-Hariri’s burial tents became a permanent shrine made of temporary

---

3 Zournazi Hope p 211.
4 Khalaf Heart of Beirut Reclaiming the Bourj p 20.
5 Khalaf Heart of Beirut Reclaiming the Bourj p 20.
6 McCarthy ‘Towards a Definition of Interiority’ p 119.
7 Abercombie cited, McCarthy ‘Towards a Definition of Interiority’ p 120.
8 Khalaf Heart of Beirut Reclaiming the Bourj p 24.
9 Khalaf Heart of Beirut Reclaiming the Bourj p 241.
material, cohabited by the living and the dead, the 'Independence 05' tents, through daily habitation by people from various political and ideological backgrounds, domesticated the square. At the same time they evolved into spaces for discussion forums, enabling the getting to know the 'other'.

During the demonstrations, the 'Independence 05' tents also created physical and conceptual thresholds between private and public through establishing codes of practice to condition the rules of living. For example, one allowed only men to stay in the tents overnight; they alternated shifts in order to protect the protest site and the 'tent city'. So the tents were treated as both domestic and public places, that were lived in but had to be guarded due to their unsanctioned occupation. The tents were used for temporary habitation; not only to sleep, but also to eat, talk, sit, drink, and run heated discussion forums, and therefore they were appropriated along with the Square to act as both political and domestic interiors. Objects such as: mattresses, blankets, food, clothes, cups, cutlery, lighting, heaters, and camping equipment, were used to cater for a semblance of everyday life. The tent city projected domestication, while still acting as the embodiment of a political act, reflected through its evolution into socio-political and cultural discussion forums.

After the demonstrations all the tents were dismantled except for Rafic-Al-Hariri's grave and the main original 'Independence 05' tent, both which became permanent and visited continuously. The latter is now abandoned, but exists today as a memorable national symbol of the demonstrations. However it carries part of its domesticated character through the sheltered interior with its abandoned artefacts contained within.

**Tents in the square/the square in the tents**

Khalaf says of the Bourj "It seemed at its best when it was playing host to unconventional activities or unorthodox events that run against the grain and defy normative expectations." The tents superimposed in the Square built on a spatial desire of communication and temporary appropriation of space to serve a political and a social 'cause'. They generated unconventional spatial dynamics creating private and public thresholds within an urban space, freeing the Square of the conditions that delimited its original function, in order to acquire new spatial attributes. For example, the extraordinary events which occurred as a result of the assassination transformed the original function of the public square from a commercial and business district into a protest site that offered unpredictable and flexible interiority through various types of habitation such as: the funeral, demonstrations of 05, Rafic-Al-Hariri's grave, and the 'Independence 05' tents. The white materiality of the tents, their minimal interiority and temporary nature, attracted attention offering not only a spatial navigation through the square but also a temporal navigation through the events of contemporary Lebanese history.

---

10 Khalaf Heart of Beirut Reclaiming the Bourj p 235.
The presence of the tents is a political act that offers a new treatment to the public square, a risk in our interiority reading of the Bourj where interiority is, according to Simpson & Weinber, "opposed in all sense and uses to exterior." However, the transient nature of the tents and the square is determined through a series of exterior and interior thresholds that may merge into each other. These unsanctioned occupations of places open up a new possibility of movement between the private and the public, the internal and the external, the temporary and the permanent. Such movements are detected as people pass by these white tents, which invite entry as they carry conventional interior qualities, albeit placed in an unconventional location. For example, the red colouring of the decorations, the warm light, the sound of religious verses, and the white flowers covering the grave are all engaging interior attributes. Also the abundant use of large portraits alongside family snapshots infect the interior and the grave with a more personal and humane atmosphere, framing the mood and giving a sense of spirituality and humility. McCarthy writes that "It (atmosphere) is the possibility that the ephemeral and visually immaterial might construct interiority in its own terms."

In the above pictures both the materiality and immateriality of Rafic-Al-Hariri's portraits, the light, the sound and colours, the way people are using the space and the location together form a sympathetic and empathetic atmosphere of attachment, contemplation, questioning, and accepting, justifying the grave's unsanctioned existence in the 'Heart of Beirut'. Visitors engaged in performative contemplation are barred from the tomb by a metal balustrade that forms a conceptual and a physical threshold between them and the shrine. While still visually accessible, the bars, control, restrict, and inhibit access into the grave, dictating to people where to walk, to pray, to light a candle, to stop and where to exit.

To risk is to hope, to change, it is to extend the boundaries, stretching the norms, the expected. Risk is an opportunity that is foreseen and acted upon with unpredictable consequences, such as that of Rafic-Al-Hariri's funeral and the occupation of the Bourj Square. This unsanctioned occupation gave the Square an open and new probability to be used as a public space with personal and human occupation. Here, however, the risk lies in using the permanent notion of death in a public space, using temporary material. What do we risk by occupying and inhabiting the public square, turning the private into a public ritual which is a private at the same time? What do we risk if we create interior thresholds which dictate the movement of people within their public square or city?

Wall occupations: marginal interiority in Istanbul

Unsanctioned occupation appropriates and adapts space; and in Istanbul such occupation is enacted by people living on and in the margins of the culture and the politics of this vast, complex and multiplicitous city. We now examine the humble interior practices that people have adopted in order to navigate through increasingly marginal existences. These photographic recordings were made in the space of a day's touring of one section of the historic defensive walls of old Istanbul. Here it is possible to witness lives performed within and without the walls; "of lives within the Wall, of lives contingent on the Wall, and of lives which may just brush the Wall momentarily." Speculations on these momentary recordings of wall-based occupations suggest three notions of event/interiorities contingent on negotiating threshold conditions; washing, trading and housework.

The Theodosian Walls offer a material and a textual mapping of inhabitation. Parts of the walls of old Istanbul are more than 2,000

---

11 Simpson & Weinber cited, McCarthy 'Towards a Definition of Interiority' p 112.
12 Christine 'Towards a Definition of Interiority' p 121.
13 Stengers, I, 'A Cosmo-Politics'.
14 Lee 'The Intention to Notice' p 64.
15 Where threshold is located conceptually beyond the doorway; is the point where a new experience begins or where a psychological or physiological effect starts.
years old and they stretch from land to sea to land. They were built over hundreds of years in ever increasing circles to protect those living within; eventually the rolling hills, the farms and gardens beyond were subsumed. There are land walls and sea walls; they consist of an outer wall, moat and inner wall that form a band varying in width from 55 to 60 metres, exhibiting various qualities of interior inhabitation.

Ahunbay\textsuperscript{16} writes that the walls stride across plateaus, that they climb gentle slopes and they descend gently to the sea. Their evolution over the past century or so has recorded interventions beyond those of external attack. Transcending cultural imperatives, they were built by and are named after Roman emperors and were maintained by successive Ottoman rulers. They have been subject to continuous repair and renewal, intervention and alterations. Each length exhibits a specific architecture, each length exudes a specific history of attack and defence and the politics of empires. Yet a contemporary reading of the walls suggests a shift in the once contested space around and within the walls. It is said that now the walls protect the natural beauty of the countryside from the possible threats originating from the inner city.\textsuperscript{17} In order to get about in the 20th century, openings have been blasted and cut through, new openings, less formal than the original gates; those gates which could be named, those gates once used for ceremony and execution, now operate in the realm of the domestic situations of the locals overlain with scenic concerns of the tourist.

People live and work in the inner and outer spaces of the Walls. The stone is spatially permeable to allow for setting up of workshops or for a container hidden for safe-keeping. The Wall is a spine as well, it is as though you could back up to the wall and nestle in and make a house which simply hangs off the old stone; both a living scale shift and an architectural shape shift at the same time. Off the Wall, on the other side of the street, the lane, the courtyard, the Wall affects the view; it looms, it allows visual passage sometimes, it’s mostly a dead end, and it’s a point of reference in the distance.

Three scenarios for unsanctioned occupation

The Wall is textured spatially. Surface topographies uncover insertions and incursions in the stone and a layered narrative of occupation emerges in the tourist’s mind; one that pays attention to the performative montages taking place in the lives of people and their artefacts. The outsider’s reading notices these incursions as points of resistance to sanctioned occupation; the Istanbul Wall-dwellers initially squat in the margins and the defensive Wall changes into a site of domesticity. Here, unsanctioned occupation transitions into permanence demonstrating Massumi’s observation that “...the power to act and exist comes from the power of production, of acting to form something, not being acted upon.”\textsuperscript{18} The Wall is no longer simply a barrier that allows passing through only at designated gates. Through a non-violent and performative interaction with the threshold nature of the Wall, these marginalised squatters not only make a home and a place to work, but through such subtle intervention, enable an ethico-aesthetic politics\textsuperscript{19} of spatial occupation. The politics of disadvantage recognises the potential that comes from the risk of making an event of the way the Wall has been occupied; it is made visible through building and through the ephemeral objects of occupation.

Marginal occupation also challenges concepts of designed interiority. McCarthy writes on certain conditions where we may interrogate interior thinking; in particular regarding notions of controlling space through limitation and restraint in relation to the organising structure of the boundary. To cross the boundary from exterior to interior means to change one’s state (of mind), from openness to enclosure, from freedom to constraint.\textsuperscript{20} Yet the porous boundaries of the Wall are the very zones where traversing and transitioning from outside to inside challenge such notions. Spatial occupation in the wall is more akin to McCarthy’s second condition where:

\begin{itemize}
  \item Boundary conditions determine the flexibility, mobility and the extent of interiority. They move and change, making temporality an active condition of interiority.....[as] a responsive phenomenon.
\end{itemize}

\textsuperscript{16} Ahunbay ‘Conservation of the City Walls of Istanbul’ p 53.

\textsuperscript{17} Ahunbay ‘Conservation of the City Walls of Istanbul’ p 54.

\textsuperscript{18} Massumi 'Navigating Movements' p 213.

\textsuperscript{19} Guattari paraphrased, Massumi 'Navigating Movements' p 235.

\textsuperscript{20} McCarthy 'Towards a Definition of Interiority' p 113.
...Interiority's boundary "is not that at which something stops, but is that from which something begins its presencing."\(^{21}\)

The three threshold interiority scenarios below further draw on McCarthy’s conditions to assist in theorising and illustrating where tactics of risky interior occupation inform methods of domestic permanency.

**Threshold interiority 1: Washing: the everyday domestic in/on the wall**

![Figures 6 and 7](image)

Wall, pink house, lace curtains and washing

McCarthy suggests that "Interiors are notoriously transient... Differently scaled times and spaces butt up against one another in pockets of unrelated and ephemeral interiorities."\(^{22}\) This small pink washed house hangs off the Wall, seemingly only one room wide — and a narrow room at that. The house has a parasitical and symbiotic relationship to the Wall. It could be only one room wide although it infers burrowing into the wall; indeed habitation is inferred through the ephemeral appearance of the washing on the line — but who lives here? They are man’s work clothes, but the curtains are lace, the house is airing, touches of a feminine domesticity. This intimate public view of the Theodosian Wall, where once wartime occupation and protection coincided, now reveals in this illegal dwelling, a life supported and the boundary between interior and exterior made ambiguous.

If to be domesticated is to be kept on the inside then this threshold condition interrupts the historical force of the materiality and scale of the Wall with a curiously externalised gendered domestic situation; the feminine scale and colouration of the house and its decoration, hand made and appropriated from elsewhere; and in the necessity for public washing line, a life and its rituals offered up to the street. As much as the inhabitant has no sanctioned right to be there, the tourist that comes upon the scene is enabled to speculate and project imagined domestic arrangements of those mute beings in occupation at this moment in time. And the protected life lived inside is drawn through the threshold outside, into the street.

**Threshold interiority 2: trading: opening in/out the wall**

![Figure 8: Woodworking/shopkeeping](image)

The hidden, private and mysterious interior suggests an exclusive, restricted and private space differentiated from the outside.\(^{23}\) Yet insertions into the Wall, constructed interiors for making and trading come with wide-open doors and a welcoming presence; the woodworker at the threshold of his workshop tunnelled out from the interior fabric of the Wall and the shopkeeper lazing on the Wall between the temporary imposed contemporary fabric juxtaposed against the disused and barricaded original threshold.

\(^{21}\) Heidegger cited, McCarthy ‘Towards a Definition of Interiority’ p 115.

\(^{22}\) McCarthy ‘Towards a Definition of Interiority’ pp 119-120.

\(^{23}\) McCarthy ‘Towards a Definition of Interiority’ p 121.
These keepers of the Wall, poised between the inside and the outside, infer that work and commercial transactions go on inside dimly lit caverns hidden from the tourist gaze unless you are brave enough to enter. The thresholds are physically open but the stranger pauses, waiting to be invited in.

If atmospheric interiority is contingent upon the private and the darker unknown, then these everyday arrangements refer to an ambience that draws upon a domestic scale inhabited by commercial opportunism, where private and public activities transcend traditional threshold conditions. The interior may be unrevealed, but the performative work inside is brought outside through the open trading door. The spatial threshold is expanded between the enclosed yet unknown interior and the ambiguous ephemeral stage of the street.

**Threshold interiority 3: housework: sanctifying outside the wall**

Just outside the Wall, the prophet’s tomb interrupts the road and the trajectories of those moving in and out of the city. The tomb, enclosed by a visually porous wall and fence on two sides with the towering Wall on the others, has been there for hundreds of years. Huddled in the corner behind the tomb is where tomb keeper resides from time to time. He is absent on the day of the tour yet through the presence of his tools — the mirror, the brush, the broom, the polishing rags and a little wooden stool — alongside the absent body implied by the tomb, this place reveals a practice of everyday housekeeping, and thus interiority, beyond simply a place for outside worship.

This is a sanctioned site, but the sanctity of the tomb is transcended by the domestic operation of tomb housekeeping. These traces of domestic engagement transcend the limits of the practiced interior to spatial enclosures defined by walls, roof and threshold. Rather this conceptual interiority is defined by the perceived and the imagined bodily activities of the (momentarily absent) tomb keeper. McCarthy confirms that “Traces are evidence of an engagement with the boundaries of interiority and a history of occupation... [they] map the complexities and contradictions of living. ... [and] the evidence of habitation and the limits of interiority.”

This tomb interiority is a curiosity but no contradiction in the range of unsanctioned occupations provoked by close association with the Wall and the shelter and opportunity it offers. This space offers a multiple occupation — it is space for both home and work to the tomb keeper, yet is also transitional space, not planned for, simply space bounded by wall and tomb,

---

24 McCarthy ’Towards a Definition of Interiority’ p 120.

25 McCarthy ‘Towards a Definition of Interiority’ p 119.
enabling privacy and a public presence, simultaneously. It is a performed interiority contained by ambiguous boundaries.

**Experiments in threshold interiority: sites of coincidence?**

Our investigations into the Beirut and Istanbul sites of protest and domesticity reveal many coinciding ‘affects’; where these sites coincide in their unsanctioned existence in public spaces enabled by the conceptual and physical undecidedness of their host’s ephemeral and physical thresholds. The Square and the Wall are both spatially and historically differentiated. Although they both are sites of great political disturbance, they also enable bodily responses to everyday concerns; they are porous structures that are spatially and materially flexible and enclosing enabling occupiers to mediate their activities between public display and private inhabitation. We acknowledge that McCarthy’s interiority conditions encompassing control, boundary, exteriority, habitation, bodies, time and atmosphere are all contained in the narratives and events that have been enacted in the interior spaces of the Square and the Wall.

So what can be learnt about risky interiorities from investigating such marginal yet invasive sites of interior occupation?

One aspect involves understanding the politics of interiority relating to these sites of projection; where an altered condition, in this case one of domesticity, is practically and conceptually applied to places where their formal structures are historically programmed for public and political events. This overlaying of domestic arrangements in public spaces, even as a transitory occurrence, profoundly transforms the spatial attributes of the formal structure. The Square is transformed into a multiplicity of transitional dwellings, furnished with the bare necessities for existence, simply and immediately affected by the appearance of mass-produced tents. And the Wall is permeated by domestic insertions and inclusions enabling living, washing, making and trading; activities that may be transitional and mobile, but just as often merge into the fabric of the Wall as permanent installations.

The other aspect revealed is where conditions at the threshold zone imply transitional interiorities that not only shift from inside to outside, but also superimpose privacy and publicity in indefinite threshold space. The wall/boundary condition defies definition at the moment where the open door reveals less of what lies beyond than the events taking place in the exterior zone. The conceptual boundary of the prime minister’s tent displays inscriptions on walls to herald what lies within – the tomb is expected but the interior conditions and the associated inner performances and artefacts transform the humble tent interior into a site of great sanctity. And some thresholds prohibit physical access but invite mental, visual and spiritual access; the tomb keeper’s everyday space and its effects implies a greater sense of veneration for the prophet than any of the built and material form contained within the site.

We posed a question for ourselves at the commencement of this work. By moving outside the comfort of the interior zone, what do we risk? Essentially, we realise that we have instead investigated the discomforts of the interior zone in marginal and political public space and now understand that in order to occupy difficult space concerned people choose to inhabit such places through adopting humanising tactics. In the domestication of the Square and the Wall, the risk is less one of working with uncertainty, but rather that we face and test our preconceptions of what domestic interiority involves, in order to recognise where alternative thinking and unsanctioned action can inform [political and] ethical design practice.
References:

All images are the copyright of the authors
This paper concerns the role of accidents and generative processes in design. It discusses two studio projects carried out at the University of Auckland School of Architecture and Planning in 2006. 'Accident' called for the design of a vehicle depot as a place for chance meetings and failures to connect. 'Emergency' called for the design of an emergency facility. Both projects were intended to provoke students to consider the unintentional, serendipitous and disastrous aspects of designing. In initial discussions, accidents were commonly understood as exceptions to the norm, failures of a system, or loss of control. Against this view, students were presented with concepts from emergence theory, and Paul Virilio's argument that accidents are inherent in systems. In response, students opened up what this paper describes as 'risky intervals', strategies for exposing their design to the unintentional.

It is common practice in studio teaching to attempt to alert students to the serendipitous aspect of designing, and to encourage them to harness unintended effects of their work. Similarly, students often asked to work in a 'generative' mode, in which final judgement on the value of production is postponed until after a series of iterations. These significant uses of accident in design, however, are frequently at odds with the expectation that students will act in non-arbitrary ways. Students are expected to justify their design choices and validate their design with reference to a framework of theoretical value judgements.

This paper argues for a conscious engagement with accidents in studio practice and counteracts the idea that accidents are arbitrary incursions into design. It does this by considering theories of emergence, Paul Virilio's critique of technology, and student
work carried out in two recent studio design papers at the University of Auckland.

Emergence

In his seminal 'Embryological Houses' project (1999), Greg Lynn used scripted modelling and digital manufacturing to produce "a strategy for the invention of domestic space." Rather than proposing a house, which was a singular architectural object, Lynn established a set of genetic rules (a scripted algorithm) which was capable of generating an infinite number of houses according to certain variable geometric relationships. The houses are not simply a theme and variations. Instead, the project "employs a rigorous system of geometrical limits that liberate an exfoliation of endless variations." In the language of systems theory, Lynn is manipulating a phase space. He does not directly vary the individual values of his system (the thickness of a wall, the position of an opening, or patterning of the surface). He varies the system itself (adding or subtracting environmental variables, setting maxima and minima) in order to control an entire field of possibilities. In this way, an interval opens up between intention and effect. Outcomes are not directly anticipated, but emerge from interactions within the 'generic envelope' of the project. Emergent properties of a system are higher-level properties that arise from the accumulated interactions of lower-level properties. Studies of complex systems from sociology to the natural sciences, to software design have employed emergence as an explanatory principle. Often-cited examples of emergence are the behaviour of flocks, swarms, and herds: although each member of the group acts independently, the group acts as a single entity through the dynamic interactions of many individuals.

In the last fifteen years popular texts like Kelly's Out of Control: The new biology of machines, social systems and the economic world and Johnson's Emergence: The connected lives of Ants, Brains, Cities and Software have recommended emergence be considered as a methodology or manifesto rather than simply an analytical technique. This instrumental view of emergence has been particularly influential in contemporary spatial practice. Biological studies of morphogenesis such as Thompson's On Growth and Form have been treated as methodological treatises for architectural design. Architectural morpho-geneticists see form as a product of the forces acting on it, and advance Lynn's generative strategy by incorporating iteration and environmental feedback as a way of seeking out emergence in the design process. In Morphogenesis and the Mathematics of Emergence, Weinstock writes:

It is necessary to think of the geometry of a biological or computational form not only as the description of the fully developed form, but also as the set of boundary constraints that act as a local organising principle for self-organisation during morphogenesis.

In generative or morphogenetic design, algorithms and rules are not simply constraints. They are an abstract geometric diagram (a 'local organising principle for self-organisation') which demarcates a field of more or less strongly emergent possibilities. The defining conditions of morphogenesis according to Weinstock are iteration and feedback. A process operating according to these conditions traverses this field, exposing its unexpected potentials.

The Integral Accident

An alternative way to consider the gap between intention and effect is provided by Paul Virilio. In Crepuscular Dawn, Unknown Quantity, and most recently The Original Accident, Virilio contends that accidents are inherent in systems. Arguing against uncritical technophilia, he warns that every new technological system bears the possibility of accident within it. Every new system that is invented opens up a new domain of potential accident: "to invent the sailing vessel or the steam ship is to invent the shipwreck." The risk, according to Virilio

---

1 Lynn 'Embryological House' p 1.
2 Lynn 'Embryological House' p 1.
3 A phase space is an abstract, multidimensional space in which each axis corresponds to one variable of a system. Every possible state of the system is thus represented by a single point in phase-space.
4 Lynn 'Embryological House' p 1.
5 In its most abstract sense, emergence is nearly equivalent to the philosophical concept of supervenience. Supervenience first developed into emergence in the work of British philosophers examining the relationship between consciousness and causality. See Horgan 'From Supervenience to Superdeterminism' pp 555-586 and O'Connor and Wong 'Emergent Properties' unpaginated.

---

4 Kelly proposes "Nine laws of God" which include "control from the bottom up... pursue no optima... seek persistent disequilibrium." Kelly Out of Control p 468.
5 Weinstock p 14.
6 Virilio Unknown Quantity p 24 (italics are Virilio's).
is that each new capability is also a new capacity for accident, and the more far-reaching the capability, the more extensive is the capacity:

The old techniques of the transportation revolution provoked accidents that were specific, local. Invent the luxury liner, and you invent the 'Titanic'... On the other hand, by virtue of cybernetic technologies, the accident is total. It simultaneously concerns the entire world at the same instant.9 Virilio urges us to conceive of the accidental domains that we have opened up with new technologies, but which we have not yet experienced. The accident does not intervene from outside the system, but derives from the internal functioning of the system. An accident does not arbitrarily enter the domain of normal, systematised conditions, to be either defended against or generously accommodated. The accident is part of the conditions that define the domain of system from the outset. Virilio quotes Freud: "Accumulation puts an end to the illusion of chance." Through iteration, the exceptional event becomes inevitable. This inherent relationship between systems and accidents is not counter-intuitive in light of emergence theory: accidents, mishaps and catastrophes could be considered emergent possibilities of systems. It would be misleading, however, simply to describe Virilio as an emergentist. In his own studio teaching, he stressed the one-to-one correspondence of intention and action in design.10 His writing about accidents is an explicit critique of some of the very technologies and processes that are central to emergent design practice. But perhaps the most significant impediment to mapping Virilio’s accident directly onto emergence theory is that it requires positing that accidents are an instance of a system’s self-ordering. Virilio himself provides no argument to this effect.

Although Virilio’s accident and emergence theories are not directly equivalent, their tentative alignment may prove productive in thinking critically about the role of accidents in designing. The two lines of thought were presented for testing to two studio groups at the University of Auckland School of Architecture and Planning in 2006. What is the connection between accidents and emergence? To what extent are accidents emergent, or emergence catastrophic? How can a consideration of the unintentional enrich studio design practice?

**Accident and Emergency**

The two projects, 'Accident' and 'Emergency,' were organised around group discussions of work in progress, and emphasised design as research by requiring the production of an illustrated and referenced design report. 'Accident' (a fourth-year project) asked students to develop a theoretical position on the relationship between accident and architecture. It called for the design of a vehicle depot, understood as a site for meetings and failures to connect. 'Emergency' (a third-year project) asked students to employ emergent systems in the search for unexpected architectural outcomes. Students presented a proposal for an emergency facility.

Both projects began with individual students identifying an accident (train derailments, nuclear containment failures, volcanic eruptions, accidental survivals, things becoming lost, coincidences) and describing the various systems it involved. In discussion, it became clear that the students understood accidents as exceptions. Almost exclusively they described their selected accident as the failure or limit state of a system: a train derailment was the failure of the system of controls and mechanisms of a rail network; a survivor of the Holocaust was a failure of the system of extermination represented by the camps; an earthquake was caused by tectonic plates failing to move smoothly along their course. These discussions polarised around the opposition of the systematic (which was seen as deterministic and predictable) and the accidental (which was seen as arbitrary and chaotic).

Students were asked to use these analyses to inform a generative process. These processes included mapping movements in simulated networks: converting safety procedures at nuclear power plants into drawing methods, experimenting with spray-paint and stencils, carrying out particle-based collision simulations, photographing water, and experimenting with toffee production. In refining their processes conceptually and technically, students were asked to postpone judgments on use-value.

---

9 Virilio & Lotringer Crepuscular Dawn p 160.
10 Virilio & Lotringer Crepuscular Dawn p 25.
11 “Virilio would constantly push us to expose ourselves, to adopt points of view, and would force us to make them stronger and more personal. For him there was only one type of architect: author. He would tell the students: ‘Author or unemployed – you must choose.” Bessard ‘Paul Virilio’ p 44.
A common experience in the studio during this period was concern over the value of accidental work. One student commented that she didn’t feel like she was designing. Did something carried out accidentally even constitute ‘work’? A number of students held to the view that accidents represented a failure of ‘designerly’ discipline, and were to be excluded. They saw design as a conscious process of control and consequently, as their project developed, they downplayed the significance of intuitive movements and chance discoveries.

One such student, SB, developed a broad typology of disasters, based on a formal mapping of historical events. Accidents were placed into a governing systematic framework. Her analysis assimilated accidents as classifiable events, as an insurance assessor might. SB was interested in architecture as the restoration of a disrupted order. She set herself the task of designing a rail terminal for Ports of Auckland, arguing that the atrophy of Auckland’s rail network constituted a disastrous event for the city. The human-scale spaces of her proposal were marked by a series of knowingly nostalgic gestures to a ‘golden age’ of NZ rail: slightly vaulted ceilings like those in train carriages, brass fittings, overhead storage nets, walls of railway sleepers.

Each design decision, for SB, was a conscious movement that needed to be explained. When she was unable to justify a decision she had made, SB would pause until she had established a plausible chain of cause-and-effect reasoning. SB saw the role of the studio tutor as pointing out causes that had not yet found their expression in effects, or effects that needed to be justified with respect to a cause. Maintaining the proper relationship of cause and effect was central to SB’s design practice.

Another student, JW, was interested in involuntary physiological responses to film. He described these responses as accidental, because they were not the product of direct intention. Even though his project concerned unintentional actions, JW’s architecture was itself the effect of the designer’s conscious intentions. In the same way that a filmmaker could produce a physiological response in the viewer by means of the film, an architect could control the responses of occupants by means of the architecture. There was a clear chain of causality that passed through the building. Architecture was the effect of the designer’s intentions, and in turn subjected the occupants to those intentions.

SB and JW successfully addressed accident as a theme, but they excluded it as a design strategy. By restricting accidents to the status of theme, they could be classified and guidelines for response drawn, while the designer retained a traditional position of external control.

Risky Intervals
Other students deliberately pried open what could be called a ‘risky interval’ between cause and effect. The precise nature of these risky intervals varied by student, but they can be characterised as spaces where loss of control was permitted.

AG for example, was interested in sleep and dreaming as examples of the loss of conscious control. Of particular interest was the idea that dreaming was how the brain processed memory. From her research, AG identified four processes which occurred in sleep: the reconstruction of cells and tissue, preservation of energy, compression of memories, and the development of the brain, understood as a kind of unfolding. These conceptual processes were turned to a method of making fabric castings by wrapping familiar objects in fabric saturated with glue, and then binding them. When the glue was dry and the object freed, a flexible cast remained.

In this way, AG devised an abstract machine, which she then fed with a range of inputs (household objects). The ability of the objects to speak about sleep and dreaming did not reside in the objects themselves, but in the processes. We might suggest the objects were performative, rather than constative. They did not represent ideas about sleep and dreaming; rather, those ideas were enacted in the production of the objects. By ‘automating’ a part of her design process, she established her project in terms of a phase-space rather than a single significant object. Within this space of possibilities, all possible objects met the criteria for being read in terms of sleep and dreaming. In the language of emergence theory, AG operated algorithmically. As she tested her algorithm by varying the inputs, she was able to refine it technically and conceptually.

A project by JT worked with refining a kit of bamboo and cardboard parts for use in rapid-response disaster relief. By designing the individual parts and connections, JT was manipulating a phase space. She developed her components through manufacturing them in large numbers and testing their flexibility
for producing a range of spaces. Early versions of the components lead to a phase space sharply divided into horizontal constructions and vertical constructions. This observation was fed back into the process by making subtle modifications to the components so that vertical and horizontal could be mixed, producing a smoother phase space and a more flexible system. At another point, the phase-space organised itself around small spaces, which JT identified as unsatisfactory and addressed by further subtle modifications of her components. Although at all times during the process JT was working with specific architectural details, the object of her design was actually the phase-space itself. Observations at a large scale fed back into operations at a small scale.

Neither AG nor JT operated in a traditional mode where intention orchestrates and validates action. Instead algorithmic operation allowed for unexpected outcomes which still fitted within conceptual and technical parameters. Rules were not constraints on production but a means to open up a field of potential accidents. In both cases feedback was introduced to the system as the students manually evaluated their productions. The possibility that feedback might be integrated algorithmically is demonstrated in a project by PN.

PN began by looking at human interactions at traffic lights and tried to describe through drawing the way that two individuals simultaneously respond to each other as they try to determine the other's intentions. As she moved on to consider larger groups, individuals became jittering particles in a field of dynamic interaction (Figure 1). PN proposed an Accident and Emergency Clinic for Grafton Gully. She established a diagram of site and function, which was then deformed by the 'material' properties of dynamically interacting occupants. Hesitation and ambivalence, which appeared in her drawings as irregular, unsteady lines, became roughness of surfaces: gravel underfoot or roughcast concrete. Sudden decisive movements became sweeping corridors or moments of way-finding clarity. PN's proposal was conceived as emerging from a dynamic simulation. The programmatic diagram is modified by the simulated behaviour of occupants, and is responded to in turn until a relatively stable state is reached.

This is how PN's project outlined the possibility for a sophisticated emergent system. But rather than actually simulating the movements of people through the diagram and allowing moments of hesitation or clarity to emerge, PN intuited where these moments would occur, based on her assumptions about how people might act in various circumstances. She opened up a risky interval by siting some decision-making externally, but then managed that risk by annexing that decision-making to herself. The question of decision-making becomes particularly pressing in the case of intuitive action. WW made a series of elegant, complex pencil drawings as an intuitive response to the idea of material transformations that occur in accidents. Her drawings were puzzling for her, because she was not immediately able to articulate what qualities of accident they expressed, or how. Her intuitive drawing drew on her unconscious resources: the assumptions, preferences and concepts that she was not consciously aware of having. Most of her designing from this point consisted in re-interpreting her own drawings in order to disclose these unconscious conditions. At the end of her project, WW described architects as working with reference to this subconscious pool, as "symbol collectors and ideas alchemists."

Intuition is often taken as arbitrary or uncritical action. In PN's case, intuition thwarted a properly generative process. However, WW's work suggests that, properly framed, intuitive action can become an opportunity for reflexive disclosure. While other students adopted processes that were external to themselves, WW treated her own subconscious as an emergent field that she traversed quasi-psychoanalytically. Intuitive action is problematic for a discourse of intention because it is neither the act of an intending subject, nor an external imposition on the subject. In considering intuition in emergent terms, there may be no simple inside and outside. Virilio suggests, quoting Hugo, that "it is inside of ourselves that we have to see the outside — a terrible admission of asphyxia." Instead of a distinctly separated interior and exterior, we find a risky continuum.

12 Christian Norberg-Schulz proclaims: "One of the important insights offered by architectural theory is that a building task cannot be solved through intuitive improvisation." (Norberg-Schulz Intentions in Architecture p 217.) According to Norberg-Schulz, intuitive action is untheoretical, and therefore unjustified.

13 Virilio & Lotringer Crepuscular Dawn p 129.
Anxiety
Stefani Ledewitz describes anxiety over loss of control as ‘one of the most serious difficulties we face in teaching students to design.’ She sees this anxiety as one of the main problems with the ‘analysis-synthesis’ model of design teaching in which a preliminary phase of analysis (of conditions such as concept, site, program, history, type) is followed by a period of synthesis in which these conditions are all accommodated in a scheme. The problem and the anxiety arise because there is a gap between analysis and synthesis that must be leaped over.

Dreading this leap, students often hope for ‘the big idea’ that will bridge the gap for them. If the big idea, or the ‘right’ design concept, is seen as an unpredictable inspiration, it may become the source of anxiety, oppression, and a loss of self-confidence... These students are caught in the grip of a design process they do not control and consequently cannot apply purposefully to solve design problems.14

This gap opens up between cause and effect. Analysis could be seen as the enumeration and definition of causes, and synthesis as the determination of proper effects. In Ledewitz’s view, students become anxious because they cannot properly connect cause to effect. No amount of analysis can automatically entail a synthesis. The analysis-cause proves insufficient to produce the synthesis-effect and the student experiences this as a loss of control.

The anxiety produced by working in a generative mode is very similar to this. Because there is an uncontrolled element introduced to the process a gap opens up between intention and effect. The student is suddenly subjected to the design process. Instead of wielding it purposefully, he or she is in its grip.

Soliciting Accident
All designing incorporates both intention and unintention. The designer cannot be treated as an agent of pure, unconstrained intention.

This is particularly true when confronted with contemporary morphogenetic techniques and technologies. Lebbeus Woods, in his contribution to Virilio’s Unknown Quantity, writes:

Paul Virilio’s insight that the accidents occurring within a system are as designed as its intended results corresponds closely with the dynamics of unpredictability characteristic of a culture based on innovation and technological process. As this implies, determinism by itself is no longer an adequate framework for understanding contemporary life or spaces designed for it, yet we cannot dispense with it. Instead we should seek to enlarge its scope and deepen its implications.15

According to Woods, we cannot continue to operate according to a binary opposition of the deterministic and the accidental. He encourages us to read in Virilio the continuity of determinism and accident. This modified view enables a newly critical approach to technologies, and destabilises intentionalist determinism.

The guiding principle for the Accident + Emergency studio papers was that the accidental should be treated as neither arbitrary nor exceptional. Accidents are not just exceptions to an established order that are to be mastered by reasserting that order. The loose diagram of the ‘risky interval’ proved a helpful way to identify the role of accident and system in these projects. The risky interval is the space which is opened up by a shift from direct intentional control to an algorithmic or rule-based process (whether it be digital or analog). It is what I have described above as a phase-space, or a domain of accident. The risky interval is not intended as a concept which sums up all the issues of accident or emergence, but as a technique for foregrounding these issues in the design studio. By encouraging and assisting students to establish and explore a risky interval an intensive and reflexive engagement with accident, emergence, and other forms of unintention becomes possible.

---


References:


Uneasy: design and working between cultures in remote Western Australia

Fiona Harrisson
RMIT University, AU

This paper is concerned with exploring some of the challenging and risky aspects of working on a cross cultural project through an examination of a community engagement project run as an RMIT University design studio in Broome, Western Australia. RMIT was invited by a local community to consider Minyrr Park, a large tract of land adjacent to Cable Beach, an iconic tourist destination, and which is part of a larger unresolved Native Title Claim. The project did not fit into the standard ‘research’ or ‘consultancy’ models, as this project was initiated by the community and was run voluntarily. It also operated as part of the University curriculum. In the absence of guidelines specific to design The Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders Studies (AIATSIS) Guidelines for Ethical Research in Indigenous Studies were drawn on to inform the process of consultation. These Guidelines offer a clear and succinct framework for working with indigenous communities and whilst they were useful at the outset, as the project developed it became apparent that the project did not sit easily within them. It seems that modifying the project to neatly fit the Guidelines would have had the potential to undermine the project’s inherent complexity and for the design process to avoid this risked the project becoming simply another ‘feel good’ example of an urban University working with a remote indigenous community. This paper posits the possibility as put forward by Tom Spector, an architect writing specifically on ethics and design practice, when he asks “How might embracing one’s uneasiness affect the ethical dilemmas of the architect?” The paper will reflect on the project through the Guidelines and in light of the question of uneasiness as raised by Spector.

1 Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders Studies (AIATSIS) Guidelines for Ethical Research in Indigenous Studies.
2 Spector The Ethical Architect p 34.
Introduction
This paper explores some of the uneasy aspects of working on a design project with an aboriginal community in remote Western Australia. The project was run as a design studio within the Landscape Architecture program at RMIT University and came about as a consequence of an invitation by a local aboriginal family in Broome. It drew on ethics guidelines from the Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders Studies (AIATSIS)¹ and although the project was largely a success there were moments where the ethics guidelines and professional judgment seemed to be pulling in different directions. It is offered as a case study not because it is exceptional but because it brings into sharp focus the complex negotiation of expectations and intentions that occur in all design projects. These issues exist in all community projects but working in a cross-cultural setting and with the ethics guidelines brought an accountability that becomes invisible in many projects. At the outset of the project it seemed that the design outputs were the objective of the design studio but increasingly as it progressed it became apparent that the process, not the outcomes, was the main game and that it was in reflection on the process that the lessons lie. The paper therefore offers a reflection on the process but rather than focus on the successes of the project it will explore the uneasy moments where critical choices were made that then effected the project trajectory. This paper makes no claims to finding solutions, rather it suggests that whilst project reviews focus on the outcomes to the neglect of the means there is little possibility for reflection or learning from the difficult choices that are part of all design projects, and which become increasingly complex when working across cultures.

Uneasy possibilities
In his book titled The Ethical Architect, Tom Spector suggests that 'unease' is inherent in professional practice which he says is necessarily a consequence of negotiating between conflicting demands. Whilst Spector's main focus is the role of the architect acting between public and client this paper extends this dilemma to working between cultures. Spector suggests that the uneasiness that comes from negotiating between different, often contradictory, requirements is part of the burden of the professional where responsibility is traded for status. Spector offers no solutions except to say that accepting this burden and working with it is part of what constitutes ethical practice, that is not pretending it doesn't exist. The underlying assumption in The Ethical Architect is that it is possible to act responsibly within society if only we grapple with the implications of this burden. Margaret Crawford, theorist and architect, offers a different reading. In her article 'Can Architects Be Socially Responsible?', Crawford identifies various approaches employed by architects in order to answer the question. One end of the spectrum is where the architect is disinterested in their social role, instead cultivating a position more akin to the artist. At the other end of the spectrum she identifies 'the radical architects', who she says were typified in the 1960s and were driven by a social agenda but who ultimately sacrificed "professional power to democratic principles" and in the process "failed to empower the masses."² There is, of course, territory between these two poles and it is this territory that this project navigates. How is it possible to offer both the specialist knowledge that is the conventional role of the profession and to simultaneously be in collaboration with the client?

The design disciplines are geared towards the provision of final products but the messy and often unstable relations that arise in the design process are overlooked or overshadowed by privileging discussion of the final product. Jeremy Till, an advocate for community participation, extends this critique. He says "the participatory process brings forward the moment when the political nature of space has to be dealt with: in so doing it disturbs the comfort zone (which architects so often revert to) of a world stripped bare of the messy, complex, lives of users."³ In a bid to acknowledge this critique, this paper offers another approach to telling projects. Rather than focus on the final products, which are by nature clear and decisive, this paper will present the moments where choices were made that defined what it became. It is in these tenuous moments where the power is negotiated and which gives a closer insight into the project mechanics rather than the final output. More

---

¹ AIATSIS, Guidelines for Ethical Research in Indigenous Studies
² Crawford 'Can Architects Be Socially Responsible?' in Ghirado Out of Site, p 39.
³ Till 'Negotiations of Hope' in Blundell Jones, Petrescu & Till (eds) Architecture and Participation p 34.
consideration of the ways in which ideas are negotiated with clients and communities could enable a more reflective practice that could lead to deeper engagement with our clients and the world. A process that may have the potential to transform all parties rather than the designer remaining the provider of solutions. Even though this paper is specific to a particular project these choices take place in all design processes.

**Project in context**

The project was initiated by an indigenous community in Broome who invited the Landscape Architecture program at RMIT to run a design studio on a large tract of land which has both cultural and spiritual significance to the local aboriginal community. Throughout this paper the use of the word 'community' will refer to the aboriginal group who invited RMIT to do the project. It is worth noting that the individuals within this group, not surprisingly, had differing views. The word 'community' therefore collects a diverse group of people and like all communities cannot be represented by a singular voice. Whilst this community did not necessarily represent all the indigenous families with interests in the land, this 'community' played a recognised role as caretakers of Minyrr Park both at the time and continue to do so.

The project sits between conventional consultancy and research. The project was not a typical research project even though it was carried out by a University as the project was initiated and partly lead by the community. The project was not a typical consultancy as there was no exchange of money and participation was funded by the University and the students with a hope for a cross cultural experience. The studio nonetheless followed a consultancy model whereby the community, that is the indigenous community, was situated as clients in relationship to student work and where the brief was negotiated up front. The author's job was to negotiate between a number of roles; a facilitator between the community and the student body, a teacher and a consultant.

In the absence of ethics guidelines specific to design, guidelines put together by the Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders Studies(AIATSIS) were used. AIATSIS was formed in 1989 and is the official caretaker of research and education for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders. Although the AIATSIS ethics guidelines are "predominately intended for researchers" AIATSIS acknowledge that they are applicable more broadly. The guidelines are useful to designers in that they offer a clear and succinct framework for working with indigenous communities. The guidelines rightly encourage a working process that is transparent and negotiated. There are some anomalies in the guidelines which arose in relation to this project. The aspiration for consensus is, of course, ideal but if we accept that conflict or difference of opinion is part of negotiating relationships of exchange then the aspiration for consensus is difficult if not impossible to achieve and perhaps only achieved by overlooking or silencing dissent. Consensus is an ideal but it is unlikely to be achieved in most negotiations with communities. As Till suggests this notion of transformative participation is too cozy: it suggests idealised conditions of mutual cooperation, uncontested knowledge bases, open communication and eventual consensus. In reality such ideals do not exist, and it is dangerous to hope blindly that they might.

The guidelines tend to focus on the relationship between the researcher and the community and make no allowance for the fact that communities by their nature are made up of many different people and points of view.

**Negotiating the brief**

From the outset RMIT was invited to investigate a large tract of land (at least 8 square kilometres) called Minyrr Park. This park is significant culturally and spiritually to the local aboriginal community. It consists of local vegetation, some of which is used for food collection, and it also has extensive beach frontage and significantly the park is adjacent to the international tourist destination Cable Beach resort. At the time of the project Minyrr Park was also part of a larger Naïve Title claim in the High Court, which was in its tenth year of proceedings and has since been settled in favour of the indigenous claimants. It was clear that the context of the park was political and it was crucial for the project to engage with this aspect. This is because the political nature of land in Australia is largely avoided in urban areas where the students had come from.

---

4 AIATSIS Guidelines for Ethical Research in Indigenous Studies 'Introduction'.

5 AIATSIS Guidelines for Ethical Research in Indigenous Studies p 34.
Also it seemed that to avoid addressing the politics in some way would have rendered the project naïve because the conflict in land values was at the heart of the project and the decade long court proceedings over land tenure was testament to this fact.

Prior to the commencement of the project a colleague (who has a long-standing relationship with the community) and I flew to Broome to further tease out the project brief. The discussions carried out over a number of meetings. The bounds between work and play were blurred but much was exchanged in these discussions. It was clear that the very real issue confronting Minyrr Park was the expanding urban development of the Broome township, a situation that was untenable for the community. It appeared that they had tried a number of tactics in defence of the land including calling it a ‘park’ rather than just Minyrr, its traditional name, thus giving the land a recognisable status in the eyes of the town. The fact that the boundaries of Minyrr park were different on various maps and according to different people indicated that this park was a contested territory. Another tactic employed to protect the park from urban encroachment seemed to involve giving Minyrr Park a recognisable purpose. A suggestion was made by the community that the RMIT students could design an indigenous youth camp in the park for locals to be exposed to traditional practices. This would give the park an explicit purpose which at the time was perceived by some as vacant land. Whist it was apparent that the camp would offer the community a useful facility, from an educational perspective it seemed this project was inappropriate for white urban middle class students to design a camp for aboriginal kids and it also avoided the political context of the park. This was my reading of the principle that “indigenous knowledge systems and processes must be respected.” Whilst this was my interpretation of respecting their processes and systems it did not necessarily align with the individuals with whom we were in conversation.

It seemed that what the RMIT students could offer to the project was ‘new eyes’ a fresh insight into a situation that familiarity tends to overlooks. It was apparent to us that the township of Broome had turned its back on Minyrr Park. It was difficult to access on public transport for the locals and was not part of the international tourist itinerary. It appeared that if the indigenous community bought into the terms of mainstream Broome where the town was developed into neat easily consumerable packages it undermined the very potential of the park and risked becoming like everywhere. In its ‘undeveloped’ state it offered locals and tourists an experience not already in proximity to the town. Reading between the lines the problem from the community’s perspective was not with Minyrr park, but with the relationship between the park and the town which was ever expanding. Through negotiation the studio question was framed as ‘how can we redesign Minyirr park without changing the park itself?’ This speculative question problematised the town rather than the park. This question was underwritten by the political context and seemed to be a challenging issue for the students as well as address the broader issues of concern to the community. It did not, however, progress the projects already proposed for Minyrr Park.

The brief required that students propose physical changes to the landscape of the town though transport, infrastructure and public space which fundamentally reconstructed or altered the relationship of the town to the park. Whilst these ideas were greatly received by the community at the presentation three weeks after arrival, it was not clear whether the brief was ‘mutually understood’ as explicitly stated by the guidelines, “Consultation and negotiation should achieve mutual understanding about the proposed research” before the project commenced. This project draws on a point made by Till “It is not a matter of attempting to find consensus among these competing positions, but of using one’s judgement to make best sense of them.” The project brief was an attempt to make the best sense, whilst in this case it proved to work, there was a leap into the unknown.

**Processes for exchange**

A number of mechanisms were put in place to meet the requirement that “Researchers must accept a degree of Indigenous community input and control of the research process.”

The project was structured in relation to the community’s request that all students and

---

6 AIATSIS Guidelines for Ethical Research in Indigenous Studies ‘Guideline 4’.
7 AIATSIS Guidelines for Ethical Research in Indigenous Studies ‘Guideline 3’.
8 Till ‘Negotiations of Hope’ p 40.
9 AIATSIS Guidelines for Ethical Research in Indigenous Studies ‘Guideline 1’.
lecturers must undertake the nine day trail. This 'trail' is an annual event, whereby a local aboriginal family lead a 90 kilometre walk on their traditional land. This trail begins at Minyirr park. It provided the students with an insight into other ways of knowing country but is also had a counter effect that many students returned from the walk with a romance for the traditional life. Whilst the trail deflected from the studio agenda in some ways it did demonstrate our willingness to take the time and effort to learn about the their culture.

The students' assessment was also geared to the community. Whilst we were in Broome the community was positioned as the client in relationship to the project, thus privileging the community's reading of the project over the lecturer's. The students were therefore required to develop their work towards the community rather than any preconceived idea of what is normally expected at RMIT. They were assessed in their ability to communicate their ideas to the community and in their capacity to engage with the feedback through the development of their ideas.

During the weeks either side of 'the trail' the community initiated a number of gatherings. These involved doing things and spending time over talking about the project. The initial briefing, for example, occurred in Minyirr park and involved a walk in the park. Scratched legs and burnt noses, the students emerged three hours later with a new born respect for the extents of the site and the intimacy that the community have with this land. During their time in Broome, the students seemed to be simultaneously frustrated by the vagueness and unpredictable nature of the meetings and also profoundly inspired. This disruption of our usual ways allowed space for another way of learning, one of direct experience rather than intellectualising, it got us out of our heads and into the landscape.

During the rest of the time not spent with the community the studio group consulted with the various stakeholders including the other communities, town folk, local government, tourists and developers. There was a feeling of discontent from some members of the community, as though the students weren't spending enough time with them. This reaction may in part have been a consequence of the lack of clarity about the brief but it also may have been that the process was not carried out as expected or as they had experienced in the past with Outreach Australia. This studio had deliberately been set up differently to earlier models, whereby students were encouraged to imbed themselves in the community, to become more akin to family than a consultant relationship. This project required the students to straddle a number of perspectives, including that of the community. Whilst the students were required to take a position on the project they were not expected to take sides. This approach had direct implications on the project in terms of the ethics guidelines as the issue of community expectation is raised in the guidelines, "The community's expectations... should be in agreement..." and at times we were unclear if this was the case. The expectations of all parties were unsettled ultimately all parties were required to extend themselves beyond their preconceptions.

**Presentation of ideas**

It was agreed at the outset that the community would participate as critics to give feedback on the student work before returning to Melbourne. This enabled a forum for exchange and it also required the community to participate in a conventional educational mode. The broader Broome community were invited, including the local government but they did not attend. The presentation occurred the day before departure in Minyirr park; think heat, red earth and a rudimentary shade structure. The students were required to present their proposals for rethinking the relationship between the township and Minyrr park. The drawings were pared back to a single idea addressing the relation between Minyrr and Broome. Much of the excess often included in presentations was edited in preference for clarity and directness. It was a leap of faith for the students to present only three diagrams but as the community responded with sharp and useful feedback, it was clear that the drawings had done their job. This exchange was extremely productive for students and it seemed at this point both parties realised the value of the project.

It also seemed that the value of the project was realised for community at this point because they verbally expressed gratitude and became more keenly involved with the project afterwards. It was only at this point, and not before, that a real basis for exchange was established. The positive outcome at presentation would have been unlikely if the

---

10 AIATSIS Guidelines for Ethical Research in Indigenous Studies 'Guideline 8'.
project relied on a clearly negotiated brief at the start.

It was agreed before departure that the students would develop their projects in light of the comments and these were sent to Broome for feedback. This was driven by the desire to maintain a relationship as outlined by the guideline, "The responsibility for consultation and negotiation is ongoing." The production of the work for comment required an effort from the students which was more than might have been expected in other studios but the intention was to continue the dialogue. Unfortunately we received no comments directly from the community. We learned the hard lesson of the importance of face-to-face negotiation. Ultimately the document was useful for us as a record but useless to them.

Whilst nothing was built something was made in this project. Even though at the time we thought the aim of the project were the project outcomes, in retrospect it was about building relationships with the inherent challenges of negotiating with community and across cultures. Perhaps the focus on outcomes eclipses the possibility for human exchange.

Conclusion

The question of ethics arises in all consultant relationships but working across cultures the process becomes more opaque. Working across cultures necessarily involves an extension beyond an existing knowledge base and makes it difficult for architects/designers "to cling to the certainty of what they know rather than the uncertainty of what others may know," as Till Points out. One of the benefits of working in a cross cultural context is that guidelines such as the AIATSIS ethics guidelines oblige designers to give due consideration to process and the complexities that arise on the way. Spector answers his question "How might embracing one’s uneasiness affect the ethical dilemmas of the architect?" suggesting that "architects might find comfort in understanding that unease is an inherent part of their role." He acknowledges the precarious nature of the decisions involved in a design process and questions the idea that the path to an ethical practice is smooth. This paper offers an alternative narrative on design in cross-cultural context, one that focuses on processes of exchange rather than the products of design. Where the ambiguous and uncertain moments are included in the story. Where practice becomes a process of adjusting through reflection. It appears though for designers to find comfort in one’s unease requires an unsettling of disciplinary tendencies, a willingness to own up to failures as much as successes and to inhabit the uneasy terrain of reflection. Margo Huxley, a social scientist, suggests that reflective practice is at odds with professional disciplines. She says that

"In so far as there is reflective, critical and socially aware discussion taking place about environmental and urban design issues, it generally comes from geography, sociology, urban studies...in other words, academic disciplines that have not yet become the terrain of professional territorial claims."

While Huxley’s pessimism is grounded in reality perhaps the cross over between academia and practice offers another paradigm within which reflection can occur. If this happens within Universities it might leak into the profession.

---

13 AIATSIS Guidelines for Ethical Research in Indigenous Studies 'Guideline 2'.
14 Spector The Ethical Architect p 21.
15 Huxley Escaping the Culture; Landscape Architecture and the Praxes of Empowerment p 35
References:


Designing Risk into the Design Studio

Peter Hedley, Dr Dianne Smith, David Fermer
Queensland University of Technology, Brisbane, AU

In 2006, course structures were standardized across the Faculty of Built Environment and Engineering. As a consequence, a number of changes were required, including the time available to teach interior design being reduced from six to four hours per week. We were driven to seek an alternative to the traditional ‘studio based’ learning model even if it involved risk. Using an intensive experience-based learning process, a new Learning and Teaching Model combined information and ideas with planned experiences. Action research is integral to the Model. Outcomes include highly engaged students, group ownership of content and teaching amongst the staff, and a transparency of course content that offers all parties common ground from which to discuss changes and improvements. The Model facilitates student-directed learning. The first year design units outlined are a useful vehicle to identify and discuss the risks involved in embracing change within the university context. The aim of this paper is to identify risks and to propose a process to manage risk embedded in innovations. The Model also offers a successful alternative to the traditional project-based studio format, and could be adopted to any of the design disciplines.

Introduction
How do contemporary academics respond to critical changes such as restructuring in universities? The options include: to resist such changes, to modify our known practices the best we can, or to rethink our positioning and what it is we are truly trying to achieve. All alternatives involve risk – professionally and personally.
This paper will discuss the introduction of a new teaching strategy for Interior Design university students and will outline the risks. The Interior Design Learning and Teaching Model (the Model) used in this paper reveals the risks confronting the academic, and also, offers a successful alternative to the traditional project based studio format that could be adopted in any of the design disciplines. A process to manage change that will assist other academics to drive innovations in their programs is proposed.
In response the University and Faculty restructure, the Model sought to explicitly
address the need for change. The Interior Design staff chose to see change as an opportunity.

Our learning and teaching strategies were remodelled to address two key issues which are becoming more significant for us as academics each year in respect to student engagement and learning. Firstly, contemporary Australian universities have reduced resources. This has impacted on funding at a unit level, the number of staff, and available teaching aids. For example, over the last few years, studio staff student ratios have increased from 1:12 to 1:17 and hours of contact reduced from seven in year one Interior Design to four, while student intake has been rising from approximately fifty students to the high eighties in 2006 (and well over a hundred in 2007). Secondly, the differences among contemporary students with regard to age, work commitment, learning styles, and attitudes are much greater than in the past. The old and tested ways of delivering and engaging with a discipline, and other substantive areas of knowledge, are being stretched to the point where they are in danger of being ineffective, and in some cases, irrelevant.

It was essential to re-evaluate and redesign our approach within the Interior Design undergraduate program, rather than simply adapting and refining our existing strategies. The approach to curricula development was action learning where theory is discovered in a first hand manner while engaging with relevant activities. As Gibbs states, "learner activity is a key factor in encouraging a deep approach" to learning. Although students entered a pre-designed unit; that is, one which was carefully structured so the objectives, content, and activities were fully integrated, their feedback was sought continually throughout the year. This also formed the basis of an action research project.

This paper will briefly outline the aim of redesigning the curriculum and the resultant Model. This will be followed by a discussion of potential risks embedded in this strategy to cope with change. Suggestions for how to address these risks are outlined. Although not prescriptive, the strategy is described to assist others to respond to change.

1 Wilson and Fowler ‘Assessing the impact...’ p 90.

1.0 Aims: To Improve Student Learning and Staff Teaching

The challenge, and the risk, was to best engage with students, while engaging the students more productively in their learning. Through discussions with full-time and sessional academic staff, we brainstormed how to reduce our face to face teaching from six hours a week to four hours a week as directed without losing our passion for teaching and without the students losing their passion for learning.

A new strategy was obviously needed. Our concerns were: Will this work? How can we get this to work? What if the students cannot adapt to a different approach? Will they be able to apply the new approach to project work in a self directed manner? Modern students’ everyday environments are largely fast-paced, multi-tasked and largely electronic; for example, split screens on television, news bulletins, information programs, infomercials, text messaging, and so on. As Henry Jenkins states: "A teenager, doing homework, may juggle four or five windows, scanning the web, listening to and downloading MP3 files, chatting with friends, word-processing a paper, and responding to e-mail, shifting rapidly between tasks." We questioned and tested different scenarios. The breakthrough came with a model that would mimic the students’ fast-paced environment. This model became the basis for our new teaching approach, and complemented the students’ everyday experiences.

2.0 The Model

No lectures were given. The weekly studio was divided into four sessions, or teaching areas; each being a core aspect of designing. The content was delivered via the initial
three as interactive tutorial sessions; each focussing on a particular aspect of one content theme per week. The academic staff rotated through each of the three tutorial groups, facilitating the specific exercise related to the weekly theme. This approach enabled the student, in a very focussed way, to engage more deeply in this core material.

As the Model has been described in detail in another paper, a brief overview is presented here. The three interactive strands were Environment, Process, and Communication. Theory was put into practice during the first three strands; through 50 minute exercises, which engaged students with key content material from three distinct and different viewpoints, and allowed them to learn by integrating their own personal methods. Each strand focused on a particular aspect of designing to assist the student to engage deeply. These three aspects are:

- **Environment Strand:** an introduction to the importance of the environment (natural then built) to design. The ability to identify, critique, describe, and represent these was the focus.
- **Process Strand:** an introduction and exploration of the techniques, issues and modes of thinking, commonly used when designing. Relevant theory was introduced to facilitate the exercises. The focus was on the process, not on the completed work.
- **Communication Strand:** an introduction to a variety of techniques of visual communication in the context of design and the process of critical design thinking.

The final session was the Consolidation session during which the information gained from the interactive strands is integrated. Its aim is to foster a deep understanding of the weekly topic area, to integrate the interactive strands, and to clarify anything from the previous sessions, projects being undertaken, and the like.

A Guidebook which contains the theory and the weekly tutorial activities was prepared for each unit. This Guidebook provided the conceptual framework and operational structure for the students and staff. In preparation for the weekly studio sessions, the students needed to engage with the theory in a self-directed and pro-active manner. Because the Guidebook presented the relevant content for the weekly strands within a broader theoretical description, students could potentially contextualise their weekly exercise. The student and staff engaged proactively with the material in a relevant and productive way. The Guidebook enhanced student learning and functioned as a reference tool; its format also supported the structure of the new strands. It contains the theoretical material, a weekly breakdown of activities, their projects, a bibliography, and a glossary of terms. It contextualised theory with practice.

Further, students could revisit past concepts in new situations, forward plan to develop the design projects by applying and developing key concepts, and integrate substantive knowledge to the new situations presented. The learning occurs through focused engagement with material, which in turn is seen as a resource to be critically selected, reviewed, and interrogated through the activities. The design of the accompanying Guidebook is therefore critical to encourage visually-orientated design students to access it in a meaningful way.

The project became a logical outcome of the five to six weeks’ exercises and captured the student’s integrated understandings. Also, it gave students an immediate opportunity to apply the knowledge gained through the studio exercises. The amount of tutor to student tutorial time was also significantly reduced, although an increase in the standard of the final projects was evident.

Successful outcomes from the Model included:

- building confidence in the majority of the students, enabling them to readily embrace the activities and to experiment and participate (as demonstrated by their willingness to a) readily commence activities, b) discuss outcomes, c) actively seek and contribute pertinent aspects within a few weeks of commencing the unit and d) produce tangible outcomes identified in the weekly tutorial worksheets in class);
- exposing students to their own process and its outcomes, thereby normalising interaction, generating ideas, and exploration;
- exposing students to others’ work, enabling them to peer-teach and to learn with the potential result being an increased understanding and better outcomes;
- enabling students to also develop better group skills and improved interaction as many exercises were done in pairs, teams,
or individually at tables where others were also creating or exploring issues; an unforeseen outcome from their learning experiences via these weekly exercises was a removal of the traditional students' focus on end results (marks) rather than process; and, the often seen habit of hiding away to produce a scheme on hand-in day, in the traditional model, was not evident here.

Academic and Teaching Risks
All available Interior Design staff were involved in the Model's development over the previous twelve months. Acceptance of the Model was a collective decision, however, every staff member brought their own understandings and experiences of design, education, teaching and learning relationships, and curriculum design to the studio.

Herein lies the risk. Many of these personal constructs may be implicit, and therefore, not needing to be expressed or dealt with consciously until confronted by a new situation. The change to the Interior Design course provides such a situation. Therefore, a number of specific issues will now be described through a narrative outlining the evolution of the first year design units. In association, the generic issues pertaining to risk will be discussed in relation to aspects identified in the education literature. These identified aspects will potentially assist in the development of new units, and more broadly, inform strategies to deal with change in university program and to assist the management of risk.

Stage 1: Initial Risks Identified
Discussions among staff regarding operationalising the new system involved the following issues:

Would full time academic staff be willing to commit to writing a Guidebook for each new semester?

Would the tutors embrace the new system, and be willing to teach the same topic three times each week?

Would each tutor be willing to commit to sharing the management, and the understanding of what was to happen on a week by week basis?

Should the tutors become facilitators, and not teachers?

Academic freedom and commitment: The balance between an academic's autonomy and the requirements of a strong and discipline-based structure is raised through the above questions. Freedom can be viewed as free from intrusion and/or the ability to engage. Tight defines academic freedom as:

- the freedom of the individuals to study, teach, research, and publish without being subject, or causing undue interference...an acceptance by academics of the need to encourage openness and flexibility in academic work, and of their accountability to each other and to society in general.

The risk for the academic, in this case, is that the explicit structure requires a commitment to comply with the fundamental principles and to contribute to the development of associated resources. This may be interpreted by the academic as an imposition and that other aspects may need to be reprioritized or their value reassessed as a result.

Therefore, a sense of belonging to the discipline and the unit is important at the onset. The staff teaching in the two first year design units discussed here, achieved this end through constant reflection and exchange. It is also highlighted in Viskovic's literature survey of teaching and educational development, academics are appointed as content experts and often teach in isolation. The Model provides opportunities for informal learning, modelling of teaching, and mentorship. The balance between freedom and personal development is assisted by a sense of belonging and ability to contribute openly in the new design units in our course.

We also identified that there would be a necessary fragmentation of teaching inherent in the way the new curriculum was conducted due to the three strands and the pace of the group work. A different relationship with students is required. The removal of the traditional one to one project tutorial raised questions about 'getting to know' students in the new self-directed, activity based studio situation. Tutors are challenged to avoid helping students in the normal 'one on one' studio situation.

Lecturer-Student Relationships: A closely directed studio allows the lecturer to develop control and often power based relationships with the students. Associated with the design studio is the ability to spend time with each

---

4 Akerlind & Kayrooz 'Understanding academic freedom.'
5 Tight cited, Akerlind & Kayrooz 'Understanding academic freedom' p 328.
6 Viskovic 'Becoming a tertiary teacher.'
student as the 'expert' working with the student toward resolving a scheme. There is a risk in this relationship of co-dependency where the student depends on the lecturer for knowledge while the lecturer enjoys contributing directly to the work and the student's learning.

Research into adult learning, indicates that adults if provided with meaningful learning situations are more engaged. "Adult learners are known to require meaningful learning experiences... [and] vital involvement in one's world as opposed to the spurious flirtations of youth." In addition, as Oliver and Morrison state:

It is important that students are socialised from the beginning of their tertiary studies into active, involved modes of learning which will maximise both understanding of material and an acceptance or personal responsibility for one's own learning... [and] 'empower students to take control of their own learning.'

Contemporary students need to deal with multiple sources of information rapidly and discriminately. This ability was fostered by staff acting as facilitators of the structure and associated processes, while empowering the student to source and navigate the information in the companionship of their peers. The three theories of teaching that underpin academic practice proposed by Ramsden — that is, transmitting, organising knowledge actively and can then apply this knowledge to a project in a self directed manner. Interactive engagement methods are defined by Ahlfedt et al. as "those designed to gain a conceptual understanding through heads-on (always) and hands-on (usually) activities that result in immediate feedback with peers and instructors." Activities that promote engagement, and therefore influence learning, include "active learning, involvement in enriching educational experiences, seeking guidance from staff and students." By dividing content into two themes delivered via three strands, which represent key aspect of designing, directed intensity was ensured. McClenney identifies five benchmarks which "encompass 38 'engagement items' and 'that reflect many of the most important aspects of the student experience' in her article, 'Redefining Quality in Community Colleges: Focusing on Good Educational Practice.' All five have been seen to be addressed in the current Model. These are defined as: Active and Collaborative Learning; Student Effort; Academic Challenge; Student-Faculty Interaction; and Support for Learners. The Model explained in this paper was designed to allow students to be actively involved in their education; to have opportunities to think about and apply what they are learning to different settings; to collaborate "with others in solving problems or in mastering challenging content;" contribute significantly to their learning through effort; to adapt learning to variety of means to explore content; are challenged intellectually and creatively — all being aspects of the five benchmarks described by McClenney. In contrast, student-academic contact has increased compared to the traditional studio mode, not through one-to-one contact, but instead, because students are actively

10 Ahlfedt et al 'Measurement and analysis of student engagement...' p 5.
12 Coates 'The value of student engagement for higher education quality assurance' p 26.
13 McClenney 'Redefining Quality in Community Colleges' p 18.
14 McClenney 'Redefining Quality in Community Colleges' p 19.
present with their peers throughout the studio session in the company of the academics. Traditionally, in a studio one to one critique sessions are allotted to a student or project team with a staff member (an expert designer); and as resources are reduced and student numbers increase the time may be reduced to 10-15 minutes with little additional time for the academic to roam and engage more freely with the class as a whole. Therefore, under the Model students are in the presence of academics and peer feedback throughout the sessions rather than for a short personal critique. As a consequence, they are potentially more likely to “learn effectively and to persist toward achieving their educational goals.” The smaller classes (groups) enabled through the strands, are also important in fostering a sense of belonging and engagement. In addition, students have been more likely to attend the entire four hour studio.

Stage 2: Further Staff Concerns as the Units Unfolded

After deciding the new program would work, we wrote the Guidebooks for semesters 1 and 2, 2006, with the aid of a Teaching and Learning Grant from the Faculty, which allowed us to employ a research assistant to commence gathering information. New Guidebooks will be written for each of the new units introduced until 2009. Thereafter, only updating will need to be done. By then, staff will be familiar with the Model, and only a brief examination and refinement of the material will be necessary before each studio.

Although having decided to proceed, the interior design academics involved in course development were initially uncertain about the new model; and members had to keep reassuring each other that it would work. Some responses were:

- Should we have more one-on-one tutoring before each project?
- Let’s see what happens in the first project, before going any further.
- I can’t see a positive result unless we have more personal contact with the students.

We should wait and see what happens.

Trust and dealing with ambiguity and uncertainty: The above comments demonstrate the need for commitment and trust to avoid undermining the potential of new ideas and structures. Possibly the most important aspect that came to the fore, was the respect for each other’s input, opinions, and professional experience. As a group, we needed to hold our resolve, to regard the new model as a challenge. This resolve resulted in its success. It is, therefore, important to consider trust (building trust and trusting others) in two situations; in relation to the academic team and in relation to the students as learners. Bartel discusses the work of Dewey, Kamii, and Bower to demonstrate how trust is integral to learning communities. For example, the teacher needs to believe:

- what the classroom represents and its vibrancy and enjoyment for learners can be maintained;
- that the aim of education is autonomy, independent learners with dispositions for lifelong learning;
- knowledge is co-constructed;
- the learning community is a place built on fairness, freedom of expression, and responsibility;
- is about connectedness and relationships; and
- where one values and sincerely appreciates diversity in many forms.

In the team developing the overall structure for Interior Design, and in particular, the design units discussed in this paper, these same characteristics were evident as we operated as a community of learners in our own right. However, it also flags the need to address at an organisational level, these same issues when new staff is employed, or others are new to the system or feel they are unable to take responsibility to understand the intricacies in a self-directed manner.

Another potential problem was time management. We needed to understand and accept that each member of the team had other commitments, which made it difficult to find the time needed to allow dynamic development within such a strong substantive and procedural structure. An essential part of the model was matching staff expertise, knowledge and interests across the strands, and ensuring that each week’s content was understood and delivered in a cohesive, stimulating environment. In essence, we were challenged to bring individual flexibility into a set structure, and allow each tutor to

15 McClenney ‘Redefining Quality in Community Colleges’ p 19.
16 Bartel ‘Learning Communities’ pp 151-152.
bring their own individual thinking into each strand each week.

**Team work and collaboration:** These issues question the balance between an individual academic and their responsibilities to the team and to their own personal career development. This juncture provides opportunities for both the structure and the individual to be challenged, and therefore, both to be managed. Dall’Alba highlights that when the familiar is made unfamiliar, we can reflect on our practice and opportunities to transform the self arise;\(^\text{17}\) the transformation involving the integration of ‘knowing, acting and being.’\(^\text{18}\) She also notes how belonging to a community who is committed to student learning enables exposure to new ideas, confidence to discuss education, opportunities to interrogate and reflect upon teaching practice, access to colleagues as resources, and to ‘transform ways of being university teachers.’\(^\text{19}\)

In light of this observation, it is also important to recognise that differences in personal objectives and level of willingness to truly collaborate may arise. Barskey and Woods have identified a number of influences that determine if staff and students will confront points of conflict within universities. These are: the perceived length of a relationship, cost-benefit analysis of action and outcomes, resignation to situation, expectation of natural resolution, withdrawal from conflict as a norm, lack of confidentiality, indecision, being quiet, and non-confronting personalities. Some degree of conflict is inevitable and depending on how it is handled will influence the team’s success. In the design units the openness and unwillingness to be respectful while honest lead to its success.

In order to manage change and create a sense of belonging to a team, which is building a unit or course framework, it is necessary to foster an environment that promotes belonging, a place to express doubts and anxieties, and an ability to discuss ideas and reach agreed directions or at least an agreed willingness to openly ‘go with the flow’ to see what will happen through respect for the team and objectives.

**4:0 Risk Strategies Adopted in the New Roles**

---

\(^\text{17}\) Dall’Alba ‘Improving teaching’ p 366.

\(^\text{18}\) Dall’Alba ‘Improving teaching’ p 367.

\(^\text{19}\) Dall’Alba ‘Improving teaching’ p 367.
foster trust and resolve to deal with ambiguity through discussion and reflection and a willingness to proactively learn as-you-go;
mismatch staff expertise, knowledge and interests across the strands;
ensure that each week’s content was understood by the relevant staff member (and the rest of the unit team) and delivered in a cohesive, stimulating environment; and
enable individual flexibility into the set structure and strands each week.

And in regard to students:
  discuss and design ways to empower students to take control of their own learning as part of the curriculum design process;
  encourage students to source and navigate information and activities in the companionship of their peers;
  incorporate activities that promote engagement, and therefore, influences learning;
  increase student-academic contact through student active involvement, and therefore, high level of attendance throughout the studio; and
  restructure large groups into smaller classes (groups) spatially to foster a sense of belonging and engagement.

As stated previously, in the future we also need to address (at an organisational and operational level) these same issues when:

new staff are employed,
others are new to the system, and/or
a staff member feels he or she is unable to take responsibility to understand and embrace the intricacies in a self-directed manner.

CONCLUSION

Is risk worth taking? All six staff and the vast majority of the eighty students involved in design would definitely say yes. Although a number of risks have clearly been identified in the paper, the strategies identified in Section 4.0 do suggest successful integration of the Model can occur through sensitive and reflective curriculum design.

However, it is important to remember that new courses or program structures, such as the units outlined in this paper, are examples of change, and therefore, need to be managed accordingly. As Dall’Alba has pointed out in regard to being a university teacher:

While transformation of the self can be liberating and empowering, it is often fraught with uncertainty and some degree of anxiety. For example, when a transmission model of teaching is called into question during the course, some participants can be excited and troubled by new possibilities for their educational practice. A challenge in the course is to both facilitate and support transformation in ways of being university teachers. ...[Our] teaching reflects not only our knowing and what we do, but also who we are as teachers.  

Dall’Alba ‘Improving teaching’ p 369.  

20
Acknowledgements

To the other academic staff (Michael Molloy, Alithea Egea, Carolyne Jackson) and the students of DTB101 Interior Design 1 and DTB201 Interior Design 2, School of Design, QUT, Australia.

References:


This paper uses the notion of risk in its exploration of the way the physical environment contributes to the production of social order. It does this by using a case of McDonald’s restaurant as a means of examining the way practices of domination are manifested through space. In this instance the spatial design of McDonald’s contributes to the perpetuation of acts of globalisation.

In this paper it is argued that using the spatial setting as a means of perpetuating the institutional order of globalisation involves great risk. This is because in order for McDonald’s to operate successfully and reinforce a moral code of conduct it relies, in part, on participants recognising and then misrecognising what the physical environment is attempting to do. That is, in order for McDonald’s to perpetuate a code of conduct founded on the principles of efficiency, predictability, calculability, and control great risk is taken in instituting this process throughout the physical domain. This is because it also relies upon a particular kind of environment to producing the global experience of ‘sameness’ in order to sustain economic growth. Thus, participants must willingly engage with a space that operates to ensure that “power is exercised and simultaneously disguised” through the experience of homogenisation.

In order to understand this set of relations the paper begins with a discussion about the way social order is produced and role of the built environment in this process. In this description the concept of symbolic violence, proposed by Bourdieu, is introduced to unpack the complex set of relations needed to sustain social order and the relevance of the spatial domain in this process. This provides an opportunity to highlight the importance of making the role of space in the production of social order explicit. The paper then uses McDonald’s as a case to tease out the role of the spatial setting in perpetuating the world order of globalisation. It also draws attention to the

---

1 Ritzer The McDonaldization of Society; Ritzer The McDonaldization of Society: An Investigation into the Changing Character of Contemporary Social Life; Ritzer, Explorations in the Sociology of Consumption: Fast food, Credit Cards and Casinos.

2 Bourdieu, Language and Symbolic Power, p 164

3 Bourdieu, Language and Symbolic Power.
complexities of diversifying from existing models of restaurant design and the risks
associated with deviating from the principle of 'standardisation' — so crucial to the
financial success of McDonald's. In conclusion the paper highlights the relevance of
this kind of discussion and the generation of new theories about the way the physical
environment contributes to the production of new world orders, as exemplified through
globalisation.

Introduction

McDonald's restaurant is taking large unprecedented risks through the built
environment. This is because the interior setting of McDonald's is where its patrons
are required to participate in everyday practices embedded in the social institution
of globalisation. For this process to operate with relative ease and maintain financial
growth the spatial domain must facilitate the experience of 'sameness' across the
globe. Ensuring this occurs also requires the built environment to perpetuate a set of
relations founded on domination and control. In order to understand this, a
discussion of a particular McDonald's restaurant is provided. This demonstrates
the significance of producing particular kinds of environments in the maintenance of
the new world order of globalisation.

By utilising the concepts of social order and symbolic violence it is possible to unpack
the way the social institution of globalisation is constructed at an everyday level and the role of the spatial setting in
this process. The site of McDonald's restaurant is used to explore this relationship and, more broadly,
demonstrate how organisations produce commonsense worlds and the risk associated
with explicitly using the built environment in this way. This business corporation takes
a great risk in constructing a particular kind of setting designed to homogenise
experience in order to remain intimately tied to the phenomenon of globalisation.

Social order: symbolic violence and the
built environment.

It is argued here that the production of a commonsense world is what lies at the
foundation of social order. This understanding is explained in the works of
(1991) who argues that this process is

possible because of the operation of
symbolic violence and the spatial domain is
one site where symbolic violence is often played out.1 In order to understand this
relationship this paper discusses the notion of a commonsense world and its connection
with social order. Then the concept of symbolic violence is introduced. Collectively, these offer an opportunity to
outline the role of space in the construction of a commonsense world.

Goffman2 describes the social world as an ongoing accomplishment. He is one theorist
who accounts for the way individuals and social structures attend to a 'public order' in
order to produce a commonsense world. He stresses that the existence of a powerful
cognitive and moral order at the level of everyday action accounts for the production
of social order. He is also adamant that the spatial domain is a key constituent in this
process. Goffman emphasises the necessity of unpacking the way space is embedded in
the production of a locally produced order. The existence of a locally produced order is
presented as a distinct domain in its own right and is known as 'the interaction
order'.1 This is different from traditional social theories because it emphasises the
way individuals and social structures attend to a 'public order' in order to produce a
commonsense social world. He refers to this procedure for viewing the world as the
dramaturgical model, which allows us to examine the role of space in everyday life
and the way daily practices are sustained. Understanding this relationship is very
important for interior designers.

The dramaturgical model also draws attention to the way social order is

1 Bourdieu, The Field of Cultural Production; Jerome,
An Examination of the Production of Social Order: A
Case of the Women's Refuge.
2 Goffman, The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life.
3 Goffman, Encounters.
bracketed by broader social institutions. It does not however, provide a means to describe the way social institutions contribute to the construction of this process. It is Bourdieu who provides a concept to unravel this system of relations. This concept is known as symbolic violence. This concept also offers a way to comprehend how the spatial domain facilitates the perpetuation of everyday practices and legitimises moral codes of conduct in order to maintain social order. Collectively, these provide a framework for designers to understand the reflexive relationships between micro and macro structures and the way a commonsense world is constantly navigated and the significance of space in this process.

In order to understand the significance of the concept of symbolic violence the following description of a reception room in a mental hospital is explored. This description describes the construction of a commonsense world and emphasises the significance of the spatial domain.

[The visiting room in some total institutions is important here. Both décor and conduct in these places are typically much closer to outside standards than are those that prevail in the inmate’s actual living quarters. The view of inmates that outsiders get thus helps to decrease the pressure these outsiders might otherwise bring to bear on the institution. It is a melancholy human fact that after a time all three parties – inmate, visitor, and staff – realize that the visiting room presents a dressed-up view, realize that the other parties realize this, too, and yet all tacitly agree to continue the fiction.]

In this instance, ‘the visiting room’ is effective because the social reality it depicts is recognised as fiction and then negotiated and misrecognised by participating members in order to produce a social world of commonsense. This is because there is more to be gained by sustaining this performance than fracturing it. The décor of the space, and subsequent conduct, help to construct the system of relations equating to misrecognition and symbolic violence. It is worth noting at this point that Bourdieu & Wacquant define these concepts and their interrelatedness as:

[s]ymbolic violence, to put it tersely and simply as possible, is the violence which is exercised upon a social agent with his or her complicity. … To say it more rigorously: social agents are knowing agents who, even when they are subjected to determinisms, contribute to producing the efficacy of that which determines them insofar as they structure what determines them. … I call misrecognitions the fact of recognizing a violence which is wielded precisely inasmuch as one does not perceive it as such. What I put under the term ‘recognition,’ then, is the set of fundamental, prereflective assumptions that social agents engage by the mere fact of taking the world for granted, of accepting the world as it is, and of finding it natural because their mind is constructed according to cognitive structures that are issued out of the very structures of the world.

The social and spatial relations of the visiting room described by Goffman, encapsulate the act of symbolic violence because they manage to sustain interaction and a continuance of the everyday. That is, the social and spatial relations of the visiting room operate to create a social reality at a local level that is recognised as fiction but reinterpreted by participants and misrecognised in order to manage a performance, construct a commonsense world and sustain social order. Therefore, the participants who partake in this act of symbolic violence sanction the practices of this institution as legitimate. In this instance, the spatial domain helps to guarantee the complicity of social relations and functioning of symbolic violence. This example demonstrates the way the spatial domain is embedded in practices of social control. It highlights that the built environment is a significant constituent in the perpetuation of practices of domination. It is also clear that the operational success of these practices is reliant upon participants recognising and then misrecognising what the physical environment is attempting to do. That is, in order for the mental hospital to perpetuate a code of conduct founded on relations of domination great risk is taken in instituting this process throughout the physical domain.

4 Jerome An Examination of the Production of Social Order; Rawls ‘The Interaction Order Sui Generis: Goffman’s Contribution to Social Theory’, Rawls ‘An Ethnomethodological Perspective on Social Theory’.
5 Goffman The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life p 102.

7 Bourdieu & Wacquant An Invitation to Reflexive Sociology p 168.
8 Bourdieu Outline of a Theory of Practice p 133.
Globalisation and the homogenising of experience

Globalisation is a worldwide phenomenon that has spread and colonised many areas of the world. It holds a very specific ideology that is based on the belief that human wellbeing is intimately tied to consumption. This ideology emphasises the importance of the volume and quality of goods and services in the achievement of personal happiness.\(^{13}\)

As a consequence of this worldwide adoption of an ideology founded on the accumulation of wealth, the instrumental trades of globalisation “opening up of trade, the emergent power of financial markets, the transnationalisation of corporations and international economic co-ordination”\(^{14}\) have been afforded a privileged place in the construction of everyday life. Activities and policies that promise an increase in the rate of economic growth in order to service the ideology of “consumption as the foundation lifestyle” are a priority and this prioritisation is re-enacted at a global and local level on a daily basis.\(^{15}\)

It is argued here that one of the methods that the phenomenon of globalisation relies upon to maintain its increasing presence in the construction of a commonsense world is the frequent inclusion of acts of symbolic violence. As previously discussed, these seduce people, to whatever degree, from

...having grievances by shaping their perceptions, cognitions and preferences in such a way that they accept their role in the existing order of things, either because they can see or imagine no alternative to it, or because they see it as natural and unchangeable, or because they value it as divinely ordained and beneficial.\(^{16}\)

As a mechanism of governance it enforces a new world order. Globalisation invites and engages with the production of homogenising experience in order to sustain a commonsense world that is largely underpinned by the “economics of profit rather than the economics of sociality.”\(^{17}\) The homogenisation of experience is what tends to drive the individual on the endless

---

9 Bourdieu Language and Symbolic Power p 164.
10 Jerome An Examination of the Production of Social Order.
12 Ritzer The McDonaldization of Society: The McDonaldization of Society (Revised Edition); Explorations in the Sociology of Consumption.
13 Hamilton The Triumph of Ideology: Environment’.
14 Hamilton The Triumph of Ideology: Environment’.
15 Hamilton The Triumph of Ideology: Environment’ p 199.
pursuit of consumption in anticipation of happiness. This kind of ritual becomes misrecognised as a positive form of progress and embodied as an acceptable way of engaging with everyday life because of its link with human wellbeing. This set of relations is what enables the ideology of globalisation and its affiliated practices to recreate and construct a commonsense world that rejoices in consumerism.

It is at the point of certain built spaces, which actively reproduce the phenomenon of globalisation, such as McDonald’s restaurant, that provides an opportunity to unpack the way the homogenisation of experience is maintained at a local level. These kinds of sites also highlight the way symbolic violence is embedded in the process of constructing a social institution.

In order to comprehend the way the spatial domain of McDonald’s encourages participants to partake in the ‘pursuit of happiness through consumption’ a description of one particular interior setting of McDonald’s is provided. As a result of this description it is then possible to describe the way the spatial domain is embedded in the production of a commonsense world.

The McDonald’s Experience

Upon entering McDonald’s you are greeted by a tiled floor of muted browns and earth tones. This formula is repeated on the vinyl panels that cover the wall to dado rail height. Deep blue laminate panels cover the wall to picture rail height. To the right of the entrance are waste disposal bins separated by bench seating at window sections. To the left of the entrance are two parallel rows of fixed rectangular tables with fixed stools. Along the back wall of the restaurant, bench seating invites larger groups to partake in the ritual of dining. Adjacent to this area are toilet facilities. These are serviced through an enclosed communal space, which is screened by glass doors. Dark blue vinyl covers all the seating and the table and bench tops are mottled brown granite.

Straight ahead of the entrance lies the service area. The counter is clear and the overhead signage is well illuminated with graphics displaying consumable items. To the rear of this service area is the food preparation section, barely visible behind the stainless steel kitchen items. Beside the service area is another section nominated for the provision of coffee, teas and condiments. On the granite bench is a display cabinet with cakes, muffins and sweet biscuits. Behind the counter the display signage shows imagery of coffee mugs, cakes and milkshakes. In this area the lighting is notably softer — engaging with downlights as opposed to the fluorescent lighting used elsewhere. Adjacent to this area and in the centre of the restaurant are armchairs used for seating around fixed lowest granite tables. A dividing low-set wall of dark blue vinyl tiles and glass mosaic panels of bronze and blue tiles delineates this section from the other ‘less cosy’ areas throughout the space. Dining areas have fixed tables and chairs and are located along the perimeter of the restaurant. Loud music from the local radio station is consistent throughout the space.

Streamlining activities through the positioning of fitted and unfitted furniture, defining zones through lighting and décor and minimising distracting design features, helps to achieve the operational principles of efficiency, predictability, calculability, and control that underpin McDonald’s restaurant. Collectively, these operate to ensure standardisation. In this context participants are required to participate in the consumption of standardised food in a standardised way in a standardised environment. As Robin Leider describes

McDonald’s pioneered the routinization of interactive service work and remains an exemplar of extreme standardization. Innovation is not discouraged … at least among managers and franchisees. Ironically, though, “the object is to look for new innovative ways to create an experience that is exactly the same no matter what McDonald’s you walk into, no matter where it is in the world.”

The success of this practice relies very heavily on the built environment. In most instances the interior setting operates to standardise the ‘act of dining’ and offers ‘sameness’ as a component of consumption and the pursuit of happiness. In the case described here this is managed through techniques such as providing a sterile backdrop and harsh lighting along with regimenting the arrangement of the furniture within an open plan that clearly delineates zones of activities such as; servicing area, eating area, toilet area. These design solutions ensure that the act of

---

18 Ritzer The McDonaldization of Society; The McDonaldization of Society (Revised Edition); Explorations in the Sociology of Consumption.
19 Leider p 82.
dining is a public event and because of this participants are encouraged to police their own actions as well as those of others in the pursuit of personal wellbeing. ²⁰ By engaging the built environment in this way and homogenising experience, participants are more likely to recognise and misrecognise this process as a good thing.

Arguably, the success of operations of McDonald's also requires participants to willingly, if only temporarily, acquire a set of dispositions to act and think in a local context whilst drawing upon global forms of cultural knowledge underpinned by the notion of homogenisation. Participants must recognise and then misrecognise what the physical environment is attempting to do in order to perpetuate codes of conduct founded on the economics of profit and the maintenance of social order. In order for McDonald’s to perpetuate these great risk is taken in instituting this process through the physical domain. This is partially because it relies on participants willingly engaging with a space that operates to maintain relations of domination and control. McDonald’s also takes a great risk in this procedure because it veers away from traditional corporate business strategies of diversification. ²¹ That is, whilst McDonald’s recognises that ‘diversity’ is a key method in managing risk, evidence suggests that comprehending the extent of diversification manifest in the built environment is crucial for maintaining economic security. This is because all forms of ‘diversity’ do not guarantee the homogenisation of experience.

As demonstrated, one of the ways McDonald’s manages to seduce its patrons into misrecognising that the homogenisation of experience is a good thing is through the inclusion of design outcomes such as an efficient thoroughfare, predictable seating arrangements and easily identifiable and accessible service areas that ensure a locally produced order is maintained. It is important that these characteristics remain consistent in McDonald’s settings to sustain movement and the commonsense world it manufactures for economic profit. Across the globe the spatial domain and the practice of the homogenisation of experience facilitates processes of standardisation to ensure that the phenomenon of globalisation is entrenched on a daily basis.

Clearly the space of McDonald’s is about producing a financial profit. Interestingly however, more recent developments in the use of theme-ing in these restaurants raises important questions about just how much the physical environment can tolerate before the homogenisation of experience is fractured and locally produced order is jeopardised. It is Bryman ²² who draws attention to the negative effects of certain theme-ing techniques that often create carnival-like atmospheres employed by some McDonald’s restaurants dotted around the globe. He argues that theme-ing “becomes a means of reducing the sense of sameness and thereby enhancing the appeal of its products.” ²³ What is significant is that themed restaurants have experienced financial difficulties since employing this technique. ²⁴ This suggests that theme-ing does not ensure that participants are more likely to consume goods and services from McDonald’s because ‘experiencing homogenisation’ does not under-pin codes of conduct aligned with the settings of these restaurants. Because of this kind of diversification the process of standardisation is not secured and subsequently no longer sufficient in attending to the ‘production of a profit.’ It is at the point of space that this relationship falters. Arguably, therefore, employing design theme-ing techniques to provide entertainment whilst engaging in acts of dining disrupts the codes of conduct generally assigned with McDonald’s. In this instance the built environment does not contribute to the disguise of acts intent on dehumanising experiences and presenting them as beneficial in daily life. The inclusion of theme-ing, which serves as a distraction to the underlying intent of the space and no longer creates a social reality that presents consumption as an acceptable vehicle to happiness, is a risky business if McDonald’s is to participate in the field of “economics of profit not the economics of sociality.” ²⁵ The corporate business strategy of using the built environment to minimise diversification is a crucial business method. This strategy must recognise how the spatial

²⁰ Ritzer The McDonaldization of Society (Revised Edition) p 126
²¹ Laux ‘Integrating Corporate Risk’; ‘Corporate Risk Management: Real Options and Financial Hedging’.
²² Bryman ‘McDonald’s as a Disneyized institution: Global implications’. ²³ Bryman ‘McDonald’s as a Disneyized institution’ p 159 ²⁴ Bryman ‘McDonald’s as a Disneyized institution’ p 160 ²⁵ Bourdieu Practical Reason.
domain can produce ‘sameness’ and respond to cultural design trends in order to guarantee the maintenance of relations intent on reproducing codes of conduct underpinning the social institution of globalisation.

What is interesting is that the sameness of the facilities and the activities it generates is compatible to participants willing to partake in the belief that consumption equates with personal happiness. This relationship suggests that participants are content to misrecognise the way the built environment maintains the ideology of globalisation. This is important. It is proposed that this process of misrecognition is recognised by the vast majority of participants who choose to participate in this social world and conform to the actions the space prescribes. This is because there is more to be gained by sustaining and interacting in this locally produced world according to the dominant commonsense understandings of it, than by disputing it.

As demonstrated at the site of McDonald’s restaurant, it is a certain kind of physical environment that perpetuates the homogenisation of experience in order to drive consumers to consume more and more in the pursuit of happiness. This kind of experience is misrecognised as a significant aspect in achieving a lifestyle of personal wellbeing. This is how symbolic violence comes to be reflexively related to the built environment and the way it is embedded in the construction of the institutional structure of globalisation.

Discussion
In this instance a particular spatial domain of McDonald’s restaurant is explored because it is representative of the significance of space in the reproduction and perpetuation of acts pertaining to globalisation. Like Goffman’s discussion of the interaction order and the mechanisms that maintain social order, this paper explores the way McDonald’s employs the spatial domain in the construction of a commonsense world and the production of globalisation. It is only through a detailed observation of the locally produced order that it is possible to comprehend the precision McDonald’s requires in producing a setting that institutes a particular code of conduct in order to maximise consumption and maximise profit. It is only through an investigation of the daily operations of a particular McDonald’s restaurant that it is possible to understand the reflexive relationship between space and symbolic violence and social order.

As demonstrated, the spatial design plays a very important role in maintaining the global principles of calculability, control, efficiency, and predictability aligned with McDonald’s financial success. Employer training, the same equipment, back-lit menus, formula food and beverages are constant. Although the built environment responds to cultural design trends it constantly and strategically cloaks acts of symbolic violence by employing a variety of generic design features associated with the act of dining in order to homogenise experience. What is interesting in this case is that when McDonald’s employs the strategy of ‘diversification’ to the built environment it runs the risk of no longer cloaking the processes of symbolic violence that are in operation to maintain the reproduction of the social institution of globalisation. Demystifying these cloaking processes through the built environment does not minimize risk.

Ritzer notes that the kinds of ‘cloaking processes’ employed by McDonald’s on an everyday level tend to disenchant the world; they have a wide range of dehumanizing effects on people as workers and consumers as well as on human relationships; and they tend to have an homogenizing effect that often serves to make life far less interesting and exciting. By deliberately employing techniques that focus action on the activity dining consumers are seduced into consuming more and more in the hope of acquiring happiness. What has been demonstrated here is that a particular kind of spatial setting is a crucial component in the operational success of McDonald’s. That is, the spatial domain is a key constituent in the successful operation of this global company, which strategically aligns itself with the ideology that consumption is intimately tied to personal wellbeing.

---

26 Goffman Encounters.

27 Illouz and John, Global habitus, local stratification, and symbolic struggles over identity.

through the experience of homogenisation. In order to ensure that this ideology is produced at a local level the homogenisation of experience is introduced, operationalised and maintained throughout the built environment. It is emphasised that McDonald’s restaurant takes great risk in perpetuating the social institution of globalisation in this way because it relies very heavily on particular kinds of built environments to do this. Specifically, it minimises risk in this area by ensuring realms of activities are clearly delineated and that dining is a public event whilst injecting subtle forms of design diversification relevant to cultural trends. These processes of standardisation are reflected in and through the built environment. As demonstrated when design diversification disrupts the experience of ‘sameness’ this commonsense world struggles to sustain itself. This is because the likelihood of experiencing homogenisation is reduced, which decreases the possibility of participants misrecognising what the restaurant is about and therefore disputing the apparent ‘order of things’.

Conclusion
The relevance of understanding the way the built environment contributes to the construction of a commonsense world and production of social order is demonstrated through an exploration of one setting of McDonald’s restaurant. Undertaking this kind of examination and unpacking the layers of everyday life reveals the significance of the built environment in the construction of social institutions like globalisation. In this instance McDonald’s restaurant is used as a case study to comprehend the way the spatial domain reinforces acts that impose meaning and legitimise actions founded on “the ideology of growth and consumer capitalism in the pursuit of personal happiness.” McDonald’s must minimise its risk in the environment by providing a setting that clearly delineates zones and activities to ensure the experience of ‘sameness’ is sustained whilst including design features that respond to cultural trends. These features must not distract the participant from the primary intent of the space — ensuring that actors navigate moral codes of economic rationalism. Thus, McDonald’s must steer away from injecting too much diversity in and through the built environment if a particular kind of commonsense world is to be maintained and economic growth is to be sustained. Understanding the intricacies of this relationship is important. First, it provides great insight into the way the physical environment contributes to the construction of social institutions like globalisation. Second, it highlights the role the built environment plays in the disguise of practices intent on dominating and controlling populations. Third, it offers an opportunity to comprehend why this particular kind of setting is successful in achieving a commonsense world in some instances and not in others. Understanding these relationships are very important for the design fields because this kind of knowledge is generally absent. Descriptions that unpack the way the spatial setting maintains institutionality and constructs social order are crucial for designers. As this discussion highlights, failure to take into account the logic behind the appropriation of particular design strategies employed by corporations like McDonald’s can lead to professionals naively participating in the construction of a new world order.

29 Ritzer The McDonaldization of Society; The McDonaldization of Society (Revised Edition); Explorations in the Sociology of Consumption; Hamilton ‘The Triumph of Ideology’. 30 Hamilton, ‘The Triumph of Ideology: Environment’, p188. 31 Jerome An Examination of the Production of Social Order; ‘Constructing “independent women” through space’. 
References:


15 keys:
the (ad)venture of student —
industry projects

Jane Lawrence & Joanne Cys
Louis Laybourne Smith School of Architecture and
Design, University of South, AU

For interior architecture academics, tertiary education is inherently underwritten with an element of risk and chance. Large student numbers, differing level of competencies and pedagogical emphasis on original creative project responses are contributing factors into realms of unknown outcomes. Professional relevance is also a necessary factor to be included in interior architecture curricula but the obligatory academic rigor of project work can be circumvented when working with industry whose timelines, methodologies and expectations differ from those of the academy. For interior architecture students who may have staked vocational practice, financial reserves and familial responsibilities to study, tertiary education is a forum for both possibility and gamble.

This paper will describe the perils of a vertical studio comprising a mix of 80 second and third year students who, with a property developer consortium, generated design proposals for a series blighted retail sites. It will elaborate upon the dichotomies of the prevalent economic drivers of developers and how students dealt with the driving social issues of disenfranchisement and political and historical factors of urban renewal in their projects.

The paper will also contrast the pedagogical intent of interior architecture education with the rationalised and opportunistic expectations of industry and how academic staff addressed the risk of dealing with a series of indeterminate factors and differing attitudes and aims. In addition, it will illustrate the positive and negative outcomes of the student-industry collaborative studio in where the impetus to succeed is driven by public scrutiny and competition.

Old Port New Port
Port Adelaide is the last of the major ports in Australia to be re-developed. Like its interstate antecedents it has transformed from a colonial centre of trade and prosperity into a decrepit, if not dangerous suburb. Its grand stone Victorian buildings and massive warehouses lining the water’s edge which once housed lucrative industrial,
mercantile, administrative and commercial businesses are now mostly abandoned, unkempt and home to homeless and disenfranchised groups. Like all urban sites suffering from neglect they, in themselves, are the riskiest areas to visit let alone inhabit. The roots of The Port are working-class and staunchly proud of them as being culturally and socially defining. Yet because of relative proximity to city and sea; its cultural, social and physical diversity; its dangerous ‘edge’; and rich and grainy fabric, combined with low rents in spacious accommodation, it also attracts a bohemian sub-culture. This eclectic mix of working class and creative class; fringe dwellers and young art and design practitioners who inhabit the sought after warehouses lining the docks and semi industrialised areas; all hold a deep seated passion and love of The Port.

The geographical characteristics of The Port are diverse and include an inner and outer harbour, a river and surrounding plains. Like most port centres, the geography has allowed significant industrial and commercial development. With the decline of The Port as the State’s centre for all import and export, many local industries disappeared, leaving a legacy of wasted and contaminated land.

The South Australian government with a consortium of developers has invested $1.2b for a substantial redevelopment that aims to stimulate economic growth and job creation in the region. This gentrified revitalisation of this blighted land includes 2000 new residential dwellings on engineered waterfront land surrounded by purpose-built mixed-use precincts. The plan also includes public boardwalks, commercial development and the obligatory waterfront cafes and restaurants. It is the largest urban development project to be undertaken in South Australia over the next decade. The desirability of this development has been proven with off the plan sales of multi-million dollar penthouses complete with moorings and wall-to-wall lifestyle. Although this development is located only two suburban blocks away from the heart of The Port, in terms of its ideological, cultural and social positioning it is as remote as the eastern seaboard counterparts it aspires to be.

Answer: Yes or No

The coordinator of this influential consortium; familiar with regulatory bodies, financial powerbroker, used to commissioning expert consultants in billion dollar deals and gambling with market forces, extended his risk exposure by seeking out the undergraduate interior architecture program as a partner (albeit a minor one) in this enterprise.

According to Poldma & Samuelson, industry-based projects bridge the gap between practice and theory and can contribute to acceptance and understanding of the value of design research by industry.

Design research and development at the academic level must seek to be rigorous and forward-looking, as well as being sufficiently flexible and general that it can be adapted for use in a variety of contexts. But at the same time, sponsored projects tend to be highly contextually determined. The broader applicability and general lessons of such projects may well be the processes and methods employed, not the specific results...

The project helped to contribute to the corporate perception of design as a comprehensible and transparent process that is at once complex, challenging, time consuming and rigorous.

Reflecting on the benefits for design pedagogy, Holt-Damant and Franz both identify the potential of industry projects. Holt-Damant’s view of industry projects, such as the Brisbane Railway Corridor study, is that they not only test the value of design research in the commercial realm, but also have the potential “generate new and appropriate theory, which can be fed back into teaching.”

Franz elaborates on the advantages of real sites and projects as a mechanism for teaching social responsibility and professional ethics and a means of becoming more responsible through design practice. This is “an opportunity for them [students] to explore and challenge their own underlying values and preconceptions by considering uses that are viewed as marginal.

---

1 Port Adelaide is colloquially known as The Port.
2 Richard Florida has identified the creative class as a key contributor to economic development. Florida The Rise of the Creative Class
3 Poldma & Samuelson ‘The SICO color naming project: forging ties between educators and industry’, pp 68-69.
by some groups in society and that may also be held as taboo by themselves.”

At the time of our involvement in the project, aspects of the proposed Port development, most notably the apartment, retail and marina projects had received much criticism from the Port Adelaide Residents Association and the local branch of the National Trust. Other responses that attempted to communicate the historic insensitivity of the new development included visual art exhibitions and a public design forum. There was a strong view that the proposed revitalisation project had not included adequate research to identify the intrinsic built material and spatial qualities of The Port and consequently the design did not consider these conditions as contributing to the new built form. There was also an expressed view that the gentrification of The Port would displace certain groups of low socio-economic groups of residents (including Indigenous residents) who currently rented residential properties. As interior design academics, we regarded the project as an opportunity to not only provide our students with a current, tangible research experience that could underpin and be applied to their design process, but also as an opportunity to demonstrate to the client and the public alike the outcomes that can be achieved when design research is employed as an inherent part of the design process.

Aware of the possible benefits for studio pedagogy and the potential to increase industry regard for interior design, and equally conscious of University objectives and encouragement to form industry partnerships under almost any circumstances for both student and economic benefit, the risk for the authors was twofold. There was a risk in saying ‘no’ and a risk in saying ‘yes’. To reject the offer to be involved in such a high profile project could render us as removed from ‘the real world’ of professional practice and serving the community. To accept, as we did, would expose us, our students and the reputation of our program to many hazards; some predictable and some unforeseen.

15 Keys

The client had identified fifteen vacant commercial sites, for which students were required to propose a profile and a design fit out for the tenancies, many of which bore the legacy of squatters, vermin and years of inoccupation and neglect. The worst, lined with decaying floorboards, falling ceilings and broken and boarded up windows, were on the verge of being condemned. These wildly different shop tenancies straddled the two multi-laned arterial roads intersecting the heart of The Port known as the Black Diamond Corner. These broad almost hostile streets are currently smattered with only a few viable shops and commercial businesses. The hub of the retail sector of this area is characterised by the big chain supermarkets and discount stores which are secreted behind these roads and accessed via ubiquitous bleak malls that are denied street frontage and have (almost fortuitously) no connection to their external surroundings. The selected tenancies divided by the east west axial of the Black Diamond varied in type, size, age and character and most were over 70 years old, most of which were boarded up and were once the home to vagrants and vermin.

On one precinct closer to the water and in a more gentrified section of the Port were a row of russet red heritage listed, and fully restored Victorian terraces. Positioned at the other end of the spectrum and on the opposite end of this road were a more challenging collection of dilapidated and inhospitable tenancies.

In recognising the imperative to reinvigorate this precinct, and coat-tailing on burgeoning commercial interest in some of these

---

6 Hence the title of the studio project ‘15 Keys.’ We were given a key for each of the 15 tenancies at The Port.

7 The origin of the name ‘Black Diamond corner’ stems from the pattern of coal dust left on the road surface at the intersection by vehicles carting loads to and from the dock.

Franz ‘Fostering social responsibility for interior design practice’, p 27.
properties, the client required design concepts for interior fit out that would be installed and displayed in each shop front. The client’s intention was to stimulate commercial interest and ultimately investment through purchase or lease. Just as the adjacent residential development is offering a taste through ‘display suites’ in which prospective investors can imagine their future ideal home and lifestyle, the objective in this project was to provide an appetiser for commercial and retail speculators.

The project titled ‘15 Keys’ was run for a combined second and third year interior architecture studio comprising of over 80 students which was divided into four tutorial subgroups that were each allocated a precinct containing approximately four tenancies. Due to the limited time frame, complicated and varied nature of the project, and in the interests of equity, students were required to work in mixed year level groups of between three and five students. Each student group was allocated one of the tenancies from their precinct.

From the onset of the project, the client warned that there was a risk that any of the 15 tenancies could be leased at any stage of the project. This became reality for one group who in the penultimate week of installation had to make radical adjustments to their design for a new shop front three times the size of their original one. Worse, and far more precarious, was the fire damage that razed one tenancy as a result of an illicit crystal meth lab exploding at the rear just days before the commencement of the project.

The project was set out in three stages over eight weeks.

Stage 1
Initially students were formally briefed by their client both on site and in the studio. Each tutorial group recorded and mapped, photographically and with sketches, the cultural and commercial characteristics of their tenancy, its precinct and surrounding environment in the aim to propose a responsive profile for their precinct. Additional research was undertaken to inform a viable theoretical position to support the existing typological disposition and infrastructure of their precinct; the community in general and proposed social fabric of The Port.

For this stage, the student groups undertook a variety of research exercises ranging from the expected case study analysis of comparative examples of port revitalisation projects (of which there are many); interviews and questionnaires with locals; through to highly imaginative, historical, material, environmental and social investigations.

Stage 2
In the second stage, each student group took responsibility for their own tenancy in accordance with their proposed precinct profile. They researched a cross section of relevant international, national and local contemporary case studies and completed a functional analysis which enabled them to identify the branding and planning strategy necessary for their tenancy. This culminated with a design for their tenancy and proposal for the shop front display.

Stage 3
The final stage was the installation itself. Unlike the genre of conventional studio presentations where construction and details are scrutinised, this work had to instantly engage and visually stimulate the general public. Graphically persuasive plans and perspectives, a model and a 3d constructed installation which abstracted and reinforced their commercial concept were displayed in each of the shop fronts. Students were required to consider how to display their material for a three month duration without artificial lighting, considering the impact of heat loads on west facing glass frontages and visual impact from passing traffic for the more obscured frontages. Ironically, the dilapidated nature of many of the tenancies afforded students possibilities to display their work without damaging the existing ‘fabric’ of the building. In an act of generosity but without consultation with studio staff, the client offered a ‘prize’ for his best-judged ‘winning’ proposal.

The Gap
One might question the motivation for such a moneyed multi-national and influential client to seek out the involvement and services of an undergraduate group as being either altruistic or simply self-serving. The fact that the client provided $3,400 to be divided between the 15 groups towards the cost of installation plus a prize incentive for his best judged ‘winning’ proposal left us unsure as to whether this was generosity or exploitation.
The first and fundamental risk to overcome was the potential mismatch of paradigms. As interior architecture academics the theoretical and philosophical underpins our studio pedagogy. Our client though eager to gain creative and innovative outcomes, demonstrated little understanding that in a contemporary context, these must result from a more profound consideration borne from research that extends beyond economic rationalisation, site conditions and timelines. This is the ever-present and much debated gap between theory and practice; the discipline and the profession; the academy and the industry.

The gap widened, and the risk increased, when our client revealed his misunderstanding of the nature of our practice by contracting an interstate visual merchandiser to outline the fundamental techniques of window dressing using tiered merchandise, themed backdrops and theatrical lighting to increase retail sales. The polished presentation was perfectly couched to the student demographic for who retail therapy and the power of visual persuasion is second nature. In the studio session directly following there was evidence of the impact of the presentation with some groups abandoning abstraction for the literal and the subject for the object.

The studio brief, however, required students to take a much more conceptual (and in the context of this project, a more realistic) approach to their shop window as an abstracted installation that was both spatial and metaphorical — more a proposition than a prop.

Minimum Impact Maximum Effect

'Starboard' a menswear boutique tailor made for the yachting set, was the only example that wholly embraced the project as simply a window display, turning its back on the existing social and cultural condition and presenting itself to the new Port demographic. Highly stylised, masculine and predictable, the proposal incorporated all the expected nautical symbols and props against a rosewood backdrop. Contrary to his stated desire for creativity and innovation, this scheme which took the fewest risks in terms of the studio brief was judged by the client to be the ‘winner’.

Some groups did take a competitive approach to the project spurred on by the tangible prize in the offering that was entirely independent of academic assessment criteria. The client did not set any judging criteria and his selection was entirely subjective. In what must have seemed a cruel blow, 'Starboard' received an average grade. It could be argued that the 'Starboard' group took the highest risk of all by matching the client’s expectations rather than extending them.

The most dynamic designs came from groups that kept the edge on their projects and proposed commercial ventures that responded to the existing subcultures in The Port while also acknowledging the working-class histories of the area. The intended large-scale urban revitalisation project prompted groups to explore issues of disenfranchisement and social circumstance, and recycling design proposals that exploited the patina of the tarnished environment were among the exceptional and not coincidental. Groups whose research investigations unveiled the surprising, the ingenious and the intellectual achieved the most innovative and creative results.
branding, spatial elements and material strategy.

Some students who deliberately engage and delight in non-conformist activities recognised that this densely layered and gritty environment, the breeding ground of perilous activities, challenged even their own perception of what constituted a dangerous place. With (arguably naïve) enthusiasm to experience the true culture of The Port, one group, sporting balaclavas and fluorescent spray cans, used bill posters and stencils to 'brand' their territory with their designed graphic identity. Rather than this being interpreted as a deliberate act of vandalism (or stupidity), it contributed to the dynamic of both the environment and their radical investigative project.

The undeniable low socio-economic demographic is manifest in the composition of The Port; in the streets, at the bus stops, on the wharf. Many groups responded to the disenfranchisement of existing residents rather than addressing retail opportunities offered by the new Port development.

From the onset, a number of groups gathered material that was evidence of the existing social fabric and continued to develop and apply this to the extent that it not only generated and informed the strategic profile of their proposal, but also directed and underpinned the design of their fit out proposal and shop front installation. Groups, whose early investigations focussed on this social displacement, based their proposals on concepts of reinvention, reuse and recycling. Inspired and empathetic projects considered the old and the new; the discarded and the valued. One group made a shrewd analysis of the dichotomy between the richness of the old Port’s social fabric, history and diversity and the aspirational, lifestyle development of the new Port and questioned the values of the development-driven reinvention of the Port. Their retail proposal 'salvage' with street cred provided an outlet for low cost, recycled homewares that would appeal to both old and new residents. Similarly, other groups developed proposals along similar lines, including a recycled/refashioned clothing boutique and a café specialising in locally produced food packaged in recycled containers.

The overwhelming risk was one that affected students, staff and client and was one that is inherent in professional practice — the design work would not remain as a representation of an idea in the confines of the studio, but be physically realised and ultimately open to public scrutiny. Further, the restricted timeframe of eight weeks meant that there was little time for reflection and re-working. Students had to conceive a design that had maximum visual effect without the great deal of detailed development that would normally be inherent in a studio curriculum. In addition, the student objective was to resolve idiosyncratic material, fabrication and construction issues with their limited budget.

The risk of failure was not only about the concept of the installation to be undertaken in half a day, but also the students’ ability to physically fabricate and install their presentations. It was not surprising that the soft option of stacked boxes and hanging proprietary display devices was adopted by some.

One example of the difficulty in reconciling idea with reality was a proposal for a waterfront café ‘eat dock.’ The tenancy was in a prime location in an unremarkable ten year old salmon coloured, Tuscan inspired building that addressed the boardwalk with large clear expanses of glazing. The convincing concept of a ‘cook-it-yourself’ eatery deliberately acknowledged the popularity of the local fish market and proposed a unique and currently lacking family destination for this tourist precinct of The Port. However the massive fractal shop front installation comprised of hundreds of angled paper and MDF panels on a timber and steel framework with masonry supports far exceed the students’ construction and fabrication abilities (and understanding). Despite the best attempts of the group to resolve the construction problems on site (as many had to) and the unquestionable quality of the design intent, it was obvious to any passer-by that its built resolution was inept.

As in all collaborative student projects, staff and students are exposed to issues of inequity between groups and in this studio, sites were also of consequence. Group size, skill level, studio engagement, group ‘divorces’ and personalities are all factors that contribute to the success or otherwise of group outcomes and this project was no exception. Despite our decision to allow teams to self select and a concerted effort to encourage a balance of second and third year students, some third year students defied this intent and formed homogenous groups. By combining their equally
advanced skills in digital representation and fabrication experience, these groups were obviously advantaged.

The diversity of commercial properties in port precincts and the properties that were unleased and available at the time of this project ranged in size from a narrow fronted shop front no more than 2m wide with a boarded up entrance, to a double-fronted tenancy open to a mall on one side and a car park on the other. The locations and condition of the tenancies were as equally varied. This studio gambled with the resulting student satisfaction and perceptions in the mandatory evaluations conducted at the end of the studio.

Running the Risk
Despite an innate knowledge by staff that this project would struggle to achieve best studio pedagogy and a recognition that aspects of the project were compromised (sometimes driven) by the client, the students however felt very differently. Results of evaluations revealed the majority of students rated the studio program in the highest category because of its actual engagement with client, site and community which they understood mirrored professional practice. The public attention generated, thanks to the client’s marketing machine which encompassed local media, radio and widely distributed glossy print publications, appealed to students’ sense of accomplishment which cynically could be interpreted as vanity or notoriety. The client’s overwhelming delight in the outcomes that surpassed his expectations was expressed again through the media and personally to the students in two glowing testimonial letters. These pronounced public accolades may well have influenced students’ satisfaction with the project.

There was no doubt that the unforeseen risks particularly the importation of the visual merchandiser and the client judged prize, (without set criteria and based wholly upon subjective choice) had significant impact on student motivation and the manner in which they approached the project. The commanding characteristic of the client, not only in stature and influence, but his authoritative position amongst the states powerbrokers, had a magnetic effect on the students and pervaded the studio culture. Industry projects should be questioned as to how they are best housed into the interior architecture curriculum. Ironically, tertiary institutions are increasingly being marketed on the strength of industry relevance with prospective students being enticed by the opportunity to work on ‘real world’ projects. In acknowledging that they can be both a risk and opportunity, industry projects are best balanced and underpinned with theoretical content, for without it they run the risk of replicating practice rather than extending it.

Throughout the project, the academic staff felt that the pedagogical research intent of the studio was railroaded by the client’s blatant commercial focus. The potential of the design research component, identified as a critical and valuable outcome of industry-based projects by Holt-Damant, Franz and Poldma & Samuelson, was at times in jeopardy. While it is true that some students were romanced by the lure of prizes, public accolades and high visibility of their work and made a decision to align their projects as such, (eg. the 'Starboard' project) the majority felt that the commercially-driven approach was at odds with the palatable, existing social and physical environment of The Port. Most groups celebrated the existing fabric of The Port and its residents, and in fact drew upon it in their design proposals. Whether it was the students’ reaction to the overt commercial drive of the client; the gentrified insensitivity of the proposed development; or the influence of the undeniable and palpable condition of The Port, the majority of proposals were informed and enriched by a principled position. Through prior studio experience, students recognised the imperative of research to inform and inspire their design solutions and sensitivity to the design problem developed from research explorations. These cultural and historical investigations: formal and informal conversations with residents (even drinking with the locals at the pub); drawn and photographic and material mappings were also design exercises in both two and three-dimensional forms. They directly influenced the functional, spatial and material decisions in a sensitive and apposite manner. This research wasn’t seen a discrete activity required only as an academic exercise confined to library shelves and the World Wide Web, but rather as an essential and critical component, in fact it was the key to the project. The studio was a tangible example of what we, as academics, believe is best practice for interior architecture that employs research to challenge and extend the client’s brief,
and is grounded with an ethical and sustainable philosophy.

References:
Insider Trading
a qualitative review of two urban markets

Jane Lawrence & Rachel Hurst
*Louis Laybourne Smith School of Architecture and Design, University of South Australia, AU*

This paper uses two urban markets in Adelaide and Melbourne to demonstrate two types of risk taking in thinking about interior space. One deals with an experimental analogy in a typological reading of space, based on gastronomic associations with the raw and the cooked. The second theme explores the degree of risk inherent in the layout and aesthetics in both markets, by examining the degree of predetermination in the design.

While markets follow universal typologies and are a recurrent form of egalitarian interior space, they are also nuanced indicators of culture, country and region and the locus of food distribution and consumption. Based loosely on Levi Strauss’ deployment of the raw and the cooked as metaphors for cultural states, the paper illustrates how marketplaces reveal these tendencies not just in foodstuffs, but in architectural vocabularies, spatial layouts, social interaction and sensory stimulation.

These markets are visibly different in their level of refinement. On the surface one appears haphazard while the other is highly ordered. What affect do these differences in design control have on patterns of use, personal appropriation and risk taking in the way we inhabit space? This paper will discuss how a deliberately provocative mode of thinking about space has suggested insights into similarly unorthodox occupations of space at an everyday level.

**Foodstates**

Pears and gorgonzola. Quinces and vine leaves. Strawberries and balsamic. In the traditions of gastronomy the experimental combination of different food types has produced some of the most memorable tasting experiences. In fact, risk taking is at the heart of all development in the culinary arts. Yet taste is only one aspect of enjoying what we eat. The smell, colour and texture of food all contribute to our overall sensory experience. Similarly our experience and interpretation of space is not limited to one sense alone, involving instead a complex interplay between the senses. The design of memorable spaces is also a result of risk taking, and as with food, our perceptions are subjective and
idiosyncratic. To mix our metaphors in a prelude to a technique that is about mixed metaphors, ‘one man’s meat is another man’s castle.’

Both food and architecture are grouped in classifications that allow us to make sense of the plethora of elements and combinations that have evolved. These categories sort by considering, for example, physical characteristics, processes, cultural histories, and functional or nutritional value. In her comprehensive discussion of typological readings, Franck anthologises versions of this process in what she describes as “diverse and, at times, conflicting perspectives of type as a form of knowledge.”¹ This overview is in-sightful; as it identifies that no single method of typological analysis is ultimately inclusive. However the orthodox framework to analyse space concentrates on issues of natural light, circulation to use, unique to repetitive elements, unit to whole, symmetry and balance, hierarchy, massing, structure, material and parties.² But curiously the sensory qualia or social and experiential readings that are critical to the perception of interior space in comparison lack a formal means of expression or classification in such analyses. By comparison, the way we talk or write about food concentrates on just these qualities and hence provides a possible companion language of reflection.

This paper describes a typological reading derived from gastronomic analogies using two prominent and primary places of food distribution and consumption, the Queen Victoria Market in Melbourne (QVM) and the Adelaide Central Market (ACM) as parallel case studies. Traditional urban markets are cultural signifiers, providing rich sensory experiences, social interaction and regional specificity. Since it is these spatial and cultural characteristics that also distinguish good interior design practice and are worth emulating, markets provide an excellent typological example for analysis. Furthermore they are predominantly interior public spaces. Though they often present as substantial edifices, monumental in scale and façade, it is their interiority which is their defining characteristic.

The paper will correlate each marketplace with the definitive food states of the raw and the cooked and make an argument for linking the fields of interior architecture and gastronomy. Then, through a comparative description of formal and operational characteristics of each market using a gastronomic framework, it identifies how some spaces implicitly accept risk as a component of public occupation, while others suppress it. Finally, the paper argues the inherent possibilities and hazards of this approach.

A matter of taste

Conventional forms of typological analysis such as the diagrammatic dissections of Clark and Pause³ work within a framework of architectural interpretation that tends to focus on rational phenomena e.g. physical manifestations such as geometry, structural disposition, orientation or alternatively chronology and ideology. In comparison the gastronomic analysis discussed here privileges the tangible and sensory aspects of space, and therefore is inevitably linked to the subjective and open to speculation, just as is one’s taste in food is ‘a matter of taste’. Carolyn Korsmeyer elaborates on the migration of the term ‘taste’ to describe both gustatory sensation and aesthetic judgement.

The English term ‘taste’ has had several meanings in its history, all of which relate in some way to the idea of intimate acquaintance with and object by means of one’s own sensory experience… and of course ‘taste’ also refers to personal dispositions and preferences, as in the expression ‘to have taste for’ something, whether a food or an activity or a type of object. The sensation of tasting seems to carry a virtually inescapable affective valance: tasting involves registering the sensation as pleasant or unpleasant. Therefore this sense provides a suitable analogue for judgements of the quality of experience by means of immediate, subjective approval.⁴

For these associations, food and architecture are increasingly being explored as stimulating metaphors for design and discourse⁵. While these alliances are often based on the sensory evocations gastronomy is able to impart to interior architecture,

---

¹ See ‘Classificatory Types in Architecture’ in Franck & Schneekloth Ordering Types p 185.
² See for example Catterall Food: Design and Culture; Franck Food + Architecture; Horwitz & Singley Eating Architecture; Frascari ‘Architects, never eat your maccheroni without a proper sauce!’ pp 41-53.
³ See 'Classificatory Types in Architecture' in Franck & Schneekloth Ordering Types p 185.
⁴ Korsmeyer Making Sense of Taste pp 40-41.
⁵ See for example Catterall Food: Design and Culture; Franck Food + Architecture; Horwitz & Singley Eating Architecture; Frascari ‘Architects, never eat your maccheroni without a proper sauce!’ pp 41-53.
the use of food as a parallel field of inquiry also foregrounds its connections to place and process, issues of commodity, cultural heritage, and the everyday.

**Raw and Cooked**

In his influential appropriation of food terminology to analyse social constructs, anthropologist Claude Levi Strauss treated food customs as a language. ‘He identified the primary binary opposition, common to all cultures, between ‘nature’ and ‘culture’ as analogous to those between the ‘raw’ and the ‘cooked.’ Levi Strauss and other anthropologists, Douglas, Visser and Khare used these classifications ‘with the premise that food categories encode, and therefore structure, social events.’ Alternatively, other cultural theorists have observed gastronomy as an insight to political systems, gendered perspectives or post-structuralist realms. The link between the primary binary opposition, common to all cultures, between ‘nature’ and ‘culture’ as analogous to those between the ‘raw’ and the ‘cooked.’

The work of Levi Strauss was seminal in expressing the relevance of the raw and cooked categories. This work set the stage for the ‘cooked’ term to be reinterpreted as an insight to political systems, gendered perspectives or post-structuralist realms. The link between the primary binary opposition, common to all cultures, between ‘nature’ and ‘culture’ as analogous to those between the ‘raw’ and the ‘cooked.’

**Under the market umbrella**

The ACM and QVM were products of late nineteenth century expanding economies. While each was predated by a series of open-air stalls they evolved into substantial examples of roofed urban markets, formalised into enclosed built entities at around the same time. Both were critically sited in prominent central locations with multiple connections into the city grids. Beyond these similarities the scale and containment of each market is idiosyncratic.

**The Adelaide Central Market**

The ACM fills an entire city block alongside the main central square of the city, yet is oddly and unobtrusively subsumed in a commercial and legal precinct. Its origins as a network of streets and lanes becomes obvious upon entry; a grid encased under a vast steel canopy, it is more a shed with two serviceable brick frontages than a grand architectural statement. The escalators which connect the rooftop carpark to the main trading hall operate as a central spine of pedestrian access, disgorging visitors right into the belly of the market. Natural and borrowed light is barely able to penetrate beyond the first few stalls near its street frontages. The uncomplicated rectangular footprint and simple envelope of the market are a straightforward response to the city’s undifferentiated grid and basic functional criteria. Like a wholesome picnic assembled in a robust basket and consumed al fresco, its space and structure are utilitarian, pragmatic and raw.

**The Queen Victoria Market**

11 The ACM (1870) predates the QVM (1878) although it appears both markets were officially operating before those official opening dates.

8 See for example Wigglesworth Cuisine and Architecture Wigglesworth states that “in both cuisine and architecture a sensory and social world opens up from the perfect combination of elements brought together in time and space.”

7 Lupton Food, the Body and the Self p 9.

8 The work of Levi Strauss was seminal in expressing the connection of food with culture, and generated a continuing debate and critique on the cultural significance of gastronomy. However, Levi Strauss and other Functional Structuralists, have been criticised for their biologically reductive and ethno-centric account. Alternatively the Critical Structuralist approach, including Marxists and Feminist critiques, neglects to adequately consider the function and purpose of food habits and over simplifies aspects of production and consumption. Post Structuralist perspectives attempt to concentrate on understanding the meaning of food and eating as a plurality of dynamic systems and embodied experiences. This paper aligns with the latter.

9 Lupton Food, the Body and the Self p 9.

10 Lupton Food, the Body and the Self p 12.
The regally named QVM is made up of more than seven hectares of trading halls, brick arcades, open sheds and car parks. The marbled Dairy Hall and adjacent tiled Meat & Fish Hall are imposing signature buildings, and herald the Market’s identity at its most prominent urban edge. Within the Dairy Hall the space is lofty and luminous, naturally lit with expansive roof lights and a regular grid of pendulous opalescent light fittings. Lavish in its opulence and detail, it is redolent of evolved architectural recipes, like the carefully arranged and cultivated food it sells.

**Spatial layouts: eating aisles**

At the ACM, the terra-cotta face-brick openings of the main entries are unembellished and unambiguous portals, never entirely sealed to the elements. The stalls troop a regular rhythm down the internal streets, which varies from three to four metres wide. Each retail bay is based on a four by five metre module, modest portions of space defined with modest means. Suspended bulkheads from the unlined corrugated sheet roofing are the least negotiable of the spatial dividers, artlessly incorporating the vital services of lighting and signage, and poaching crucial mezzanine space from behind their naive and tacky claddings. Elsewhere, waist-high displays, slim steel columns, open platforms and movable shop fittings loosely delineate each traders’ space, allowing us to see right through the network of unpretentious businesses and make our own erratic pathways through the grid of pedestrian thoroughfares and the stalls themselves.

The entrance to the Dairy Hall of the QVM is through a symmetrical façade of tile and stained glass and over a terrazzo threshold. Each of the main entrances is crowned with a double height arched fanlight and leads straight into the twin arcades, which at four metres wide are ample in width and scale. Framed in almost identical pristine shells of polychrome marble are a variety of businesses specialising in value added foodstuffs. The shops borrow the order and clarity of Georgian architecture, and its strategy of amassing a repeated module, like an individual townhouse, to create a singular entity of palatial and gracious scale, elegantly articulated from the overarching mantel of its built envelope. The entire workings of each shop, front of house storage and service areas, are immersed within this larger edifice, as are the lighting and signage in a carefully composed repetition of elements and material. The control and preconception required to achieve this kind of composition and finish parallels the type of pre-planning needed to produce highly refined food.

**Sensory stimuli: cornucopias**

Urban markets are a city’s ‘heart of colour, smell and movement, attracting shoppers, ownerless dogs, courting couples and poets.’ Markets are possibly the most intense condensers of sensory experiences of any design typology. By example the ACM is a jumble of sensory stimulation. There is no prescribed relationship of one part to another, like gathering raw ingredients for a sandwich, everything is at hand and effortlessly assembled. A comprehensive market, which includes greengroceries, meat, fish, flowers, gourmet foods, and cafés, there is no rationale to the juxtaposition of the stalls. The arcades of independently illuminated stalls present a *chiarasuro* of makeshift theatrical vignettes against the dimly lit auditorium of the market shell. Brilliant pyramids of polished apples and watermelon halves the colour of lipstick sit next to palisades of crusty baguettes. Spruikers shout an improvised opera of specials as rough sawn crates are offloaded from forklifts in a cacophony of noise and activity outside the Asian grocery. This daily dangerous dance between pedestrians and wheeled carts along the bitumen is a continual reminder of the ACM’s street origins.

The dramatic contrasts, between light and dark, rough and smooth, and the aromas of ground coffee against the unmistakable smell of fresh fish assault the senses. The architecture of the place is secondary to this untempered assault on the senses. Yet this robust shed allows the ACM to be

12 Symons *One Continuous Picnic* p 70.
adaptable and responsive to the essential temporal nature of marketplaces, where “the sights and smells of new produce makes you change your menu plans.”¹³ Like the seasonal associations of raw food, the market revels in a spontaneous version of architectural engagement.

Alternatively, the QVM offers a more orchestrated parade of sensual stimulation, where the appeal is principally to the visual. Row upon row of olives, stuffed peppers and coiled anchovies are arranged and labelled meticulously.

Laid out at eye level in marble and curved glass counters the food is always undercover and out of reach to the consumer. The generosity of the display operates around and within the counters, but stops short of unsolicited offerings to taste, touch or smell the goods for sale. The lustrous terrazzo and marble shop-fittings are precisely detailed to both invite and resist wear marks of perpetual contact and maintenance. Garnished with figured marble parcel ledges, panelled hatches and ornate ventilation grilles, these shop fronts perpetuate the finesse, durability and craft of early 20th century design and evoke in their richness, the culinary creations of that era. Instead of the unpredictable hubbub of the ACM, here the sounds are muted within the fabric of the building. Loading and deliveries are carried on at the rear of the stalls, so there is negligible aural and visual intrusion from forklifts and trolleys. Like the neatly sorted delicacies arranged with curatorial precision behind glass, this market is an example of design which displays its cultural origins and technical expertise in a conscious taxonomy of space and material.

Sociability: more than retail therapy

The public space of shopping has long been recognised as a major part of civic life. From the classical model of the agora¹⁴, to the internalised and risqué promenades of 19th century English and French arcades, to the modern mega-retail malls with movie theatres, spurring fountains and child care, these places exist to support our need for social interaction and entertainment as much as, if not more than, our need to purchase essential goods.¹⁵ ‘Going shopping regularly for food at markets gives you a lot more than fruit and vegetables at good prices. It’s about noise, bustle, about arriving with a list and leaving with completely different items.’¹⁶

The social aspect of the ACM begins with the exchange at the counters. With minimal barriers, invitations to taste and other relaxed protocols for selling goods, one feels part of the business as one shops. The transparency between stalls encourages neighbourliness between traders, as they affably vie for business. These are unconditioned and impromptu social structures, with all the freshness of the food that surrounds them.

At the QVM the stallholder behind the counter at the Hellenic Deli is elevated and framed in front of perfectly ordered walls of imported foodstuffs with elaborate gilt labelling. ASCM. There is a distinct contrast between the social networks operating within the building and without, a demarcation between traders enforced by the physical enclosure of each store and a respectful distance between customers and shop keepers. The physical environment of the Dairy Hall breeds reserved and decorous behaviour, both discrete and discreet, just as respectful culinary tradition has engendered the mannered food it sells. Trading is distilled into a polite risk-free engagement both spatially and socially where there is safety and clarity between personal and physical provenances.

Possibility and Probability

¹³ O’Donnell ‘Mietta’s Australian Food: Queen Victoria Market.’

¹⁴ See a comprehensive discussion of the social dimension of the agora see Sennet Flesh and Stone.


¹⁶ O’Donnell ‘Mietta’s Australian Food: Queen Victoria Market.’
There clearly are commonalities of purpose and physical organisation between these two markets; in the matrix of pathways, the invitations to eat, visual stimuli and legibility, and in their social and sensory richness. However, if one focuses on first impressions they feel remarkably different – as different as the taste and texture of raw onion is to cooked. The ACM with its rudimentary open structures, rough finishes and utilitarian atmosphere can readily be associated with the notion of rawness, and like raw food, one requires an element of caution in tackling the experience. In this erratically lit and noisy place of interlocking streets peopled with forklifts and pedestrians, it is easy to become disoriented amongst the repetitive market stalls. Negotiating around this market requires vigilance. It is a far riskier endeavour than pedestrians, it is easy to become disoriented amongst the repetitive market stalls. Negotiating around this market requires vigilance. It is a far riskier endeavour than

...the ordered journey through the QVM. The fabric of the ACM, like the food for sale, is not far from its raw state, and the spatial layout of stalls reveals a palette of robust materials which project an elemental quality. There is a sense of roughness and hazard in the tactile experience of this market. Most raw dishes comprise food in its original state, or if processed, the food remains discernible as separate flavours. The ACM has a similar quality of lucidity and individual identity, conveyed through the openness of the spatial layout, the exposure of each stall, the ad-hoc juxtapositions of different types of produce all displayed without artifice. It responds to spontaneity and immediacy, not just with the set-up and turnover of produce, but with the turnover of the businesses themselves. At every visit the exact makeup of the ACM may be different, yet individual visitors and stallholders accept (and delight) in this risk of impermanence.

In contrast, the quality of the QVM Dairy Hall structure and its formal organisation communicates a rarefied environment which, like a well-cooked dish, is usually the result of pre-planning and a lavish use of expensive materials. Recipes for food that become part of the art and lore of cooking do not exist apart from an intellectual or historical context. Nor does this building, with its visible references to the stylistic conventions of early 20th century Melbourne. Cooked food is generally the end stage of preparing food for consumption and in the development of the recipe, much of the risk associated with eating untested foodstuffs has been removed. By analogy this market projects a similar resolved finality through its design and permanence, where the potential hazards of civic life have been moderated over time into a familiar set of experiences. It is an Approachable and un-intimidating building that takes few aesthetic risks.

Just as the great chefs of the 19th and 20th century extolled the virtues of well-organised kitchens, and arranged their cookbooks and work environments with scientifically derived categorisation and hierarchies,17 this market is pervaded with a similar order and specialisation. The QVM demonstrates this logic from the macro to the micro scale: each building specialises in one type of produce; in the Dairy Hall the envelope of the building and the blocks of individual shops are distinct; each shop stocks one foodtype –effectively reducing the risk of competitive trading; each is laid out as a complete entity, and separates traders from customers. The assiduously organised food sold and packaged with careful compartmentalisation, makes no exception to this rule. Unlike the ACM where cafes and stalls anarchically coexist under the main roof, even the act of eating is spatially and socially detached from the shopping part of the market experience.

The process of cooking raw food not only makes it more digestible but reduces the risk of contamination. The same could be argued for 'raw' spaces and considering the case of the ACM and in its undisciplined state devoid of polish and order, it appears if not less palatable then certainly less 'prepared' than its Melbourne counterpart. The pervasive control of the QVM in spatial dynamics and aesthetic considerations, where little is left to chance, heightens the sensory experience of the built place, rather than the produce - the opposite of the ACM where it can be argued that the food takes precedence over the rudimentary environment. Like the composed plates of *haute cuisine* designed to be enjoyed at first gaze, the symmetrical framed shop fronts invite a full-frontal view, possessing the whole conception from an ideal protected spectator point, and in knowing there is security.

---

17 Definitive examples are to be found in Beeton *The Book of Household Management*. Mrs. Beeton’s *Cookery Book*. For a broader discussion see Flandrin *Massimo Montanari & Albert Sonnenfeld*; Symons *The Pudding that took a Thousand Cooks*; and Franck ‘Design on a Plate’.
Risk analysis
There are the risks common to any appropriation from one area of knowledge to another or what has been described as “pitfalls of the post semiotic-interdisciplinary genre.” Ideas can be lost in translation, or more positively interpreted; no two cooks produce an identical result from the same recipe. In cooking, as with any form of communication, the subtlety of the language employed can be ambiguous, for example ‘cooked’ is to ‘well done’ as ‘raw’ is to ‘rare’. The notion of ‘cooked’ could also be an ambiguous and pejorative labelling for both food and design, if one were to consider it in terms of a leathery steak and over-designed interiors. The processes of bringing food to the table raw or cooked can be deceptive, eg smoked salmon, though ‘raw’, has gone through several processes before it’s served. Arguably it could be regarded as equally evolved as any ‘cooked’ dish. Yet this very complexity within the language, significance and reality of food gives it an associative richness pertinent for analogy with the intricacies that underlie design and its meaning. If the oppositional nature of the initial philosophical binary posed by Levi Strauss begins to break down under interrogation here, it is to the ultimate benefit of this more localised analogy.

The deployment of a gastronomic reading of these examples based on the raw and cooked shifts the emphasis from the internalised language of design discourse; however this process is not dependant upon the literal presence of food in the brief. Rather than produce a fixed set of rules, the states are more like general ‘performance criteria’ which can be applied to defining typological characteristics of any building type. In the way that cooks interpret recipes according to taste and technique, this particular typing is not rigidly prescriptive and could be subject to misinterpretation. For example, the observed similarities between raw places - their transparency of layout or adaptability - are not immutable characteristics of all raw places, just as a picnic can be made many ways. Correspondingly, ‘cooked’ places might not employ ornate vocabularies and rely on highly worked materials, but are consistently identifiable by the level of detail and control inherent in the design, in the same way that cordon bleu cooking relies on elevating cooking to a precise art form.

The success of the analogy is potentially affected by the level of gastronomic sophistication of the user group. Originally conceived as a teaching strategy to engage novice interior design students and help them to perceive and analyse the sensual and experiential qualities of space through a language they already knew, some limitations were expected. Understanding that many students exist on a predominant diet of fast food served in and from a plastic setting, on one hand risked sensory homogeneity, yet surprisingly paid dividends in reinforcing links between design, identity and contemporary culture.

Deploying this gastronomic framework to facilitate learning then raises a concluding question: is it easier to analyse our reactions to food than to space? Perhaps its essential place in our lives makes us more attuned and critical to its stimuli, though we begin experiencing space and food at much the same stage in our development. The personal and interiorised perception of ‘taste’ that Korsmeyer eludes to, is both the strength and weakness of the raw and cooked metaphor. Through the association of food it provides an intense and nuanced opportunity for judgement. The same ingredients in combination, can taste completely different with the addition or omission of only one spice or process. Yet at the same time the subjectivity of one’s taste is so powerful that it can overtake any subtle reading. If you vehemently dislike a particular foodstuff for example, its inclusion in any dish will usurp the taste of it. Herein lies the risk in translation, for the same is not entirely true of one’s perception of space. It is experienced externally from the body whereas the consumption of food is an internalised activity. In this inherent interiority of eating, we are innately more cautious about ‘what’ we ingest than ‘where’ we ingest, and are educated through sensory experimentation. In this gamble of market analysis the serendipitous combination of food and interior space allow a venture into both with equal return.

18 See Book Reviews Journal of Architectural Education.
References:

Duruz, J. (2004) 'From Malacca to Adelaide: Fragments Toward a Biography of Cooking, Yearning and Laksa', in International Conference in The Production of Food and Foodways, Asia Honk Kong Heritage Museum, Leisure and Cultural Services Department, HKSAR and the Department of Anthropology, Chinese University of Hong Kong.
threatening to unravel: 
the material of teaching & research 
in design

Jane Lawrence & Rachel Hurst
Louis Laybourne Smith School of Architecture and Design, 
University of South Australia, AU

The divide between practice and theory, and, by extension, that between teaching and research is often polarised as an inevitable fault line between the real and the conceptual. Or, conversely, the binary is portrayed as the emancipated intellectual high ground of research versus the stable but prosaic world of application.

Where the content of that teaching/research nexus is to do with the everyday - the familiar patterns, tribulations and rituals of daily life — how much more exaggerated this opposition can seem. And how much more contentious any attempt to translate the mundane and banal fabric of ordinary life into the realms of the theoretical.

This paper discusses how a successful teaching partnership in the disciplines of interior architecture and architecture arose from the inexorable concerns of everyday life, both as core issues for design students, but also for two academics attempting to juggle professional and familial lives. It outlines how this perilous practice, with its imprecise pathways, has been translated into a productive research collaboration, producing diverse outcomes, from publications, consultancies and grants, to a series of creative installations and artefacts. It suggests that just as teaching and research need not be divorced from each other, neither need they be removed from the intrinsic pleasure of everyday existence.

starting in the middle

Take for example what in France is called la perruque, the wig. La perruque is the worker’s own work disguised as work for his employer. It differs from pilfering in that nothing of material value is stolen. It differs from absenteeism in that the worker is officially on the job.¹

It’s difficult to recall when we first met. In the daze of first year university orientation there were so many new faces and experiences to absorb. Or was it even before that, at Saturday morning art classes

¹ de Certeau The Practice of Everyday Life v 1, p 25.
all those years ago, shyly checking out each others CrayPas and watercolour efforts in lieu of formal introductions? The simple fact is that we were friends and students together well before we became collaborative teachers, that we knew we shared similar professional interests and values because we had already tested our partnership thorough shared late nights in the studio, research field trips and, sometime later, compared notes about our childrens development.

Yet our unusual collaboration of over twenty years of teaching, researching and designing translates blandly when we attempt to write the mandatory biographic details required for published work. Our partnership is more complex and formative in the work than can be described in conventional scholarly terms. The problem of finding a suitable voice is symptomatic of the whole. In fact the actual process of collaboration is in itself a precarious venture. The vicissitudes of everyday life, its passions and frustrations, its idiosyncrasies and coincidences, don’t readily translate to the rational world of academia, neither in appropriate expression nor relative importance. The nexus between these realms is arguably more tentative than that between teaching and research. However it is a critical one for us as it has provided both the raw material and impetus for us to make research a more achievable activity. By drawing on the realities of our situations, and those things closest to our daily lives, as banal, predictable, challenging and chaotic they may be, research can be integrated with those things we must do as well as those things we choose to do. The risk is that responding to and relying upon serendipity is not the most strategic and seamless way of generating valid research agendas in the current pragmatic funding climate. Yet in the past eight years our idiosyncratic approach has produced four teaching awards, two book chapters, four group exhibitions and well over twenty international and national publications.

**a danger to ourselves**

The Situationist philosopher Michel de Certeau articulates a similar way of operating. He describes how these styles of action intervene in a field which regulates them at a first level [for example at the level of the factory system or in this case, design education system] but they introduce into it a way of turning it to their advantage that obeys other rules and constitutes something like a second level interwoven into the first [for instance, *la perruque*].

This paper will discuss how this almost reactive attitude toward teaching and research has worked for our partnership, firstly describing the underlying nature of what we are teaching and researching, and secondly the specific processes and outcomes, both good and bad. It identifies three areas of risk-taking in interior architecture education, as a field for written research, and for research as design. Each one of these areas informs the other in a cyclic loop. Firstly, the successful teaching collaboration in all year levels of studio across both the interior architecture and architecture programs complicates pedagogical structure and logistics. It also risks exacerbating demarcation disputes over professional territory. The politics between these disciplines is a potential minefield, and our determination to unite these disciplines in education as they are in the profession has required focussed intention if not an evangelical enthusiasm.

Secondly, our areas of research investigation which deal with the everyday and alliances between food and design as metaphors for design education, form the resource for both studio programs, written research and creative artefact. These may often appear to be modestly framed observations and outcomes, despite what we would argue is their inherent profundity. To write and create works about them in order to elevate them to the status of ground-breaking cancer research by Research Quality Framework (RQF) measures requires reckless conviction.

Thirdly and most perilous of all our practices is the making of artefacts for the sheer enjoyment of it. These are loose explorations of space and occupation created in an open ended provocation to our own ideas and design skills. These commence without a known academic or public destination.

A few parameters should be defined: the discipline of interior architecture has a comparatively short history within academia, arising like architecture, as a vocational rather than esoteric field. As the

---

2 de Certeau *The Practice of Everyday Life* v 1, p 30.

3 RQF is the emerging Research Quality Framework through which research quality and impact will be evaluated and funded.
imperative for research increases within universities, the connection between teaching, practice and research becomes an accessible and obvious resource for design disciplines but remains problematic against more established realms of scholarly output. Furthermore, the discussion in this paper has, inevitably, an anecdotal quality and non-conclusive ending because of the propinquity and nature of the material. However it is offered here more as a set of observations of a practice in action with its inherent difficulties, than a desirable model to be adopted.

the magnificent mundane

The theoretical underpinning of our teaching and research is about the everyday and the activities and practices of daily life that form the background against which all of the more visible and validated academic duties of teaching and research are carried out. It is the stuff our lives are made of and therefore reasserts itself compellingly, unwittingly, unavoidably into our thinking. Further the everyday is an internalised construct, it is mundane and generic and without allegiance to a priori architectural styles and formulas.1

This theme of the everyday, of the embodied knowledge accumulated in being in the world has been to some extent disregarded as part of a scholarly knowledge base, when we would argue, it should actually be a central part of it. The Situationists, amongst other schools of thought informed by anthropology, sociology and phenomenology, have gone some way to challenging this neglect, but yet there is often a dramatic separation, emotionally if not intellectually, between how we experience the world as individuals going about our lives, and the rarefied concerns of proper research questions. The design world it seems is particularly susceptible to this characteristic, choosing to focus more often on the high profile projects or provocative propositions, rather than more modest issues of shelter and dwelling. And yet we would argue that the everyday is a core issue for designers who are after all dealing with the basic task of inhabitation, and that unless design can apply itself at the level of the mundane it is not fulfilling its transformative potential within society.

In the built environment, the everyday is nowhere more evident than in our homes and yet the domestic realm is problematic for both interior architects and architects. Since gaining professional credibility, the Interior Architecture profession has aligned itself predominantly with commercial and residential design and not generally with the ordinariness of the domestic. Domestic design is the vernacular of the everyday; it is personal, confrontational, messy and unostentatious. In the realms of architectural design it is the poor relation to residential design. More specifically, in interior design practice it can often be mistakenly associated with decoration and surface, curtains and cushions, fashion and décor, anathema to design professions still in the shadow of modernism. Yet it is to this site of the everyday that we are compellingly drawn despite its awkward status in our professions.

trying not to lose anything in translation

There are three modes identifiable in our teaching/research translations. The first is the direct translation of teaching programs and practices into refereed papers about design education. The second mode of translation grows from the first, and is a smaller group of book chapters and journal articles which develop the themes explored in the original teaching projects but are not themselves about teaching. The third mode of translation is into creative artworks and installations and it is this one that carries the highest degree of risk.

words that count

Writing about teaching programmes and practices as scholarly reflection for refereed papers is such an obvious and accessible link between what we do as teachers and the research realm, it seems almost facile to put it forward as an insight (although, surprisingly, we are the only ones in our School who have consistently published in this way). Apart from the well-established network of forums, journals etc related specifically to the educational and humanities discipline, almost every conference or journal in the design realm encompasses the topic of education, so it is easy to find regular and appropriate venues for disseminating this kind of work. It has been the most successful in terms of the number of accountable publications.

---

1 Architecture of the Everyday p 222.
2 For elaboration on the role of the everyday in relation to spatial practices refer to de Certeau The Practice of Everyday Life Vol 1; Franck & Lepori Architecture Inside Out Chap 1 & 2; Burke, Harris, Lefebvre & McLeod in Harris & Burke Architecture of the Everyday.
Design studio programs are reinvented virtually every time they are run unlike most technical or body of knowledge type of courses, which are refined into repeatable packages. Consequently there is a continual resource of teaching practices and outcomes being generated as a font of research speculation. On a number of occasions we have used a conference call for papers to shape the approach of our teaching in a forthcoming studio, thereby setting up a strategic circularity between the genesis of the teaching and research into that teaching. A good example is the level of interest in regional identity, as a foil to globalisation. Our studios have benefited demonstrably from this attention on issues of regionalism and multi-culturalism, and, in another productive nexus, the focus has enabled us to successfully apply for Teaching and Learning Grants to develop the work. There is undeniable advantage in identifying the ideological zeitgeist operating at any one time, and since design is inherently about appropriate responses to problem-based learning, studios are actually improved by an underpinning of currency and reactivity in their premises.

The problem here is that there are limitations to this strategy. It tends toward closure fairly quickly, that is, when the project or teaching practice has been run, the course is over, the students have left the building, the paper written, presented and published the process is effectively over. The provocations or questions which have arisen from our dissemination of our collaborative teaching and which might naturally lead to an extension of the thinking and research have been comparatively few. Though other academics have chosen to trial or adopt some of the ideas we have explored, it is within their own practices and institutions, and may not be very visible. Additionally, the effects arising from successful projects appear to be limited by the nature of design courses themselves, which are characteristically episodic, and with a comparatively short time span, of one study period only.

Moreover, if one’s teaching is underpinned by a set of principles which have been developed and refined extensively, there is a limit to the number of times and ways one can write about them without feeling that the research ideas are becoming fixed and stale, regardless of how the mode of application might be varied and tested out. There is the danger of finding oneself repeating the same precepts to the point of uncriticality.

A further issue is that contemporary Australian public discourse related to design favours descriptive reviews rather than critical analysis. In a climate where the coverage of design issues is minimal (compared with for example political or sports reporting), and the profession is bound by professional codes of conduct, negative critiques are rare. The same concern could be observed in the reporting of teaching as a research outcome. It tends to focus on successful programmes, rather than educational experiments which haven’t entirely worked. This makes perfect sense in many ways - (who wants to hear about what not to do) - but does suggest that the data is carefully managed, in a way which is not consistent with authentic empirical research, to present the most optimistic reception. Rigorous statistical analysis is a method rarely employed in the design side of interior architecture education. It is primarily about ideas and creative production, where if there is no right answer then consequently it is harder to identify the wrong answers. The few times we have been openly frank about the failures or difficulties encountered in our teaching, (even when allied with a majority of success stories) we have been discouraged by peers from focussing on these. Though this positive bias is understandable in a higher education climate which uses measures of teaching performance as means of awarding funding, it potentially undermines the long term value and rigour of the research base itself.

**words that do(not) count**

Like the first set, these works are conventional pieces of research, i.e. scholarly essays and articles, contextualised and referenced within a given discipline area and disseminated principally as academic texts. These follow ideas and perceptions that have grown from and link to our teaching, and enable us to explore our interest in the everyday in a less pragmatic manner. The opportunistic aspect about this collection is that they have generally arisen serendipitously, rather than strategically, from the least likely avenues, (the smallest most obscure conference, the non-refereed big congress) and yet they are the most prestigious of our collaborative productions, in terms of resolution and visibility (or in RQF terms...
quality and impact). Ironically, these un-refereed congresses, colloquiums and conferences do not receive University funding for registration and attendance. As such they are self funded and/or draw upon modest reserves of awards and grant dollars. Every endeavour of this nature effectively requires weighing up the financial and familial demands and gambling on the odds that it will pay research dividends eventually.

As just one example, an academic paper prepared for international refereed conference covered a theoretical and applied method for typologically reading contemporary Australian architecture through food analogies. Through the paper presentation an invitation was received to contribute a chapter to Architectural Design edited by established US author, Karen Franck. The resulting publication was much more widely distributed and sophisticated in its full-colour glossy production than any conference proceedings, yet failed to attract research credits. However it did spawn an interview on national radio and a further invitation for a critical essay on Australian eating places in a popular newsstand journal. Both of these outcomes would have reached a wide (and somewhat critical) audience, yet again gained minimal research credit. One could question which of these related papers, equally rigorous, counts the most?

more than words

Although this is the smallest set of quantifiable outcomes (approximately four collections over eight years), and certainly the least substantial in terms of audited points, it is the most powerful driver of intellectual energy and genuine enquiry for us. It would be accurate to say that in our partnership it is also the most enjoyable. Perhaps because these works are closest to our original motivations to become designers, or because they are already in the same language of aesthetics and artefact as the teaching programs they relate to, these are the research projects we hold as significant. Though usually conceived as deliberate manifestations of past teaching events, there exists an open-endedness and latent potentially that seeds new ideas and endeavours. Some of these may be written reflections on the work itself, but more valuable is their role as catalysts for future creative and teaching directions. This is best illustrated by a brief description of two projects - one titled material maps which was the starting point of our creative work and represented in a public exhibition and the other called DOMUSTicity recently exhibited.

DOMUSTicity

This collection consists of six abstracted 3-dimensional architectural aprons, which convey spatial qualities of a selection of domestic projects from 1950s Domus magazines. We came about this incomplete collection by chance. Discarded by the library because of the broken and damaged series, they offered a serendipitous resource of captivating and highly charged images. The interior spaces depicted are precariously balanced between highly designed modernist interiors and the aesthetic of quintessential 1950s domesticity. This was a pivotal time to observe changes in the design of the house and kitchen, and patterns of domestic occupation, politics and aesthetics. Modernity and its technologies liberated not only the spaces of the house but also the housewife. In particular, the kitchen was no longer a place of manual labour and duty, but a highly stylised realm operating as an extension to the living areas of the home. Symbolic of this, the design of the apron shifts markedly from being a pragmatic protective garment, to both a fashion item and symbol of the pristine nature of the modern home. Perhaps because of the era or maybe our nostalgic reading of it, the images seem more perennial and seductive representations of domestic life than the pristine photographs of contemporary interiors in current journals. The attraction in the grainy Domus images lies in the peculiar contrast between the iconic designs we now know them to be, and the patina of the dog-eared magazines. It provoked exploration into objects and concepts which sit awkwardly between avant-garde design and everyday familiarity.

The collection of butter paper aprons represent form, plans, sections, architectonic devices, textures and fittings of analysed interiors. The way the spaces have been transformed and reconceived symbolises the major transformation that underwrites most design imagining and communication i.e. through the medium of two-dimensional explorations on drafting tissue. The choice of media correlates directly with the basic tools for design conceptualising, while additional materials and crafting (sewing, thread, staples, plastic etc.) relate to domestic processes
Lawrence & Hurst 'threatening to unravel' Inhabiting Risk IDEA Conference 2007

and paraphernalia. The translation of material qualities of some of the images into layered, folded and pleated paper, tested not only the techniques of production with architectural media but also the spatial analysis and observation of these interiors. In addition to the analysis of space, the aprons comment on architectural drawing and design process, employing transparent layered drawings, textural instructions and repeated modular elements. The serif Italian text which was carefully rendered onto various elements of the aprons, provided a means of alluding to the imported quality of design journals and the act of translation which happens with any reading of drawing and space. The desired effect is of pieces poised between the substance and solidity of interior space and the fragile flimsiness of these wearable tearable constructions.

Image 1: DOMUSIticity: these pieces are poised between the substance and solidity of interior space and the fragile flimsiness of these wearable tearable constructions.

This project is a direct response to the prompt to practice as agency - as speculation. At the time we began production of the aprons there was no specific opportunity for the exhibition, use or accountability of our work. Rather it was an open ended experimentation undertaken on the risky supposition that it would eventually find a place where we could hang it within our research agenda. That the project has only recently found a forum in a cross institutional exhibition titled strangely familiar is more chance than design.

material maps
Produced for a joint staff exhibition with RMIT School of Architecture & Design, the work consists of sixty-two small cast plaster panels and embroidered fragments the size of a matchbox, arranged to make physical the patterns of a collaborative partnership. It details an arbitrary month in 1998 for a mapping of concurrent work activities, familial patterns and personal incidents, and uses devices of the grid, whiteness, the miniature and the everyday directly borrowed directly from contemporaneous studio courses. Impressions of dolls hands, lego blocks, slide mounts and paracetamol pills were cast into the plaster; small wax teardrops and messages from the mouths of our children were stitched onto handkerchief linen as references to the daily trials, tribulations and triumphs of motherhood, academia and daily life.

Image 2: Material Maps: sixty two small cast plaster panels and embroidered fragments arranged to make physical the patterns of a collaborative partnership.

The diminutive scale of the panels echoes Bachelard's profound writings on the intimate immensity. It depicts the minutiae of daily events, tiny in themselves but significant, and attempts to convey the syncopated and contrapuntal rhythms generated by the coincidence and coexistence of two separate but interwoven working and living patterns in the arrangement of the individual pieces. In the repetition of particular aspects of the


7 Bachelard The Poetics of Space Chapters 7 & 8.
composition, it draws upon studies of pattern and type and acknowledges the continuum of architectural and cultural lore. The pleasure we took in the production of the work initiated a continuing, though erratic, series of mappings based on the overlap between home and work, the latest of which is suspended as partial experiments around our shared office space as a tangible prompts to research activity. Material Maps was later selected by MIT Press for inclusion in an anthology Eating Architecture and is described as follows:

Work environments, whether educational institutions or design practices usually operate with the implicit assumption that the primary progenitor of patterns, processes and activities is the work itself. However beneath this layer of rational organization and focus, exists the perpetual, invisible and diffuse patterns of the quotidian ...a tapestry of familial, social and mundane events, duties and joys, which continually threatens to unravel. This fabric is, for working mothers, less an invisible foundation garment than an apron...sometimes worn with pride, more often with pragmatism.8

playing the field

This text could be read not just as a summary of that project, but the ethos of our teaching and research in general. What might appear to be an orchestrated investigation of a set of themes through our teaching and research connections has actually been a series of gambles and reactive responses to circumstance and opportunity. The recurring themes aren't there because they're being methodically interrogated, or because they've been identified as critical epistemological frontiers, but mostly because of an inherent interest in them, and their unavoidable proximity and relevance to our lives as collaborators, mothers and designers. Neil Brown has described this characteristic as a valid approach to contemporary research: that practise as a mess and starting in the middle9 is a concept counter to the logical or systematic processes typical of orthodox research but no less legitimate.

While this tactic of starting in the middle is counter to conventional practice, so too have been the methods, tools and techniques of our creative production within the context of Interior Architecture education: stitching blind without a pattern; pouring plaster into makeshift moulds; replacing the computer with a sewing machine and using both sides of the paper not simply for economy. Each project is characterised by a desire to experiment with old media in a new way. The deliberate craft aesthetic of these works blatantly resists contemporary digital and high technology modes of production. Hence it is in danger of being dismissed for its archaic and domestic overtones in an environment that is predominantly focussed on pushing the limits of technology.

Despite the tangible external framework of the built environment, all occupation is intrinsically internalised whether in our homes or in our heads, and these projects attempt to make more manifest at least some of the existing profound and pervasive patterns of our inner lives. In this way these are interiorised research projects beyond the obvious connection to interior design. Against conventional generators of research practices, which refer consistently to the establishment of new knowledge, it could be argued that these exemplify a form of anti-research. In addition the status of design based research in current higher education research climate in Australasia, remains unclear. However, given the anticipated changes in the regulation of the research framework, and fuelled by provocations from leading design academics10 to challenge current orthodoxies, we have optimistically embarked on these types of projects as a compelling form of research which may or may not be legitimised.

It might be apt to conclude with a final pragmatic observation on how our research is produced, the actual mechanics of the process. It is a totally joint endeavour, where we produce the work at the same computer at the same time, discussing, brainstorming, and editing all at once. In the case of the creative works, substitute a drawing board, worktable or kitchen for computer screen. While this might not be an efficient way to work for everyone, and in an open plan environment it has the disadvantage of disrupting collegiate concentration, it does have the advantage

---

8 Lawrence & Hurst Diffuse Patterns of the Quotidian p 36f.
9 Brown Developing an Individual Research Plan unpaginated

10 For example, Brown "Developing an Individual Research Plan" unpaginated
of making collaborative research a conversation and a way of insinuating our friendship into the task at hand. These incremental, interstitial and incidental projects which celebrate ordinary inner geographies are not likely candidates for the major and politically correct research grants and as such, we risk exclusion from the mainstream of national research funding and recognition. The alternative gamble is denying our ardent belief and pleasure in the universal value of small everyday acts of creativity as the foundation of daily life and ethical design practice.

It returns us to de Certeau and his speculations on the worth of blurring the dividing line between work and leisure (which can just as usefully be applied to teaching and research). The two areas of activity flow together. They repeat and reinforce each other. 11 or, in a quote which is tempting enough to stitch onto an apron, Sly as a fox and twice as quick: there are countless ways of making do 12

References:

11 de Certeau The Practice of Everyday Life v 1, p 29.
12 de Certeau The Practice of Everyday Life v 1, p 29.
Design, specifically Industrial Design, in conjunction with Architecture and Interior Design, produces the items of everyday use that make and fill our homes. Disseminated via advertising and commerce, from *Vogue Living* to 'The Warehouse', design is generally used as a ‘value added’ attribute, overlaying necessity with desire, and seeking to convince ‘consumers’ that one product is better than another, despite nominal functional differences. The most complex ‘value added’ quality promoted, is the possibility that the desired product will transform the consumer’s everyday into an idealised ‘life style’.

SubArt is an ongoing collaborative project in the murky territory between Design and Fine Art. By critiquing the differences between domesticity and its fashionable image, irreplaceable and mass-produced objects, and the designed tool versus the rarified artwork, SubArt has designed hybrid works that test the conventions of these boundaries. By rethinking the subjective relationships constructed by the design object itself (primarily the ‘producer’ and the ‘consumer’) through the contemporary art theory of ‘relational aesthetics’, original design may have been created.

...a scene which greatly depends on ideas of touch and the memory of hands, and belongs to the visually lazy or sightless journeys of the body through its immediate envelope of space.\(^1\)

The ongoing project, SubART, frames an investigation into the operations of art and design in domestic contexts. As a collaboration between an artist, an interior architect and an industrial designer, the project has resulted in much interdisciplinary risk taking: negotiating conflicts in methods and language, of priorities and expectations, and of conventions in practice. But what this research has revealed as most at risk, which I will discuss in this paper, is the object of study itself: the everyday quality of the domestic life and the role art and design play in manipulating domestic consumption. SubART has been seeking ways to transform the relationship between analysis and production and thus to define and mediate these threats.

A ‘forensic examination,’ as invited by the conference theme, reveals the risk inherent

\(^1\) Bryson in *Looking at the Overlooked* p 76.
within this project. Such processes promote dismemberment of ‘chaos’ into objectified and alienated boundaries, defining ‘occupant’, ‘action’, ‘habitat’, ‘observer’ (whether designer, artist or an actual detective), and their roles as passive or active agents in the study. The resulting research material, like a crime scene, leaves the subject in the repose of a corpse. This investigation method sharply contrasts the everyday that, as described by Norman Bryson, ‘greatly depends on ideas of touch and... the visually lazy.’ With consideration of this design for domestic contexts, and making artwork for and about the home, an awareness of the risks of excessive systematisation and abstracted judgement must be developed. Not least for the inevitable attraction of making abstract assertions on the best and worst ways to live, and arbitrary judgements about wayward habits and lapses of safety. By adopting elements of relational aesthetics, fashionable in contemporary art theory, SubART has been able to propose alternative ways of thinking the polar objects of ‘consumer’ or ‘user’, the ‘artist’, the ‘designer’ and the ‘design product’. The research findings presented here are postulate that a more (ecologically and intellectually) sustainable mode of everyday practice can emerge through the reconceptualising of analytical boundaries within the process of creative production in domestic contexts.

Begun in 2005, SubART has so far exhibited three ‘products’ at the interface between art and design. My aim is not to describe these objects in this essay, images will be shown in the presentation. Rather, this paper is written as an enquiry from the perspective of a designer who looks for a way to critique the designed project in fine art terms. But also, as the project is ongoing, it aims to reflect on how these products came about, and where new products could emerge. This critique, this paper in fact, does not attempt to tread too easily on what we have done; to engage with risk in our own research practices it is important not to be un-critical of our various assumptions and lapses in the investigation process. Placed in juxtaposition with the products, this paper seeks to propose rigorous directions, future explorations, in the way that the writing of theory always laces between and through made objects of theory.

As commented by a referee of this paper, the conjunction of fine art and design is a well-travelled path, and in Europe, generally speaking, this conjunction can be almost seamless. In the New Zealand context however, for whatever reason, art and design meet in tension, and as a consequence, the flow of concepts from one zone to another has been fraught. Accordingly the establishment of the SubART collaborative was met with degrees of both condescension and optimism. With the former, there were expressions of the relative naivety or stupidity of the opposing discipline, and in the later, a view that more money is available in the ‘other’ discipline. The question of money, or more specifically, the opportunities that design presents as the producer of ‘consumer goods,’ is perhaps the most intriguing of the misconceptions driving the initial phase of the project. In New Zealand the opportunity for independent designers to produce and sell their work, to the extent where they could be said to be ‘making money,’ while in competition with imported products is rare. This necessity to see the project as producing ‘consumer goods’ did however alert collaborators to the critical issues in contemporary design which revolve round sustainability and the ethical question of domestic over-consumption.

The domestic is where we carry out our everyday lives: it is not the time or place where we contemplate the finitude of life, nor the majesty of fine art. The opportunities and difficulties of approaching it as an object of study through the frame of fine art, is apparent in Bryson’s collection of essays published in Looking at the Overlooked. By comparing still-life and other representations of the quotidian through the history of Western painting, Bryson suggests that the representational problem of quotidian space as a site of continual distracted activity, shifting moods, meals cooked and milk spilt. It is not a heroic tale with a beginning middle and end, but a continuous rolling forward of one day into the next. It is also a site that draws moralised judgements. As the title of his essay ‘Abundance’ suggests, the tradition of the painting of food and other corporeal excesses, has given licence to criticise the corpulence, laziness and slovenly behaviour of others. In critique of The Battle between

---

1 Bryson Looking at the Overlooked p 76.
2 Bourriaud Relational aesthetics.
3 Not to mention the ‘writer’ or ‘theorist’ who is allocated an outside or sideline position to the process of production.
4 Bryson Looking at the Overlooked, particularly the essays ‘Rhopography’ pp 60-95 and ‘Abundance’ pp 96-135.
By Pieter Brueghel, Bryson suggests:

Carnival and Lent

It is humanity seen through the eyes of class condescension and even class hatred. At the same time, however, there is the possibility that this life of appetite and creatively dependence may be presented in the image as a universal state, one which as much concerns the superior viewing class as is does its peasant figures; there is intimacy that at a certain level of existence, namely that of hunger and food, all people are equally comic and degraded.  

Similarly, in the still life paintings of Juan Sánchez Cotán (1561-1624) and Francisco de Zurbarán (1598-1664), though painted in celebration of the common place and mundane, Bryson argues, there is “a sense of reproof and correction offered.” The rigour and precision of the views constructed, alienates the observer from the observed, for example, Zurbarán’s painting The Young Virgin:

The painting is severe in its demands on perception: the flooding of the darkened world with its light is painful as the eye is stung into action, and disused optical pathways are re-opened and switched to current. But the strain is necessary, if vision is to rise above the fallen world.  

Because the manipulations possible in representations of the quotidian were already construed as a mechanism for the edification of the sleepy audience, Bryson goes on to argue, the genre contained “potential for isolating a purely aesthetic space.” This characteristic he suggests, is “undoubtedly one of the factors which make the genre so central in the development of modernism,” and subsequently inflated the importance of the genre in the discourse of Western Art History. When Cézanne (1839-1906) painted a table of fruit, with bowl and tablecloth, the composition was intended to display an aesthetic spectacle rather than any domestic scene. And when the Cubist painter, Juan Gris (1887-1927) produced Breakfast (1914) it was not to celebrate domestic routines, but to explore the “pull between the forces of abstraction and the… inertia of still life’s familiar forms.”

The making of art, pre-modern and Modern, desires a forcing through, or a shattering of the boundary of distracted habit: it demands an awakening, and a sensitising of the viewer, whether to the beauty of the life, or the ridiculousness of the corporeal. Perhaps to protect the realm of distracted habit, contemporary art has tended to suppress the domestic. Andrew Brighton, in the essay “Avant-Garde and Kitsch Revisited” argues:

Modern serious art’s hostility to the habitual and the familiar make it profoundly unsuitable to the task of creating… [a] sense of community, identity and civic pride… [he goes on to suggest]… the reconsideration of the domestic is of value to serious art to the degree that it problematises it.  

Considering works such as Rachel Whiteread’s House (1993), Damian Hirst’s The Physical Impossibility of Death in the Mind of Someone Living (1991), or the Chapman brother’s provocative anatomically manipulated mannequins, it’s clear that much contemporary art, in the quest to sting the eye and the mind into action, has adopted ever more blunt techniques. The aim of SubART is not to analyse the problematising issues of the domestic in art, so for the sake of the length of this paper I will adopt Brighton’s argument without the critique that it deserves, but rather ask what is it, in Modern art’s hostility to the habitual and the familiar that reveals to us something about the nature of domesticity and domestic space, hence making it useful for designing domestic objects? This question is pertinent, not least of all, when Modern design is not immune to the anti-domestic trend. The (anti)-domestic interiors to which I refer, the vast open areas of flooring with subdued colours and even more subdued interior detailing, are those familiar sights of contemporary design magazines. As Bryson suggest:

[A]nti]he modernist house… the barriers between compartments of space are thrown down and space re-unifies in an open plan bounded by white and empty walls; the modernist interior resolves the problem of overproduction by carving out from the general profusion a secluded emptiness that marks an escape from the teeming and seething pool of commodities. The visibility of goods becomes an embarrassment and must be screened, making of culinary space, for example, a vacant stage surrounded by concealing doors; those few possession which are displayed are chosen

6 Bryson Looking at the Overlooked p 101 
7 Bryson Looking at the Overlooked p 76. 
8 Bryson Looking at the Overlooked p 76. 
9 Bryson Looking at the Overlooked p 81. 
10 Bryson Looking at the Overlooked p 85. 
11 For example in Reed Not at Home. 
12 Brighton ‘Avant-Garde and Kitsch Revisited’ p 256
to make the surrounding space vibrate with its own emptiness.  

In popular culture, the mechanisms that sell domestic objects seek to cultivate the usual models of desire, envy, insecurity and promise. A house, as a beautiful home, is described in a magazine, whether for the sake of selling carpet, wall paint, furniture, art or design, as the domain of a consumable ideal. The ideal, by definition cannot be an ugly mess of the everyday; specific depiction of the idiosyncrasies of domestic life, rather in the minimal, pared back simplicity of a condition of the Beauty ideal. In mimicry of Le Corbusier’s call for the ‘machine for living’, contemporary fashion’s call is for a minimal house, not minimal in scale or number of bathrooms, but in its ability to sequester the affects of domestic consumption. Contemporary domesticity opens the interior to the landscape, to light and the hygiene of home filled with light, efficiency and vacancy. However, simultaneously there is an increasing tendency to promote ‘consumer choice’ as the contemporary mode of identity construction. Research conducted in this area, such as by Ian Woodward (2001), by necessity, simplifies the clutter of the domestic, erasing the un-ideal ugliness of complexity, through the study of consumable ‘epiphany objects.’

However, these choices are increasingly normalised; dictated by the need to be fashionable, and to renew, or ‘make-over’ one’s look. As a consequence the magazine lifestyle image quickly slips into the realm of kitsch; the viewer, and possible consumer, recognising the falseness of the construction. The occupants have no wrinkles, nor do their clothes, and ever increasingly, nor do the interiors they occupy. In the pursuit of the impossible ideal of a domestic Beauty, creases and folds in interior surfaces are subtracted, either under the aegis of cleanliness, low maintenance, or a transcendence of domestic clutter.

So, if both modern art and modern design are being propelled away from the habitual and the visually lazy, where should one look for an alternative direction? In Bryson’s discussion, he identifies one artist as attending both to the necessity of artfulness and the everyday. The still life paintings of Jean-Baptiste-Siméon Chardin (1699-1779), Bryson suggests, succeed in overcoming the de-familiarising act of representation by painting the blurred vision of the ‘every-day’. Chardin’s renderings of the domestic can be seen simultaneously as a unique art scene, and a mundane habitual environment, Bryson argues, because he attended to the duration of the gaze; the passing of a distracted vision across the mixed terrain of the familiar. By representing the quotidian as it becomes present, every day, Chardin avoids an idealisation of the domestic in a state of kitsch, nor does he heroicise the everyday beyond the pale. But what, beyond the realm of painting, could such blurriness mean? What is an out-of-focus interior? How does one conceive of a design product within the duration of a gaze?

Returning to the scene of contemporary art, another strain of work is being produced which has emerged out of the performance art of ‘events’ and ‘happenings’ of the late 1960s. Recently defined as ‘relational aesthetics’ by Nicolas Bourriaud, this art specifically engages in creating the environment for, and documenting the effect on, social relationships. In Rirkrit Tiravanija’s Untitled (Tomorrow Is Another Day) (1996) at the Kölnischer Kunstverein, for example, the scene of art, the gallery, became the scene for the initiation of domestic intimacy. As Claire Bishop describes the work, “a wooden reconstruction [of the artist’s] New York apartment... was made open to the public twenty-four hours a day,” living in the gallery for the duration of the exhibition, Tiravanija recorded the event as a diary of conversations of industry gossip and flirting with visitors.

As Bourriaud defines it, the programme of relational aesthetics asks: “does this work permit me to enter into dialogue? Could I exist, and how, in the space it defines?” While such questions, it can be said, are common to all art, Bishop’s critique adds to this definition when she suggests the "clearest..."
expression of Bourriaud's argument [is] that relational art privileges intersubjective relations over detached opticality.\(^{19}\) That is, the artist, though maintaining the position of initiator of the event of the work, is only a partial component in the work itself: only one subject amongst the many subjective relationships formed. The heroic status of the artist is marginalised while the agency of the 'audience' is activated beyond the role of consumer, able to influence the nature of the work. Hence the work is also 'blurred': no longer a finite object to be hung on the wall, it unfolds in time, and not only disappears but is potentially un-made by the end of the exhibition.

Taken into the context of design, these concepts have the potential to shift the understanding of design. SubART products have not been developed as new designs for existing domestic objects, but as potentially creating new types of objects. These objects share the common property of being wall-mounted objects similar to paintings. With this in mind they are visually tasteful and have aspects of colour and form that invoke, for example, a landscape, an abstract colour field, or a still life. These objects however are designed to be used as variously, placemats, a safe place to stash your keys, and a hanger for clothes. Though when 'at rest' the works look potentially dull, it is through rearrangement and use that they become active, and their value as meaningful art/design objects is revealed. Though there have been designs that purport to pursue a similar aim, SubART, we believe, has done something slightly different, primarily because there is no concept of the 'proper way' to use the works: there is not a correct layout or placing. Rather mis-use, whether chaotic and cluttered or restrained and cleared away, is elevated by the works, to present and celebrate the everyday, in all its habits, slippages and distractions.

\(^{19}\) Bishop 'Antagonism and Relational Aesthetics' p 61.
**References:**


The paper uses the instance of a visit to Cairo, Egypt to examine how interiority operates within an urban context, in order to identify how the city works and to examine its mechanisms of spatial and social connection. It examines the city as revealed to the foreigner, an outsider. The paper considers the role of Edmund Burke's *A Philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful* in defining notions of interiority and exteriority.

**Introduction**

Cairo is a word which conjures images of pyramids and pharaohs, the Nile and the origins of western civilisation. Its 16 million people make it second only to Indian cities in terms of population density. It is an icon of foreignness and the exotic. For the west, Egypt is both a familiar, well known image, embedded in primary school projects on pyramids, and a distant world, in time, geography and culture. As such, it crosses definitions of interiority and exteriority. For the first time lone traveller, it is a place which seemingly repels and resists the foreigner. It is a hard city. This paper explores Cairo as an urban cultural site which manipulates conditions of interiority and exteriority, as shadows of Burke's *Philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful*, from the view of a single female western English-speaking traveller — a foreigner in Cairo in all senses of the word. The paper argues that risk, as "the thing which comes into play with every possibility of something... challenging... a recipe for... engaging with strangeness," is a measure of a degree of openness to exteriority and is managed and ameliorated by interiority. It is a critical aspect of the shifting and defining
boundary which distinguishes and shapes interiority and exteriority. Taking and avoiding risks can extend, maintain or obliterate regimes of interiority, as descended from Burkes' eighteenth-century definition of the beautiful as small, smooth, clear, delicate, and socially oriented, while exteriority traces links to the sublime, as vast, incomprehensible, obscure and intimidating. Traditional ideas of the interior as safe, accommodating, comfortable, controlled, intimate and comprehensible, and the exterior as environmental, volatile, exposed, distant and dangerous suggest a lineage to Burke's discourse, which breaks from a mundane accounting of inside and outside as arbiters of interior architecture as a theoretical discipline. The paper suggests that foreignness is where the sublime and the beautiful collapse into each other, extending geo-spatial notions of interiority and exteriority, which are the abstract and theoretical distillations of an interior or an exterior, respectively. The paper draws on the experience of travel to Cairo, Egypt and notions of foreignness to articulate and test this.

**Arrival**

The point of leaving the airport on foreign soil is perhaps, for most people, the first meaningful affront of exteriority in their travels. On leaving the plane and entering Cairo city, an awareness of being ill-equipped to cope with the immensity of this city of 16 million foreigners, and what it stood for, became enormous and incomprehensible. The spatial rhetoric of the sublime predominated. Forward planning became exposed as a limited form of control, one dependent on locals to also operate according to a foreign set of rules — yours not theirs. Such planning simply defers the inevitability of the foreign and of risk, and is undermined only by confinement to an airport hotel, or package tours (epitomes of going nowhere which insulate the traveller from foreignness). The visitor is not in control of how they become familiar and intimate with the city. This immensity was juxtaposed with the domestic scale atmosphere, and seemingly unregulated and comic informality, of immigration and customs procedures at Cairo airport at 7am local time.

On entry into a truly foreign place, the substance of interiority vanishes. The slim traces and fragments which remain don't protect against vulnerability and the need for defence that exteriority demands. Exteriority in Cairo for me was lined with insecurity. My greatest fear was an inability to operate in this foreign and politically unstable world, manifest in the potential inability to escape (loss of passport, airline tickets), or to survive (loss of money, credit card failure). Everything was dusty and dirty and looked as if it was on the point of failure. My past reliance on cleanliness as a signal for working condition became revealed as ineffective in the North African desert. Cleanliness, in my Anglo-American world, was a sign of use, it betrayed a recent interaction and engagement — that some thing was still relevant and so part of a functioning society. The formal qualities of Burke's definition of beauty (as smooth, clear and delicate) suggest an alignment with ideas of care, maintenance and cleanliness. Dirt (Douglas' "matter out of place [which] offends against order"), suggests redundancy and obsolescence — that which is past and outside and hence exterior, unable to meet my everyday needs. A dust covered ATM machine does not inspire confidence when your sole source of money relies on plastic credit cards. It repels interiority as that which supports familiarity, intimacy and accessibility to use. Exteriority was hence resident in the perception of both danger (real and imagined), and the foreign condition of the everyday. Western images of order (clean streets, traffic control, safety belts in cars, a common language, a common currency, safe ways to cross streets, common dress appearance) were all absent. These non-architectural manifestations of interiority (rules, customs, comprehension, agreed understandings and expectations) gain intensity and significance in their loss when butted against another culture. Danger and risk infiltrated the very basic levels of survival in the face of poverty, pollution, and infection: "Don't even think of drinking from the tap in Egypt... Tap water is not safe to drink throughout Egypt. Stick to bottled water or boil water for 10 minutes, use water-purification tablets or a filter."

Personal health required a scrutinising of normally mundane objects and activities and everyday life, which, for Leuilliot, "is what

---

3 Exteriority and interiority are intrinsically personalised positions.

4 Douglas Purity and Danger pp 36, 2.

5 Maxwell et al Lonely Planet pp 85, 558.
Take ONE tablet once daily with food until finished.

๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋๋.om
suffice. It is a stretching of the known, and a desire or realisation of the unknown, the incomprehensible, a tendency toward vastness, and the sublime. The additional is supplementary, the icing on the cake, or the dispensable. To be 'in addition' is to be aware that as a foreigner you are expendable, and someone who stands out as not belonging. In contrast interiority is a bounded condition, whether theoretically, socially, culturally, temporarily, or physically bounded condition, whether theoretically, not belonging. In contrast interiority is a expendable, and someone who stands out as aware that as a foreigner you are dispensable. To be 'in addition' is to be supplementary, the icing on the cake, or the.

McCarthy 'Foreignness and Productions of Interiority' Inhabiting Risk IDEA Conference 2007

Manufacturing Localness

Egyptians are salespeople par excellence. Intimate contact is persistently offered in the touristic economy of Cairo. Journeying to the pyramids at Saqqara or Giza you cannot fail to meet persistent and truly professional touts who are courteous, polite, insistent, and who meet rudeness with amplified offence. Closeness and uneasiness co-exist, the pleasure and fear which respectively play out for Burke in the beautiful and the sublime find themselves in close proximity. On the streets and in the market place of Khan al-Khalili there is an elegant slipperiness; an inoffensive positioning of closeness, and the persistent gentleness of one whose friendship is genuine because it is critically determined by an economic necessity to make money. Shopkeepers forge connections with foreigners and construct interiority through processes of negotiation and bargaining. The social orientation and interaction of the beautiful again emerges. The Lonely Planet describes haggling as:

part of everyday life in Egypt and almost everything is open to haggling, from hotel rooms to the price of imported cigarettes. Even in shops where prices are clearly marked, many Egyptians will still try to shave something off the bill... when buying in souqs such as Cairo's Khan al-Khalili, bargaining is imperative unless you are willing to pay well over the odds... remember it's a game not a fight. This social construction of intimacy uses various techniques. Skilled sellers stitch their research into tourist origins, and the provision of services (cups of tea or coffee, directions, advice, invitations to parties) into relationships of familiarity, debt and dependency. They weave interiority about you, enthralling with psychological entrapment, exploiting basics levels of etiquette, and social obligations. Skilled recall and memory of specific tourists and of particular places forge attachments to potential buyers through time and place. Their knowledge of the tourist means New Zealanders can be greeted with 'Kia Ora' and 'Kiwi' over 16,000 kilometres from home. Everyone I met said they had either been to New Zealand or were going there. Everyone positioned themselves as the traveller's 'best friend.' For some this is an unwanted and one-sided intimacy, as the Egyptian's ability to interact, productively and positively with 'strangers' is misread as nuisance, instead of good-natured economics. Insistence on participation implicates commitment, the risk of finding yourself indebted, or of being sucked into a situation you find you have no control over. Closeness in this context forms across the tension between a fabricated intimacy and a system of etiquette you have little knowledge or control over. This form of negotiation and exchange, of give and take, occupies the interstices of interiority and exteriority. The tourist who haggles at a distance, suspicious of paying more for an item worth less, misreads haggling as a competitive art, and prioritises the result over the process, which is one of engagement, incorporation and interior play. Instead haggling typically becomes a perverted system capable of proving 'localness' among foreigners. Youth hostel discussions become stories of prowess — boasting about cheap prices and how one deceived the locals.

Taxis

The fear of being 'ripped-off' as a tourist unschooled in local notions of value, hardens the tourist who cannot believe the locals, especially taxi drivers, and instead seeks the frighteningly universal authority of Lonely Planet.

13 Burke describes the incomprehensible sublime in terms of extension. Burke A Philosophical Inquiry Part II. § VII, p 126.
14 The opposite is not the case, that which is excessive to the exterior is more exterior, e.g. outerspace.
15 Maxwell et al Lonely Planet p 532.
16 "If you do get your price or lower, never feel guilty — no vendor, no matter what they may tell you, ever sells below cost." Lonely Planet p 532.
If a driver suspects that you don’t know what the correct fair is, then you’re fair game for fleecing. As long as you know you’re not underpaying (and the fares in this book are generous), just walk away. It’s all bluster and the driver is playing on the fact that you’re a khwaga (foreigner) and don’t know better.¹⁷

Lack of trust breeds suspicion, and maintains the tourist as foreign and exterior. As Kristeva puts it “In the world of dodges and shams that make up his pseudo-relationships with pseudo-others, hatred provides the foreigner with consistency.”¹⁸ The impossibility then of the tourist to truly know local value means that tourism engenders a possibility then of the tourist to truly know because taxis are shared.”¹⁹

E15 (tourist).

While the taxi ride is far more than this. While the Lonely Plant describes taxis as “by far the most convenient way of getting about,”²⁰ and analytically dissects the process,²¹ the taxi ride is far more than this. It is a beautiful microcosm of the city, and it is dangerously seductive. The lack of seat belts and the constant flux which typifies vehicular traffic in Cairo demands constant awareness and self-awareness of the travelling environment by both driver and passenger, and places the knowledge of one’s relative position as critical. It is a civic contract of responsibility and responsiveness within the city. Once the taxi I was in suddenly stopped to avoid hitting sideways traffic and I flew into the back of the front seat (there were no seat belts). The driver looked at me disapprovingly: “Watch out!” His look conveyed the message that I had responsibilities that I wasn’t keeping up with. It was my (and everyone else’s) responsibility to know what was going on, and to be ready to adapt to the consequences. Even as a back seat passenger, I was part of the larger city fabric. It was wrong to take a position outside it.

Driving at its best in Cairo is a wonderful choreography and is death defying. At its worst it is somewhat tame, echoing Anglo-American modes of driving. The usual paraphernalia of the street (traffic lights, traffic officers, road markings and roundabouts) are present, and to these are appended an expectation of acceptance and responsibility to be aware.

I would like to think the dance of traffic is universally appreciated by local Egyptians, but I have met Egyptians who relish driving in Cairo and others who live in fear of it. For an Anglo-American eye, Cairo traffic appears unruly. Road markings (lane markings, pedestrian crossings) appear to be completely ignored (two-laned roads easily accommodate three cars abreast), pedestrians and other cars move among the traffic. It is as if an intelligent awareness infiltrates the individual cars sewing them into an elastic system where they both move independently and work as one. The realisation of one’s place within the city effects a complex system of interiority, manufactured through techniques of participation, interaction, and generosity. Honking appears to be an incomprehensible art, and everything occurs at speed. Sophisticated weavings are elegant, beautiful and skilfully terrifying, and adrenalin-dense.

In this Cairo, a cultural intelligence predominates. The citizens do not fear the sublime too, whether this cause of terror, be endured

Spatial Exchange

The taxi ride is the best illustration of this. While the Lonely Plant describes taxis as "by far the most convenient way of getting about,"²⁰ and analytically dissects the process,²¹ the taxi ride is far more than this. It is a beautiful microcosm of the city, and it is dangerously seductive. The lack of seat belts and the constant flux which typifies

---

¹⁸ Kristeva Strangers to Ourselves p 13.
¹⁹ A taxi from Talaat Harb to Heliopolis is E7-10 (local), E15 (tourist).
²¹ "It doesn’t matter if there is already someone inside because taxis are shared." Lonely Planet p 550.
²² "Whatever therefore is terrible, with regard to sight, is sublime too, whether this cause of terror, be endured
of interiority from exteriority might involve a misunderstanding of the sublime (terror and the incomprehensible) as beautiful (elegant and within one's individual or collective ability). Risk is a balancing and assessment of these extremes. It is an aspect of faith as much as it is of knowledge. Interiorised, it is a positioning of responsibility and an obligation to be skillful.

In Cairo taxi drivers do not necessarily know where they are to go. Cairo is a large city of 16 million people. A new development off the Ring Rd caused confusion resolved by taxi drivers asking pedestrians, other drivers, and stopping at local hotels. Lack of knowledge though was not a reason to not proceed. Instead a freedom to inquire, and to openly acknowledge a lack of knowledge, demonstrated a dependence on the knowledge of strangers and presented the city as immensely interconnected. This interconnectedness, and its rights and responsibilities were played out many times. The taxi drivers had no qualms about asking bystanders on footpaths for directions for where I wanted to go, as the map provided often made no sense to them.\textsuperscript{23} The initial stages of most taxi rides consisted of such inquiry, going from one pedestrian to another, popping into hotels to ask for directions to destinations, and stopping in the middle of the road, the conversation (of where exactly the conference venue was) becoming the subject of discussion between three or four stopped cars, windows wound down, in the middle of busy traffic. Communication and alternating productions of distance and intimacy reproduced new understandings of the city, where everyone was simultaneously close and far away.

This proposed to me that, for Cairo to work as a city, contact must be privileged, and one must be secure in taking risks and being made vulnerable. Relishing contact with strangers is a critical dynamic and contrasts the 'stranger-danger' mentality of Anglo-American urbanity which seemingly privileges conditions of isolation and distance, and the elimination of close proximity. The cars themselves appeared to also operate in a flexible, organic relation to notions of regulation. Road markings, predicted two lane traffic where taxis over- and under-took, impossibly slipping between other cars. Speed and elegance and the sophisticated awareness of the city, of other cars and pedestrians, made a responsive choreography. Crossing roads was a process of prolonged negotiation, moving slowly and predictably, allowing drivers (who didn't necessarily slow down), to participate in the mutual making room for us all.

Giving and taking worked to find ways where we could all operate — not necessarily in our individually preferred optimum condition — but rather as negotiated and compromised means, where that which enabled the city to continue to operate was acknowledged and privileged. Common sense rather than litigious hardness prevailed, and proposed that interiority is a form of responsive awareness, interactivity, and negotiation, dependent on an engagement with risk. Cairo demands that such active participation be stitched into its city's fabric, and in this way the foreigner experiencing Cairo in terms of exteriority is subject to an idea of pragmatism which acknowledges others needs and accommodates them within the city's terms. Cairo is a harsh city, but equally its inhabitants and the city are always reaching out to you. The constant crossing of boundaries into personal space is both surprising for the unaware and culturally exhausting. As Somer notes: 'The violation of individual distance is the violation of society's expectations; the invasion of personal space is an intrusion into a person's self-boundaries.'\textsuperscript{24} Contact risks, and reaction can either deepen or slash interiority.

Conclusion

Interiority is conventionally that which uncontrovertially sits inside. Travel beyond the aircraft presents the difficulty of such sustained interiority, and, in Cairo, Anglo-American risk is reframed in terms of an unlikely incorporation of Burke's overwhelming sublime through responsive urban networks, commitment to automotive and social skills, and the art of urban compromise. Risk provides the possibility of this transformative work on the sublime - a staple of exteriority, and it is perhaps the possibility of such transformative work that enables the very abstraction of interiority, as released from simplistic architectural frames which crudely reference insideness, to

\textsuperscript{23} It seemed that a significant number of Egyptian taxi drivers aren't able to read maps.

\textsuperscript{24} Sommer Personal Space p 27.
instead inform a wider and more productive theoretical base.

References:
Intrusion and Reconfiguration in Occupied Territories

Terry Meade
University of Brighton, UK

Division, separation and intrusion into private domains are contemporary issues. New laws, rules and regulations in the political sphere, the increased use of surveillance, the militarisation of public space and the use of checkpoints and barriers, all point to fear of an intractably disordered and dangerous world.

This paper will be about the inhabitation of interior space against such a background of unease, threat and insecurity. Using the Israel/Palestine conflict as a case study, this paper will examine spaces of occupation. It will focus on intrusion and reconfiguration of private space and the risks involved in building viable domestic environments within complex and rapidly changing situations.

The 'state of exception' identified by Giorgio Agamben, as the abrogation of the principle of law, will act as a frame through which to explore some of the issues of control and security which have kept the all inhabitants of this region hostage for decades.

This paper will attempt to extract some lessons from the study of a heavily contested environment, in order to unravel the effect that issues of security and control have had on domestic space and the discipline of 'Interiors' in the 21st Century.

---

* The background for this paper comes from work carried out in Israel/Palestine with an Israeli peace group. The Israeli Committee Against House Demolitions (ICAHD), is a non-violent Israeli direct-action organisation established to resist Israel’s demolition of Palestinian houses in the Occupied Territories — over 12,000 homes destroyed since 1967 — and, ultimately, to end Israel’s occupation of Palestine.
If oppression is so awful, it's because of how it limits movement, rather than because it violates eternal values. Risk is an attractive subject to explore, particularly when associated with inhabitation. Risk is usually associated with words such as danger and insecurity, or it is coupled with other words in order to determine the amount of risk in a certain situation – risk analysis, risk management and risk assessment. I want to explore ideas about interiors, inhabitation and risk in a situation where, insecurity and fear often provoke a radical reshaping of an environment and where movement, interaction, and risk management all have heightened significance. In this paper I will examine the concept of risk in relation to occupation.

Inhabiting Risk

"Occupation is not just a state of forced control," writes Arthur Neslen, "it is also a state of mind, a way of keeping busy and of passing time." Occupation may be considered as the acquisition of territory by force, a process of keeping people and places confined (and defined), within physical boundaries. It can also be seen as inhabited space, where borders become defended boundaries.

A life under occupation moves within an unsettled time frame. It is fundamentally a discontinuous existence, often defined by an unpredictable procession of events. Occupation is experienced in houses and public spaces, with guns and bombs and other weapons. But also with bulldozers, walls and fences, infrastructure, settlements and policies of enclosure separation and containment. Most people are familiar with their own culture and surroundings. Those under occupation are forced to exist within two cultures; a second, usually, alien culture is spread over the existing one. Confronting each other, these two cultures elicit different behaviour and inhabit the same spaces in different ways. For the occupied, daily routines and activity are curtailed, moulded and adapted to the changed environment, often with corrosive effect. For the occupier, vast amounts of energy and resources are expended on enforcing new rules and regulations and maintaining a protective skin to 'sustain the air inside its own bubble.'

If fantasy can be grounds for license and pleasure (the popular meaning is not of course completely out), it can just as well surface as fierce blockading protectiveness, walls up all around our inner and outer, psychic and historical, selves. This paper will focus on Israel/Palestine as a special place. Since its creation in 1948, a National state of emergency has existed there for every year bar one, 1966. It is a place where occupation and conflict is deeply inscribed in the urban fabric. Israelis and Palestinian's view the conflict in fundamentally different ways. Israeli's frame it almost exclusively in terms of security. In this framing, they are the victims of unremitting vicious terrorist violence, which must be met with force. Palestinians frame the conflict in terms of resistance to a brutal occupation, which has lasted nearly 40 years, and dispossessed them of their land, livelihood and independence. Both sides have resorted to extreme measures of violence against the other, each using their own resources. The issue of security is therefore hugely significant for both communities. A bomb on a bus or in a café in an Israeli town or city is hideous and absolutely indefensible. There is no denying the fear such attacks provoke. Equally indefensible is a refusal to see the link that occupation (with its concomitant settlement building, targeted assassinations, land seizure, demolitions and blockades), has with terror attacks in Israel. In this paper I subscribe to the view of the conflict expressed below by an Israeli peace campaigner Dr Jeff Halper: Our reframing, rejects the notion of 'both sides'. While we recognize that the Palestinians and the wider Arab and Muslim worlds possess their share of responsibility, we also recognize the fundamental asymmetry of power between the sides. Israel is an internationally recognized state possessing overwhelming military and economic might and allied to the world's dominant super-power. It is occupying the lands of a stateless people, impoverished, with no army and little political leverage. Given that equation, we contend that Israel possesses the ability to end the Occupation, the major obstacle to a just peace and regional security, and will do so

2 Neslen Occupied Minds p 3.
3 Rose States of Fantasy p 4.
4 Halper Obstacles to Peace p1.
5 Jeff Halper is the coordinator of the Israeli Committee Against House Demolitions (ICAHD)
only when it is brought into compliance with internationally accepted standards of human rights and international law—not to mention Jewish morality and values.⁶

A regime of walls and borders pervades almost every level of contact between Palestinians and Israelis. The Israeli Peace group, 'Checkpoint Watch', use a number of terms (they call it a glossary of oppression), to distinguish the range of obstacles designed to curtail movement. These include separation walls, checkpoints, barriers, blockades, curfews and closed military areas.⁷ This 'matrix of control' is also extended through property regulations, employment, and restrictions on marriage. It is most visible in the relentless shrinking of the space of Palestinian inhabitation and mobility, imposing occupation as a form of house arrest.

Risk and Resistance

Resistance as a concept is far closer to defensiveness than to freedom; you resist when you don't want to budge⁸

Salim Shawamreh is a Palestinian who was born in the old city of Jerusalem in 1956. After the 1967 war his family was forced to move to the Shuafat refugee camp in East Jerusalem, the family lived in a room 3 metres by 6 metres. Salim studied to be a construction supervisor and eventually found a job in Saudi Arabia in 1978. After saving some money he returned to his family home, and bought a small plot of land on the periphery of the nearby town of Anata, just a few dozen meters into the West Bank. He applied to the Israeli Civil Administration for a building permit — each application costs about $5000 in application, surveying and lawyers fees. The permit was refused because the land had been zoned 'agricultural land,' although it was far too rocky to have ever been farmed. He was told that if he applied for a special permit to build on agricultural land he might receive it, so another $5000 — and this time he was refused the permit because the 'slope' of his land was too steep. Salim pointed out that, "Jerusalem is built on mountains, and from my land I can see the Hebrew University and French Hill." He was also told that his land was too close to a by-pass road — although the road had not yet been built. However, the Civil Administration officials advised him to apply once more. Another $5000, and another refusal, this time because they claimed he lacked two signatures of previous owners on the deed!

Finally, with my money running out and with nowhere to go with a growing family, I decided to build anyway. It was a cold calculation. There are thousands of Palestinian homes with demolition orders, but Israel only demolished a couple hundred a year — so I might buy a year or two, or maybe even 'win' the lottery and not have my house demolished at all. And don't forget, the 'peace process' had by then begun and everyone was sure that house demolitions would stop and that we would become part of the Palestinian state.⁹

Shortly after the family (Salim, his wife and 4 children), moved in, in 1994, the demolition order arrived. He began legal proceedings to counter it along with a number of other families in the same situation and their case went all the way to the Supreme Court. Their appeal was turned down in 1995. He and his family continued to live in the house for four years until 9th of July 1998, when the Civil Administration officials arrived with about 200 soldiers. They informed Salim that he had 15 minutes to remove his belongings because the house was to be demolished. After a struggle, Salim and his family were ejected and a bulldozer flattened their house. Salim’s wife Arabiya said:

In that demolition I lost everything. I lost all the memories of my life — pictures, documents, belongings from my childhood, my wedding, our years in Saudi Arabia. Everything that meant something to me personally. We lost all our possessions — our furniture, appliances. All our savings from all those years of work were gone.¹⁰

With the assistance of the Israeli Committee Against House Demolitions, (and as an act of resistance), the house was rebuilt. It was again demolished on August 3, 1998, rebuilt and demolished for the third time on April 4, 2001. Once again the rebuilding went ahead, and by April 2003, the family were ready to move into the fourth home. On April 3, 2003, just as the last plastering was being done inside the home, the Civil Administration bulldozers arrived again and demolished the home.

---

⁶ Halper Obstacles to Peace p 2.
⁷ Keshet Checkpoint Watch p 14.
⁸ Rose States of Fantasy p 5.
⁹ Halper Obstacles to Peace p 46.
¹⁰ Halper Obstacles to Peace p 49.
Salim's house has now been rebuilt for the fifth time. After the trauma of the demolitions and the effect on the family's mental health, they decided to make the home a centre for Palestinian and Israeli peace groups attempting to explore ways to bring a just peace to the country. The centre has been named Beit Arabiya, the House of Arabiya. Salim and his family are not permitted to live in the house (they have to rent a small apartment in the refugee camp), and can only visit for maintenance purposes or when the house is used for peace gatherings.

Uncertainty

A house demolition in Sur Bahir started at 10:30 August 2nd 2006. Soldiers surround the house while bulldozers commence the demolition

There is evidence to suggest that Israel uses planning practices and zoning regulations to effect a quiet transfer of Palestinians out of the country, or, "to confine them to small enclaves, thereby leaving the land (their land) free for Israeli settlement and annexation." The demolition of houses is an invidious part of this process. It is almost impossible for Palestinians under occupation to obtain building permits. Master plans and zoning regulations have been carefully prepared, in order to severely constrain Palestinian neighbourhoods. The Israeli authorities are thus able to deny building permits on supposedly 'professional planning grounds' and to demolish their 'illegal' homes without appearing to discriminate. This has resulted in a cycle of illegal construction and retributive demolition. Palestinians must decide whether to build without a permit and risk demolition, or not build at all and live cramped into spaces far too small for the family group.

The demolition process is arbitrary. "Since Palestinians do not have home mail delivery (including in East Jerusalem), demolition orders are distributed in a very haphazard manner. Occasionally a building inspector may knock on the door and hand the order to anyone who answers, including small children. More frequently the order is stuck into the doorframe or even left under a stone near the house." Palestinians may never receive the order and thus be denied recourse to the courts before the bulldozers arrive.

In Jerusalem a favoured practice is to 'deliver' an order at night by placing it somewhere near the targeted home, then arriving early in the morning, (just after the men have left for work), to demolish. Once it is affirmed, the bulldozers may arrive at any time – the same day, weeks or years later, or never.

Health problems related to stress and psychological tension (often aggravated by poor living conditions and financial strain), plague Palestinian communities. ICAHD members have been told explicitly by legal officials in the Civil Administration that fear and intimidation is effective in deterring Palestinians from building. Neimah Dandis, whose home in Anata was finally demolished in November 2004 after a wait of eight years, said, "My morning routine consisted of getting out of bed, going to the window to see if the bulldozers were approaching, then going to the bathroom."

The house in Sur Bahir, partly demolished after the family obtained a court order to postpone the demolition

Dr Meir Margalit, formerly a member of Jerusalem's City Council has described the differing effects that house demolition has

---

12 Halper Obstacles to Peace p 37.
13 Halper Obstacles to Peace p 37.
14 Halper Obstacles to Peace p 38. See also Amnesty International Report Under the Rubble (2004:4)
on men, women and children in Palestinian areas. For the men there is often deep humiliation at their inability to protect the family and provide it with basic shelter, combined with the loss of a living bond with the family's land. He says men often weep during (and long after), the demolitions, experience rage and swear vengeance. For Palestinian women, the house is central to their lives and their status as wives and mothers. Grief, depression and humiliation are common as the family is usually forced to seek accommodation in the often overcrowded homes of relatives and friends.}

Dr Margalite recounts the story of a Palestinian man who was summoned home from work to find his home a mass of concrete rubble and the family's furniture and personal belongings broken and full of dust lying outside. After initially trying to re-house his family by distributing his children among various relatives and friends he finally pitched a tent on his land so they could at least be together. This created an intolerable strain on the family because of the lack of privacy and lack of basic conveniences combined with their sense of humiliation at living in a tent. Eventually he decided he must take the risk of rebuilding his house. When asked why, he replied that his two daughters were now of marriageable age and that no one would take as a wife a girl living in a tent.

Children are generally greatly affected by the loss of home and possessions. They often see their parents beaten while trying to prevent the demolition. There is ample evidence of the trauma and distress through problems of bedwetting, nightmares, fear of leaving home and sharp decline in school grades. They are also often exposed to eruptions of domestic violence caused by the strain of displacement, humiliation and impoverishment.

15 Margalit Discrimination in the Heart of the Holy Land p 90.

16 Margalit Discrimination in the Heart of the Holy Land p 92.
The shadow of the 'State of Exception' hangs over spaces under occupation. Identified by Giorgio Agamben,\(^ {18}\) as the power of a sovereign to suspend or abrogate the rule of law during times of perceived or imagined emergency, the state of exception is not a special kind of law (like the law of war). Rather, it defines law's threshold or limit. It is characterised by pure de facto rule, a paradoxical space placed by the law as being outside the law. The word 'outside' is important here because it implies a reforming of boundaries both territorial and legal.

Decreeing a state of exemption (by definition focused, sorting out its objects and setting them apart from the rest), is the most awesome and terrifying of the weapons of punishment the sovereign can wield with its legal arm.\(^ {19}\)

Transformation of the built environment under occupation is routinely justified by military necessity. Under the guise of security, a state can seize control of a territory, an area, or a house. Israel has long maintained that major changes to the environment such as the settlements and the massive security barrier (which Israeli's call a fence and Palestinians call the separation wall), are not 'permanent changes'. Even the word occupation suggests a temporary situation. However, Israel has been using temporary security needs for forty years in order to create permanent 'facts on the ground'. Israeli architect, Eyal Weizman says that to maintain the 'temporary' state, "two seemingly contradictory conditions must be maintained — the persistence of violence and the presence of initiatives for political resolution."\(^ {20}\) Numerous proposals for resolution can be traced through the history of the conflict, making it seem that it is always on the brink of being resolved. Simultaneously, as Palestinian scholar Samera Esmeir claims: "Security rituals must not bring about absolute security"\(^ {21}\) because that would mean the loss of the rationale for their further application. The problem then shifts to one of management of the occupation, rather than solution to the conflict. Borders are established and re-established on almost a daily basis,

---

[Image: Children standing in their partly demolished house after the demolition was stopped.

Image: Women of the house sit in the ruins of their house after the demolition.

Ambiguity

Temporariness is now the law of the occupation; temporary encirclement and temporary closures, temporary transit permits, temporary revocation of transit permits, temporary enforcement of an elimination Policy, temporary change in the open-fire orders... when everything is temporary almost anything, any crime, any form of violence is acceptable, because the temporariness seemingly grants it a license, the license of the state of emergency.\(^ {17}\)

---

\(^{17}\) Weizman *Hollow Land* p 239.

\(^{18}\) Agamben *State of Exception*.

\(^{19}\) Bauman *Society Under Siege* p 224.

\(^{20}\) Weizman *Hollow Land* p 240.

\(^{21}\) Weizman *Hollow Land* p 240.
legitimating constant re-definition of security measures.

Much has been written about our 'shrinking world' and the 'collapse of distance'. Less understood is the increase of distance for people under occupation, a phenomenon described by Israeli journalist Amira Haas, as 'the theft of time'.

Day by day Israel's closure policy robs 3.5 million human beings of that precious resource, from each one individually and from the collective as a whole. With time, they are also robbed of the right to plan their lives. How can you plan when you don't know if you will wait at the checkpoint for one hour or four, if you will encounter three checkpoints or only two, if the permit will arrive or not?

In the West Bank, the modern 'settler only' by-pass roads compress time and space for the occupiers, while the minor roads and dirt tracks, earth barriers and checkpoints, expand time and distance for the Palestinians. The occupiers moving ever outwards in a process of ceaseless expansion while simultaneously installing partitions and proscribing borders around and between an occupied people.

Appropriation

This is why we opted for the methodology of moving through walls... Like a worm that eats its way forward, emerging at points and then disappearing. We were thus moving from the interior of homes to the exterior in a surprising manner and in places we were not expected.

Questions of occupation resonate within disciplines of interiors. Interior space is always inhabited space — at different times, different occupations will occur. Eyal Weisman has described an extreme case of temporary occupation by the Israeli military in their attacks on Palestinian towns such as Nablus, Balata and Jenin. They have developed a tactic of walking through walls, the way a worm moves through an apple, in an effort to avoid circulating in the more dangerous public space of the street. They move through the dense contiguous fabric of the urban structure horizontally through party walls and vertically through holes blasted in ceilings and floors. Before they begin an attack they cut off services, (water, sewage, electricity, TV in order to contain the inhabitants, and then attempt to turn the city inside out, to disrupt its logic. This brings the conflict into the very private domain, into the bedrooms and living rooms of the inhabitants. A Palestinian woman identified only as Aisha described the experience:

Imagine it — you are sitting in your living room which you know so well; this is the room where the family watches television together after the evening meal. And suddenly that wall disappears with a deafening roar, the room fills with dust and debris, and through the wall pours one soldier after another screaming orders. You have no idea if they are after you, if they've come to take over your home, or if your house just lies on their route to somewhere else. The children are screaming, panicking. Is it possible to even imagine the horror of a five year old child as four, six, eight, twelve soldiers, their faces painted black, submachine guns pointing everywhere, antennas protruding from their backpacks, making them look like giant alien bugs, blast their way through the wall.

When the soldiers have passed through the wall, the inhabitants are locked inside one of the rooms where they are made to remain — sometimes for several days until the operation is concluded, often without water, food or medicine.

In a bizarre twist, Weisman says that research institutes within the Israeli army are fully aware of avant-garde urban research conducted in architectural institutions and have reading lists containing many works of critical theory. Works by Deleuze and Guattari, Guy Debord and the situationists, along with contemporary writings on urbanism, psychology, post colonial and post structural theory. Even the work of artists such as Gordon Matta-Clark, borrowing terms such as his 'un-walling the wall.' There is a fascination with the writings of Deleuze and Guattari, particularly their writings about Nomad versus Sedentary and smooth versus striated space. A retired Brigadier-General who conducts the Israeli Army Operational Theory Research Institute said the army often use the term "to smooth out space" when they conduct operations in Arab towns which are anchored to place and enclosed by fences, walls ditches roadblocks and borders. However, the army appropriates

22 Haas "Foreword" p XV.
24 Weizman 'Lethal Theory' p 55.
25 Segal quoted, Weizman "Lethal Theory" p 57.
key words or phrases from critical theory texts in a way that loosens them from their original discursive context. They appear to be more concerned with an intuitive grasp of the way these concepts might produce specific military effects or at least challenge orthodox thinking within the military establishment.26

There is too, a reliance on technology in the creation of such brutal chaos. A fantasy that technology can provide solutions within to complex and intricate situations. Technologies of surveillance can now create intricate 3D models of Arab towns, and new developments in seeing through walls, and also of shooting through walls, can effectively render architecture transparent. Stephen Graham has written about a growing body of work about urban warfare (particularly aimed at Arabic cities), being distributed at special conferences attended by western military strategists. He describes army-produced video games simulating counter terrorist attacks in dense Islamic cities and mock Arabic urban centres built throughout the world, to enable military forces to practice assault tactics.

Replete with minarets, pyrotechnic systems, loop-tapes with calls to prayer, donkeys and hired 'civilians' in Islamic dress wandering through narrow streets, and olfactory machines to create the smell of rotting corpses, this shadow urban system works like some bastard child of Disney. It simulates, of course, not the complex cultural, social or physical realities of Middle Eastern urbanism, but the imaginative geographies of the military and theme park designers that are brought in to design and construct it.27

Weisman inserts a warning that we can all become victims of this technology. It is not only the military that learns from other militaries but also large civilian industries. The world is synergetic and interconnected.

**Risking Inhabitation**

Though the Israeli Palestinian situation is extreme in its contested territories, it nonetheless reveals issues that are perhaps less pronounced or merely latent elsewhere. A fortress mentality is gradually infiltrating other urban contexts in more subtle ways. An array of walls and borders are forming and informing interior spaces today, (at gated communities, entrances to shopping malls and barricaded enclaves etc.), all with the intention of isolating, separating and guarding against intrusion. Fear is again the reference point. Environments are being reshaped through security measures designed to track down and eliminate risk.

Zygmunt Bauman has argued that state power is now built on personal vulnerability and personal protection, rather than social vulnerability and social protection. Politicians have abdicated any responsibility for moderating the impact of other forms of instability so they offer to assuage insecurity and threats to physical safety.28 Richard Jackson, in his book *Writing the War on Terrorism,* makes a convincing case about the exaggeration of threat and the construction of myths about terrorism. The purpose, he says, is to maintain a certain level of social fear and to justify government’s extraordinary measures. Both the British and American Governments have argued that restrictions on civil liberties are necessary for the security of civilised societies. Most poignantly, they maintain that the threat ‘resides within’. Such language is designed to touch upon deep cultural insecurities and reinforce the idea that ‘the home’, may no longer be a place of comfort and security.

When control and security take precedence a fortress mentality usually results, closing things down and inhibiting movement. Security and risk management are unavoidable issues in design, but cannot determine inhabitation. Far from accepting fixed terms, ‘Interiors’ as a discipline, thrives on the creative potential of risk. With its ability to operate at the edges and in the in-between and unexpected spaces, the discipline can challenge simple and exclusive alternatives. Rather than occupation as a system imposed from the outside, we might consider a more accommodating (and perhaps more risky) term, occupancy. Occupancy suggests a fluid and changing relationship between protagonists. It raises questions about inhabitation and about the way spatial boundaries are devised. It takes account of the social and temporal context that people move within and takes notice of shades, layers and traces of prior inhabitation.

26 Weisman *Hollow Land* p 210.

27 Graham “Remember Fallujah ” p 211.

28 Bauman *Society Under Siege* p 93.

29 Jackson *Writing the War on Terrorism* p 113.
Occupancy questions the static and the closed nature of occupation and risk management.

References:
Halper J. (2005) Obstacles to Peace, A Re-Framing of the Palestinian-Israeli Conflict, Jerusalem: ICAHD.
Design Led Futures: 
provocative concepts as promotional tools

Edgar R. Rodríguez Ramírez, Ross Stevens & Simon Fraser
Victoria University of Wellington, NZ

Design has the intrinsic capability of suggesting creative solutions that, by their novelty, imply possible success for industry, and an inherent risk. Should companies take more risks and allow design research to instigate, and not limit, creativity? How can companies use risk taking concepts to their advantage, without implying a business risk? How can design teams make use of provocation in order to broaden the company's perception of risk? These issues have been considered in the Design Led Futures Programme. This paper shows examples of how design students reacted to the challenge of risk taking in design. It presents some of the steps followed by the programme. It discusses the reaction from the clients to the concepts produced; which range from product, to interior and architecture design; and why they decided to develop the projects further. We suggest that companies can use conceptual designs as promotional tools that help them develop an image of innovation, and as stepping-stones for future developments. In order to reach high levels of innovation, the programme relies on using highly provocative concepts. These concepts go beyond 'thinking more broadly', and have also been used as stimulating tools by the client companies for their internal divisions. Furthermore, and in order to be more provocative, the programme disregards clients' input in the first stage of the process. Finally, this paper concludes with a summary of the process followed by DLF.

Risk, industry, and design
Risk is defined as an exposure to chance of loss or damage.¹ The perception of risk is a fundamental part of the human decision-making process. Some systems allow for a risk reduction or increase. For instance, insurance is an investment that reduces risk against a potentially considerable loss. On the other hand, gambling is an investment that increases risk by offering a high chance of loss against a small chance of high profit. Saving money in a bank offers the opposite to gambling, a small but guaranteed return.

If the core of a company's aims is to increase profit, one of the main ways to achieve this is

to reduce risks in investments. However, companies constantly need to take risks in order to compete in the market. It is at the heart of a company's interests to develop strategies that increase the chances to stay ahead of the group, with a minimum risk for their business. Many business successes occur because the company found an appropriate risk balance, in which the company successfully engaged in a risky enterprise. For instance, there is a classic example in the history of General Motors and Ford. GM became the number one producer of cars in the world in 1927. One of their main strategies was to offer one chassis for a number of different cars. They offered a variety of shells and colours. Before them, Ford had a powerful 50% of the world's car market. While Ford developed a revolutionary mass-production line for its time, the company only offered a basic model, in one colour, for almost twenty years. General Motors decided to challenge this practice and take the risky decision of offering variety, which dramatically increased their share and put them on the road to become leaders of the car industry for the rest of the 20th Century. The change of focus from an engineering perspective, and paying attention to the emotion of the users probably helped GM achieve such success. The cheap production by Ford and the engineering advances by GM expanded the market, which allowed GM to offer different designs. However, even with the engineering advances, GM could have decided to follow the 'one model only' standard by Ford. Nevertheless, GM decided to introduce design changes, and that was the reason why many customers preferred to purchase GM models. While the example occurred that long ago, it is still a good, clear, and even radical example of the power of taking risks in design for the success of a company. This does not mean that offering different designs is enough to be successful. At the time, it was a strategy that served GM well. It is necessary to study risk in design in order to assess what strategy has worked or not in the development of design concepts.

On the other hand, some companies that have disregarded taking risks in design have proved unsuccessful. For instance, by mid 1990s Polaroid understood that the public had an image of them as 'conventional', which implied a lack of risk taking. This was the reason why Polaroid decided to redesign their Spectra model, which had been on the market for over a decade. Even Polaroid dealers had pressured them into developing new models. However, Polaroid took too long to take the risk of investing in new technology (digital cameras) and design. The bankruptcy of the company has often been blamed on this. Such failure can be linked to managerial decisions and engineering advances. However, design research is increasingly important for making decisions such as what kind of technology should be developed according to consumer and user behaviour findings. The design of the overall concepts that Polaroid decided to pursue (including their technology) was essentially flawed. More risk taking was necessary. The suggestion of what kind of technology the company could develop is an important point for the DLF programme. Students are required to investigate new technologies and suggest what is necessary in order to obtain the best results possible in their design process.

The development of products is filled with uncertainties that require significant decision-making skills. As mentioned before, every decision-making process involves a level of risk. A large body of knowledge exists about risk management for the development of products. This knowledge has been developed mainly by engineering or management disciplines. However, little has been reported about risk-taking in the actual creative design process.

**Design research as a tool to reduce risk**

Companies make use of many disciplines in order to reduce risks, including marketing, economic analysis, futures studies, and so forth. Design organisations make use of research for informing the design process and as a tool for reducing risks in the decision-making process. For instance, Philips Design makes significant investment in design research with the main goal of reducing risks for business.  

---

3 Fearis 'The Polaroid Experience' pp 1-3.
4 O'Neill 'The New Polaroid' p 1.
5 See for instance Laurel Design Research: Methods and Perspectives; Santos Hispanic Culture in Design Research; St Pierre Research and Design Collaboration.
6 For instance Ahmadi & Wang 'Managing Development Risk in Product Design Processes'; Baxter Product Design; Browning, Deyst, Eppinger, & Whitney 'Adding Value in Product Development by Creating Information and Reducing Risk'.
Philips continuously develops design concepts that reach into the future and that are often not intended to enter the market. For instance, they developed the Vision of the Future project in 1995. The project involved the development of electronic concepts for home appliances scoped for 2005. Although some of the projects from that study did see the light in some way or another, the main goal of the project was to show the company the range of possibilities they had. For instance, the Vision of the Future suggested a digital photo display that would be feasible within the following ten years. Sure enough, the digital photo display, which works as a frame to place on the desk, was released in 2004. Vision of the Future helped Philips establish a goal and a path to work on for the following ten years. The fact that Philips Design invests large amounts of money on research in order to reduce risk raises some questions. Why many of the projects are never produced? We suggest that concepts such as these are highly valuable as promotional tools. Companies can produce conceptual designs that help them assess such concepts, and that create an innovative image of the company from the public's perspective.

Risk in Design

While risk in design can be addressed under the perspective of economic risk, this paper is not about monetary risk, it is about risk taking in design. How can risk in design be defined? If risk is defined as potential harm, an understanding of what can bring such potential harm would be required. It could be argued that harm in design would result from developing an 'unsuccessful design'. This brings the need to define what a successful design would be. For purposes of this research, a working definition of a successful design is a design which is considered by its stakeholders to fulfil or surpass their expectations. The stakeholders may include the company, clients, public, and the actual designers. While it is admitted that this definition may be challenged, it will be used as a working definition.

An example from the graphic design community can offer an example of the necessary discussion to address risk in the development of design concepts. Many designers openly criticised the UPS logo and loosing the bow was considered as a risky move for the recognition of the company. However, the company responded by saying that the designs the company had adopted throughout their history had evolved from the previous one, and this time was not the exception. The company wanted to express an evolution of their designs, and not a revolution. In fact, while the design community considered the change to be radical, the company perceived it as a smooth transition.

More and more risk taking is becoming a necessary part of a design company. Creativity and innovation are inherently accompanied by change, and therefore by a level of risk. Changes in society and technology are so fast, that companies need to innovate constantly in order to stay ahead. Most times, companies are too busy trying to keep up with their short-term futures, that they have little resources to look at the bigger picture. This means that they may be able to innovate only inside a constrained range of possibilities.

This paper reports on the design process of the Design Led Futures (DLF) Programme. It explains the steps that the team takes and the relationship that develops with clients. It mentions how the team understands the concept of risk, and how we use provocative ideas in order to broaden companies' perspectives.

Design Led Futures Programme

DLF is an initiative by Professor Simon Fraser and Ross Stevens at the Victoria University of Wellington's School of Design. The programme offers companies visions of the future. It explores possible scenarios for ten years into the future. It attempts to expand the range of possibilities that a company can see by challenging what the company currently does. It entices companies to study new visions by offering believable future scenarios. It was mentioned that risk in design needs to consider the level of satisfaction that stakeholders share. The stakeholders in the DLF programme are the VUW's School of Design staff, the industry partners, and the students. In order to offer challenging visions of the future, the DLF programme follows some simple rules.

First Stage: Clients are not allowed in the Process

First of all, students (between 20 and 25 fourth year Industrial Design students) are given a topic related to a brand, but which is

---

9 Marzano Vision of the Future, p 45

9 Boomenkraz 'Evolving the UPS Brand' p. 70.
open for interpretation. For instance, the 2006 project was developed around the topic ‘Inside-out’. The programme is divided in two parts. During the first stage, the students work in teams of 4-6 people. Each group develops a brand philosophy. Under the brand umbrella, each student works on a single product. This first stage takes one trimester (16 weeks) and consists of three internal presentations. At the end of the trimester, the students expose their ideas to the clients at the fourth and final presentation. The number of students working on the project offers clients a large number of working hours, and a wide variety of projects. The number of proposals means that there is a broad range for comparison, and options for the clients to choose from. Under this perspective, all the proposals together constitute a unit. This helps the DLF programme reduce risks as an entity offering design services. During the development of the projects, the tutors make sure that the different teams, and individual projects, diverge from each other. At the same time, the projects normally offer diverse levels of innovation. This allows DLF to show clients an assortment of proposals and increases the chances of presenting concepts that are acceptable to them. The programme also believes that students might be at their most creative points in their lives. Some companies, including Dyson, agree with this point and are often hiring young designers because of their creative skills.

Furthermore, having different levels of innovation and provocation for each project allows for presentations that together form stepping-stones. Some of the concepts have been easier for the clients to assimilate after they see all the ideas together. The less provocative concepts help pave the road for more provocative ones. At the same time, the most provocative ideas open the clients’ perspective in order to assimilate ideas with medium-level provocation.

The Brief and the Client
The company client is not part of the briefing process. Although the programme coordinator meets with the clients in order to negotiate the project, the participation of the client in the overall setting of the design brief is kept to a minimum. The students have no contact with the clients until the very end of the group project, at the first and final presentation to the clients.

There is a simple reason for disregarding client input at the initial stage of the process. DLF works under the assumption that if the client defines the brief and has constant contact and input with the students, the final results will reflect their involvement. Client involvement can lead to results that may be very similar to what the company is already able to do, but probably not done as well as the company would do. DLF attempts to open the client’s perspective by offering a broad range of provocation in the concepts that students develop. Clients are not always comfortable with such protocol, but have agreed that it is a necessary step for the goals of the partnership. Excluding the clients from participating on the initial brief also allows for flexibility and re-interpretation. The nature of the projects implies that the initial stages of research will dictate the form of the brief for the design phase. Teams are meant to define their brand philosophy within the first two weeks. This philosophy will then be the factor that defines the design brief. Each team has a distinct philosophy that entails for separate briefs. It is expected that each brief will produce diverse proposals.

Some clients perceive University teams to be small versions of themselves, or as apprentices in which they have to invest time and effort. While many companies based overseas expect tangible results from collaborations with students, this is still rarely the case in New Zealand. Fortunately, this is changing and now there are examples of close collaborations between industry and academia, such as the DLF programme. DLF does not promise solutions with the potential for acquiring Intellectual Property. DLF offers visions of areas with potential interest for the company. The concepts are illustrated with finalised products, but this does not necessarily mean the final product is intended for market release. It is rather a tangible way to tease the company’s design team in order to incite provocation. DLF widens the perception of risk for companies by normalising provocative ideas (figure 1). At the first stage of the process, students are encouraged to take the risk of suggesting highly provocative ideas, in particular during the first two presentations.

Figure 1. Diagram of the company’s perception of risk before and after DLF projects
By the third presentation, the projects should be refined and include sufficient information to make them believable. Research plays a crucial role in this part. The programme receives specialist advice in order to teach research methodologies in the areas of futures studies (including Delphi studies), scenario building, emotion and behaviour, sustainability, among others. Colleagues comprise researchers and practitioners from abroad and within the School of Design, which include Turkka Keinonen (UIAH), Dirk Schmauser (Porsche Design), Joanne Oliver (IDEO), Thomas Gerlach (via4), John Gertsakis (RMIT), Peter Haythornthwaite (Creativelab), and Edgar Rodríguez (VUW in-house).

Students are not required to prove the complete technical feasibility of their proposals. However, they are obliged to show that the concepts are possible. This is sometimes achieved by showing examples of scientific experiments that hint at the existence of a particular technology. The students often carry out empirical testing, which is recorded and included in the presentations. There are no rules as to how the feasibility may be argued, as long as the project becomes believable.

**High and Medium Levels of Provocation**

![Figure 2. Pulse project, by Clarke Bardsley, Daniel Emery, Jason Wright StClair, and Matthew Backler.](image)

For instance, the project Pulse (figure 2) offers a high level of provocation. It was developed for Methven in the 2005 project. It suggests that appliances around the house can sense the level of nutrients in an occupant's body. The toilet scans excretions and sends the data to the other appliances. The water purifier is also a mineral mixer. It assorts a mix of the minerals that the person needs, and delivers them in the next water cup. The gesture to take water is also provocative. The user needs to push a flexible cone with the glass, in order to make the water spill on the side of the cone and into the glass (www.designedfutures.com). As the project states it:

> We imagine a pulse water control... server that energises and alters the state of water to cater to our different needs and wants. Like a living organism, the products communicate by pulse, bringing the machine in tune with the user.  

While the ideas seem unfeasible, all technology necessary to put such a system in place already exist.

**Projects further developed by client companies**

A project chosen by Methven in 2005, which presented a lower level of provocation is Pipette (figure 3), by Kylie Baker. Pipette is a six-metre long shower shaped like a giant pipette using rainwater and water pumped from a filtering garden to slowly fill the bulb reservoir throughout the day. As the bulb fills, the balance changes visually, expressing the stored potential and opportunity for a shower. While the person showers, she can see the bulb emptying, resulting in visual feedback about the use of resources. The shower can rotate over a showering area that ranges from indoor to outdoor, through private enclosures and public spaces. Methven chose the Pipette project for several reasons. Firstly, Methven thought that the project was unexpected, and that was the main reason they had hired the DLF team. Secondly, the project was believable and achievable. Possibly more important for the client, the project touched some of their market concerns. Methven desired to invest in New Zealand's great outdoors image, and Pipette offered a strong connection between bathroom and the outdoors. Finally, Methven wants to be highly associated with quality architecture and sculpture. Pipette represented a highly aesthetic landscape sculpture, with the potential to express some of the important principles of the company.

![Figure 3. Pipette, by Kylie Baker.](image)

The case for the selected project in 2006 is different. This time the client was Fisher and Paykel and the topic was 'Inside-Out'. There

---

10 Bardsley, Emery, StClair, & Backler ‘Pulse’.
were two projects that interested the clients. One of them was Furl, by Daniel Chen (figure 4). Furl is a dynamic and adjustable gas cooking surface that concertinas to minimise space and maximise the cooking surface. Furl's flexibility allows it to be manipulated into a shape and size to suit the person cooking. The project was considered to have a very high aesthetic and functional value. However, Fisher and Paykel was about to release their Luna cook-top. The company preferred not to work further in an area in which they had just achieved a very high standard.

Instead, another project with very high quality was selected. Ice3 by Adzrina Mona Ibrahim, is a six-metre-long, modular refrigeration system that is embedded in the wall. It can be slid inside or outside. The containers come in two sizes and are made of corundum transparent ceramic (external layer), maize plastic (internal layer), and LCD tint glass. These components provide for the individual temperature control of each unit, which makes an efficient use of energy by cooling only the necessary space. It allows for the removal of individual containers. Fisher and Paykel chose to use the refrigerator project to challenge the Refrigerator Division within the company. This included engineers, designers, marketing, and the rest of the team within that division. In this case, the approach of instigating high levels of provocation proved so successful, that the company decided to use it within their own internal divisions.

Both projects, Pipette and Ice3, were built into prototypes by the companies involved. This occurs during the second stage of the projects, which happens outside of the School of Design.

**Second Stage: Clients Get Involved**

Clients take on an integral role during the second stage of project development. Once all students have presented their proposals; the clients, in consultation with DLF staff, select the three concepts with the most potential. Subsequently, the clients select which project they wish to pursue further. Several students with the best projects are summoned for an internship interview. The selected students spend a few months at the company's premises as design interns. Their main activity is to build a working prototype of the selected concept. After the internship, students may be offered a position as a designer for the company. Some of the students have been hired following this process.

DLF invests large amounts of money in making the concepts believable. The quality of the presentations is enhanced for each individual project after the students' final submission. Professional graphic designers are hired to polish the presentations. The programme believes that quality of presentation is important for the perception of their feasibility. The more professional the projects look, the more clients can focus on the actual content of the proposals. A badly finished presentation shows obvious visual faults that make it harder for the viewer to understand the message students are trying to portray. The retouched scenarios are the base of the programme's portfolio, which is showcased on the website.

The DLF website takes most of the programme's expenditure. The website is seen as an investment for attracting new partners. It also showcases previous projects and it serves as a concept portfolio for clients. The website is shown to potential partners when in negotiations for starting a new project. It has proved to be a successful tool. For instance, the programme successfully signed Nike for the 2007 project. Executives from Nike Headquarters will travel to New Zealand from Oregon in order to attend the final student presentation and select the projects with most potential.

The unconventional and seemingly controversial (therefore risky?) step, from the educational perspective, of further enhancing and focusing students work via the website
stems from the fact that we see our role in design education in the broadest sense – that of educating (enlightening) students just as much as the industries they will enter. To do so, we have to get the message across to upper management quickly and in a language they will understand. Therein is also a lesson for the students – if they reflect on the website.

**Conclusion: The need for provocation and for addressing levels of design risk**

It has been discussed that businesses increasingly invest money in research that may help them reduce risks. However, the world is changing ever more rapidly. For instance, Moore’s Law proposes that the power of computers will double every two years. This means that the growth in computer power increases exponentially. While Moore suggested that such an idea would work for the decade between 1965-1975, the law has held true ever since. Technologists agree that the Law will be true for at least another twenty years. DLF is taking such predictions seriously. The team is working on ideas that consider such changes/predictions.

Big changes facing our futures, such as an exponential increase in computer power, suggest a challenging future for companies. DLF suggests that producing provocative concepts is only a necessary step in assessing the scenarios that organisations may have to face in the future. It will be increasingly difficult to keep up with change. Research assessments of risk are necessary. However, creative solutions are necessary in order to be competitive in an ever-changing world.

Examples of collaborations between academia and industry exist. However, these are not always reported. DLF follows its unique process, such as not including clients in the briefing process; using a high level of purposeful provocation in the concepts developed, which goes beyond ‘thinking more broadly’; and addressing risk with an umbrella of concepts.

This paper has mentioned some of the steps that the DLF process follows, and its intentions. It highlighted the need for provocation. It suggested that a wide range of concepts with different levels of innovation are necessary in order to develop a better understanding of possible futures for organisations. This variety is helpful for clients, but also for DLF, given that it gives security to the programme as a design services provider.

The range of concepts, and their high levels of provocation, attempt to pull out and broaden the clients’ perspectives. After the clients see the presentations, they may be willing to consider more risky proposals. In order to achieve this, the projects need to be believable, although not necessarily feasible at the present point in time. The projects also need to be presented at a very high level of quality. This allows viewers to concentrate on the content of the ideas, and to appreciate the aesthetic value of the proposals.

Examples of collaborations between academia and industry exist. However, these are not always reported. DLF follows its unique process, such as not including clients in the briefing process; using a high level of purposeful provocation in the concepts developed, which goes beyond ‘thinking more broadly’; and addressing risk with an umbrella of concepts.

This process is followed with the intention of showing that design can indeed be a leader in defining what our future may be like. We can design more desirable futures, and react against undesirable ones. The work done by the students has so far reached professional quality in which they are often able to express their social and environmental concerns. They work hard in order to make their ideas believable, and to make the phrase “I don't think that's possible”, harder to say.

---

11 Moore ‘Cramming More Components Onto Integrated Circuits’.
References:


To Take Risk in Education Requires Time for Exploration

Nancy Spanbroek & Brenda Ridgewell
Curtin University of Technology, AU

"Without changing our patterns of thought, we will not be able to solve the problems we created with our current pattern of thought." A. Einstein

Student/teacher time relationships are minimised in universities due to a range of fiscal directives. However, when analysing the success of design teaching, the time required for critical analysis through making and drawing, which is recognised as a crucial aspect of the development of the design project, is limited to the student. There is insufficient time for students to explore design ideas due to the reduced teaching time, condensed semesters, and high expectation of output. The thinking time — the unmarked component — becomes evident at the final stage of the project. It takes time to analyse, research and question a design approach.

This paper presents a case study of the initiatives of an Experimental Design Studio in the Department of Interior Architecture, University of Technology, Australia. The studio addresses the perceived problems in our education system through an experimental project to encourage enquiry, inspire originality and set new standards for industry, avoiding the risk of mediocrity, one line statements and eclectic solutions. The risk here is giving the students the time to explore in a supportive learning environment.

* http://smarteconomy.typepad.com/smarteconomy/smart_thinking/index.html
Introduction
The workers of tomorrow will need to think critically if they are to survive a constantly changing work place. As the world becomes more complex and technology continues to progress with accelerating change, employee performance will be measured more by their thinking competency than skill based abilities. Successful workers of the future must possess intellectual tools which will allow them to be disciplined, flexible and analytical thinkers, able to address and resolve complex problems. Robert Reich, former US Secretary of Labour suggests that in the future we will be faced with unidentified problems and problems with unknown solutions requiring new patterns of learning. Where information is readily available it will be the capacity to think creatively and effectively that will be considered valuable.¹ This situation also applies to Interior Design. Critical thinking in interior design needs to be taught and nurtured from the education stage however, in order to learn to think critically, interior design students need to be in a learning environment that allows them the time to discuss, analyse and challenge new ideas.

Current Design Education
Academic semesters at Curtin University are twelve weeks long with a two-week study break. The course content originally designed for a thirteen-week semester is now taught in the twelve-week semester. In the Department of Interior Architecture, students enrol in four years, eight semesters, of full time study. Each semester consists of four or five core units, depending on the year of study. Student contact times range from 18 hours in their first semester to eight hours in their final semester. Teaching Units range from two hours of contact teaching time for the theory units to six and a half hours of weekly contact for the design units which are studio based. All units have a one-hour lecture per week followed by tutorial sessions that generally vary from one to three hours. The teaching ratio on average is from 15:1 to 21:1 but is reduced to 12:1 for final year students. The push by Australian universities to increase student numbers as discussed in Murray and Dollery’s working paper series highlights pressures both academic staff and students face.

The quality of teaching may also be determined by factors like student/teacher ratios. An increase in this ratio will result in less available teacher/student contact, increasing class sizes, and less preparation time for academics². This push is budget-driven and does not recognize students need for direct interface with their lecturers. There are now greater pressures on academic staff to increase their production of research and to take on more administrative duties, which further restricts student/teacher time. Students become frustrated due to the limited time available to them by academic staff. This coupled with the stress of full-time study and part-time work may result in student withdrawal from their academic programs, with students choosing to reduce their workloads so they can cope with the pressures of academic life.³ This observation of staff time allocation is supported by Tsui in her comment:

"after all, to effectively foster critical thinking instructors need to invest extra work in experimenting with innovative teaching methods and assessment procedures. Many institutions prefer that this additional time be spent on research."⁴

The Design Studio
In 2006, an Experimental Design Studio was initiated in the Department of Interior Architecture. The studio was established as a reaction to the growing expectation that students’ works should reflect the professional standards of practice, generally resulting in slick computer drawings but failing to address the critical aspects of the occupation of space. It was felt that the detailed critical examination of design through questioning and experimentation was being over looked as students hurried to achieve the time-consuming presentation level for their projects. The resulting program was structured to encourage students to focus on the design process and not to be concerned with the final presentations. The emphasis was to think critically through the making of a series of models, reflecting at each stage on the issues of occupation, cross-cultural issues in design, physical, mental and spiritual issues of place, symbolism, metaphor and meaning,

³ McInnis ‘Non completion in Vocational Education and Training and Higher Education’ p 19.
⁴ Tsui ‘Effects of Campus Culture’ p 23.
tectonics and their integration through
design.

Design Project
The project to design a Cultural Centre on
the campus in the existing Architecture
building was developed through a series of
lectures, readings, research and photographic
studies. The project aims were to encourage
students: to think critically at all stages of
the design process, to develop the ability to
question and challenge accepted norms, to
master the integration of theory, materiality
and design issues in interior environments and
to develop an understanding of cultural and
social issues within the interior environment.

Students' creative and critical thinking
abilities were stimulated through model
making and drawings exploring the themes of
‘eating architecture’ as a design metaphor.
Students explored the alchemic process of
cooking and food preparation, initially
capturing these processes in a series of quick
sketch models. These forms explored the
captured themes of cutting, stretching,
folding, wrapping etc. This process involved
a series of quick drawing and modelling
exercises that encouraged students to create
on impulse using key words as descriptors.
The images of Michelle Salomone’s (a third
year student) work illustrated below explore
the sequence of forms that the key descriptor
of chopping and peeling reveals. Figures 1
and 2 describe the elevation and section of
forms that occur through the chopping or
slicing of an object and through modelling
illustrates the rhythm that occurs. Figures 3
and 4 illustrate the remnants of peelings
within a container and how these influence a
given form. Figure 3 illustrates a reflective
interior view of a metal grater whereas figure
4 illustrates a plastic triangulated grater,
which due to the translucency of the plastic
grater allows light to penetrate introducing
softness to the space that the reflective
interior of the metal grater does not allow.
These quick models provide the students’
with the tools to examine the qualities their
models create and give them a starting point
to discuss and explore possible design
directions for occupation.
The following images are of the second stage of the project where students were encouraged to continue to explore their design direction focusing on one particular theme. Salomone explored the notion of kneading dough which was further tested through slicing and rolling. This exploration is evident in both figures 5 and 6 below where the combination of stretching and moulding results in the appearance of an aesthetic growth increasing in size and depth.

Teaching and Learning Methods

The project was primarily studio-based, conducted in two sessions of 3.5 and 3 hours per week, the studio structure varied from session to session and frequently demanded more time. The studio was deliberately scheduled at the end of the day which allowed both staff and students to continue their discussions well beyond the timetable hours of the studio.

Methods of study including lectures, student readings and presentations, individual tutorials, workshops, tutor and peer reviews occurred throughout the semester. Lectures occurred in the first three weeks of the semester, these were informal discussions intended to supplement the research undertaken by students in order to provide a forum for discussion and critique.

The studio sessions provided an opportunity for students to: discuss their work with their colleagues and tutors, gain valuable analytical review on their design work and were challenged in a supportive and critical environment. Students worked on their models/drawings in the studios. It was clear that students enjoyed the materials based approach to design exploration, and frequently would return to the studio at the end of their classes to continue with their work. Where possible, staff made themselves available for design debate, assisting with the process of making and critical examination.

Potential outcome scenarios were discussed at the commencement of the semester for each stage of the design process, and students were advised that assessment on each submission would receive a pass/fail grade only as illustrated in the chart below.

Assignments and Weighting

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Weeks</th>
<th>Submission</th>
<th>Mark</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Exercise 1 – Student Readings and Presentations</td>
<td>P/F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Exercise 2 – Ingredients (Initial Building Photographic Studies)</td>
<td>P/F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Exercise 3 – Entrée (Explorative Working models discussing selected design themes)</td>
<td>P/F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Exercise 4a – Main (Sectional models exploring development of design themes)</td>
<td>P/F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Exercise 4b – Main (Exploration of interior through 2 dimensional drawings)</td>
<td>P/F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Exercise – Dessert (Model of selected area at 1:50 scale)</td>
<td>P/F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>FINAL SUBMISSION OF ALL WORK</td>
<td>P/F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Folio – Includes Journal/Writings + Project Work</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Students generally are numerically graded for each submission of design work, however in
this instance, students accepted that they would only receive a pass or fail grade, and that the final grade would not be submitted until all the process work was assembled. The emphasis was on the process work, not the final submission or presentation of the work. Students were clear of their progress at all stages of the semester program, this clarity was gained due to the ongoing student development of their model work which better allowed for studio discussions, critique and reviews of their process. There were no surprises or misconceptions, students accepted the grading system and stressed their enjoyment and learning achievements from the project at the conclusion of the semester. The following images are examples of student Jenna Hogan’s (2006) process work through modelling and drawing exploring the cooking themes of dipping, stretching, and ladling. The final drawing illustrated in Figure 11 shows a section through the building and reflects the various stages Hogan explored in this project.

Unit Outcomes
At the end of the semester students achieved the following outcomes; the ability to develop a design project beyond the pragmatic, an ability to communicate a design intent reflecting an understanding of the magic and poetry of the environment and its impact on the occupant, and an ability to express the materiality and tectonics of an interior environment through drawing and models. Students were able to resolve design problems at an informed and creative level and were able to think critically and translate findings into project work.

Tsui in her paper ‘Effect of Campus Culture on Students’ Critical Thinking’ supports our findings as she reflects upon the time demands of institutions placing greater emphasis on critical thinking needing to devote extra time to teaching related activities and students needing extra time to learn in a critical manner than those being taught in a passive learning situation. Academic staff who teach in creative design programs are expected to teach within a traditional education framework which generally has prescribed outcomes. However for creative design to be taught successfully, timeframes and structures must alter in order to allow staff and students to develop creative and innovative design solutions. The time required to critically explore design problems is measurable but may extend well beyond the standard academic teaching framework. This in itself can be problematic with the teaching day structured into teaching streams that require constant changes of venue and breaks in concentration. Thought processes are therefore interrupted and time constraints act as constant pressures.
Prescribed outcomes for student work contradict empirical learning, where students learn through question, exploration and discovery. The danger with prescribed outcomes within a project brief is the amount of evidential output in relation to the learning achieved. Critical thinking processes involving not only the building of competency in cognitive reasoning, but also the ability to translate competency into effective action is important to the student’s learning, but often in total contrast to the processes of a student submitting a minimal finished project. Minimal finished projects can be assessed to meet all the predetermined outcomes desirable within the university system. While the critical thinking process will have gained an enormous amount of learning within the processes undertaken, and is the valued component in developing thinkers skillful at analysing and evaluating information, reflecting on meaning, examining evidence and reasoning, and forming grounded assessments about facts collected from observation, experience, cognitive reasoning, and/or communication, all absolutely important in the process of learning and building good design, but not assessable unless reflected in the outcome of the work in the critical thinking process will have gained an enormous amount of learning within the processes undertaken, and is the valued component in developing thinkers skillful at analysing and evaluating information, reflecting on meaning, examining evidence and reasoning, and forming grounded assessments about facts collected from observation, experience, cognitive reasoning, and/or communication, all absolutely important in the process of learning and building good design, but not assessable unless reflected in the outcome of the work. The thinking time – the unmarked component – becomes obvious at the final stage of the project. The disappointment is evident in the lack of time allocated in a semester to explore, revisit, analyse and discuss a project. It takes time to analyse the form, experiment with materials, research construction techniques, and develop appropriate design aesthetics, without sufficient dedicated time these critical aspects of design become incidental.

In contrast to the universities’ push to reduce student/staff contact time it is revealed that ‘most medical schools are moving from a traditional, lecture-based curriculum to a new ‘problem based learning’ (PBL) curriculum that uses small group, case-based, learner-centred approaches designed to stimulate lifelong learning. The issue for educators, is that this approach is more effective in many respects with improved performance of students on high stakes exams in the United States, but also more costly for educators since it requires a higher staff to learner ratio of 1:8, rather than lecture-based courses in which lecturers deliver their wares to hundreds of students at a time, albeit with a knowledge retention rate of 10-30%.

This observation is further supported by the statement made by Tsui, “Undergraduate education can become more effective by not only limiting the number of large lecture courses but also by offering more seminar courses to freshmen and sophomore students.”

Impact of Condensed Time Frames
Due to time constraints and predetermined outcomes students within these university systems compartmentalise the units they study, loosing the overall knowledge approach needed to develop ideas creatively. They isolate bodies of knowledge and rarely acknowledge the interaction of specific subject knowledge as they have so little time to think and assimilate the knowledge base across the breadth of their education. The inspired input of the university academic has been lost in the process of assimilation of knowledge due to lack of contact time. Everyone is so involved in their own small fraction of academia that time for communication and reconciliation of knowledge has gone; academic staff have little time for collegial debate, course reviews or to explore new and better ways of teaching.

Surviving Student Life
Student time for academic output is further compromised as they have to live whilst at university. Most students now work up to twenty hours a week and still expect to complete a fulltime course and lead a ‘normal’ social life. As a consequence students become experts in compromise of minimal input for maximum output. There’s nothing new about university students going to work to make ends meet. According to the most recent studies, about three-quarters of the estimated half-million full-time domestic uni students in this country hold down a job. But these days it seems that students are working longer hours than ever before with some juggling two or even three part-time jobs for up to 30 hours a week. The irony is the more they work to study, the less time they have to actually hit the books. According to Rose Jackson, National Student Union Representative, 80 per cent of students are in paid employment and the average number of hours that they are working per

6 Tapper ‘Student Perceptions of How Critical Thinking is Embedded in a Degree Program’ p 23.
8 Tsui ‘Effects of Campus Culture’ p 436.
week is 14.5. That is a threefold increase from 1984.\(^9\)

Government support for students within the economic situation of today does not provide enough monetary support for them to live adequately in any manner let alone provide the necessities of university life such as books, telephone connection, internet connection and a computer. Students are the poor cousins of the workforce of the same age, and will remain disadvantaged if we don’t find a solution to provide these students with more time to think and develop ideas rather than just repeating the expected.

**Student Learning**

Success in developing critical thinking requires institutions to recognise that enhancing students’ abilities to think critically is truly within their own interests because graduates who can think critically become more productive and successful alumni and citizens.\(^{10}\)

Assigned projects are now frequently designed to give the students research and developmental time outside the bounds of the University. These resolutions are often followed with minimal input from the lecturer as the student with ideas is a lesser problem than the student without any form of resolution. Time restraints demand that the lecturer’s attention is devoted to the struggling student allowing the student with embryonic ideas to follow through the project without outside input other than that of peers, often resulting in predictable outcomes rather than exemplary design. There are always the exceptions, those academics who stay late in the day to explore design notions with enthusiastic students, or to enthuse a student to open their minds and explore the many options available.

**Possible Solutions**

Creating more time for critical thinking is no longer desirable it is absolutely critical. Tuition free weeks are a time to think for both staff and students. Students using their time efficiently find this time excellent for developing their projects, consulting with lecturers and preparing for various submissions. A fantastic solution for both lecturer and students, sadly the students using the system efficiently are the exceptions. Many students need to work extra time to have enough money to meet the demands of the next weeks of study. The success of this study period is often connected to the student’s financial situation.

**Recommendations for Change.**

The following suggestions are how to make more time available for students within the current University system:

The time period allocated for project submission could be extended in the following ways:

a) present the project brief during Orientation Week.

b) Develop design projects over two semesters, semester one for planning and materials investigation; semester two for resolution of ideas and bringing the project to a conclusion with all the outcomes expected in a critical learning situation. The breadth of the project could be limited so one aspect is developed well, and the student then understands how to develop the process to obtain an exemplary outcome.

The Bauhaus of Pre-War Germany was progressive in the design of machine made goods, furniture and architecture as it was in its educational philosophies. The notion of students working together with their professors on shared design projects allowed them to explore a variety of ways of thinking, allowed them to quickly learn the drawing skills required to communicate their design intent, providing them with mentors that advised them about tectonics, materiality, colour and light, but most importantly, they were able to stay focused on one design project, with a realm of activities that all played together for the one purpose of thinking critically in order to create new solutions.

Traditional higher education programs produced workers who have specific skills within specific areas enabling a high level of problem solving constrained by their specific area of expertise. Employers now need employees who are capable of thinking beyond their specific area of expertise and therefore need more expansive thinkers within the workplace.\(^{11}\)

**Critical and Lateral Thinking**

Effective critical thinking involves not only the building of competency in cognitive reasoning, but also the ability to translate competency into effective action. To think

---

\(^9\) ABC ‘Students Working longer hours in juggling act’ unpaginated.

\(^{10}\) Tsui ‘Effects of Campus Culture’ p 23.

critically, one must have and own a willingness to be accountable for results. Good critical thinkers are skilful at analysing and evaluating information, reflecting on meaning, examining evidence and reasoning, and forming grounded assessments about facts harvested from observation, experience, cognitive reasoning, and/or communication. Those who become skilful at critical thinking are able to reach conclusions and develop solutions that generate new results. Central to the idea of effective critical thinking is the practice of thinking laterally. Good lateral thinkers always see, appreciate and analyse the forest and the trees. The central inquiry in lateral thinking is, if I do this, then what? The best critical thinkers turn their attention to innovation. They are the creative problem solvers who lead the way to the future. These innovators set the standards.

Richard Paul believes that we can be sure that the persuasiveness of the argument for critical thinking will only grow year by year, day by day — for the logic of the argument is simply the only prudent response to the accelerating change, to the increasing complexity of our world. No gimmick, no crafty substitute, can be found for the cultivation of quality thinking. The quality of our lives can only become more and more obviously the product of the quality of the thinking we use to create them.12

Our students deserve at least a fighting chance to compete, to rise to the challenge of the day.13

Conclusion

Education needs to look to the global future, it has a responsibility to each and every student that passes through its doors to provide the necessary skills to survive within a competitive marketplace, if these skills are critical thinking and in order to achieve this more time is required to develop this skill, then so be it. Educational institutions must make time available for the development of critical thinkers and free up academics from ‘Housekeeping’ to be available for debate of alternative thought and the fostering of critical thinkers for the future.

The case study presented in this paper shows that critical thinking in Interior Architecture students can be nurtured and taught through flexible time scheduling and exploration of design through staged process work. This studio approach has allowed students to step back from their work and truly question the design intention and its occupation. Where the focus was placed on the process rather than the final outcome students were comfortable in questioning each stage of their design work recognizing that this was part of the process and not another interruption preventing them from completing their work. On more than one occasion students found they had to revisit a particular design stage before their work could progress, as this was an accepted part of the studio project, students were willing to revisit their design ideas and consider their approach from different perspectives.

The opportunity to explore and discuss design through modelling, drawing and discussion has proven to be very successful in this studio. Students have responded with positive feedback and staff have commented on the strength and quality of this cohort’s design work in ongoing semesters. Although the flexible time scheduling may not work for all units, it is important to note here that it is the focus on the process that benefits the student, and the learning that occurs within each stage and not the final outcome.

There are no right and wrong answers to set problems within design, in fact there may be many answers to one set problem, in this instance it is how the student is encouraged and allowed to explore the problem that may provide them with a successful learning outcome. For creative design to be taught successfully timeframes and structures must be more flexible in order to allow staff and students to develop creative and innovative design solutions.

12 Paul Critical Thinking p 16.
13 Paul Critical Thinking p 5.
References:

Australian Broadcasting Corporation [ABC], ‘Students Working longer hours in juggling act’ TV programme transcript, Reporter: Scott Bevan, Broadcast: 15/08/2006 www.abc.net.au /7.30/content/2006/s1715824.htm,


The places and spaces that we inhabit on a day-to-day basis elicit powerful emotional responses that influence our health and wellbeing. In response to this notion, the paper describes emerging research that focuses explicitly on the relationship between emotional responses and health and wellbeing. More significantly it does so from a holistic perspective relying on an integrated health systems model. Exploring the implications for interior design, the paper presents a basic understanding about ‘person’ as a whole and how various systems of the human body are interrelated and connected to ‘emotion’ and how the wellbeing of a person as a whole should be considered in relation to the built environment and its various elements. The paper argues that failure to consider the interrelated and integrative nature of the human body and the dialectic nature of the person-environment relationship severely restricts the potential of interior design to make an enduring positive impact on emotional health and wellbeing.

Introduction
The places and spaces that we inhabit on a day-to-day basis elicit powerful emotional responses that influence our health and wellbeing. In many situations the impact of our surroundings on our emotions is expected and accepted even when the impact is negative. But what about situations where the interaction or the responses from encounters with the physical environment lie just below the surface, a fraction beyond our reach, so elusive that we fail to notice the difference; situations where there is a less obvious follow-on effect to and through other dimensions of wellbeing. What is the risk to design and the health of a space’s occupants if this integrative aspect of person-environment interaction is ignored? For example, there may be times when we do not acknowledge or are not even aware of our inner conflicts or responses towards the space we are in because of the necessity to focus on the events, activities or tasks we are faced with. Not knowing the psychological and physiological impact of the built environment on the building users poses a risk for the people who are responsible for the design of the space. Design-education institutions need to address this aspect of the built environment and incorporate awareness of
such environmental impacts on health outcomes during the learning process to avoid perpetuating the risk for future users of space.

In response to the above questions, this paper describes emerging research that focuses explicitly on the relationship between psychological (emotional) responses and health and wellbeing connected to an in-depth literature review covering a wide range of scholarly literature. The person and environment relationship is examined as a whole using a transdisciplinary integrated health systems model. The transdisciplinary dimension acknowledges various qualities of the built environment and their impact on human health and wellbeing. This dimension is related to the ‘elusive’ aspect or ‘below the surface’ characteristics as highlighted previously. These aspects when not given much notice may contain a high risk factor for design endurance. If design does not influence positive responses, it fails in its obligation of having minimal harmful effect on human health in the long term. As emotion is the trigger for the release of other ensuing physical responses, physical environmental elements influencing emotion is seen as a high-risk category.

Most of us do not realise the smaller effects our surroundings may have on us while we are dealing with far more important issues. The sensations that occur as soon a person comes in contact with the built environment are swift and sometimes unrecognised. However, they influence the person’s perceptions and cognitive capabilities. They also evoke certain emotions and feelings in people. These emotions may cause certain physiological outcomes as well, such as affecting neuroendocrine and immune systems in the process. People exposed to physical environments that are incompatible to their needs may be at risk if they are unaware, and therefore do not intervene.

In consideration of this, an integrative model which looks at person and environment as a dialectic whole is essential. A basic understanding of such a model is presented here enabling the construct of the person to be understood more deeply and purposefully. In living beings, psychological reactions influence the neuroendocrine system thereby, affecting the immune systems which may concurrently elicit positive or negative health and wellbeing issues. The built environment also consists of various facets such as physical, psychological, and social dimensions. Environmental situations may involve one or all of the aspects that evoke specific responses in people; thereby being causal in eliciting several psychological or emotional reactions that influence physiological outcomes. This will be explored in detail in the following sections.

**Integrated health systems: the interior environmental concept**

While previous research implies a relationship between a holistic understanding of human health and wellbeing and the environment, the extent or specific nature of this understanding of how the notions of health, wellbeing, and environment are integrated and conceptualised, is not always clear. Design contributes to a large extent towards responses derived from person environment interaction. This implies that it may be important in such inquiry to both understand the person as a whole and the built environment to be considered in its entirety.

Integrated health systems when integrated with the physical environment reflect and support the concept that the physical environment is a key influence in maintaining human health and wellbeing. As stated previously, the model was developed as part of a larger study which looked at built environment and health research using a transdisciplinary approach. ‘Integrated health’ refers to the transactions between the mental state and physical state resulting in either positive or negative wellbeing. It acknowledges the physiological responses and reactions that the psychological responses can elicit and then consequently influence health and wellbeing in the process. The person is conceptualised as a whole according to this understanding. Using an integrative approach, people and environments cannot then be viewed in isolation. On the other hand, the different aspects of the environment cannot be separated from one another; as people environment relationships they interact and transact within themselves, eliciting different reactions from the person as s/he experiences place. In other words,

---

1 Suresh Mapping Interior Environment and Integrated Health Systems Research pp.2-5.
3 Schedlowski & Tewes Psychoneuroimmunology pp. 1-340.
4 See Bell, et al. *Theories of Environment-Behaviour Relationships* pp. 52-68.
they cannot be “defined independent of the other.”6

For interior designers, the integrative model is particularly relevant due to the intimacy of the relationship of the person and the interior environment; the way in which people interact with the environment and vice versa is of concern as design solutions are developed with the human element as a main criteria. As Abercrombie7 proposes, the designer should:

be attuned to that person's tastes, habits, mental sensibilities, and psychological susceptibilities... the designer must not forget the more obvious fact that the person also has a body... our body is also the key instrument in the art form of interior design.8

In general, several factors are of relevance to designers, in order to develop a more comprehensive understanding of the relationship between built environment and holistic health and wellbeing as they influence each other.

Understanding the 'whole person'

As argued the interrelationship between the various systems of the human body and their connection to 'emotion' and consequently the wellbeing of a person as a whole should be considered when designs for human inhabited built environment are regarded. An increasing number of studies have documented the connection between mind and the body.9 Similarly, there have many studies that document the connection between the mind and the body where illnesses are shown to have developed through mental stress and strain.10 Cancer, arthritis, asthma and cardiac illnesses are only some of them. If one's psychological/emotional health is depressed, the physical body could be more susceptible to illnesses. Accordingly, the interactions between the psychological systems, the central nervous system (CNS) and the neuro and endocrine systems are included as they also are understood to affect the immunological systems of the body. For instance, the experiences of stress can result in the production of an excess amount of epinephrine (adrenaline), causing a chemical breakdown resulting in the internal weakening of the immune system, and an increased potential for disease.11 Thus emotions are responsible for creating havoc within the human body and being responsible for many illnesses and diseases.

Wheatly12 has described in length the impacts of stress on various physiological conditions. These include blood pressure, which may escalate due to high levels of hypertension, certain psychiatric disorders such as phobias and panic disorders, and depression arising from exposure to prolonged chronic stress. He also suggests that many infectious diseases and life threatening illnesses like cancer can also manifest due to stress; for example, students who faced failure or more disappointments in life were diagnosed as having sore throats, and those with prolonged sadness with acute respiratory illness. This is because people under stress are more susceptible to the impairment of the immune system thereby potentially increasing their vulnerability to infectious diseases. Recovery is also slower under stressful conditions. Environmental situations that contribute to stress may thus be responsible for a multitude of illnesses and diseases.

The studies regarding human systems show psychological and physiological systems cannot be separated. Reactions and responses that a person derives from environmental relationships should not be separated and should be understood in terms of further reactions that can occur. Risk increases if they are ignored.

Person environment interaction on health and wellbeing

With this understanding, the paper now focuses on the relationships that a person forms with the physical environment and their contribution to positive or negative health and wellbeing outcomes or, in other words, the efficacy or inefficacy of the built environment on health and wellbeing. To identify the current understanding of the environmental responses, it is of value to explore research literature in the built environment and, to some extent, health research as well. The findings about the people environment relationship principles can be shown to aid the linkages of ‘person’ and built environment to encompass an integrative picture.

---

6 Ittleson ‘Environmental perception and contemporary perceptual theory’ p 56
7 Abercrombie A Philosophy of Interior Design p. 164.
8 Abercrombie A Philosophy of Interior Design p 164.
11 Schedlowski & Tewes Psychoneuroimmunology: An Interdisciplinary Introduction pp. 93-111
The theoretical concepts as well as empirical research related to psychological, social, and physiological aspects of people environment relationship are relevant as they support the argument that the built environment and the emotional changes generated may be associated with instigating conditions related to poor physical health and wellbeing. They also help describe the various attributes of an integrative health systems model. Environmental behaviour research indicates that studies on people environment relationships have mainly focused on the psychological and social aspects of people environment interaction and transaction. Several key people environment relationship dimensions have been proposed as ways to understand and explain environmental behaviours, responses and experiences, such as spatial use, environmental privacy and control practices, other experiential behaviours, preventive health factors connected to the environment (such as 'sick building syndrome'), importance of aesthetic qualities, and design for human physical activity. Most concepts have sought to explain people environment relationship as a result of the interaction/transaction of a collection of factors.

Underlying the premise of the integrative system approach is that if we are to really understand the consequence of person-environment relationship in relation to human health and wellbeing, we need to regard the person and their psycho-physiological systems in a collective sense. In general, however, a person’s psycho-physiological relationships with the built environment, particularly emotional and mental relationships and their influence on the physiological systems, are less studied in physical environment research. As Parsons & Tassinary state from the perspective of environmental psychophysiology, “All psychological events have some physiological referent — there is no entity called mind that is independent of the central nervous system.” Some theories in environmental psychology such as those related to environmental stressors, restorative environments, topographic cognition, environmental aesthetics, isolated environments, and restricted environmental stimulation therapy, indirectly imply that psychological events have some "physiological referent.”

Considering person and the built environment in the integrated sense
The failure to consider the interrelated and integrative nature of the human body and the dialectic nature of the person-environment relationship may severely restrict the potential of interior design to make an enduring positive impact on emotional health and wellbeing. Design impacts on people using place and space. It facilitates or impedes quality of life in several ways. Among them is the health and wellbeing of the person. For a person to enjoy quality of life, it is vital to be healthy in all aspects. If these issues are not considered, a certain risk factor exists which may or may not be evident. The interaction with space could elicit certain responses in people in such a way that they may influence emotions consequently triggering physiological reactions. This may further affect health and wellbeing therefore being harmful at certain stages. While some responses are recognised by users, some are not as evident.

Previous research shows that most of the work in attempting to understand the influence of the physical environment on health and wellbeing in humans has focused on physiological and stress factors. Frumkin states that environmental health being dynamic in nature encourages interdisciplinary as well as transdisciplinary research, rather than trying to concentrate on one discipline to conceptualise relationship between human-health and the environment. It is thus important to consider interdisciplinarity as well as transdisciplinarity in design applications. In the design context for example, interdisciplinarity inquiries into design implications should include understandings of interdisciplinary areas such as environmental psychology and so on while transdisciplinarity studies could be informed through collaboration from science and medicine. Transdisciplinarity uses knowledge from the disciplines working together informing inquiries without any 'boundaries.'


14 Korpela & Ylen Perceived health’ pp. 1-14.

15 Parsons & Tassinary ’Environmental Psychophysiology’ p 174.

16 Parsons & Tassinary ‘Environmental Psychophysiology’.

17 Stokols ‘Environmental Design’ pp. 19-23.

18 Butler & Jasmin ‘Longevity and Quality of Life’ pp. 1-3.

19 Frumkin Environmental Health pp. xi-xiv.

The aspects of the user’s and creator’s influences indicate that the making of a place and its use are interrelated to our experience and inter/transactions; designer, researcher and user categories influence and manipulate each other in a multifaceted way. While this is exemplified by the notion that the designer is responsible for the users’ experience, it may be important to note that if creators ignore the factors responsible for human health and wellbeing responses, they may be complicit in creating health hazards for people using the environment they created.

Ulrich believes that humans respond immediately, unconsciously, emotionally and physiologically. These processes play a critical role in how humans respond to the physical environment, its configurations and elements. These concepts relate to the person environment interrelationship integrative health systems model, which gives precedence to the emergent human subjective and objective reactions due to spatial inter/transactions. Furthermore, Pennebaker & Brittingham state that certain environmental stimuli can elicit physiological responses influenced by psychological responses. They state that, when there is ‘external information’ (stimuli outside the human body), the ‘internal sensation’ creates awareness of it which is “directly related to physiological change,” these perceptions evolving either consciously or without deliberation. People may not be aware of the internal physiological sensations unless it is something contradictory to everyday encounters. The main risk factor that may be involved here is the fact that the responses and reactions may sometimes be unknown to the user. This signifies the importance of the designer in implementing certain standards to design applications so that it would positively elicit responses.

Exposures to everyday environments may elicit various effects on human psychological and physiological systems. Ulrich’s experiments measure the person’s physiological and psycho-physiological responses (such as muscle tension, brain waves, heart rate and blood pressure) when experiencing the physical environment. His results indicate that preferred environments reduce anxiety and enhance recovery process and stress responses. Such studies suggest that the environment consists of several stimuli that influence the psychological and physiological responses in humans.

Although generalisations can be found within each area of research, it is still helpful to identify general patterns crossing over environmental perceptions, cognitive and emotional responses, preferences, cultural influences and therapeutic and restorative qualities of the occupied space, to understand their influences on health outcomes. It may well indicate that the results found for one particular group may apply to other groups and that no single study by itself can be conclusive. However, as numerous studies provide similar understandings and concepts, they indicate that direct and indirect effects may exist. Emotion feature repeatedly in research concerning person environment interaction, pointing out that feelings play a role in human psychological and physiological responses to place and that the physical environment can directly affect or alter emotions.

**Conclusion**

This paper identifies some specific risk factors, that is negative health and wellbeing outcomes such as stress resulting in high blood pressure, respiratory illnesses and so on. For example stress could be triggered off as a result of overlooking the underlying elements of our surrounds. Psychological or more specifically emotional wellbeing of a person influences health and wellbeing thereby affecting quality of life. Several studies have provided basis for such an understanding. As research also indicates that the built environment contributes to positive as well as negative psychological wellbeing, the possibilities of health issues in relation to the environment we interact in is equally important. Thus, design affects people on all aspects of psychological and physiological wellbeing influencing health and quality of life.

Transdisciplinary research may be key in exploring such relationships. This is demonstrated by current research synthesised...
to develop an integrative model.\textsuperscript{26} This would have been impossible had other studies outside interior design been ignored. The element of person was understood in total only after including understandings of person in a medical or scientific way. Such studies contribute to an understanding of a person as a whole and the built environment in finding applicable design solutions.

Taking this into consideration it is recommended that further research into illnesses caused by environmental impact on emotional wellbeing and consequences on the neuroendocrine and immune systems is necessary. Also further exploration into the benefits of applied linkages between person’s integrative health systems and the physical environment practice would provide a better understanding for application into practice and the production of a positive environment where distress and the potential for illness and disease are minimised.

Educational institutions should also emphasise the importance of transdisciplinarity in all areas of application and give further importance to research and education in such domains by collaborating across a number of disciplinary faculties. Other than a handful of programs such as environmental health, public health, and environmental psychology (which concentrate on the health aspects related to the physical environment), architecture and design disciplines do not necessarily look at these integrative elements of applied design for human health. By including design projects that embrace the integration of students from other disciplines such as psychology, nursing and so on. Design students also could be introduced to the psychological and physiological workings of the human body helping them to find better design solutions that positively influence users. It is our aim that given a tool such as the integrative health model, design students could develop a broader and more grounded knowledge about the health of the users of their design without compromising their creativity.

\textsuperscript{26} Suresh et al. ‘Person Environment Relationships to Health and Wellbeing’ p. 22.
References:


Howard Frumkin (Ed) *Environmental Health: From Global to Local*, New York: John Wiley & sons, Inc.


Strangers in a Material World
mapping the application of new materials and risk in the design process

George Verghese
University of Technology Sydney, AU

This paper will examine the ideas behind risk and new materiality by discussing key issues and using them to inform a new diagram about risk, design, and material. This diagram is aimed to assist in integrating material thinking into the design process, a process that is not limited to the confines of educational institutes, but is part of the life-long learning about materiality. Designers who are progressive in their investigation of materiality will be briefly mentioned as inspirational leaders examining materiality in design. The handling of risk is most certainly a trait that all designers are engaged with, no matter what discipline; whether or not the design outcome is focused on avoiding risk, or challenging the norm, risk is integral in any design methodology. Eventually the design outcome stands as a stranger in a material world and as a tangible expression of materiality and process.

Introduction

This paper will examine the ideas behind risk and new materiality by discussing key issues and using them to inform a new diagram about risk, design, and material. This diagram is aimed to assist in integrating material thinking into the design process, a process that is not limited to the confines of educational institutes, but is part of the life-long learning about materiality. Designers who are progressive in their investigation of materiality will be briefly mentioned as inspirational leaders examining materiality in design. The handling of risk is most certainly a trait that all designers are engaged with, no matter what discipline; whether or not the design outcome is focused on avoiding risk, or challenging the norm, risk is integral in any design methodology. Eventually the design outcome stands as a stranger in a material world and as a tangible expression of materiality and process.

Ezio Manzini clearly defines the term ‘new materials’ in his ground-breaking book Material of Invention in which he states:

The term ‘new materials’ does not merely mean a limited number of sophisticated materials developed in a few advanced applicative areas. We are talking about the entire set of qualities that, to varying degrees are appearing throughout the landscape of materials – including the most traditional and venerable of them – shifting them with respect to manufacturing processes. The term, in short, expresses a new technical and cultural
atmosphere, within which the transformation of matter is taking place.1

Countless exhibitions, reference books and databases appearing recently all demonstrate a growing concern by designers in various disciplines towards material innovation driving their design outcomes. This progression of innovative ideas and the adoption of new material technologies into design outputs are fuelled not only by the designers themselves, but also by the manufacturers who see the social and economic benefits of new materials. George Basalla states:

the process of innovation involves the interplay of psychological and socio-economic factors is generally agreed. An overwhelming emphasis on the psychological elements leads to a genius theory of invention, of which the contributions of a few gifted individuals are featured. An excess concentration on the social and economic elements yields a rigidly deterministic explanation that presents an invention as the inevitable product of its times.2

Clearly this opens a larger debate and investigation about innovation, novelty, progress, materialism, and culture. Risk is a pivotal part of all of these ideas as Bernstein proclaims, "[t]he revolutionary idea that defines the boundary between modern times and the past is the mastery of risk: the notion that the future is more than the whim of the gods and that men and women are not passive before nature."3

If designers in the modern world must rid themselves of the bonds of the unknown, they need to do this through exploration, understanding, and education. Key concepts of this context are: the profession; the designer' education; the elements of risk; and, the dual demands of the discipline. All are demanding in scope and illustrative of the relationship of risk to design, and all are crucial to a much wider discussion. However, to contain the scope of this investigation, the paper will examine the relationship of these concerns and why designers take risks through the use of new materials to create a spatial enclosure called an interior.

We are well aware of those designers whose work enlightens us to the potential of material innovation. Frank Gehry talks extensively about the relationship of materials to the idea regardless if the outcome is a chair, a residence, or a large-scale commercial commission as Milred Friedman states "[b]ut success has not spoiled Frank Gehry; rather, it has given him the self assurance he needed to persevere with his singular experiments with materials and form."4 Oddly enough one of Frank Gehry's earlier project has recently been transformed by Pugh + Scarpa in a manner not dissimilar to Gehry's latter works. Their projects have all been described as "an ongoing research into materials and technologies as well as a re-examination of known conditions."5 Here we clearly see practitioners dealing with context, ideas, and materiality — all concerns that will be dealt with later in this paper. Other designers are also aligned with this exploration "[a]s advanced technology is becoming more prevalent in society, designers are becoming more active protagonists in the exploration of sensuality through the use new materials in design."6 The internationally renown firm of Yabu Pushelberg also experiments with processes, ideas and "high-tech gadgetry, unconventional materials like resin, and handcrafted pieces of artwork."7 This firm has refrained from a stylistic design approach in order to be firmly committed to innovative material and design ideas. All these firms and others like Diller and Scofidio, Molo Design, Herzog and de Meuron, OMA, and Ron Arad Associates have all explored the material terrain with close attention to the edges of the map, and with each new investigation they are helping to provide a body of knowledge of new materiality in design.

The research for this paper began years ago with empirical understanding and knowledge gained in design practices using new materials, a typical path for practicing designers whose knowledge of materials is gained through specification and direct contact with materials. This has led to secondary research into relevant areas. The methodology used for this paper is that of secondary sources used to frame the research, with the intention to explore this

1 Manzini Material of invention p 18.
2 Basalla The evolution of technology p 64.
3 Bernstein Against the gods – the remarkable story of risk p 1.
4 Friedman The reluctant master' p 11.
5 Sueyoshi 'COop Editorial' p 145
6 Verghese 'Sensual spaces through material abstraction'.
7 Leung 'Interior vision' p 139
area through primary research at a latter stage.

The challenges of the profession and discipline

All design deals with unknowns, risk is always apparent and the degree of exploration can vary. Design is about amending the future and moving forward. This is the challenge of education to recognise the beauty of tradition and continuity, but also to encourage students to take calculated risks and explore ideas when designing. Fostering the idea of exploration within the minds of young designers will allow them to strive for innovation within the context of practice. Interior design education provides the platform for exploration but is often challenged by dealing with the twin concerns of the profession and of the discipline that at times do not align. The profession calls for an individual that offers a service to the community to provide direction and advice to build internal environments that address function, health and safety needs of the inhabitants. This is described by Guerin and Martin in their research into the 'Interior Design Body of Knowledge' as "improving the quality of life, increasing productivity, protecting health, safety and welfare of the public," in short, meeting pre-determined code requirements. The importance of these concerns is without doubt in the day-to-day activities of practicing designers. These designers are all acting professionally designing spaces to satisfy the needs of the clients. However, regardless of how appropriate the design solutions may be, is continuity the goal? Assurances of health and safety are important, but continuity, in itself, could not possibly be the sole aim for the design professional. Those that have broken away from conformity, and have established new datum points for the discipline — they all have taken risks. We need to consider the premise that "diversity that characterises the material objects of any culture is proof that novelty is to be found wherever there are human beings." If this was not so, continuity would rule and there would be no desire for material objects or material arrangements to ever go beyond what was produced before hand, and imitation would be the standard approach with innovation and progress non-existent. We know that this is not the case as the Enlightenment took the Greek idea of progress forward during the Industrial Revolution. This period also saw the economy and knowledge grow at a rate fast enough to generate a continuing flow of investment and technological innovation. "Among other things, this transformed attitudes: for the first time, the idea that something was 'new' made it attractive, preferable to something that was traditional, familiar, tried and tested." The education of designers deals with the issues of the profession in terms of comprehension, knowledge, and skills needed to participate and shape the profession, but it also deals with the wider scope of the discipline. History, theory and critical thinking all help students to weave the knowledge of the past with those ideas for the future and understanding of the present. Although there are many approaches to design pedagogy, this paper will use an approach raised by Edward Krick when he discussed the education of engineering design students. The issue he was addressing was the challenge for students to engage with the universe of possible ideas and not be restricted with standard solutions. Krick's diagram will form the basis of a diagrammatic study of new materiality and risk proposed later in this paper. In Krick's study on engineering design problems, he states that the universe of ideas is vast and varied and within this context, the designers are limited in their choices that lie in the solution domain bounded by three different limits. (See figure 1). The Limits of Knowledge defines the boundary that is constantly expanding through education. The Limits of Fictitious Restrictions deal with concepts that are untested and invalid. Lastly, the Limits of Genuine Restrictions deal with issues that cannot be altered.

---

8 Guerin & Martin The interior design profession's body of knowledge — its definition and documentation p 9.
9 Basalla The evolution of technology p 64.
10 Watson Ideas — a history from fire to Freud p 553.
11 Krick An introduction to engineering and engineering design p 137.
Krick's universe of ideas diagrammatically represents the possible solution for any and all problems. From the Venn diagram it can easily be seen that the area that is shared by all limits is the solution space, a space where the criteria set by each of the limits are met. Krick's methodology aims at increasing the size of the solution space to allow the designer more options, so he calls for the designer to firstly expand the limits of knowledge. Education, both formal and informal, allows for the limits to be expanded. Secondly, the Fictitious Restrictions must be removed or reduced. And lastly, the Limits of Genuine Restrictions must be tested to assess its accuracy. The simple clarity of Krick's model has great relevance to design pedagogy.

**The elements of risk**

The United Kingdom is one of a number of countries worldwide generating key discussions on the relationship of materials to the economy, and integrating the need for innovation is often one of the key objectives in all these discussions. The UK-based Materials Innovation & Growth Team produced a report in March 2006 providing a sense of scale to the concerns stating that "[t]he UK must build on its strengths in material science and technology and accelerate the pace of innovation if it wants to stay competitive." If designers accept these boundaries as fixed, the design world would be very limited. However, despite knowing their ignorance of certain aspects of the world, they disregard this ignorance and constantly challenge their limits. Clearly issues of conformity are addressed here, but also the willingness to risk normality and explore the limits of how far can the boundaries be pushed, and what is the risk in doing so. Ashby and Johnston discuss the application of the new, the novel and the ultimately of the untested, of one which requires a degree of risk. Designers have to balance the cost of failure with the likelihood to add value to the performance, and the opportunity to address the character and meaning of the project in ways that existing materials fail to achieve. However, design is often about creating the edge, the point of difference, the exclusive, and the original. In terms of professional outcomes for commercial clients, innovation is equal to profit, and for private non-commercial projects, innovation is equal to exclusivity, uniqueness, and sometimes, novelty.

The simple question of whether or not a material will succeed in the market place needs to be asked. Maine and Ashby have developed a clear investment methodology for materials that looked at this question. Their methodology dealt with three interconnected factors: viability assessment, market forecasting, and analysis of value capture. They state the descriptions of these three factors and the relationship to new materials as:

Viability assessment involves that analysis of technical suitability of the material for an application, an estimate of production cost, and the market trade-off between performance attributes and cost. Market forecasting involves gathering application-specific market preferences, making an estimate of the technically and economically viable market size, and predicting the timing and industrial adoption by comparison of relevant

---

12 Department of Trade and Industry A strategy for materials p 35.
13 Department of Trade and Industry A strategy for materials p 5.
14 Ashby & Johnston Materials and design: the art and science of material selection in product design p 33.
15 Bernstein Against the gods p 207.
16 Ashby & Johnston Materials and design: the art and science of material selection in product design p 159.
It can be concluded from this methodology that the role of design is vital in all three categories. The viability assessment is evident in the actual design process of material analysis and synthesis. The market forecasting and analysis of value capture both deal with concerns that designers have no immediate control over, but they do need to integrate these factors such as market, precedent, and client’s organisational profile within the design analysis.

The economist Phyllis Deane discusses the Industrial Revolution as: "[o]ne thing that is clear about modern economic growth is that it depends on, more than anything else, a continuing process of technical change." Change in the status of anything automatically implies taking a risk. The relationship between economic growth, innovation, and the inherent risk is as valid today as it was when innovation was rampant during the Industrial Revolution.

Today the UK construction industry recognises the need for technological growth, but still has some resistance as John Manning concludes, "[t]he introduction of any ‘new’ material to construction projects requires careful long term planning. The industry is not generally receptive to ‘newness’ in materials. However, material development is an essential part of innovative design concepts.” Part of this resistance to taking the risk is the individual nature of most construction projects that are wedded to a site and projects are generally produced using a clear division of trades instead of a controlled factory condition that could be easily programmed. The other resistance is the suitability of joining technologies, as failure at the junction point is crucial to avoid. Many new materials are adopted into the construction industry from other industries, via technology transfer, and the scale and composition of the joints may have not been fully resolved for the transfer into the built environment.

**Duality of design**

Interior designers have to constantly resolve the duality of their profession. Being caught in-between two opposing forces that bring equal urgency to their outcomes. These forces are that of tradition on one hand and non-conformity on the other. This is true of most design disciplines and John Heskett writes about this tension as: "[i]n the history of industrial design the twin themes of continuity and change constantly recur in different guises, and at times pronounced tensions have been created by their conflicting demands.” Just as Krick talks about addressing the boundaries of design when dealing with fictitious restrictions, genuine restrictions and the limits of knowledge, we need to constantly address these boundaries and search for new discriminations to extend our knowledge and our cultural base.

The design process is not linear and initial solutions are rarely the final ones. Discovery is as much a part of design as problem-solving, and if design is an iterative process that can encompass the exploration of ideas that lead to problem solutions, it can also lead to solutions to problems that are yet to be asked. Practice-led research helps to frame this approach in which the practice of design leads to new forms of knowledge. The idea can be extrapolated to include the exploration of materials that lead to design solutions. The iterative design process deals with accumulated knowledge and the understanding of the problem addressed in creative ways by the designer; however, when faced with a choice of materials, a very rational and routine process occurs through searching databases, journals, personal material files, published manufacturer’s literature, and through discussions with sales representatives. This routine process and the duality of life as a designer are echoed here by Hellmut Fischmeister who states: "[t]hese conditions favour incremental innovations. By contrast, if the designer’s creativity is set free to consider entirely new functions on the basis of a new material’s previously unutilized

---

18 Deane The first industrial revolution p 118.
19 Manning ‘Risks associated with the use of new materials in construction’ p 57.
20 Heskett Industrial Design p 7.
characteristics, genuine breakthroughs may come out."21

If we agree that risk is associated with economic gain, then the factor of timing becomes important for designers to consider, especially if they are inclined to constantly have free flight in the material world. The fashion industry understands this concept thoroughly, and now, other design fields are also becoming more cognizant of this issue. James Laver indicates the cycle of fashion in the following chart (see figure 2), as it appeared in Stephen Bayley’s excellent examination of Taste.22 Now the marketing and advertising world have incorporated the past as a more positive element with retro fashions and designs, making the '10 -20 years after its time' period now not seemingly so hideous our ridiculous. However, apart from the currency of fashion, the economic return on the investment is crucial to manufacturers. Different design disciplines such as fashion, product design, interior design, and architecture all have different constraints and inherent timelines that need to be considered when dealing with adoption of new materials or material technology transfer.

### Table 1: Cycles of Fashion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Style</th>
<th>Years After Its Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indecent</td>
<td>10 years before its time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shameless</td>
<td>5 years before its time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outré</td>
<td>1 year before its time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smart</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dowdy</td>
<td>1 year after its time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hideous</td>
<td>10 years after its time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ridiculous</td>
<td>20 years after its time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amusing</td>
<td>30 years after its time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quaint</td>
<td>50 years after its time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charming</td>
<td>70 years after its time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romantic</td>
<td>100 years after its time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beautiful</td>
<td>150 years after its time</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2. Cycles of Fashion
From James Laver Taste and Fashion 194523

### New materials and risk diagram

In order to understand the conceptual issues of risk in relationship to new materials, a diagram is proposed that provides a link to Krick’s design process diagram. The diagram brings together the design process and also the methodology raised by Maine and Ashby. The aim of the diagram is to provide designers, educators, and students with a holistic view of the problem of choice. Its aim is not to provide methods for choosing the material, nor a list of materials and their uses, but rather a comprehension of the shortfalls in understanding of materiality.

The diagram exists in a space of a ‘universe of materials’. This space is essentially all existing materials (new or traditional) known to us, and also all materials not yet known. In other words, this space is all matter and permutations of matter that form a material substance. Within this space exist three areas that intersect and the boundaries of these areas are called the limits of that particular area. The three areas are: the material knowledge domain; the context of the problem; and lastly, the myth of material constraints.

The domain of material knowledge, lets call this domain A (see figure 3), is gained through formal and informal methods. In this domain we see some designers separate themselves from others through thorough research, exploration and understanding of materials. It is here that designers use their databases, material libraries, and sales resources to generally look at the performance criteria of the material, with any related market forecast and historical precedents. As young design graduates begin practice they exponentially expand their formal education in materials through on-the-job experience and specification. Oddly enough, some designers find a material and stick with it, using it in the same way over and over again. Fischmeister outlines some remarkable research: “[a] field study involving experienced designers and/or engineers in a number of progressive machinery companies during the 1970s showed that, during the creative stages of design, these persons worked, on average, with no more than seven (!) different material types.”24

---

21 Fischmeister ‘Materials-inspired innovation in a world of routine design’ p 309.
22 Bayley Taste – the secret meaning of things, p. xiv.
23 Cited, Bayley Taste – The Secret Meaning of Things
24 Fischmeister ‘Materials-inspired innovation in a world of routine design’ p 311.
Where domain A, material knowledge, is linked with proven facts, empirical findings and scientific research, domain B, material myth (see figure 4), is based on belief structure and existing scientific thought. As myth is generally the starting point for civilizations and human technological development, it slowly becomes replaced with knowledge. The diagram illustrates that there are some materials that become known outside any previous related belief and myths; such as, nano-materials and smart materials. There are also myths of materials that still exist; such as, certain polymers cannot be recycled. Currently this idea lies outside the existing knowledge domain. If in time this is proven incorrect and all polymers can be recycled, then the knowledge domain will increase and encompass the myth. Most recently, the myth that plastics are not able to conduct electricity is now dispelled.

New materials are not of significance unless they engage in the real world. The ideas of novelty, innovation and risk have already been discussed, and to translate all of these thoughts into this diagrammatic analysis, the use of the term 'context' is the most appropriate. The context of problem, let's call domain C (see figure 5), may indicate material solutions that are not conceived of yet but are not unfeasible. It may also contain material options that are based on fantasy. The problem constraints and precedents are all within this domain that helps define the context of the problem. All areas of Maine and Ashby's methodology fall into this domain: viability assessment, market forecasting, and analysis of value capture. It is within this domain, commonly associated as the only domain of a design problem, that the viability assessment of matching requirement criteria of a project to the performance criteria of the material exists. Figure 5 also represents all three domains intersecting and creating a material solution space (noted as area D).

Using Krick's pedagogy as a starting point we can see that the option that is most favourable to decrease the risk is to increase the 'material solution space'. This has to be done simultaneously in any problem. The increasing interest in new materiality is aiding the expansion of the material knowledge domain. Transmaterial®, Material Connexion®, and Materia® are all providing expert service in this necessary expansion. Whilst expanding the limits of material knowledge there will be a simultaneous reduction in the limits of the domain of material myth. The main aim of designers is to dispel and eventually eliminate the domain of material myth. As previously noted, designers don’t always work in a linear manner; here the issue of practice-led research leads to the limits of the problem context being challenged by the exploration of materials outside the problem that can lead back to innovate approaches to the problem. The limits of context have to be constantly examined and allowed to grow appropriately. Designers are often approached, or choose so independently, to examine a new material and suggest new uses for it. Here they will be using materials outside of the domains of knowledge and context, in doing so they help to stretch the limits and the final solution space for selection of future materials. They do so as a challenge, as the territory at this point is uncharted and has inherent risks. Viability, market and venture capture assessments then all become quite speculative.

25 Fildes ‘Chemists work on plastic promise’.
Conclusion

The role of the designer is varied and complex, and it is constantly pulled by the tensions of continuity and change. Yet despite all of the pressures, their main role is to provide a sense of place and character to a spatial condition, in short they aim to improve the quality of life for the users. “Quality is created by material manipulations to develop the character of the space.”\textsuperscript{26} However, to be thoroughly comfortable in selection of materials, an adequate material solution domain must exist and be constantly expanded. This paper has proposed a diagrammatic analysis of the issues faced by designers who choose to look at taking calculated risks and explores new materials within interior spaces. Designers like Chris Van Juijn at OMA who experiments with polyester panels for the Prada stores, or Rod Arad and his continuous experiments with steel furniture, and most recently Corian\textsuperscript{®} screens for the Venice Biennale, and smaller firms like Molo Design who have developed the Paper Softwall, and IS Ar IWAMOTOSCOTT \textsuperscript{27} who also explore materiality as central to their process and not as an addendum, are a few examples of designers working with materiality and risk. It would seem that all of these designers would agree, “imagination deserves to be freed of its stereotypes, so that materiality can take free flight.”\textsuperscript{28}

\textsuperscript{26} Verghese ‘Sensual spaces through material abstraction’.

\textsuperscript{27} Verghese ‘Sensual spaces through material abstraction’.

\textsuperscript{28} Dagognet cited, Manzini The Material of Invention p 13.
References:
Home Invasion and Political Risk

Kathy Waghorn
School of Design, Unitec, NZ

This paper will examine the limit of the home with direct reference to the debate framing a piece of New Zealand legislation. The Crimes (Home Invasion) Amendment Bill (1999), arose in an election year as the government's response to a perceived surge in 'home invasion' crimes. The bill required an attempt to delineate the limits of the domestic. In order to make legislation, the verge, edge and limit of the home was sought. In parliament confusion reigned as the limit of the home was variously located at the front door, the garden, the letterbox. The rhetoric surrounding the bill exposed many assumptions. The home was assumed to be a place of security and privacy; it was also located as a gender specific site, with politicians declaring the need to protect the grandmother, the mother and the wife, in the home. In this paper the problem of 'home' is considered, the home as a concept in law is discussed and, as a tactical response to the issues raised, De Certeau's notion of the propriety of place is invoked, as the paper identifies governmental politics attempting to win favour by embarking on the risky business of defining limits, where there are only always murky boundaries.

Introduction

The Crimes (Home Invasion) Amendment Bill (1999) engaged New Zealand politicians in an attempt to identify and articulate the limit of the home. The debate took place in an election year alongside a perceived environment of 'rising crime', 1 with the intimate and disturbing details of recent 'home invasion' crimes circulating in the media. The bill reinforced notions that the home is privileged, perceived as a site of sanctuary and security; in the process it confused the violence inflicted by the 'invasion' of the house with that inflicted upon the body. This legislative act can be read as an operation of the 'interlacing' of "dwelling, technics and politics." 2 In this paper the problem of 'home' is unravelled, the home as a concept in law is discussed and De Certeau's notion of the propriety of place is invoked, as the paper identifies

---

1 "In January, a New Zealand Herald DigiPol survey showed almost three out of four people were worried about being attacked in their homes." Laxon 'Tougher line in home invasions' p A3.

2 Teyssot 'Water and gas on all floors' p 84.
governmental politics attempting to win favour by embarking on the risky business of defining limits.

This paper draws a theoretical discussion from events that were violent, disturbing and profound. In discussing these events it is my intention to negotiate the line between the inevitable abstraction that occurs through theory while maintaining the sense of horror and repulsion that these events generated. Janz, in his discussion of the 'place-making' impact of hurricanes on the Florida coast in 2004, and of the American embassy bombing in Nairobi in 1998, begins by articulating the shift between a 'construction' or reading of the events and the real impacts of the events themselves. He explains,

In speaking of a disaster as 'constructed', I do not mean to minimize its impact on people and communities. 'Construction' refers to the rhetorical ways in which we choose to understand the world. Hurricanes and bomb attacks happen, of course, and they are not made up... the point is that considering the construction of an event does not diminish either its reality or its consequences to people. It does, however, tell us something important about the places we live in, and about the ways that places are constructed and made available at extreme times.3

Engaging with a theoretical discourse in regard to the events that I am about to describe is in no way intended to detract from the horror of what occurred, but is intended to frame a 'rhetorical way' in which we might consider the 'construction' of the home within a particular time and political context.

The events
In December of 1998 Beverly Bouma and her husband Hank, farmers in the remote central North Island New Zealand area of Reporoa, were brutally attacked by four masked and armed men who burst into their home. The attackers stole the couple's bankcards and forced them to reveal their pin number. Hank was bound and gagged and Beverly was murdered. Taking the couple's car the attackers later withdrew more than $2000 from the Bouma's bank account as they traversed the central North Island.

This murder was widely reported as shocking from the horror of what occurred, but is intended to frame a 'rhetorical way' in which we might consider the 'construction' of the home within a particular time and political context.

The legislation
The Crimes (Home Invasion) Amendment Bill was introduced to parliament by the government in March 1999, an election year.11 Simply put, the intention of the bill

3 Janz 'Places that disasters leave behind' unpaginated

4 MacLeod 'Rural fear and loathing' p A17.
5 Sell 'Brutal killing' p A1.
6 Sell 'Mother shot dead' p A1.
7 Macbrayne, MacLeod, & Sell 'Victim leaves axe raider' p A1.
8 MacLeod 'Rural fear and loathing' p A17.
9 Grunwell & Keane 'Armed offenders swoop' p A1.
10 Ryall 'Crimes (Home Invasion) Amendment Bill' (2 March 1999) p 15176.
11 The National government lost the election in November of that year, ending three consecutive terms as
was to provide a mechanism whereby longer prison sentences could be conferred by the judiciary upon those who committed a crime in the location of a home that they had unlawfully entered. The bill was perceived by the opposition as an election year stunt, through which the government could be seen to be 'getting tough' on crime. Further critique of the bill from the opposition centred on the question of whether sentence length deters potential offenders.

As the bill passed through the three readings and the select committee process several 'slippages' of meaning occurred. In introducing the bill for its second reading in parliament on March 2, 1999, the Minister of Justice Tony Ryall opened the debate by stating,

The aim of this Bill is clear. Criminals who violate the sanctuary of the home will face tougher jail sentences. I do not need to tell members about the outrage our people feel about home invasion. One cannot go anywhere in our nation without hearing disgust at the few who seek to violate the security of our homes.

In this statement Ryall exposes the first slippage made in relation to the home, that being that the home is inevitably assumed a privileged place, a place of sanctuary. Ryall then goes on to articulate a second assumption when he says, "if longer sentences deter one violent attack on a grandmother, a mother, or a wife, then I will be happy." It quickly becomes apparent from this statement that the home is gendered, those found in the 'sanctuary' of the home are women. Both of these slippages will be explored in greater depth later in this discussion.

Patricia Schnauer, an Act MP, who supported the bill, was the first in the debate to identify the problematic nature of defining 'home-invasion'. She said,

I would like to talk about the definition of home invasion in the Bill, because it is a hugely difficult topic. Everybody knows that the criminal who smashes down the door of someone’s home and kills an innocent person while he or she is inside has committed a home invasion.\(^\text{14}\)

In drawing attention to the difficulty of definition she maintains the coupling of the two terms 'home' and 'invasion', rather than asking the underlying question of what is meant by 'home' and how might we describe it as being 'invaded'. Further, in this statement we can identify another slip of meaning that so readily occurred. The deliberate killing of another person is, in the law and in common understanding, termed murder, not home invasion. In Schnauer's statement a slip is made whereby the space of the home and the crime against the victim are neatly collapsed into one. This collapse of home and body will also be explored in greater depth in this essay.

**What constitutes "home"?**

'Dwellinghouse' means (a) a building or other structure, or part of a building or other structure, that is used by the occupant principally as a residence; or (b) a mobile home, caravan or houseboat, that is used by the occupant principally as a residence.\(^\text{15}\)

The home, as described in the bill, is assumed singular and contained, clearly demarked from the spaces surrounding it. The definition sites the legislation in a suburban context, where a fully detached house, with clearly articulated ownership and occupancy, sits within delineated property boundaries. All dwelling typologies that operate with a different spatial arrangement have to be therefore considered counter to 'dwelling-house' as described in the bill. Thus the debate in parliament raged on considering other sites of home: rest homes, hotels, hostels, sleep-outs, campsites, baches, and dwellings connected to places of commerce, were all discussed in turn. What was never considered though, was any more theoretically informed or culturally specific understanding of the space of 'home'.

This paradigm of the home, as the singular site of the private domestic individual or family, segregated from the place of work, is closely aligned with Victorian, liberal views of the self.\(^\text{16}\)

The editors of the *Home Cultures Journal*, cite Benjamin's claustrophobic description of

---

\(^{14}\) Schnauer 'Crimes (Home Invasion) Amendment Bill' p 15168.

\(^{15}\) Crimes (Home Invasion) Amendment Bill' p 1.

\(^{16}\) Buchli, Clarke & Upton 'Editorial' p 2.
the idea of *dwelling* that emerged in this period:

The 19th century, like no other century, was addicted to dwelling. It conceived the residence as a receptacle for the person, and it encased him with all his appurtenances so deeply in the dwelling's interior that one might be reminded of the inside of a compass case, where the instrument with all its accessories lies embedded in deep, usually violet folds of velvet.\(^{17}\)

This articulation of the home as an interior encasing the individual reveals the Home Invasion legislation as located within colonial discourse, a discourse of spatial arrangement that arrived in New Zealand in the 19th century. In the Home Invasion debate the discussion of the home continuously returned to a description of the single family detached dwelling, a unit that is spatially segregated from other objects, an object in a clearly defined field. Any other form of dwelling, for example the marae, the fale, the nursing home, that was more spatially complex, where the object and the field were less easily defined, and where the home was not the exclusive site of the individual or nuclear family, created problems for the politicians, so much so that these 'alternate' forms of home, especially 'communal' homes, were completely absent from the discussion.

**‘Home’ in law**

In the debate on this bill a legal definition of ‘home’ was sought. In her writing on the home in law, Lorna Fox articulates the problem of the definition of the home in the legal context. According to Fox, the home in a legal sense is readily understood as a house, a physical structure and an economic asset. Fox sees the problem of the home in law as residing in the law’s preference for rationality, for objectively definable, provable interests. Fox says that,

> the relationship between an occupier and his or her home, inherently intangible and difficult to define, is not readily comprehensible to lawyers. Legal analysis tends to favour the rational, the objective and the tangible... the idea that the home bears specific and identifiable meanings beyond the physical structure or capital value of the house remains, to the legal perspective, an unverifiable and illusive position.\(^{18}\)

It is for this reason that, according to Fox, the home as a concept in law in the western tradition, has never moved beyond the object of the house and the clearly demarcated and defined property rights associated with the house. Yet, as the debate on the Home Invasion legislation demonstrates, the home in common understanding is much more than an object; the home as discussed by the New Zealand legislature is assumed a site of privacy, security and sanctity. It is commonly understood that the home acquires a meaning beyond that of house, and it is this deeper but less rationally understood meaning that the bill initially sought to represent.

**Home territory**

Fox, condensing the research of many others, identifies four areas of meaning in relation to the home: home as physical structure, offering material shelter; home as territory, a site of security and control, a locus in space offering permanence and privacy; home as means of identity and self-identity, as a reflection of one’s values, ideas and status; and home as a social and cultural unit, the locus for relationships especially those of family.\(^{19}\)

The debate on the *Crimes (Home Invasion) Amendment Bill* centred on the first two of these categories. Fox sees the law having no conceptual difficulties with the first of these categories, the home as house, a physical and material entity. The house is a technology providing “crucial, physical shelter for its occupants”\(^{20}\) and it is the “physicality of the house (that) enables the other attributes of the home to be experienced by occupants.”\(^{21}\)

The function of the house is concrete, ‘bricks and mortar’ readily define the limit of the house and the property law reinforcing these limits is well established. However, the debate on the Home Invasion Bill demonstrated that this limit could not be so simply established in the context of this particular discussion. At odds with established property law, in this particular context, the context of the ‘invasion’ of the home, the demarcation of the limit of home became problematic.

This relates then to the second of Fox’s criteria of home, the home as territory, a site of security and control, a locus in space offering permanence and privacy. According

---

\(^{17}\) Benjamin cited, Buchli, Clarke & Upton ‘Editorial’ p 2.

\(^{18}\) Fox ‘The idea of home in law’ pp 34-35.

\(^{19}\) Fox ‘The meaning of home’ p 590.

\(^{20}\) Fox ‘The meaning of home’ p 591.

\(^{21}\) Fox ‘The meaning of home’ p 592.
to Fox the home as territory satisfies a number of social and psychological needs and she cites evidence from a number of sources to indicate that "a critically important function of the home is the sense of security that it is supposed to offer."22 Dovey also describes the home as, "a centre of security, of possessed territory, a place of freedom where our own order can become manifest, secure from the impositions of others."23

While we might expect to be secure in other spaces, as a sanctuary the home is particularly privileged. Theorists of the home regard it as the locus for personal orientation in the world and it is considered a crucial site of childhood development.24 It is for this reason that the 'family' home is identified by Fox as having more currency within a legal context, a point not lost on the promoters of the Crimes (Home Invasion) Amendment Bill who claimed to have "drawn a line around the family home, around the residence."25

Concomitant to this is the fact that the home is regarded as a place of spatial and temporal order and predictability. While it might appear disordered to strangers we are usually more 'at home' in the apparent disorder of our own homes than we would be in "someone else's order."26 It is a combination of these factors that construe the home environment as secure. As Dovey explains, "when we are away from home we need to be alert and adaptable, at home we can relax within the stability of routine behaviour and experience."27

Those promoting the bill sought to assert this privileged position of the home. According to MP Dr Wayne Mapp, "New Zealanders rightly regard their home as a secure haven."28 However an important critique of the bill came from women's groups who drew attention to the slippage made whereby the home is assumed a secure environment. Advocacy groups such as Rape Crisis pointed to the high domestic crime statistics in New Zealand and revealed the anomaly in the bill whereby someone who is legally within a home, whether their own or someone else's, could commit a crime within that home and receive a lesser sentence than had they been a stranger who had forced entry to the home. Opposition MP Phil Goff articulated this ambivalence when he said,

Most people would believe that if the sanctity of the home was what the word suggested, it would not matter who committed the offence. If a person is in their own home, he or she has the right to be free from fear of crime, and if a crime is committed against that person, why should there be a lesser penalty for the molester who happened to be there lawfully?29

In the home invasion debate the home is inevitably and frequently described as a castle. The independent MP (and former policeman) Rana Waitai, sweepingly invoked this 'traditionally' held view, "this notion of a person's home being his or her castle is very deeply embedded in the psyche of not just New Zealanders but all people."30 The castle analogy was also invoked in media discussion on the bill. Detective Senior Sergeant Boreham, a member of the New Zealand Police investigating another high profile 'home invasion' crime said in an interview; "We're more alert when we walk down Queen Street, but when we are at home we are off-guard. Our homes are our castles. For something to happen in them is more chilling."31 It has been suggested that colloquial idioms about the home reflect a real and experienced response to the territorial characteristics of the home. Fox cites an empirical study from the early 1990s on the 'essential qualities of the home', where it was concluded that,

such expressions as 'a man's home is his castle' are supported by... research findings, which suggest that this feeling of control within the home is salient for most people and is linked to the satisfaction of basic psychological needs.32

If the home is not a container but instead a territory, that offers security and control, those forming the Home Invasion legislation needed to ask how far this territory should extend; to be attacked by an 'invader' inside the house is one thing but what, the politicians asked, about attacks occurring in gardens and garden sheds or other out

22 Fox 'The meaning of home' p 595.
23 Dovey 'Home and homelessness' p 43.
24 Fox 'The meaning of home' p 596.
25 Ryall 'Crimes (Home Invasion) Amendment Bill' (29 June 1999) unpaginated
26 Dovey 'Home and homelessness' p 38.
27 Dovey 'Home and homelessness' p 37.
28 Mapp 'Crimes (Home Invasion) Amendment Bill' p 15176.
29 Goff 'Crimes (Home Invasion) Amendment Bill' unpaginated
30 Waitai 'Crimes (Home Invasion) Amendment Bill' p 15173.
31 Wilson 'An invasion at my table' p 40.
32 Unnamed study cited, Fox 'The idea of home in law' p 593.
buildings, on front paths or by letterboxes? As Phil Goff noted:

The other misunderstanding that New Zealanders will have in relation to the term 'home is that they will assume it means the house in which one lives, it might mean the garage next to the house, or the hobby shed, and if one is a farmer it might mean the barn or the cowshed. At the very least, 'home' might mean the backyard and the front yard of one's property. That is what most New Zealanders will assume 'home' means. But the committee found out that ...

... an offender can go up to the doorstep of a home... and blow away a man in the sanctity of his own home, but if the offender is standing outside on the doorstep he has not committed a home invasion. 33

The spatial properties of our homes may affect the perceived limit of the home/territory. For those living in apartment buildings the shared spaces of foyer and circulation may or may not constitute the territory of home. For those living in a rural context, home may refer to the area immediately surrounding the house or it may extend many kilometres to the nearest site where one could expect to encounter others. We commonly refer to places other than our houses as 'home'. When abroad our country of origin is home. For many of us even though we reside in our own home the house or place in which we grew up is sometimes referred to as home. Within an even broader context we can say that, 'I feel at home (with people, places, ideas, situations, a language etc)." 34

As Rapoport (who argues against the use of the term 'home') demonstrates, 'home' is revealed as a fluid construction, a construction that is individually, socially and culturally formed and that can shift with time.

In the context of the 'Crimes (Home Invasion) Amendment Bill' however, the law required a precise definition of terms. However much the intention of the bill was to support the commonly held view of the home as encapsulating aspects of security, territory, privacy, family and identity, these 'unverifiable and illusive' attributes of home proved too difficult and 'home' became conflated with the object of the house. At the final reading of the bill the Minister of Justice made this clear; 'the definition of the home is that it refers to the house itself and not the outbuildings or surrounding land." 35

The bill as passed into legislation was one of 'house' rather than 'home' invasion.

Home Body

Earlier in this discussion the potential collapse of home with body, caused by the coupling of the terms 'home' and 'invasion,' was indicated. This confusion of body and home was most clearly articulated by a victim of a so-called 'home invasion' crime. In a letter to The New Zealand Herald protesting the headline 36 given to the report describing the sentencing of the man who had raped her, in her home, the writer said,

I take exception to the implication that the worst of his crimes was to invade my home. Many of his actions that night caused me considerable more distress than the fact that he broke into my home. His most outrageous crimes were against my person, not against my home. 37

With direct reference to this letter journalist Finlay MacDonald further criticised the lexical invention 'home invasion.' He wrote,

Any suggestion that the location of the act might somehow distinguish between the utterly vile and the not-quite-so-utterly-vile-but-still-really-vile is not only redundant, but also comes dangerously close to equating real estate with flesh and blood. 38

This potentially problematic interlacing of house with body was put simply to parliament, at the second reading of the bill, by MP Diane Yates when she said: "surely a rape is a rape no matter where it happens." 39

It could be argued that in the "Crimes (Home Invasion) Amendment Bill" the location or place of the crime took precedence over the effects of the crime on the body of the victim.

Conclusion: place and space, the proper house, the practiced home

The spatial theory of Michel de Certeau might help us unravel this privileging of the place of the crime over the effects on the body and person. In examining and articulating the spatial properties of the everyday, he navigates a difference between place (lieu) and space (espace). For de Certeau place is

33 Goff 'Crimes (Home Invasion) Amendment Bill' unpaginated
34 Rapoport 'A critical look at the concept 'home" p 27.
35 Ryall 'Crimes (Home Invasion) Amendment Bill' (29 June 1999) unpaginated
36 The headline read: 'Home invader had no mercy.'
37 Duffey 'Crimes were against person not home' p A21.
38 MacDonald 'Home truths' p 5.
39 Yates 'Crimes (Home Invasion) Amendment Bill' p 15178.
alined with order, the institution, stasis, and 'the proper'. He says of place,

A place (lieu) is the order (of whatever kind) in accord with which elements are distributed in relationships of co-existence. It thus excludes the possibility of two things being in the same location (place). The law of the 'proper' rules in the place: the elements taken into consideration are beside one another, each is situated in its own 'proper' and distinct location, a location it defines. A place is thus an instantaneous configuration of positions. It implies an indication of stability.  

In contrast, space comes into being as the result of tactics, actions and movement. For de Certeau space (espace) exists when, one takes into consideration vectors of direction, velocities and time variables. Thus space is composed of intersections and mobile elements. It is in a sense acteduated by the ensemble of movements deployed within it. Space occurs as the effect produced by the operations that orient it, situate it, temporise it... in relation to place, space is like the word when it is spoken, that is, when it is caught in the ambiguity of an actualization... in contradiction to the place, it has thus none of the uniocity or stability of a 'proper'.  

In short, the relationship between place and space is described thus, "space is a practiced place." In this discussion of the elusive definition of home it would seem that the house could be equated with place and the home with space. The everyday, temporal, domestic practices of residing within the place of a house transform it into the space of a home.  

Further, the difficulty of describing the space of the home in law could be productively aligned to the difficulty of describing the quotidian, the everyday. By elevating the everyday as an area of study, by turning the spotlight on it, the everyday might become altered or even erased. As Highmore, in his survey of writings on the everyday says, "the everyday doesn't have a form of attention that is proper to it." Just as the everyday eludes concrete description so the home eludes definition. Although we might intuitively understand the space of the home, when the attention of the New Zealand legislature turned to the home the definition of it became obscured. Central to de Certeau's theory are the terms strategy and tactic. For de Certeau strategy is propietorial, and aligned with place. Strategy occupies a specific place, most often that of the institution in its many forms and guises. The tactical side of everyday life continually 'irrupts' from within this place. Tactics are not counter strategy, they are "inside but 'other': they escaped it without leaving it." Highmore identifies de Certeau's use of a system similar to that of the Freudian conscious and unconscious to describe the strategic/tactical relation. He says, "strategies and tactics, like consciousness and unconsciousness, take place simultaneously, 'under the same roof' so to speak." Again, this may be a frame through which we could approach the question of house and home, and it may explain the difficulty of arriving at a definition of home. We might think of the tactical, spatial practices of home as 'irrupting' within the 'proper' place of the house. The Crimes (Home Invasion) Amendment Bill, timed as it was within the election cycle, has been read as an attempt to gain the law and order vote. For whatever reasons the bill came about, it did initially seek to represent the deeper meaning of 'home.' The debate of the bill in the select committee process saw the confrontation of the objective position required by the law with the less easily defined aspects that we all, individually, understand as home. In the 'interlacing' of "dwelling, technics and politics" that the Crimes (Home Invasion) Bill sought to achieve, the institution of the law could only harbour, to use de Certeau's terms, the proper place of the house; it could not accommodate the spatial qualities of the home.  

The presentation of this paper was accompanied by photographs by Allan MacDonald.

---

40 De Certeau The practice of everyday life p 117.
41 De Certeau The practice of everyday life p 117.
42 De Certeau The practice of everyday life p 117.
43 Highmore Everyday life and cultural theory p 161.
44 Highmore Everyday life and cultural theory p 157.
45 Highmore links this to other terms de Certeau makes use of: place, property, propriety, own, owning, ownership, and proper.
46 Highmore Everyday life and cultural theory p 165.
47 de Certeau cited, Highmore Everyday life and cultural theory p 159.
48 Teyssot 'Water and gas on all floors' p 84.
References:
Risks to the Designers’ Safe Interior Design Due to the Actions of Building Owners Undertaking Minor Building Alterations

B. J. (Jack) Williamson
Queensland University of Technology, AU

During the life of a building one can expect an owner to make minor internal alterations to accommodate changing circumstances. Generally these minor alterations undertaken by the building owner without design advice have in the past not reduced the original safe interior design. However, there are now signs that this situation may be changing. With the easy availability of a wide range of low-cost inflammable sheet materials on the market, some owners may unknowingly use these materials in a way that increases the fire risk for occupants in the building. In other situations an owner may undertake minor alterations in a performance-based designed building. If these minor changes inadvertently alter any part of the Alternative Solution approval provisions then the building approval will be automatically cancelled and the building will be illegally occupied. It could be argued that there is some responsibility on interior designers to ensure that the owners are made aware of the limitation imposed by the Alternative Solution approval and the dangers of minor alterations using inappropriate materials. This situation is further complicated by the development in Queensland with the new legislated safe design obligations for designers.

Introduction
In today’s society it is rather unusual for a building to remain unaltered during the life of the building. These alternations can be due to changing accommodation needs of the building occupants such as amended room layouts, rearrangements for increased communication needs, re-subdivision of rentable spaces or general refurbishment to update the accommodation to present day standards. Where these changes are minor they generally do not compromise the original safe interior design. Past experience to-date has demonstrated that the risks associated with minor changes to interior safe designs have been minimal in Deemed-to-Satisfy (DTS) approved buildings. This is due to most interior designs having an adequate safety margin which can accommodate most minor...
changes from a safety point of view. Where the changes are major this work would normally be classified as 'building work' and therefore subject to building legislation and one would expect that a designer would be engaged for the project.

The potential problem area is where the building owners undertake without professional advice minor alterations that involve technical and planning decisions for which the owners have not been trained. This trend could be encouraged by the owners' experience in the 'do-it-yourself' approach in the home market area. Currently it is easy to arrange the changing of the covering materials to be used for floors, walls and ceilings inside buildings. One could easily use an inappropriate material if one does not have a basic understanding of the properties of materials in terms of fire properties, health issues and safe cleaning procedures. There are today a wide range of readily available materials some of which (such as inflammable sheeting) could present potential fire hazards in the building while other materials could assist the development of an unhealthy environment for building occupants (for example certain plastics that release undesirable vapours over time under certain circumstances).

Installation of inappropriate materials by the owner

A classic case where minor changes inside a building undertaken by the owner could result in the loss of lives was the Station nightclub fire in West Warwick, Rhode Island, USA in 2003. A detailed study of this fire was undertaken by National Institute of Standards and Technology [NIST] (2005), Report of the Technical Investigation of The Station Nightclub Fire. The owners of the nightclub listed the walls and ceiling around the band area with egg-crate polyurethane foam to reduce the noise complaints from the neighbours. This material has a relatively low ignition temperature and a high flame spread rate. On the night of the disaster, the owner placed a temporary counter that restricted the main entrance to ensure that all patrons paid when entering the nightclub. To assist the atmosphere for the young audience the band used pyrotechnics with their performance. The available evidence suggests that there were no protective measures in place to ensure the safe use of the pyrotechnics. The building was a single storey un-sprinklered timber framed structure and at the time of the fire there was no legal requirement for the building to be up-dated with sprinklers.

By a strange set of circumstances the performance of the band that night was videoed. This video showed that the pyrotechnics that were to spray supposedly harmless five metre stream of sparks into the air, were located near the foam lining and as a result the sparks ignited the foam. The video recorded the fire and showed the flames spreading rapidly and generating considerable quantity of black smoke in a short period. There were somewhere between 440 and 458 occupants in the building of which 56 percent to 66 percent attempted to leave through the single main entrance even though the building had three emergency exits. This is not unusual. It has been found in various studies\(^1\) that patrons who are not familiar with the exit provisions of a building, will in an emergency try to exit the only way that they know and that is the way that they came into the building. Unfortunately in this nightclub the main entrance could not accommodate the rush of patrons due to the temporary counter placed by the owner for that night inside the main entrance and this counter restricted the exit passage leading to the main entrance. The resulting restricted exit flow of patrons through the main entrance and the speed of the fire resulted in the death of approximately 100 patrons. As a result of this disaster the band manager is currently in jail for igniting the pyrotechnics and the two owners of the building have been charged with manslaughter.

Other minor alterations by owners in existing buildings

Before proceeding with minor alterations the owner should know if the building has been approved under Deemed-to-Satisfy (DTS) provisions or Alternative Solution provisions. An 'Alternative Solution' is defined by the Building Code of Australia (2007) (commonly called 'Alternative Building Solution' by Queensland building surveyors).\(^2\) The minor alteration flexibility available for building owners can vary significantly depending on the approval system used for the building work.

The DTS system is the traditional prescriptive building regulation system for the erection of buildings to ensure principally the protection

\(^1\) Fire Code Reform Fire Safety in Shopping Centres p 147.

\(^2\) Building Codes Board Building Code of Australia v 1, p 19.
of life from fire and structural collapse and "to prevent the creation of conditions likely to adversely affect the health, comfort and general welfare of occupants." Although easy to use, it is a conservative system and this is shown clearly by the wide range of fire loads the system allows in each building classification as indicated in Table 1.

A benefit of this DTS conservative feature in the past is that most DTS buildings can accommodate most minor changes without reducing the safe design of the building. Currently this situation may be changing with the wider use of plastics in building finishes, furniture and office equipment. In some cases the percentage of plastic materials in some rooms can be very noticeable and resulting in a significant increase in the fire load in the room. It should be remembered that, if the minor alteration work involves a change in occupancy or a change in the building's fire protection needs or if the work can be classified as 'building work' under the building code then a new building approval is required in order to avoid the building being illegally occupied.

The potential problem area is where the minor alterations are undertaken in a performance-based designed building. A performance-based design allows a designer to tailor the design to comply with only those building regulations that apply for that particular building and not those that apply to all buildings in that classification. In other words a performance-based design is concerned with a unique building, its occupants and the uses of that building. In summary according to the Inter-jurisdictional Regulatory Collaboration Committee, Performance Based Building Regulations, "performance-based design means designing to specifiable and quantifiable levels of performance." By allowing alternative solutions to be considered, the performance-based approach frequently results in significant cost savings in major projects. However, it requires the designers and the assessors to have a detailed understanding of the performance provisions of the building code and the necessary skills to apply those provisions to produce safe buildings.

In those situations where the owner undertakes minor alterations in a performance-based designed building some caution is needed to ensure that the alterations do not affect the original Alternative Solution approval. Some examples of alterations that could alter the building approval given under an Alternative System are:

- Closing off a door, which has the effect of increasing the travel distance to an exit beyond that approved. (In this case the original approved travel distance was already long due to performance-based design approval).
- Rearranging a couple of sprinkler heads in a special performance-based sprinkler layout to allow the installation of a new partition.
- Replacing a solid core door with a honeycomb door where the solid core door was required by the approved performance-based design.
- Installation of non-fire rated window in an internal fire rated passage

If the minor alterations affect or alter the conditions upon which the original approval was given, then those original conditions no longer exist and therefore the original approval is automatically cancelled. If the building continues to be used after this situation then it would be illegally occupied. This would expose the owner to a difficult legal situation if a building occupant were injured in the building during this illegal occupation period. To overcome this situation a new building approval would need to be obtained.

Although the emphasis has been on fire issues, it should be noted that there are other forms of alterations that affect the safety or building occupants. These include changed cleaning procedures that may increase allergy problems for building occupants, changes in air condition ducting that reduce the quality of the air conditioning and other minor changes that increase the risk of occupants' injuries such as a slight change in floor levels that could result in tripping accidents.

---

3 Steed & Daly The Regulation of Building Standards in NSW p 2.
5 Or an ‘Alternative Solution’ as defined by BCA 2007, v. 1, p 19.
6 Regulatory Collaboration Committee Performance Based Building Regulations p 13.
TABLE 1
TYPICAL FIRE LOAD ANALYSIS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CLASS</th>
<th>EXAMPLES</th>
<th>LOW FIRE LOAD* MJ/m²</th>
<th>AVERAGE FIRE LOAD MJ/m²</th>
<th>HIGH FIRE LOAD* MJ/m²</th>
<th>EXAMPLES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Offices bldgs Dentist's offices (200)</td>
<td>255</td>
<td>420</td>
<td>693</td>
<td>High rise office (800) Printing office (1000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Shops bldgs Flower shop (80) Bank counter (300)</td>
<td>364</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>990</td>
<td>Book shop (1000) Floor covering shop (1000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7b</td>
<td>Storage bldgs Cheese (100)</td>
<td>606</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>1650</td>
<td>Warehouses Floor covering (6000) Edible fats (18900)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Factory bldgs Artificial stone (40) Brewery (80)</td>
<td>182</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>495</td>
<td>Cotton mills (1200) Briquette mfg (1600)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Laboratory bldgs Physics lab. (200)</td>
<td>182</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>495</td>
<td>Chemical lab. (500)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9a</td>
<td>Health-care bldgs</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>380</td>
<td>Hospital (300) Asylum (400)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9b</td>
<td>Assembly bldgs Exhibition for machines (80)</td>
<td>182</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>495</td>
<td>Congress hall (600) Library (2000)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. *Low fire load taken as average / 1.65 and high fire load taken as 1.65 x average based on 90% quantile value being 1.65.

Design responsibility
The traditional view has been that unless there is a design error in the original design, the designer's responsibility ends generally when the owner takes possession of the building and the designer cannot be held accountable for any subsequent building alteration work undertaken by the owner (except where a case can be pursued under Common Law). Unfortunately when there is a financial claim made due to an injury or death due to some aspect of the building, solicitors tend to include all associated with the project including the designer. This approach by solicitors is supported by the current societal demands for safer products (including buildings).

Because of this trend those Australian organisations that oversee workplace and safety issues are now suggesting that designers' responsibility be extended to ensure that the building design is "safe and without risks to the health of persons using it as a workplace for the purpose for which it was designed." This implies the designer's responsibility for a safe design could continue after the handover of the facility to the owner. Regarding the concept of a safe design, the Australian Safety and Compensation Council defines a safe design as:

the integration of hazard identification and risk assessment methods early in the design process to eliminate or minimise the risks of injury throughout the life of the product being designed. It encompasses all design including facilities, hardware, energy control, layout and configuration.

---

7 Worksafe Victoria Designing Safer Buildings and Structures p 2.
The above document Guidance on the Principles of Safe Design for Work lists the key principles as:

Principle 1: Persons with Control
— persons who make decisions affecting the design of products, facilities or processes are able to promote health and safety at the source.

Principle 2: Product Lifecycle
— safe design applies to every stage in the lifecycle from conception through to disposal. It involves eliminating hazards to minimising risks as early in the lifecycle as possible.

Principle 3: Systematic Risk Management
— the application of hazard identification, risk assessment and risk control processes to achieve safe design.

Principle 4: Safe Design Knowledge and Capability
— should be either demonstrated or acquired by persons with control over design.

Principle 5: Information Transfer
— effective communication and documentation of design and risk control information between all persons involved in the phases of the lifecycle is essential for the safe design approach.  

From the above principles it is suggested that safe design is not only concerned with the initial design stage but also includes the use of the building during its lifecycle, assessment of risks in the building and ensuring that all persons involved in the lifecycle of the building are adequately informed of the issues involved to maintain the safe design for the life of the building.

This approach appears to extend the designers’ responsibility into an area where designers have no control because buildings owners can alter the interior design without the knowledge of the designer. In this changing environment the traditional view that the designer cannot be held accountable for the later actions of an owner may not apply in all cases. Therefore, it would appear desirable for the designer to brief the owner on the safe design features of the building or interior design, to suggest caution in undertaking certain alterations including minor alterations without design advice and to ensure that the owner is aware of the limitations imposed by the performance-based design where it applies in a building.

Queensland situation
In Queensland through legislation safe design obligations have been placed on designers in the Queensland Workers‘ Compensation and Rehabilitation and Other Acts Amendment Act 2005, which is to come into effect in July 2007. The definition of designers in the Act is very wide and includes all the design professions in the building industry including interior designers. The legislative obligation on designers is to ensure the design of the structure (in the case of a building) does not affect the workplace health and safety of persons

(a) during construction of the structure; and
(b) when the structure has been constructed and is being used for the purpose for which it was designed.  

This highlights risks for designers in three broad safe design areas:

1. Safe construction — This includes not only the construction of the building but also the construction of the interior facilities.

2. Safe use of facilities — This is an open-ended area of concern for all designers. For interior designers this would include materials that are safe over the intended life of the facility and also include the design of safe working spaces for building occupants.

3. Safe maintenance — This would involve not only the traditional maintenance issues such as painting, repairs, replacement of items but also issues associated with the internal cleaning procedures for the building.

Naturally this Queensland legislation has highlighted significant legal issues for the designing professions in Queensland. As the obligations as stated in the Act are in strict/absolute terms one’s defence (such as reasonable practicability) is very limited (Private legal opinion, 2007). Another aspect is that the Queensland Act permits “civil claims by any individual who suffers injury as a result of a breach of the provisions of the Amended Act” (Private legal opinion, 2007). Subsequently, the Queensland State Government in Industrial Relations Act and Other Legislation Act (2007) amended the legislation and removed the need to produce “a written on the

---


health and safety aspects of the design before construction starts." Nevertheless, there is still considerable concern in the design professions regarding the legal implications associated with the remaining aspects of the legislation. A further complication is that since a breach of the Act would be a criminal offence then professional indemnity insurance cover would not apply.

Risk management
As indicated above there is a certain level of risk associated with the interior design of a building. In the past this risk level has been low but if current societal demands for safer buildings were to continue then that level of risk can be expected to increase. It is suggested that some form of risk management be adopted by interior designers to "control, prevent or reduce loss of life, illness, or injury, damage to property and consequential loss, and environmental impact." This Application Guide raises a number of issues but for the purposes of this study it is suggested that special attention be given to:

- Identifying the risks;
- Judging the tolerability of the risks;
- Determine the probability of the risks;
- Record the steps that were taken to reduce these risks; and
- Record the advice given to the owner regarding the safe design and the need for owners to pass on this information to future owners when the property is sold.

The above steps for an interior design may on the surface appear to be an 'over kill' but in a society that is becoming progressively more litigious this approach could in time prove to be a wise investment. Unfortunately, Australia is quickly following America in litigious actions. The key element in minimising one's risks is the paper trail that records what was considered, why certain decisions were made and what advice was given to the owner. One cannot prevent being joined in a damages claim due to actions taken by a building owner but one can take steps to minimise the risks to oneself in such a claim.

---

References:


